Strengthening Competence and Mentoring the High School Teachers teaching Social Studies for the K-12 Curriculum in Division of Valencia City, Mindanao, Philippines

Abstract of the Study

by:
Marjorie T. Sobradil
Sittie Juhanna M. Pandapatan
Reynante B. Casiro
Aljean Sareno
May Alinie P. Butalid
Meshelle M. Rivera

Central Mindanao University, Philippines

The Philippine government is in the transition of the implementation of the K-12 curriculum program. The implementation of the new curriculum made significant changes since it emphasize the shift of the new learning standards where the learning competencies should be output based and students centered. The study was conducted to evaluate the readiness of the social studies teachers on their knowledge, competencies and skills to deliver the new standards of education. The study revealed that high school social studies teachers had great challenges in dealing with K-12 program where students must have deeper understanding of the things/events surrounding him and learned the mastery of using skills and values of appreciation, analysis, and responsibility, productive and must be able to contribute solutions to the problems surrounding him. Thus, teachers must undergo more interventions for capacity development to enrich their knowledge on the multiple disciplines of social sciences. Further, they need to learn more output based teaching strategies in using multiple resources to exposed their students to multiple and contradictory viewpoints, and encouraged to seek their own position based on reliable information.

Keywords: Curriculum, Social Studies, Teachers

Introduction

Social studies are inherently interdisciplinary. Within the field, the various disciplines that comprise social studies link and intertwine. It's difficult to imagine studying historical content without examining the roles of persons (sociology), their motivations (psychology), where they lived (geography), the influences of spiritual beliefs (religion), rules that govern behavior (political science and anthropology), or how people negotiate for their needs and wants (economics). Outside the field of social studies, vital connections can also be made to language arts, mathematics, science and the arts that yield a deeper understanding of concepts and ideas.

Brain research suggests that knowledge is learned more quickly and remembered longer when constructed in a meaningful context in which connections among ideas are made (Dowen, Tony, 2007). Teaching social studies involves the teaching of social sciences subjects where
teaching needs to be revitalized towards helping the learner acquire knowledge and skills in an interactive environment. According to (Boyer, 2004), the teaching of social sciences must adopt methods that promote creativity, aesthetics, and critical perspectives, and enable children to draw relationships between past and present, to understand changes taking place in society. Problem solving, dramatization and role play are some hitherto underexplored strategies that could be employed. Teaching should utilize greater resources of audio-visual materials, including photographs, charts and maps, and replicas of archaeological and material cultures. In order to make the process of learning participative there is a need to shift from mere imparting of information to debate and discussion. This approach to learning will keep both the learner and teacher alive to social realities. Concepts should be clarified to the students through the lived experiences of individuals and communities. It has often been observed that cultural, social and class differences generate their own biases, prejudices and attitudes in classroom contexts. The approach to teaching therefore needs to be open-ended. Teachers should discuss different dimensions of social reality in the class, and work towards creating increasing self-awareness amongst themselves and in the learners.

The social sciences encompass diverse concerns of society and include a wide range of content drawn from the disciplines of history, geography, political science, economics, and sociology. The selection and organization of material into a meaningful social science curriculum, one that will enable students to develop a critical understanding of society, is therefore a challenging task. The possibilities of including new dimensions and concerns are immense; especially in view of the students own life experiences. (Haynes, 2002). There is a widespread belief that social science merely transmits information and is too centered, on the text, which is required to be memorized for examinations. The content of these textbooks is considered to be unconnected to daily realities. In addition, social science is viewed as providing unnecessary details about the past. It is also felt that the examination paper rewards the memorization of these superfluous facts, with the children’s conceptual understanding being largely ignored. Any effort to address the information overload in the social sciences will simultaneously have to review the current examination system. In this scenario, the faculty of Social Sciences department made the outreach activities to the High School teachers teaching social studies in 3rd district of Bukidnon to enhance their competence and efficiency in teaching social studies especially with the implementation of the K-12 curriculum.

Research Objectives

The study sought to determine the needs and problems encountered by the high school teaching social studies with the implementation of the K-12 curriculum in the 3rd district of Bukidnon, Philippines

To determine the changes in the secondary K-12 curriculum program from the old curriculum

To determine the relevant knowledge, skills competencies needed in teaching social studies with the K-12 program in the secondary curriculum

To determine the topics/issues in social studies needed by the teachers to update the information and trends teaching in social studies.
Significance of the Study

This study provided a significant contribution in determining the predicaments of the high school teachers teaching social studies with the implementation of the K-12 curriculum. The study is beneficial to the following: First, to the teacher participants for it gave them insights on what are the skills, knowledge and competencies needed to teach the required courses in the K-12 curriculum. Second, to the proponents of the study it serves a basis to frame a module needed to update and equip the knowledge, skills and competencies to enhance the teaching capacities of teachers in teaching social studies through interdisciplinary approaches. Third, the concepts in social sciences help the respondents to transmit the knowledge clearly to the students through the lived experiences of individuals and communities to avoid cultural, social and class differences that would generate their own biases, prejudices and attitudes. Further, it encourage teachers to teach social studies by adopting methods that promote creativity, aesthetics, and critical perspectives, and enable students to draw relationships between past and present and to understand changes taking place in society.

Conceptual Framework

![Conceptual Framework](image)

Figure 1. Conceptual framework of the Study

The implementation of K-12 program curriculum made significant changes in the social studies curriculum in the secondary curriculum with new learning standard competencies since in the old curriculum allegedly learning tended to be more focused on content, which was fragmented and disintegrated. In K-12 program, students must have deeper understanding of the things/events surrounding him and learned the mastery of using skills and values of appreciation, analysis, and responsibility, productive and must be able to contribute solutions to the problems surrounding him. The transmission of knowledge in K-12 is dynamic and gradually abandoning the traditional way of teaching students. With the shift of the new learning standards and competencies in the implementation of K-12 program. There is a need to evaluate the readiness of the social studies teachers on their knowledge, competencies and skills to deliver the new standards of education with new learning competencies where they need to update their knowledge, skills and teaching mechanisms. Thus teachers needed capacity development interventions to help them in their journey to promote quality education in the country.
Methodology

The study was conducted through the need assessment with the participants through focus group discussion and survey questionnaire. The findings of the need assessment was used a basis for making a module for the actual conduct of study. The study leader coordinated with the Department of Education and Central Mindanao University administration to conduct the study. Activities were listed so that the objectives would be achieved at the designated time. Other technical support was also identified and the preparation of the training materials. Lectures and workshops were based on the need of the participants. The faculty members of the social sciences department teaching History, Political Science and Philosophy were given assigned topics for the actual conduct of the study. The evaluation stage included the objectives, lecturers/speakers, lesson content, and participants, knowledge gained from the topics, workshop and materials as well as the venue. Evaluation was conducted through the questionnaire and the giving of impression from the participants after the seminar-workshops conducted. The result of the study was analyzed through descriptive method.

Results of the Study

Table 1. Presentation of the changes in Social Studies the Secondary Curriculum K-12 Curriculum Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Level</th>
<th>Required Courses</th>
<th>Learning Standards</th>
<th>Features of K-12 Learning Standards</th>
<th>Features of Old Curriculum learning Standards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Philippine History</td>
<td>Demonstrate a deep understanding of the basic concepts stages of the history of the Philippines using the skills of appreciation, analysis, sustainable and productive</td>
<td>Output based Learner Centered Inclusive and research based Standard and competence based, seamless and decongested</td>
<td>Knowledge, skills, and values were expected to be learnt by students within a limited period of time Learning tended to be more focused on content, which was fragmented and disintegrated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Asian Studies</td>
<td>Demonstrate a deep understanding of the basic concepts and contemporary issues Asian region with the skills and appreciation, just, and humane citizens of the country and the world</td>
<td>Flexible, ICT based and global</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade Level</td>
<td>Required Courses</td>
<td>Learning Standards</td>
<td>Features of K-12 Learning Standards</td>
<td>Features of Old Curriculum learning Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Research Methods in Social Science)- 1st semester Philippine Contemporary Society</td>
<td>Demonstrate a deep understanding of contemporary issues historical, political, economic, cultural and social of the Philippines with the theory, approaches and research based</td>
<td>Output based Learner Centered Inclusive and research based</td>
<td>Knowledge, skills, and values were expected to be learnt by students within a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues and Challenges</td>
<td>Methods of the social sciences and related disciplines to a just (just), peaceful, sustainable, prosperous, patriotic and humane society.</td>
<td>Standard and competence based, seamless and decongested.</td>
<td>Limited period of time Learning tended to be more focused on content, which was fragmented and disintegrated.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues and Problems in Philippine Contemporary Politics and Governance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues and Problems in Philippine History</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues and Problems in Contemporary Philippine Economic Development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Contemporary Global Issues and Challenges</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationalism, Identity and Globalization</td>
<td>Demonstrated a deep understanding of contemporary issues facing the world today from the perspective and approaches of various disciplines to help towards a just (just), peaceful, sustainable, prosperous and humane society.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mga Pandaigdigang Isyu at Suliranin sa Heograpiya at Kapaligiran</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEAN and Contemporary World Citizenship in a Globalized World</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Health and Social Issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1, revealed the significant changes in the K-12 curriculum where the learning competencies should be output based and students centered. Students must have deeper understanding of the things/events surrounding him and learned the mastery using skills and values of appreciation, analysis, responsibility, productive and must be able to contribute solutions to the events surrounding him. The transmission of knowledge in K-12 is dynamic and gradually abandoning the traditional way teaching such as memorization and spoon feeding of information to students. In K-12 students must develop their research skills and discover the world to help in finding solutions to the social, economic and political problems of the society.

With the shift of the new learning standards and competencies in the implementation of K-12 program. There is a need to evaluate the readiness of the social studies teachers on their knowledge, competencies and skills to deliver the new standards of education with new learning competencies where they need to update their knowledge and teaching strategies.
In the implementation of K-12 curriculum there are significant changes in the learning competencies since in the old curriculum, so much knowledge, skills, and values were expected to be learnt by students within a limited period of time. Moreover, learning tended to be more focused on content, which was fragmented and disintegrated.

In the new curriculum, Araling Panlipunan will contain concepts about self, community, local history of the learner. Moreover, the new Araling Panlipunan covers a deeper understanding of the history, geography, politics, economy, and national development in the Philippines, in Asia and in the world. At the Senior High School level, students will learn about current issues and challenges and propose solutions to them. The skills to be developed among learners include critical thinking, logical reasoning, creativity, appreciation of one’s culture, research skills, communication skills, responsibility, productivity, environmental consciousness, and having a global vision.

It uses integrative, inquiry-based and constructive approaches to develop the competencies of learners and the optimum development of the Filipino child. This component is intended to guide student inquiry and may be adapted to respond to student needs, interests, and new or emerging issues of global significance. Inquiry is a complex process that grows out of constructivist pedagogy. It begins with the selection of a topic and the design of powerful questions that guide students as they select resources, gather and interpret information, build relevant knowledge and understanding, and share their findings and conclusions. Inquiry relies upon critical and divergent thinking. During the inquiry process, the role of a teacher shifts from covering content to becoming a guide and facilitator. Students are given the opportunity to generate their own questions, to set learning goals, to acquire and share enduring understandings, and to develop the decision-making skills that are part of active revealed that among the concerns of teachers in teaching social studies is developing ideas. In teaching Araling Panlipunan in secondary education students need to achieve a balance of breadth and depth in their understanding of global issues and local issues such as Poverty, Wealth, and Power, Oppression, Gender, Politics, Social Justice, Human Rights and Indigenous Peoples Peace and Conflict. Students must develop strong inquiry questions that move beyond the accumulation of facts to the investigation of issues, conceptual understanding, and the exploration of diverse perspectives.

Teachers should strive to address issues that have local, national, and global implications. Whatever the issue, provide opportunities for students to engage in learning at the local community level. Teachers must be able to use multiple resources, including primary source material, and encourage academic rigor. Students should be exposed to multiple and contradictory viewpoints, and encouraged to seek their own position based on reliable information. Sources could include community members, specialists and academics, newspapers and journals, web-based sources, governmental and nongovernmental agencies and organizations, business and industry, environmental and social action groups, and others.

According to interviews with the teacher participants, they need to be equipped with knowledge and skills to meet the learning competencies of the secondary K-12 curriculum where outcome-based outputs are required to make the students productive and meet the vision of the K-12 curriculum. They find it difficult to develop ideas for interactive learning especially that
they are teaching different grade levels and dealing with students who have different levels of intelligence. Most of their students are coming from far places who are hiking from home to school. When they reach the classroom they felt tired to participate in the classroom and just fall asleep. Teachers need to have more access to instructional materials that can cater the different needs, concerns and intelligence of their students and suits the needs of different grade levels.

Table 2 Presentation of theme/topic based on the priority needs improvement, suitability and aspects for improvement of the participants based on the needs assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>Suitability according to grade level</th>
<th>Methods/Strategy based on Interdisciplinary Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary global issues, problems and challenges</td>
<td>Political Ideologies (democracy, socialism, communism and movements of nationalism)</td>
<td>Grade 7 (Asian Studies)</td>
<td>Cross-disciplinary Approach (</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of innovative and modern educational instructional materials and sources of history Patterns and development in transportation, communication, education and immigration etc.</td>
<td>Physical setting Themes of Geography Map reading Regions of Asia and the World Time Zone</td>
<td>Grade 7 (Araling Panlipunan Grade 8 (World History)</td>
<td>Multi-disciplinary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contemporary global issues, problems and challenges</td>
<td>International Organizations Issues of conflicts (national and international) Challenges to attain peace, unity and solidarity to attain global peace and prosperity</td>
<td>Grade 10 (Contemporary global issues)</td>
<td>Multi-disciplinary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics (Virtue and Value) Basic Human Rights (Global and Philippine Issues)</td>
<td>Issues on Human Rights, Gender and Sexuality</td>
<td>Grade 10 (Contemporary issues)</td>
<td>Trans-Disciplinary Approach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2, revealed the top priority needs of the topics/theme based on the needs assessment. Teacher’s needs more enhancements since they do not have textbook yet for the subjects in Grade 11 and 12 but they are required to do teach and research to make their own modules during the transition of the K-12 curriculum implementation.

The topics presented to the participants were based on their priority needs. The said indicators and topics were presented to the participants adopting the three basic approaches to interdisciplinary study in the social sciences that can be conveniently identified as multi-disciplinary, cross-disciplinary and trans-disciplinary. Interdisciplinary then remains the generic all-encompassing concept and includes all activities which juxtapose, apply, combine, synthesize, integrate or transcend parts of two or more disciplines. Multi-disciplinary activity involves juxtaposing, but experiencing little contact between the participating disciplines. Cross disciplinary approaches involve real interaction across disciplines, though the extent and nature vary considerably. Trans-disciplinary approaches feature overarching thought models which propose to replace existing disciplinary world views.
Multidisciplinary Approach was used in presenting the topics on “Patterns and development in transportation, communication, education and immigration” in relation to geography which has five themes—location, place, region, movement, and human-environment interaction. Understanding these themes will help you get a better picture of the world Earth where a place can be found. Geographers use imaginary lines on Earth’s surface. This helps them locate any place in the world. Lines that run in the same direction as the equator are called lines. They measure distance north and south of the equator measure distance east and west of the prime meridian.

Multi Disciplinary and The Cross Disciplinary Approach were used in presenting the topics and workshop on “Political Ideologies” (liberalism, socialism, communism, capitalism, conservatism, anarchism, fascism and etc. Multi Disciplinary approach tend to look beyond the horizons of one specialized discipline when there is a question of solving a problem bearing on social and economic development.; it quickly becomes evident that many links exist between elements which a specialized monodisciplinary scientific analysis would be liable to separate, and the natural impulse is to go beyond the frontiers of particular disciplines in order to get a more general and complete picture. Cross-disciplinary topics frequently emerge from perceived social problem areas. Social and economic problems such as crimes (law and order) and labor management conflicts are a social concern. Every one of the social science disciplines has something to say about social and economic problems. Every social studies focused on the role political ideology influencing political and social movements in the present and in the past. What happens in the real world has something to do with ideologies which are the root of debates in social and economic problems. Typically, each ideology contains certain ideas on what it considers to be the best form of government (for example, democracy, theocracy, etc.), and the best economic system (such as capitalism, socialism, etc). For instance, "socialism" may refer to an economic system, or it may refer to an ideology that supports that economic system. Political ideologies are concerned with many different aspects of a society, some of which are: the economy, education, health care, labor law, criminal law, the justice system, the provision of social security and social welfare, trade, the environment, minors, immigration, race, use of the military, patriotism, and established religion.

Transdisciplinary approach was used in presenting the topics and workshops on Ethics (Virtue and Value) in relation to respecting the rights of others, reflections on same sex marriage, reproductive health and use of contraceptive methods, prostitution and violence against women and children. The Transdisciplinary approach refers to learning that is authentic and relevant to the real world. Learning is not confined by traditional subjects but is supported and enriched by them. Each Transdisciplinary Theme encompasses a vast swath of universal understandings common to all of humanity and opens enough to embrace a variety of content areas. For example the theme; Who we are, explores the nature of self, our personal beliefs and values, our personal, physical, mental, social and spiritual health, human relationships, our rights and responsibilities and what it is to be human. This Transdisciplinary Theme is deeply investigated through different questions and explorations throughout the students learning journey, leaving them with a layered understanding of themselves
and the connections they have with the rest of humanity. Teachers, when effectively using this approach, do not compartmentalize learning, but rather explore content within the context of inquiry.

The Cross Disciplinary Approach were used in presenting the topics and workshop on “Mga isyung pangkapayaan mga suliranin at hamon tungo sa kapayapaan, pagkakaisa, pagtutulungan at kaunlaran” especially centered on the issues between the conflicts of Christians and Muslims in the Philippines. Cross-disciplinary topics frequently emerge from perceived social and economic problem such as territorial disputes, killings, poverty and peace and order. With regard to the increasing crime rate, efforts must be made to strengthen law enforcement institutions to cope with the difficult task of crime prevention. It is where personality deals with an individual’s organization for response to a perceived environment, culture, social structure, economy and polity all pertain to the collective or aggregate level of human activity.

Moreover, where culture generally designates the symbolic aspect of collective behavior, the rules of right behavior that are ostensibly followed by an entire population, social structure most often refers to the material aspect, to the way that behavior is affected by membership in specific categories and groupings of people within a population.

The Cross disciplinary approaches were used in presenting the topics on “Samahang pangkakabaihan, mga sector pang-ekonomiya, agrikultura, industriya at paglilingkod sustainable development. The evolution of social movements from traditional to modern movements of feminism, agricultural production, methods of delivery of services and inclusive development is affected by the environment which was primarily changed by increases in knowledge, accumulating energy control, and improvements in the technology of production. Cross disciplinary efforts were undertaken, with the increased usage of evolution as a holistic concept for handling the increasing developments dealing with the question of how societies change. Cross-disciplinary approaches involve an effort at connecting and combining across disciplinary boundaries. It involves seven categories of cross-disciplinary activity: topical focus, professional preparation, life experience perspective, shared components, cross-cutting organizing principles or concepts, hybrids and grand syntheses. Trans-disciplinary approaches involve overarching non-discipline

The Multidisciplinary and Cross Disciplinary Approaches were used to present the on the following issues: 1) International Organizations and Alliances; 2) Issues on peace, migration, territorial and border conflicts, political dynasties, graft and corruption and; 3) Asian Culture, Colonialism and Imperialism, Nationalism. Countries needs alliances for self-preservation and solve its domestic economic, social, political and cultural problems. Whenever the public calls for solutions to a serious social problem, multidisciplinary approach tend to be established. Undoubtedly, when it is a question of solving a problem bearing on social, political and economic development, it is essential to look beyond the horizons of one specialized discipline; it quickly becomes evident that many links exist between elements which a specialized monodisciplinary scientific analysis would be liable to separate, and the natural impulse is to go beyond the frontiers of particular disciplines in order to
get a more general and complete picture. The "real world" is not divided up in the same fashion as academic departments, and policy proposals based on the narrow view of one discipline are at least naive and in the worst case may lead to disastrous mistakes. Thus, a Cross Disciplinary Approach is necessary to have interaction of different fields of knowledge (disciplines) with different concepts, methods, and data and terms organized into a common effort on a common problem with continuous intercommunication among the different disciplines that may range from simple communication of ideas to the mutual integration of organizing concepts, methodology and procedures.

**Conclusion:**

The changes in the curriculum in the implementation of K-12 program is beneficial since it is student centered learning approach and output based where students develop their skills of responsibility, analysis and appreciation. The new learning competencies will enable student to become creative, resourceful and independent.

The new learning standards and competencies in the K-12 program is challenging on the part of the Social Studies teachers in the 3rd district of Bukidnon since they only have outlines of the modules which are provided in the junior high school and no modules yet for the senior high school. Further, they lack the resources needed to teach the new learning methods and strategies

Teachers must spend great deal of research, innovative and resourcefulness in accessing the materials in social studies relevant to the implementation of the K-12 curriculum.

**VIII. Recommendations:**

1. Social studies teachers should undergo more seminar-workshops to enrich more their knowledge on the multiple disciplines of social science and aid them in teaching the subject by adopting the multidisciplinary, cross-disciplinary and trans-disciplinary approaches in teaching social studies.

2. Students who are taught with an interdisciplinary technique enable the students to master higher order thinking skills. The foundation of interdisciplinary techniques will lead to a future of discovery and innovation. Thus, it is recommended that, interdisciplinary technique in teaching social studies should be encourage for it enable the students to see different perspectives, work in groups, and make the synthesizing of disciplines as the ultimate goal.

3. The interdisciplinary approach has become an important and challenging technique in the in the modern curriculum. The interdisciplinary approach synthesizes more than one discipline and creates teams of teachers and students that enrich the overall educational experience. Thus, teachers should be given more opportunities with trainings and exposures to equip them more with competencies and skills to implement the K-12 curriculum.

**References**


THE EFFECT OF MOTIVATION AND LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOR ON THE PERFORMANCE OF EMPLOYEES OF THE INDUSTRY AND TRADE SERVICE IN MAKASSAR CITY

Muh. Arifai¹, Asrani Parawansa², Herman H³, Muhammad Jihad Firman⁴, Muh. Rizal S⁵
¹-⁵ Universitas Negeri Makassar

Email: muh.arifai@gmail.com¹, asrani.parawansa@unm.ac.id², herman.h@gmail.com³, jihad.firman@gmail.com⁴, muh.rizal@unm.ac.id⁵

Abstract

This study aims to determine the effect of motivation and leadership behavior on the performance of employees at the Department of Industry and Trade of Makassar City. In hopes of contributing to the improvement of agency performance, through the application of leadership motivation and behavior at the Office of Industry and Trade of Makassar City. The population in this study were all employees of the Department of Industry and Trade of Makassar city as many as 100 people. The number of samples used was 68 civil servants using saturated sampling techniques. Data collection is done using observation and questionnaire methods. The data analysis technique used is multiple regression analysis using the Statistical Product and Service Solution (SPSS) program. The results showed that partially the motivation variable had a positive but not significant effect and leadership behavior had a positive and significant effect. Simultaneously motivation and leadership behavior have a significant effect on the performance of employees in the Department of Industry and Trade of Makassar City. The determination coefficient is 0.553 which indicates that the ability of the independent variable to predict the dependent variable is 55.3%. 44.7% are influenced by other factors not examined.

Keywords: Motivation, Leadership Behavior, Employee Performance.

INTRODUCTION

Human resources have a major role in every company and government activity, while resources and infrastructure and other resources, without human, corporate or institutional resources will not work well (Bhaskar & Gupta, 2016; Fee, Liu, & McGrath-Champ, 2013; Fernandes & Taba, 2018; Germain, 2013; Sheffield & Jaconelli, 2000; Sun, 1997; Thapisa, 1994; Tony Yu, 2008). Thus human resources are the key that must be considered in all of their needs (Bhaskar & Gupta, 2016; Chabke & Haddad, 2018; Fee et al., 2013; Thapisa, 2013; Ulhøi & Stjernholm Madsen, 2013; Wan, 2018). Human resources will determine the success of the implementation of company activities (Akib & Salam, 2016; Farida, 2017; M. S. Saggaf & Salam, 2017; S. Saggaf, Salam, Kahar, & Akib, 2014; Salam, Akhyar, Tayeb, & Niswaty, 2017; Salam & Rosdiana, 2016).

The low performance achievement of the Makassar City Industry and Trade Office, based on the indicator of approval of absorption is below 40%, which is 35.77 percent. This is due to employee performance based on special indicators issued by Law No. 43 of 1999 concerning the Assessment of Civil Servants' Work). The level of meetings of the Makassar Industry and Trade Service Officers, during January to December 2015, civil servants averaged 38%, there was no 50%, sick 12% of the total civil servants were 68 people. Below the average of 49%, absent 43%, sick 7% of the total number of employees contracted 32 people (Disperindag Kota Makassar, 2015).

The low performance of employees of the Makassar City Industry and Trade Office.
Motivation is an impulse in someone who will encourage achievement and will give a sense of satisfaction with their work. Giving motivation to employees is one of the important factors that can determine the success of an institution in achieving employee performance that improves performance.

Every employee has motivation at work, there are those who ask for awards and some who want satisfaction satisfaction in doing a job that can only be accepted by themselves. Explaining the source of motivation can be classified into two, namely the source of motivation from yourself (intrinsic) and the source of motivation from the outside (extrinsic).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Motivation Theory
According to Maslow (1943) motivation has five levels, namely: physiological (physiological), safety (security), social (social relations), esteem (appreciation), and self-actualization (self-actualization), and achieved in stages. The work motivation indicators are: 1) the person reaches the goal, 2) the spirit of work, 3) the initiative and creativity, 4) the responsibility (Al-Aufi & Ahmed Al-Kalbani, 2014; Biemann & Stamov-Roßnagel, 2012; Forrier, Sels, & Stynen, 2014; Gottlieb, Lopes, & Oudeyer, 2016; Kulviwat & Lee, 2008; Nasrullah, Salam, Pratiwi, & Niswaty, 2017; Niswaty, Rusbiati, Jamaluddin, & Salam, 2017; M. S. Saggaf, Nasriyah, Salam, & Wirawan, 2018; Salam, Akib, & Daraba, 2018). The explanation of the four indicators is as follows.

1. Encouragement reaches the goal
Someone who has a high work motivation then in him has a strong drive to achieve maximum performance which will later affect the goals of a company or agency.

2. Work spirit
The spirit of work is a good psychological state if the work spirit creates pleasure that encourages someone to work harder and better and consequently in achieving the goals set by the company or agency.

3. Initiative and creativity
The initiative is defined as the strength or ability of an employee or employee to start or continue a job with full energy.

4. Responsibility
Responsible as the ability of an employee to carry out duties according to procedures and handle problems that are being faced by agencies.

Leadership Behavior
Leadership is a process of influencing in determining the organization, motivating followers' behavior to achieve goals, influencing to improve the group and culture (Guay, 2013; Hassan, Mahsud, Yukl, & Prussia, 2013; Kirkbride, 2006; Kragt & Guenter, 2018; McQueen & Janson, 2007; Newness, Pichler, & S. Michel, 2014; Patterson, Gregory Stone, & Russell, 2004; Swensen, Gorringe, Caviness, & Peters, 2016; Winston & Joseph, 2005). The ability and leadership skills in direction are important factors. If an agency/organization can identify qualities related to leadership, the ability to select effective leaders will increase if the organization can identify behaviors and effective leadership techniques, development of personalist effectiveness in the organization can be achieved (Al Raffie & Huehn, 2016; Azah & Leithwood, 2016; Falk, 2013; Fred Garcia, 2013; Hopkins, O'Neil, & Bilimoria, 2013; Huguet, 2016; Mascia, Dal Pubel, & Sartori, 2013; Schafer, 2013). That leadership behavior of a leader towards his subordinates includes indicators:

1. Exemplary
Exemplary is a trait that must be possessed
by a leader. If a leader has been able to show his example then anyone who becomes his follower will obey and there is no doubt always to obey him.

2. Discipline
The tested discipline is not just a matter of nature but is already a disciplinary behavior and this is shown directly by the leader.

3. Motivating ability
Motivating subordinates directly or indirectly, arouses the potential of the person, so that he strives to achieve personal and organizational goals effectively and efficiently.

4. Ability to communicate
In essence the leader by his role he will convey his ideas to the subordinates, to convey this must be supported by the ability to deliver effectively, concerning the ability to deliver effectively.

5. Decision Making
The ability to make quality decisions is also a manifestation of leadership behavior.

Employee performance is a work performance that is a comparison between work results that can be seen in real terms with established work standards. Apridar & Adamy, 2018; Baba Abugre, 2013; Hernaus & Mikulić, 2014; Kundu & Gahlawat, 2016 defines performance as a result achieved by employees in their work according to certain criteria that apply to a job. Employee performance is something that is achieved by employees, work performance that is considered by employees, work ability related to the use of office equipment (Arslan, 2018; Chiang, Sun, & Walkup, 2018; J., 2014; Kagaari, Mpeera Ntayi, & Munene, 2010; Oudshoorn & de Waal, 2015).

Based on employee performance indicators, namely in Law Number 43 of 1999 concerning the assessment of the implementation of civil servant work. These indicators are: a) Loyalty, which is the determination and ability to obey, implement, and practice something that is adhered to with patience and responsibility. b) Work performance, namely the work achieved by the employee in carrying out the tasks given to him. c) Responsibility, namely the ability of employees to carry out the work submitted to him as well as possible and timely, and dare to bear the risk of decisions that have been taken. d) Obedience, namely the ability of employees to comply with all applicable laws and regulations and regulations. e) Honesty, namely the sincerity of employees in carrying out and the ability not to abuse their authority. f) Collaboration, namely the ability of employees to cooperate with others in carrying out their duties. g) The initiative, namely the ability of employees to make decision steps or carry out all necessary actions in carrying out basic tasks without waiting for orders from superiors. h) Leadership, namely the ability to influence others so that they can be directed optimally to carry out tasks.

RESEARCH METHODS
Variables are the most important indicator that determines the success of the study. Based on the research topics to be discussed, the variables used in this study were motivation, leadership behavior and performance of Makassar City Industry and Trade Department employees. There are two main types of variables in this study, namely the dependent variable (dependent variable) and independent variable (independent variable). The source of this type of data can be classified into two, namely primary data and secondary data. According to Creswell & Creswell (2017) testing all instrument items in each variable can be done by looking for a distinguishing
score for each item from the group that gives high and low answers, according to the number of respondents, in this study the number of respondents was 68 people. The population in this study were all employees of the Department of Industry and Trade of Makassar city as many as 100 people. The number of samples used was 68 civil servants using saturated sampling techniques. Results of Discussion on Test Validity and Reliability of Respondents' Answers on the Office of Industry and Trade in Makassar City. The data analysis technique used is the analysis of hypothesis testing and Multiple Regression to measure the influence of independent variables on dependent variables, namely employee performance as the dependent variable (Y) and Motivation and leadership behavior as independent variables (X). from the analysis of the data used using the Statistical Product and Service Solution (SPSS) program.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION
Result
To measure the level of influence of motivation and Leadership Behavior on Employee Performance, it will be presented using hypothesis testing, validity and reliability tests. Furthermore, using multiple linear regression analysis.

Hypothesis testing
To find out the level of influence of motivation and Leadership Behavior on Employee Performance, it will test the hypothesis. The hypothesis test is carried out such as: 1) Simultaneous Test (F Test), 2) Partial Test (t Test), 3) Coefficient of Determination (R2).

a. Simultaneous Test (F Test)
The simultaneous test is presented in table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>40,248</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 Simultaneous Test Results (Test F)

Source: Results of SPSS 2016 Data

Table 1 shows the probability value (sig.) = 0.000 which indicates that the significance level is smaller than the value of F distribution with a value of 0.000 <0.05 and a calculated F value of 40,248 which indicates that the F count is greater than Ftable with F count 40,248 > Ftable 3, 14. So it can be concluded that H1 is accepted, which means that together (simultaneous) motivation and leadership behavior have a significant effect on employee performance.

b. Partial test (t test)
To test the partial can be seen in table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>T</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1,897</td>
<td>.068</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6,483</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 Partial test (t test)

Source: Results of SPSS 2016 Data

The method used to measure the influence of each independent variable partially on the dependent variable is by comparing the calculated values with t-tables. If the t-value is greater than the value of t-table with a significance of 5%, then Ho is rejected. And Ha is accepted which means that the independent variable partially has a very significant effect on the dependent variable. T test analysis can be seen from the table "Coefficient" found in table 2.
In the Coefficients column, the significance value of motivation (X1) is 0.062. At the same time shows a significance value greater than the probability value of 0.05 with a value of 0.062> 0.05 and Variable X1 has a t_count which is 1.897 with t_table = 1997, so t_count> t_table means that there is no significant effect so that it can be concluded that the Motivation variable (X1) has no significant effect on employee performance (Y) partially.

In the Coefficient column, the significance value of leadership behavior (X2) is 0.000. As well as showing a significance value smaller than the probability value of 0.05 with a value of 0.000 <0.05 and Variable X2 has a t_count of 6,483 with t_table = 1,997, so t_count> t_table means that the leadership behavior variable (X2) has a significant effect on employee performance (Y) partially.

Coefficient of Determination (R^2)
The coefficient of determination in multiple linear regression to determine the ability of independent variables to explain the variance of the dependent variable. The following are the results of the determination efficiency in table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.744</td>
<td>0.553</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of data processing, 2016

Based on table 3, the motivation variable (X1) and leadership behavior (X2) has a correlation coefficient (relationship) or R value of 0.744 or 74.4% for the performance of employees at the Office of Industry and Trade in Makassar City. This shows that the magnitude of the motivation relationship (X1) and Leadership Behavior (X2) on employee performance is 74.4% where the correlation coefficient values are in the interval of 0.60-0.799 which means it has a strong interpretation.

While for the coefficient of determination or R Square, the value is 0.553 which means the effect of motivation (X1) and leadership behavior (X2) on employee performance is 55.3%. This number is at a moderate interpretation, while 44.7% is influenced by other variables not examined.

Test Validity and Reliability
The results of the validity test on the variables of motivation, leadership behavior and employee performance are presented in table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Correlation Total Item</th>
<th>Critical Numbers</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.268</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Invalid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.414</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Invalid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.778</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.717</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.677</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.758</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.638</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.745</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of data processing, 2016.

Based on table 4, it is known that there are two statements that are not feasible to do research, so that the motivation variable on the indicator of encouragement to achieve the goal is reduced to give the appropriate and reliable measurement results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Correlation Total Item</th>
<th>Critical Numbers</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.847</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.849</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.840</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.840</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.862</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.832</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on table 5 it is known that 10 statement items obtain valid results, thus the overall statement item can be trusted and is worthy of research.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Correlation Total Item</th>
<th>Critical Numbers</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.675</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.739</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.657</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.739</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of data processing, 2016.

Based on table 6, it is known that 14 statement items obtain valid results, thus the overall statement item can be trusted and is worthy of research.

The conclusion of the validity test conducted is that each item from each questionnaire is valid/feasible to be used for testing the variables in this study.

Table 6. Test Results for Validity of Employee Performance (Y)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Correlation Total Item</th>
<th>Critical Numbers</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.831</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.808</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.678</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.697</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.746</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0.779</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.866</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.869</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.760</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>0.710</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.735</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.642</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.788</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>0.755</td>
<td>0.238</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of data processing, 2016.

Based on table 6, it is known that 14 statement items obtain valid results, thus the overall statement item can be trusted and is worthy of research.

The conclusion of the validity test conducted is that each item from each questionnaire is valid/feasible to be used for testing the variables in this study.

Linear Regression Analysis
This analysis is to determine the relationship between independent variables (motivation and leadership behavior) with the dependent variable (Employee Performance). For more details, it is presented in table 8.

Table 8 Results of Multiple Linear Regression Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients (B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>14,593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X1</td>
<td>0.473</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X2</td>
<td>0.709</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Results of data processing, 2016.

Based on table 10.5, a regression formula can be obtained as follows:

\[ Y = 14,593 + 0.473 \times X1 + 0.709 \times X2 \]

Regression analysis in table 11.5 can be explained that constant value of 14,593 means that the value of employee performance before being influenced by Motivation factors and leadership behavior is positive or if Motivation and leadership
behavior does not exist or equal to zero, employee performance is 14,593 units. Each increase in one unit of motivation will increase employee performance by 0.473 units and each increase in one unit of leadership behavior will increase employee performance by 0.709 units.

Discussion

Motivation in this study contributes positively to improving employee performance but motivation does not have a significant effect on employee performance, because employees work only aborting their obligations. Because it can be a factor in giving inappropriate work. The employee has not mastered the work assigned to him but the employee does it because it is their responsibility. Thus employees expect to get more salaries, facilities that need to be increased by additional work facilities and get training by their fields so that employees can be enthusiastic about the work assigned to them.

Even though the facilities are quite good, but the employee does not feel comfortable with the facility, the salary received by the employee is still not sufficient for the employee's needs, even though the salary received is by the rules. The results of interviews with one respondent thought that motivation was not significant because the employee had not been grateful for what was given, the office facilities provided were quite good, the salary they received was in accordance with the rules, but talked about needs and satisfaction that could only be felt by himself, everyone definitely wants more satisfaction, so back to each employee again to be grateful for what has been given.

In contrast to previous research according to Asia (2016) stated motivation has a significant effect on employee performance, thus the hypothesis is not accepted. This is because employees with employees are different due to different environmental and cultural factors between civil servants and employees, where civil servants the salary they receive every month remains smooth even though we do not know whether the performance is good or not, different from employees because the salary they receive is in accordance with their performance did.

Leadership behavior in this study gave a positive contribution and had a significant effect on employee performance at the Makassar Office of Industry and Trade Office, due to the attitudes and behavior displayed by the leadership both from exemplary, disciplined, motivating abilities, communication skills, decision making, get recognition from subordinates so that leadership behavioral variables have a significant positive effect.

In accordance with some of the opinions of argues that leadership behavior is a specific action of the leader in directing, coordinating and motivating employees to achieve the stated goals (Crotts, Azziz, & Kent, 2013; Duxbury & Gover, 2013; Gregory, Nathan Moates, & Gregory, 2013; Khalili, 2013; Rose, 2013). The results of the Asiah study stated in his thesis that leadership behavior had a significant positive effect, thus the hypothesis was accepted.

Based on the simultaneous test results, namely the motivation variable and leadership behavior towards employee performance has a significant positive effect on employee performance, because motivation and leadership behavior together have a very strong influence on employee performance, this is due to motivation to make employees eager to work while behavior leadership provides motivation to subordinates and coordinates subordinates in carrying out their duties and
responsibilities aimed at improving agency performance. Thus the hypothesis is accepted.
The results of the coefficient determination indicate that the relationship between motivation and Leadership Behavior towards employee performance has a strong interpretation. While for the coefficient of determination or R Square shows the value of the interpretation of the moderate influence. On employee performance because there are other factors that have a strong influence but are not examined in this study.

CONCLUSION
Motivation has no significant effect on employee performance at the Office of Industry and Trade of Makassar City due to the application of motivation and stimulus that employees feel is still not fulfilled. Leadership behavior has a significant influence on employee performance at the Office of Industry and Trade of Makassar City. Due to the attitudes and behavior displayed by the leadership both from exemplary, discipline, motivating ability, communication skills, decision making, received recognition from subordinates. Simultaneously motivation and leadership behavior have a significant positive effect on the performance of employees of the Office of Industry and Trade of Makassar City. Because motivation and leadership behavior has a strong relationship to employee performance, this is due to motivation to make employees eager to work while leadership behavior motivates subordinates and coordinates subordinates in carrying out their duties and responsibilities.
The results of the coefficient determination indicate that the relationship between motivation and Leadership Behavior towards employee performance has a strong interpretation. While the coefficient of determination or R Square shows the value of the interpretation of moderate influence. On employee performance because there are other factors that have a strong influence but are not examined in this study.

Employees of the Makassar City Industry and Trade Office perceive motivation and leadership behavior in general as good but need to be improved. Then the things that need to be suggested relating to this research are:

It is expected that the application of motivation to employees will be improved so that harmonious relationships are established and employees are encouraged to achieve goals that are expected to work in harmony and work more effectively.

To improve the performance of employees of the Office of Industry and Trade in the City of Makassar, it is also necessary to increase the frequency of continuous application of good motivation, because effective motivation cannot be built once and then ignored at other times, but must be continually improved.

The leadership should be more open and try to establish familiarity with the employees of the Makassar City Industry and Trade Office, to facilitate the process of achieving agency goals and implementing more effective leadership.

Leaders should also carry out their leadership by collaborating task-oriented leadership behaviors and relationship-oriented or attention-oriented leadership behaviors, so employees will work better to improve their performance.

REFERENCE


DEMOCRATIZATION AND PERFORMANCE OF GENERAL ELECTION COMMISSION ON IMPLEMENTATION OF SIMULTANEOUSLY PROVINCE REGIONAL ELECTION

Risma Niswaty ¹, Andi Cudai Nur ², Delly Mustafa ³, Irsyad Dhahri ⁴

Faculty of Social Science
Universitas Negeri Makassar ¹, ², ⁴
Universitas Pejuang Republik Indonesia ³

risma.niswaty@unm.ac.id
cudainur@gmail.com
delly.mustafa0906@gmail.com
cha4400@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

The General Election Commission (KPU) has finished carrying out regional head elections in 17 provinces in 2018. The implementation of this regional head election is the first history of the simultaneous implementation of governor elections. KPU's performance was highlighted in this simultaneous regional head election. The number of voters in the 2018 Governor and Deputy Governor Election amounted to 143,667,935. Community participation in the 2018 Concurrent Local Election is in the range of 72%. KPU has targeted community participation of 77 percent. Of the 17 provinces that held gubernatorial elections, only Papua province exceeded the voter participation target. While the disability voter participation is on average 49 percent with the highest disability voter level in Maluku at 96 percent and the lowest in Central Java 32 percent. Furthermore, the findings related to ballots are invalid. Invalid ballots in the election of governors and deputy governors were 3,098,239, equivalent to 3 percent of all election logistics used. The most invalid ballots are found in Central Java Province, namely 778,805 ballots, East Kalimantan as many as 50,110 ballots, and East Java with 782,027 ballots. The research conducted found results that there were alleged violations that occurred in the 2018 simultaneous regional election. It was suspected that there were 1,095 violation reports and 2,038 violation findings. The number of violations in the Regional Head Election this time is greater than the previous election. This is due to the fact that the number of regions holding this year's Election is bigger than the 2017 election, which is 101 regions. The details of these violations were 291 criminal violations, 853 administrative violations, 114 violations of the code of ethics, 712 violations of other laws, and 619 categories not violations or not proven. Regarding voter voting rights, the high number of Transfer Voters List (DPPH) and Additional Voters List (DPTb). Of the total 143,667,935 people who voted in the simultaneous regional elections in 2018, there were 173,553 voters from DPPH and 2,032,556 voters from DPTb. To note, the number of DPTb is the basis for evaluating the process of updating voter data throughout the election stages. So that the performance of KPU voters' data collection is in the quite effective category.

Key Words: simultaneous regional head elections, the performance of election organizers
INTRODUCTION

Indonesia entered a period of democratic transition, so that in some aspects of the life of the Indonesian people there were still some problems that were found. The process of democratic transition or democratization process in Indonesia began when the transfer of power from President Soeharto to Vice President BJ Habibie on May 21, 1998. This became a marker of the transition period because it was at this phase that Indonesia experienced a transition from an authoritarian political system to democracy, transitioning from military supremacy to civilian supremacy, the transition from centralization to decentralization, and so on. Indonesia has moved away from the dictatorial system and is heading towards change as a democratic country. After the fall of Soeharto and the New Order, the perspective of the transition to democracy dominated the debate over the interpretation of political change in Indonesia. This perspective illustrates the process of Soeharto’s fall in the framework of democratization which involves pulling forces among elites who determine the nature of political change (Hyde, 2010), (Geddes, 2009), (Tilly, 2003).

The description of the rise of democracy and democratization in Indonesia, is seen in the opening of amazing political space, the emergence of a new generation of civil society, the liberation of media space, and also the positive spirit of demanding greater government accountability (Geddes, 2009), (Schedler, 2007), (Liddle, 2000). One of the political spaces that are open to the application of the principles of democratization is in general elections, both presidential elections and regional elections at the level of governor elections and the election of regents / mayors.

In the history of electoral affairs in Indonesia, 2018 became the first history of regional elections (pilkada) to be held simultaneously. It was recorded on June 27, 2018, there were 171 regions implementing the elections, which consisted of 17 provinces for the election of governors/deputy governors, 39 elections for mayors/deputy mayors, and 115 elections for regents/vice regents (Prasetyoningsih, 2014).

South Sulawesi as one of the provinces in Indonesia, is a province which in the election event, especially regional elections, has always been seen as an Indonesian political laboratory due to political dynamics and the dynamics of local democracy in South Sulawesi which is very dynamic.

New developments in the post-1999 election period showed a number of changes, both those that moved towards positive and negative. With the implementation of these relatively honest and fair elections, the political positions chosen must be contested by political parties. This condition ultimately led to the formation of party government which at the same time was a new era for the bureaucracy and also the wider community, including local government (Dryzek, 2009), (Munck, 2016), (Ansell & Samuels, 2015).

Talking about the concept of democratization, there are three prerequisites for fulfilling effective and democratic electoral criteria, namely independence, impartiality and professionalism (Sossin, 2008), (Desai, 2009), and (Wright, 2016). Since the regional head elections held in 2005 by the Regency/City General Election Commission, the simultaneous regional elections in 2018 are the fourth time regional elections held by these commissioners. However, there are still operational reports that do not show the independence, impartiality and professionalism of the organizers. So it is interesting to review the performance of the General Election Commission, especially in South Sulawesi related to the implementation of simultaneous regional elections.

The key concept to building a democracy of integrity is the holding of regional elections with integrity, not formal and procedural elections. To develop regional head elections with integrity requires shared awareness supported by a system of rules and
supporting infrastructure that can force the application of the principle of elections with integrity in practice (Olken, 2010), (Arrsa, 2014). All parties must jointly build integrity which will ultimately give birth to the integrity of the nation. In the implementation of elections, there are 4 parties involved, namely (i) election organizers, (ii) election participants, (iii) candidates, and (iv) voters as owners of popular sovereignty. Ideally, these four parties must have integrity.

The tendency of the community to appreciate the implementation of the elections shows that voter participation is declining. In various studies, news and reporting, facts were found regarding people's enthusiasm for the process and results of the election that tended to decreases. The fact that the decline in public participation shows the existence of problems in the implementation of regional elections.

There are at least 4 (four) causes of the decline in community participation in regional elections. First, the community consciously does not want to exercise their voting rights because it is based on apathy. For them, using or not using voting rights in the Pilkada means the same: it does not have a significant influence on daily life. Second, the chaotic and inaccurate Final Voters List (DPT) contributes greatly to weakening the enthusiasm of the people who originally intended to participate. Third, voters tend to prioritize their individual needs, such as working, farming, migrating or going to school rather than attending polling stations to exercise their right to vote. Fourth, participation in regional elections is driven by the spirit of community pragmatism. If there are candidates who provide benefits they want to participate, if not then there is no need to participate (Nazriyah, 2016).

Reviewing the performance of the organizers of the elections, it is related to the issue of resource capabilities, then provides an explanation that basically performance is determined by the following aspects:

1. Personnal Factor. That is indicated by the level of skill, competence, motivation and individual commitment.
2. Leadership factor. That performance is also determined by the quality of encouragement, guidance and support that managers and team leaders do.
3. Team factor. That is the quality of support provided by colleagues in the work team.
4. System factor. That is concerning the quality of the work system and facilities provided by the organization.
5. Contextual or Situational factors. That is related to the problem of high and low levels of pressure and changes in the internal and external environment.

Basically performance measurement is used to assess the success or failure of the policies or programs implemented. Performance is a broad concept that is in the inside has diverse meanings, for different audiences, and different contexts. The public sector performance measurement system is a system that aims to help public managers assess the achievement of a strategy through financial and nonfinancial measurement tools (Clark, 2003), (Cascio, 2008), (Waldman, 2011).

The performance measurement system can be used as an organizational control tool, because performance measurement is strengthened by establishing reward and punishment systems (Bedarkar & Pandita, 2014), (Niswaty, Mano, & Akib, 2015). Performance measurement of public sector organizations is carried out to fulfill three purposes. First, to help improve government performance, performance measures are intended to help the government focus on the goals and objectives of the work unit program. This is expected to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of public sector organizations in providing services to the public. Second, to allocate resources and make decisions. Third, to realize public accountability and improve
institutional communication (Ahdiyana, 2015). The function of measuring the performance of public sector organizations is as follows:

1. Transparency: organizations can make clear what products they offer, how to analyze their input-outputs, including their costs
2. Learning: the organization becomes a step ahead if it uses performance measurement to learn, transparency that is created teaches the organization what goodness is owned and where its development is possible.
3. Appraising: performance based assessment can be said as the functioning of the organization
4. Sanctioning: assessment can be followed by positive sanctions if it turns out good performance, and negative sanctions if the performance is poor (de Bruijn, 2002).

Performance appraisal is done to emphasize undesirable behavior, through feedback on performance results also awards both intrinsic and extrinsic. So that it can was concluded that the main purpose of performance assessment was to motivate employees to achieve organizational goals and to adhere to predetermined standards of behavior, so as to produce desired actions and results. Ivanovich and Gomes in Narimawati said that there are eight dimensions or criteria that need attention in assessing or measuring performance based on specific behavioral descriptions, namely:

- Quantity of work, the amount of work done in a specified time period. It is the quality of work achieved based on the conditions of conformity and readiness. Job knowledge is the breadth of knowledge about work and skills. Creativness is the authenticity of ideas raised and actions to solve problems that arise. Cooperation, the willingness to cooperate with other people. Dependability is awareness and can be trusted in terms of attendance and completion of work. Initiative is the enthusiasm for carrying out new tasks and in enlarging their responsibilities. Personal qualities concern of personality, leadership, hospitality, and personal integration (Umi Narimawati, 2007).

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study uses an evaluative survey approach (Fink, 2010), (Chaddad, 2006), (Lowell Bishop & Verleger, 2013), (Lu & Weng, 2007), to analyze and explain various aspects of democratization and the performance of electoral commissions in implementing simultaneous regional elections in South Sulawesi. Through this approach: (1) exploration of concepts, theories, research results, and relevant and up-to-date data; (2) trace and inventory various issues and performance contract documents, (3) deepen cases, at the election stage; (4) a retrospective analysis of the determinants of independent, impartial and professional elections in South Sulawesi.

The technique of collecting data using a questionnaire (complete survey) as the main technique, supported by focus group techniques, observation techniques, and documentation techniques.

The survey was conducted on 30 respondents (each of 10 regional election organizers from 3 districts/cities). Group discussions were conducted together with KPU, Bawaslu, PPK, and PPS members in each district. Documentation data about the stages of local election reports, especially in 3 municipal districts.

The results of data analysis of this study were carried out using descriptive qualitative-quantitative analysis techniques and shift-share analysis (Cheng, 1995), (Artige & van Neuss, 2014), (Barff & III, 1988). Descriptive analysis is carried out with a comprehensive description of qualitative-quantitative data obtained through field data searches, surveys, and documentation. The results of this analysis are very valuable inputs for the organizers of regional head elections in describing the implementation of their duties at each stage of work and the achievement of their employment contracts. Next, shift-share
analysis is carried out. The approach used to conduct comparative analysis is to look at the implementation of regional elections in other provinces.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The implementation of simultaneous regional elections in 2018 shows that the performance of the South Sulawesi election commission is in the sufficiently performing category, even though from the results of institutional performance reports through Government Institution Performance Accountability Reports (LAKIP), it is in the CC category (quite good). The highest value of LAKIP evaluation is AA (satisfying), with a score of 85 - 100, while A (very good) the score is 75 - 85, CC (quite good) with a score of 50 - 65, C (somewhat less) with a score of 30-50, and the value of D (less) with a score of 0 - 30. Even harder efforts must be made by the General Election Commission to improve the quality of its financial statements. This is because from 2010 to 2016 the KPU still received a Fair With Exception (WDP) opinion (Ichsan, Hasanuddin, & Rahim, 2017), (Ansori, 2018).

In the assessment of LAKIP, the material evaluated includes 5 components. The first component is performance planning, consisting of strategic plans, annual performance plans, and performance determination with a weight of 35. The second component, namely performance measurement, which includes the fulfillment of measurements, quality of measurement, and implementation of measurements with a weight of 20. Performance reporting which is the third component, consists of fulfilling reports, presenting performance information, and utilizing performance information, given weighting 15. While performance evaluation consisting of fulfillment of evaluation, quality of evaluation, and utilization of evaluation results, is given weight 10. For performance achievement, the weight is 20, consisting of reported performance (output and outcome), and other performance. With the performance appraisal by the Ministry of Administrative Reform, the KPU institution began to develop strategic plans and work plans based on key performance indicators (KPIs) (Peterson, 2006), (Parmenter, 2010).

The 2015-2019 KPU Strategic Plan has been determined and set forth in the KPU Decree Number 63/Kpts/KPU/2015 which was then amended by KPU Decree Number 90/Kpts/ KPU/2016. However, the KPU Strategic Plan for the 2015-2019 period was deemed it is necessary to make improvements, adjustments, and improvements as a result of the enactment of Law Number 7 of 2017, the simultaneous Election of 2019, plans for changes in the KPU’s institutional structure, and changes in leadership within the KPU. KPU is a state institution that is constitutional importance and has national, permanent and independent institutions in holding direct, general, free, confidential, honest and fair elections. The strategic role is reflected in the description of duties, authority, and obligations carried out by the KPU (Nur‘aini, 2016), (Ansori, 2018), and (Ichsan et al., 2017).

Table 1. Percentage of Voter Participation in Election of the Governor of South Sulawesi and Deputy Governor of 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Regency / City</th>
<th>Number (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>BANTAENG</td>
<td>76.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>BARRU</td>
<td>69.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>BONE</td>
<td>71.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>BULUKUMBA</td>
<td>60.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>ENREKANG</td>
<td>76.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>GOWA</td>
<td>74.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>JENEPONTO</td>
<td>79.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>SELAYAR</td>
<td>77.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>LUWU</td>
<td>77.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>LUWU TIMUR</td>
<td>64.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>LUWU UTARA</td>
<td>67.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>MAROS</td>
<td>70.17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The total percentage of voter participation is far from the initial target of the South Sulawesi Election Commission, which is 78 percent participation rate. Nevertheless, voter participation in 2018 increased compared to voter participation in the 2013 South Sulawesi regional election which was only at 69 percent of community participation. Based on the findings regarding the performance of the South Sulawesi KPU, it appears in table 2.

Table 2. Percentage of Performance Achievement of South Sulawesi KPU in 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Performance (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Goal 1. Increased implementation of democratic General Elections</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of increasing voter participation and quality in elections</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of voter participation in General Election</td>
<td>77.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of female voter participation in General Election</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Objectives 2. Implementation of Safe, Peaceful, Honest, and Fair General Elections</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of Regency / City General Election Commissions that carry out General Elections without conflict</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of General Election Organizers who are proven to have committed electoral violations</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of legal disputes won by the KPU</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Objective 1. Increased Implementation of Democratic Elections

The success of the first performance target is measured based on the level of honesty, dignity and fairness. To measure the performance of the South Sulawesi Election Commission regarding this first target, there are 5 performance indicators that must be observed, namely: 1) Percentage of increasing voter participation and quality in elections; 2) Percentage of voter participation in General Election; 3) Percentage of female voter participation in General Elections; 4) Percentage of disability voter participation in General Election; and 5) Percentage of voters entitled to vote but not on the voter list.

In the 2018 South Sulawesi election,
there were 4 candidate pairs, namely: Nurdin Halid-Abd Aziz Qahhar Mudzakkar (number 1); Agus Arifin Nu'mang-Tanribali Lamo (Number 2); Nurdin Abdullah-Andi Sudirman Sulaiman (Number 3); and Ichsan Yasin Limpo-Andi Mudzakkar (Number 4). From the Bawaslu report, it was found that the South Sulawesi regional election was ranked the highest for 2018 regional election complaints reports, as many as 506 cases with classification:

![Complaint Report to Bawaslu](image)

The details based on the type of violation are illustrated in the following diagram:

![Types of Election Violations](image)

South Sulawesi, which is often the national spotlight in the implementation of elections and regional elections, turned out to end without any lawsuits in court or election disputes to the Constitutional Court.

The performance target related to voter participation was 8 points from the initial target of the South Sulawesi Election Commission, more due to the low participation in some regions which also carried out the election of regents/deputy regents and mayors/deputy mayors. One of them happened in Makassar. Makassar City has the lowest public participation in the gubernatorial election. This is due to the interest of the Makassar community who did not come to the polling station. In Makassar when that happened the pair Munafri Arifuddin - Andi Rachmatika Dewi (Appi-Cicu) faced with an empty box. This is the first time the empty box won in the history of regional head elections in Indonesia.

In addition, data from Gowa district was also obtained about the non-invitation of the voter (C6), so many voters did not know the location of the polling place. Women's voter participation was achieved at 73.28 percent or only reached 75% of the performance target. Disability voters who use their voting rights are also only 75% of the target.

Female voters and disability experienced obstacles due to: natural factors (rain and even flooding in several polling locations), female voters who worked as shopkeepers (sales clerks) in several shops in Makassar and did not get permission to go home, female students who only holidays on voting day only, and some voters who stated they did not want to use their voting rights.

Participation of voters who are entitled to vote but not listed on the final voter list is 0.60%, higher than the target of 0.20%. This is caused by several factors, which are:

- delay in recording e-KTP (electronic identity card) voters
- some voters who have just entered the age of 17 a week up to 1 day before the elections, so it is not possible to be included in the special voter list
- Members of the Army/Police who enter retirement periods for a week up to 1 day before the election, so that it is not possible to be included in the special voter list;
- Civil society who are members of the Army/Police and lose their right to vote; and
Voters who moved to domicile or moved to polling stations because they continued their education, assignments/services, but did not take care of the information moved to vote.

Objectives 2. Implementation of Safe, Peaceful, Honest, and Fair General Elections / Elections

The essence of this second target is the achievement of all stages of the 2018 governor and deputy governor election which take place safely, honestly, fairly and with dignity for all participants, organizers and the community at large, well organized and in accordance with the stages, programs and schedules has been established.

The success of the second performance target is measured based on the level of honesty, dignity and fairness. To measure the performance of the South Sulawesi Election Commission regarding this first target, there are 3 performance indicators that must be observed, namely: 1) Percentage of Regency/City General Election Commissions that carry out General Elections without conflict; 2) Percentage of General Election Organizers who are proven to have committed electoral violations; and 3) Percentage of legal disputes won by the KPU.

There are several stages that are considered crucial and potentially reported problematic to Bawaslu, namely: the stages of the campaign; logistics distribution stages; establishment of an adhoc committee; voting; and vote count.

The study of the performance of the South Sulawesi Election Commission in the implementation of the 2018 governor’s election found:

1) Percentage of Regency / City General Election Commissions that carry out General Elections without conflict.

2) Some performance indicators that show the implementation of regional elections without conflict can be traced to crucial stages in the South Sulawesi pilgub, namely:

**Campaign Stage**

Implementation of the Campaign Stages carried out by the candidate pairs is held safely. However, there is a lawsuit from serial number 4 Ichsan Yasin Limpo-Andi Mudzakkar about the determination of the schedule and location of the grand campaign in the city of Makassar. KPU Sulsel only set a schedule grand campaign for 3 other candidate pairs. This lawsuit was reported to the South Sulawesi Bawaslu and it overturning the decision of the South Sulawesi Election Commission and ordering the respondent or South Sulawesi Election Commission to issue a Decree that stipulates the schedule and place of campaign for General Meetings in each pair of 2018 Governor and Deputy Governor of South Sulawesi based on legislation valid no later than one day before the second round General Meeting campaign. Regarding the campaign also, several state civil servants (ASN) were reported to the South Sulawesi Bawaslu and the ASN Commission for violating its neutrality as an ASN by campaigning for certain candidate pairs. Reports from this campaign stage were also found related to black campaigns against certain candidate pairs (Rasaili, 2016) and (David Dodu, 2017). The practice of violations that also occur and recur in the 2018 South Sulawesi is an alleged intervention by the regent/mayor utilizing a government structure for certain candidates. One indicated is the regent of Gowa, Adnan Purichta Ichsan, who is the son of candidate number 4 governor, Ichsan Yasin Limpo. The same thing was reported to candidate number 3 governor, Nurdin Abdullah, who was a former regent of Bantaeng 2 periods.

**Stage of Logistics Distribution**

The stages of management and distribution of logistical requirements for voting and counting on 27 June 2018 in South Sulawesi can be
completed from the management, distribution and return to the KPU Warehouse well. Anticipation is carried out by South Sulawesi KPU by first sending logistics to the islands and the outermost and farthest polling stations.

**Formation of Adhoc Committee**
At the level of the Adhoc Committee (PPK, PPS, and KPPS) and the Regency KPU there was no violation of the code of ethics, this was evidenced by the absence of the Panwaslu report or from the Community Leaders. The case of sticking ethics was not related to the implementation of gubernatorial elections, but in elections mayors/ regents at the city/regency level, among others, occurred in Palopo City Election Commission and Makassar City Election Commission.

**Voting Stage**
In the Stages of Collection, both pre and at the time of voting on 27 June 2018 all took place safely and conducively both at the TPS, PPS and PPK levels, at the Regency KPU level, as well as at the provincial KPU. This stage is well implemented, all thanks to the support of various stakeholders, the community and adhoc organizers and the election participants and campaign teams of each candidate pair.

As for the alleged violations at the voting stage, namely the South Sulawesi C1 Pilgub form sheet that was filled out before the voting day. It was found in Parang Layang Village, Bontoala District, Makassar City, Monday (6/25/2018) night. The form sheet was found in 9 polling stations in Bontoala District. The sheet has been signed by members of the Voting Organizing Group (KPPS) but the name is not included in the letter C1.

The Election Supervisory Board (Bawaslu) recommends re-voting (PSU) at 4 polling stations in 3 regencies in South Sulawesi. The four polling stations were 1 polling station in Barru Regency, 1 in Gowa district, and 2 polling stations in Pinrang. For PSU in Barru it was recommended because there were 2 voters who chose 2 times and 1 representing their mothers who were sick again. The PSU in Gowa was carried out because there were residents who chose to use a family card (KK), even though what was required was a Certificate from the Population and Civil Registry Service and/or an electronic resident card. For the PSU in Pinrang district, TPS 4 in Binanga Karaeng Village, Lembang Subdistrict because the KPPS Chairperson opened the ballot box the night before the voting and signed 400 pieces of ballots of 200 for each regent and 200 for the governor. Whereas TPS 1 Pekabata, Duampanua Subdistrict, there were 18 ballots that were not signed and used by voters to cast their ballots.

**Stage of Vote Counting**
At the stage of the 2018 South Sulawesi Pilgub vote counting there were also no violations that hampered the performance of the South Sulawesi Election Commission. The vote results of the candidate pairs are shown in the following diagram:

The percentage of South Sulawesi Pilgub votes namely NA-ASS is 43.87%; NH-Aziz at 27.32%; IYL-Cakka is 18.97%; and Agus-Tanri at 9.85%.

2) Percentage of General Election Organizers who are proven to have committed electoral violations;

Regarding the Election Code of Ethics, the term "Code of Ethics", defined as a unitary foundation of moral, ethical and philosophical norms that serves as a guideline for the conduct of obligatory, prohibited, appropriate or inappropriate conduct of general elections in all actions and sayings. The purpose of this code of ethics is to maintain the independence, integrity and credibility of Election Organizers, which are in accordance with the principles of

Election Implementation, namely: (1) independent; (2) honest; (3) fair; (4) legal
For handling violations of the ethics code of election administrators, Election Organizers Honor Council (DKPP) has been formed which has the authority to examine the implementation of the code of ethics in the implementation of general elections and regional head elections.

Given the large number of complaints compared to the total number of DKPP members who were only 7 people, it was impossible for DKPP to examine all cases that were reported optimally, and therefore in 2014 the DKPP-RI established a Regional Examination Team (TPD) to examine alleged violations. Election Code of Ethics conducted by Election Organizers at the district / city level.

American Speech Language Hearing Association (ASHA) as quoted by Jimly Asshiddiqie, that in the system of ethical sanctions, the forms of sanctions that can be applied are:
1. Reprimand or reprimand;
2. Cencure or statement of no confidence that is stated openly and published in the media association to be known by fellow members and the wider community;
3. Revocation or revocation of membership status for a certain time, namely for 5 (five) years or can also be dropped for a lifetime (until death);
4. Suspension or suspension of membership temporarily;
5. Withholding or suspension of suspension of membership registration process; and
6. Cease and desist orders or in addition to other forms of sanctions.

With regard to the form of sanctions mentioned above, the function of ethical sanctions is more preventive, as well as enforcement. Ethical sanctions are usually determined in the form of reprimand or multilevel warnings, ranging from verbal reprimand, written reprimand or mild reprimand and strong rebuke (Chakim, 2014).

No data was found regarding the organizers of the election in South Sulawesi in 2018 which were suspected of violating the code of ethics. There are 2 commissioners in the city of Makassar and Palopo who have experienced an honor council hearing, but the trial of both is not related to the implementation of gubernatorial elections, but on the implementation of the mayor/deputy mayor election which coincides with the pilgub schedule.

At the Adhoc committee level, both at the sub-district level (PPK), village / kelurahan (PPS), as well as at the TPS (KPPS) also showed good performance.

3) Percentage of legal disputes won by the KPU

Changes in other electoral systems after the constitutional changes are given the authority of the judicial authority implementing agencies to settle disputes over the results of general elections, both legislative and executive elections. The authority to settle the General Election Results Dispute (PHPU) of DPR members, DPD members, and DPRD members, as well as the president and vice president is given to the Constitutional Court (MK). While the regional head elections, which were originally based on Law 32 of 2004, constituted the authority of the Supreme Court to dispute the election of the Governor and Deputy Governor and the authority of the High Court for the election of Regents / Mayors transferred to the Constitutional Court since November 1, 2008 (Zoelva, 2013).

The Constitutional Court, since 2004,
has tried disputes over the election results of members of the DPR, DPD and Provincial DPRD as well as the Regency/City DPRD throughout Indonesia, as well as the election of the President and Vice President. This experience later became a valuable provision for the Constitutional Court in handling the case of the Regional Head PHPU. In handling election results, both legislative elections (DPR, DPD, and DPRD. President and Deputy Resident) since 2004 and also post-conflict local elections since 2008, all applicants for election results disputes always blame not only the election vote count determined by the election organizers, but also various violations in the process and in all stages of the election. As a result, the number of disputed election results that entered and were handled by the Court or to the Constitutional Court.

CONCLUSION

South Sulawesi regional head elections (Pilgub) held by the South Sulawesi Election Commission have been carried out quite in accordance with predetermined performance indicators. Even though it has structured performance indicators, the Constitutional Court was very large with a grace period very short (30 days for legislative elections and 14 days for presidential elections and post-conflict local elections).

Furthermore, in the case of violations of the General Election of Regional Heads, in the regional government law the type of violation is classified into administrative violations and criminal violations. Administrative violations, namely violations of election laws which are not criminal provisions of elections and violations of other provisions stipulated in the General Election Commission regulations (Iza Rumesten RS, 2014).

In the election of the governor of South Sulawesi in 2018, there were no reported cases of electoral disputes, either to the District Court or to the Constitutional Court.

starting from the KPU level to the Regency/city KPU, the compiled indicators are still very technical in nature. The KPU should adopt several principles of democratization in the implementation of more independent, impartial and professional regional and regional elections.

Reference


Prasetyoningsih, N. (2014). Dampak Pemilihan


Policy Economic Analysis of HIV/AIDS Intervention in Indonesian Local Government

Rijal Ramdani & Eko Priyo Purnomo

rijalramdani@umy.ac.id & eko@umy.ac.id

Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Jusuf Kalla School of Government Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

Abstract

Global governance concerns the issue of HIV/AIDS through Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and followed by Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). In the Indonesian context, the number of people living with HIV/AIDS has been increasing in the last ten years. This paper studies the HIV/AIDS policy intervention in an Indonesian local government context by using policy economic analysis. The finding demonstrates that the policy intervention has been applied through a supply approach such as in welfare states in which the local government provides free access to health facilities for HIV/AIDS-positive persons. This approach differs from the macro policy level of the Indonesian central government who adopts free-market orientation and demand intervention of health economics. The research focuses on a Yogyakarta Special Province case study while the data depend on analysing and interpreting regional and national regulation of HIV/AIDS and policy recommendations of the regional public health department. We argue that the improvement of local intervention emerges as the supply is just for the HIV/AIDS diagnosis test and it does not cover the continued HIV/AIDS health treatments and nursing.

Keyword: Policy Economic Analysis, HIV/AIDS, Local Government, and Indonesia

Introduction

HIV/AIDS is one of the deadly diseases in which global governance has paid attention through Millenium Development Goals (MDGs) and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) intervention. Six goals of SD are related to this issue including; (1) End poverty in all forms everywhere; (2) End hunger, achieve food security and improved nutrition; (3) Ensure healthy lives and promote well-being for all at all ages; (5) Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls; (9) Build resilient infrastructure, and (17) Strengthen the means of implementation (Unaids, 2015). According to the World Health Organization (WHO), HIV is a virus “infecting cells of the immune system, destroying or impairing their function. Infection with the virus results in progressive deterioration of the immune system, leading to immune deficiency” while AIDS is “a term which applies to the most advanced stages of HIV infection” (WHO, 2017). Currently, the virus has infected 36.7 million people on this
In the Indonesian context, the number of HIV/AIDS-positive persons has been impressively increasing in the last ten years. For example, in 2007 between 4,000 and 6,000 people lived with HIV, yet in 2017 the number was more than 48,000 inhabitants and almost 10,000 infected-AIDS people were identified. In Yogyakarta special province alone, where the research focuses on, the trend has a similar figure. In 2015, for instance, more than 900 HIV-positive persons existed, and 952 others had lived with AIDS. The highest rate of them came for the Yogyakarta municipality followed by the regency of Sleman, Bantul, Gunungkidul, and Kulonprogo, respectively. This figure is in a high-risk condition on how the Yogyakarta special province to deal with delivering health facilities to the infected-HIV/AIDS people not only to answer the demand of global development trend but also to response the need of citizens.

Source: department of health, Yogyakarta special province
Some scholarly works have been concerning the HIV/AIDS issue in Indonesia. Mesquita et al. (2007) found that Indonesian central government and civil society organizations have a positive commitment to response the HIV/AIDS epidemic event local governments have less concern on allocating the budget to follow up the national concern (Mesquita et al., 2007). Ibahim et al. (2009) focused on the policy intervention on how the Indonesian government prevents the spread out of HIV/AIDS diseases. He emphasised that the decentralization of healthcare policy and the development of health workers are such critical intervention on this issue (Ibrahim et al., 2010). Other scholars concern on the negative stigmatization to the people living with HIV/ADIS, which can obstruct the government` policies for HIV/AIDS diagnoses and health treatments (Waluyo et al., 2015). Trompt et al. (2015) argued that the engagement of people living with HIV/AIDS in local government programmes should be encouraged to meet with the transparency and accountability (Tromp et al., 2014).

It is apparent, however, on how to portray the policy economic analysis of HIV/AIDS in the local context whether the local government follows market mechanism or supply intervention. This paper focuses on Yogyakarta special province as a case study. We use a simple analytical method of demand, supply and inelasticity of health economics. Our finding demonstrates that the local policy intervention has followed a supply approach in which the local government provides free access to health facilities for HIV/AIDS-positive persons. It differs from the Indonesian central government who adopts free-market orientation based on the demand of health economic inelasticity. Although both levels of government interventions seem contradicted, in a neoliberal political decentralization system, a local autonomous government could stand independently to introduce a specific health intervention if they are able to cover the economic cost. To follow the discussion, the paper is divided into several sections such as a conceptual framework of policy economic analysis, research method, result and discussion, and conclusion.

Analytical framework
Negative externalities of HIV/AIDS market failure
The HIV/AIDS infection is a form of negative externalities in a market mechanism. The negative externality occurs when society suffers from the failure of an economic transaction (Economicsonline, 2019). In the market mechanism, the producer and consumer are categorized as the first and second party while society whom could be direct and indirectly affected by the market failure is recognized as the third party (Economicsonline, 2019). From policy economic perspective, costs of the transaction are classified into two categories namely individual cost and social cost (Sukirno, 2005). Individual cost is a fee that should be paid by the customer while the social cost is a fee that should be fulfilled by society as a consequent of the individual transaction.

According to Gaffeo (2003), the global transmission of the HIV/AIDS epidemic is varying from one to other regions. For example, unsafe blood donations, needle sharing of injecting drug users, and homosexual relationship are the primary medium of
HIV/AIDS transmission in the global north while the heterosexual is the most frequent in the global south (Gaffeo, 2003). This illustrates that although the epidemic transmission of HIV/AIDS depends on the first- and second-party economic activities, society could also be affected from this negative externality on account of fact that the HIV/AIDS can infect any individual. It is a government responsible, therefore, to intervene this market failure.

To deal with the negative externality of the market failure, the government could adopt some approaches (Ramdani, 2013; Ramdani et al., 2018). The first is a universal model in which the government will cover all health facilities for citizens to prevent the negative externality (Suharto, 2006). The second is a liberal model occurring when government leave the negative externalities in the market mechanism (Suharto, 2006). It means that all citizens need to take healthcare by his or her selves including people living with HIV/AIDS. The last but not the least is a residual model when the authority provides HIV/AIDS health facilities only for the basic treatment (Suharto, 2006; Eikemo et al., 2008). Whether the Yogyakarta special province adopts universal, liberal, or residual model we will analyse it through the curve of demand, supply and inelasticity of the microeconomics.

**Demand, supply and inelasticity of health economics**

The demand theory focuses on the characteristics of customer demands for goods or a product and focuses on a relation between the demand and the price. According to the demand verdict, the lower the price of a product, the higher the demand for a product will be (Sukirno, 2005). In contrast, the higher the price of stuff, the lower the demand for the stuff will be. The demand of customers to a product has related with some factors such as the quality of the stuff, a trend of other goods, family income and income per capita, the number of population, and the economic forecast (Sukirno, 2005).

On the other hand, supply theory examines the characteristic of producers once they are selling their goods in a market and it exercises the relation between supply and the price of stuff. The supply verdict illustrates that the higher the price of a product, the more the product offered in a market would be (Sukirno, 2005). However, the lower a price of stuff, the more limited the product offered would be (Sukirno, 2005). Some factors have a strong relationship with the supply mechanism, which is the price of the stuff, another product price, the cost of production, and the level of technology used in the production.
In the case of HIV/AIDS economics, however, due to the market failure, the market will come into an inelasticity of the demand. According to Sadono (2005), inelasticity occurs when the price of a product has not related to the number of demands. The changing of the quantity does not equally follow the price of the product. The inelasticity differs from market elasticity in which the number of products will follow the number of demands. In another word, HIV/AIDS is an example of market inelasticity in which the verdict of supply and demand is failed on account of fact that the price of HIV/AIDS health treatment will not follow the demand and the supply of the product. In this situation, governments could intervene whether through supply or demand approaches.

**Research method**

We utilized content analysis, which is a part of qualitative inquiry. Nowadays, this research method is used in many fields of study such as health, education, nursing and including public policy studies (Elo and Kyngäs, 2008). The content analysis aims to interoperate a meaning from the content of text data (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005). In this case, however, we follow the conventional approach rather than the traditional one, which bases on coding schemes, origins of codes, threats to trustworthiness, and context interoperation (Krippendorff, 2018). In the conventional approach, the analysis is derived directly from the text data (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005) and we started our study by developing a conceptual framework of demand, supply, and inelasticity as a lens of the data analysis. This approach can also be categorized as a deductive method, which is started from general to a specific case (Elo and Kyngäs, 2008).

In this research, the text data refers to two regulations namely the regional regulation of Yogyakarta Special province No.12 / 2010 and the decree of the Indonesian Ministry of Health No.21/ 2013. Although in regard to national hierarchal regulation, the lower regulation
should follow the higher one, in this case, the ministerial decree came later on. Both regulations regulate the policy intervention of local and national government on treating people living with HIV/AIDS. Besides, we will also refer to a presidential decree No. 75/2006 institutionalizing the national commission of HIV/AIDS. The commission is responsible for developing strategic planning to prevent, to control, and to deal with HIV/AIDS.

To analyse whether the local government utilizes supply or demand approaches to intervening the HIV/AIDS issue, we will classify the data text based on both categorisations. For example, the words “delivering health treatment” and “taking care of HIV/AIDS diagnosis” can be classified as supply approach while the words “people living with HIV/AIDS needs are responsible for their medical treatments based on the health information provided by local government” can be recognized as supply intervention. We compared these supply and demand words from regional and national regulation texts.

Finally, we focus on the Yogyakarta special province case because of several reasons. First, the province is the most progressive region in responding to the issue of HIV/AIDS. Second, the number of people living with HIV/AIDS is relatively high, compared to other provinces on Java islands such as West, Central, and East Java event the population of those provinces is much higher than that in Yogyakarta. Third, Yogyakarta is a special province based on national autonomy regulation. This province is led by a Sultan and has more power on managing their local budget.

Result and Discussion

HIV/AIDS Policy Intervention in Yogyakarta Special Province

The local policy intervention of HIV/AIDS in Yogyakarta special province refers to the regional regulation No.12 / 2010. This regulation had been regulated by 2 years earlier than the Indonesian ministerial decree of HIV/AIDS intervention No.21/2013. According to the regional regulation, the local government is in charge of delivering a sustainable medical treatment to prevent, to nurse, to medicate, and to rehabilitate people living with HIV/AIDS. They are also on duty to maintain a healthy quality of HIV/AIDS-positive persons. Moreover, the governor has an authority to make a regional policy on referral system of HIV/AIDS.

In regard to HIV/AIDS health management, the Yogyakarta special province has three stages of the intervention namely promotion, HIV/AIDS diagnosis test and counselling, and treatment, nursing, and supporting. In this research, we will more be focusing on diagnosis test, treatment, and nursing. Every citizen of Yogyakarta special province has a right to take a medical test of HIV/AIDS in public health facilities such as local hospitals. This test is free in charge of all citizens. Both public and private hospitals with HIV/AIDS medical facilities in Yogyakarta special province are responsible to facilitate HIV/AIDS test, health medication, and nursing. However, the medical cost of health medication and nursing of HIV/AIDS following the national health system, and in more details, it will be regulated in a governor decree.
To support the HIV/AIDS service deliveries, the Yogyakarta special province also commits on providing access of communication, information, and communication to society, on providing health facilities for HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, medical treatment, and nursing, and on developing the number of skilful medical staffs of HIV/AIDS. In comparison with the ministerial decree No.21/ 2013, it more focuses on macro policy on how the central government regulates the right of people living with HIV/AIDS, the transmission of HIV/AIDS, and the relation between the national and regional government. There is no clear information whether the cost of HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, medical treatment, and nursing is covered by government budget or by patients. For example, in the chapter No. 4, the decree regulates only on how health public facilities such public and private hospitals facilitate HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, the medical treatment and the nursing for people living with HIV/AIDS.
4.2 Inelasticity, Supply, Demand: between Welfare and Liberal System

Both the Yogyakarta province and national government realize that HIV/AIDS as an inelasticity of a market failure in which HIV/AIDS health price treatment will not follow the demand and the supply. At the same time, society suffers from this failure of an economic transaction as the producers and consumers could not be responsible and are not the only parties whom will be affected by the disease. The Yogyakarta special province stands on supply intervention by introducing several programmes on their HIV/AIDS strategic planning namely providing an access of communication, information, and communication to society, on providing health facilities for HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, medical treatment, and nursing, and on developing the number of skilful medical staffs of HIV/AIDS. Moreover, the province provides free facilities for citizens to take a medical test of HIV/AIDS in public health facilities such as local hospitals.

Those policy interventions reflect that the Yogyakarta special province has a high commitment to providing basic HIV/AIDS health facilities and treatment. The province allocates the cost from their regional annual budget. However, for the next stage of the health treatments such as medication and nursing, the cost is following the national regulation of health care in which it can become to the health market mechanism or national health insurance. Both oppositional interventions demonstrate that the province adopts the residual model of the welfare system since the authority provides HIV/AIDS health facilities only for the basic treatment. This scheme can also reflect the ability of the province financial allocation on threatening HIV/AIDS positive persons. We argue that the Yogyakarta province is one stage more progressive than that national government on HIV/AIDS response, even though they just focus on basic health treatment and the availability of HIV/AIDS facilities.

On the other hand, the national government stands on supply approach by regulating HIV/AIDS health mechanism. For example, the government regulates on how health facilities such public and private hospitals facilitate HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, the medical treatment and the nursing for people living with HIV/AIDS. The government holds the authority on their hand, but at the same time, they publicly put the HIV/AIDS health treatment on the market mechanism. This position reflects that although HIV/AIDS is a critical inelasticity of market failure, the national government does not intervene in the problem with an extraordinary supply intervention. We argue that the national HIV/AIDS system, in general, more likely follows the liberal model in which people living with HIV/AIDS in Indonesia have to take care their selves for their health treatment. The only commitment the national government has is on the availability of medicines and medical instrumentations. Nevertheless, they also put the cost of both medicines and medical instrumentations in the health market mechanism.

Conclusion

The HIV/AIDS is a form of an inelasticity in the market mechanism in which society can be suffered from this failure. The Yogyakarta special province is one stage more progressive on intervening this negative externality by providing an access of information and communication, delivering free health facilities for HIV/AIDS diagnosis test, developing the number of skilful
medical staffs of HIV/AIDS, and facilitating free medical check-up of HIV/AIDS test in public health facilities such as local hospitals. However, for further HIV/AIDS treatment such as medication and nursing, they follow the national health system. We argue that the HIV/AIDS policy intervention of Yogyakarta special province stands on the supply approach following the residual model of welfare economics. This differs from the national paradigm which is closed to the liberal model system in which the national government just regulates the stage by stages HIV/AIDS health treatment and put all those stages in the market mechanism.

Since HIV/AIDS is a critical disease, the national government should have more commitment to dealing with the issue. The role of provinces should not only be as the implementor of the programmes but also, they can actively be encouraged to be more autonomous on introducing local policy intervention of HIV/AIDS. The national government needs to transfer powers to the regional level to be more innovative. For example, if the province has the power to develop a network with international donors and to establish regulation on allocating corporate social responsibility for HIV/AIDS treatment and facilities, the source of HIV/AIDS budget will not only come from the annual regional budget but also can come from other sources.

Reference


Overall Program 2019
The Impact of Superior Village Product towards Poverty Level in Pandeglang District Banten

Noviyanti Soleman
Kohen Sofi

noviyantisoleman6@gmail.com
kohensofi15@gmail.com

Khon Kaen University, Thailand
Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji, Indonesia

Abstract

As the developing country, Indonesia till now must face the poverty problem. The economic crisis in 1998 become one of the reasons why the number of poverty people is increasing. Time to time, the government of Indonesia tries to alleviate poverty. Such as has been mentioned in Law No. 25 of 2000 about National Development Program, Presidential Decree No. 124 of 2001 about the establishment poverty reduction committee and Presidential Decree No. 15 of 2010 about the acceleration of poverty reduction. One of the Indonesia government efforts in reducing the poverty is through the program of Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Regions and Transmigration called village superior product that started since 2016. Minister of Village Mr. Eko Putro Sandjojo said that if a village can find their featured product so the problem of poverty can be solved. In the case of Pandeglang District as one of the villages apply village superior product, has been proven can reduce the number of the underdeveloped region from 214 to 70 villages for two year. Another side, Pandeglang also the second biggest number of poverties in Banten province. The research aims to know how the impact of village superior product to the number of poverties in Pandeglang district which can reduce the number of underdeveloped regions more than 100 in a year. The research is using the qualitative research instrument by secondary data.

Keywords: Poverty, Underdeveloped Regions, Village Superior Product
INTRODUCTION

Poverty is a problem that quite difficult to solve all over the world. In developing countries, the problem of poverty is common happen. This is become one of the focus issues as it mentioned in UN SDG’s number 1. By 2030, the UN members wants to end the poverty in all its forms everywhere (United Nations).

In Indonesia the number of poetries is still high. Meanwhile the peak of the poverty number is in the 97-98s, at that time the Asian Economic Miracle countries should survive for that (Adiningsih, Rahutami, Anwar, Wijaya, & Wardani, 2008). It has shown in the level of inflation that increase 10 times in 1998 (Sadikin, 2010).

Since that financial crisis, Indonesia must solve and reduce the number of poverty time to time. It is not that easy while the number of poetries in Indonesia sometimes increase and slightly reduce. Currently the report of 2018 shows that now Indonesia for the first time reach under 10% of poverty number, which means that slowly the number of poetries goes down. Otherwise, the target of current governance is reach 9%.

The table below is showing how the number of poverty in Indonesia from 2013 to 2018.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Level of Poverty (Million)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>29.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>27.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>25.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>24.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Level of Poverty in Indonesia (Badan Pusat Statistik, 2018)

From the graph above shows how the number of poetries slightly goes down. This not regardless from the effort of the government as what has been mentioned in the law of Indonesia. Such as Law Number 5 of 2000 about National Development Program. In Law Number 5 mentioned that one of the big problem in Indonesia is poverty and has to be solved through strengthening the base of sustainable development of economic. (Law of Republic Indonesia , 2000)

Secondly is mentioned in Presidential Decree No. 124 of 2001 about the establishment poverty reduction committee. In this decree assign the poverty reduction committee will be leaded by Coordinating Minister of People Welfare and others ministers as the member of the committee (Presidential Decree, 2001). Meanwhile in 2010, another Presidential Decree which is No. 15 of 2010 about the acceleration of poverty reduction.

In order to recover the problem of poverty, the government of Indonesia tries to push the number of poetries as much as they can. Not just the national government but also the province either the district level. One alternative tried by the government is through Superior Village Product. As in Pandeglang district, the Superior Village Product has been used to help in solve the poverty problem.

The existence Law number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages become a momentum for the acceleration of development all villages in Indonesia. Due to the direction of village development is the right of the Village Government to regulate its own Village as free from the interest of the group or unilateral interests. The one gives direction to the Law number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages is the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Areas, and Transmigration of the Republic of Indonesia.

In 2017 the Ministry of Village launched four village fund priority programs. One of that is determining the superior products of areas (Prukades in Bahasa Indonesia). The rest are building village-owned enterprises (bumdes), building village ponds, and building sports facilities in the village. (Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Areas and Transmigration the Republic of Indonesia, n.d.)

Superior Village product is a step to advance the village by producing the local products. Producing superior products will provide a way for the village to access the market and accelerate of the village economy. If a village has produced superior village products, it will be easy to build market networking and can be profitable. There are some considerations to see the village superior products, such as:

Local product
In order to optimizing the existing resources. If the resource comes from outside, it is recommended that to do the reprocessing or value added to make it different.

**Big market**
In order to make the products easily sold and generate abundant profits.

**Economic growth product**
Products can encourage the growth of various other economic activities, to be able to contribute greatly to the growth of the village economy.

**Not contra with the village business**
Do not contradict business that is generally run in the village.

**Trend product**
Superior products can also consider products that are trending in the market.

By filtering these things, to determine the superior village products will be easy and minimize the possibility of errors in determining production. Superior village product is currently a form of cooperation between villages with entrepreneurs. According to the data of Ministry of Village, the number of superior village product is about 343, in 148 districts and 29 provinces in Indonesia. There are 18 commodities that are managed through partnerships with 30 companies. (Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Areas and Transmigration the Republic of Indonesia, n.d.)

The successfulness of village superior product such as: first is Planting of maize in Banten Pandeglang, this uses an area of 51,446 hectares planted with an area of 20,441 hectares, yields of 5 tons / hectare. Projected to be the largest corn producer in Banten. Second is maize plantations in West Halmahera, North Maluku, use an area of 20,000 hectares in 9 sub-districts with a target of 80,000 and current production of 467.5 tons from 1679.48 hectares. Third is corn plantations that have become commodities since 2011 have reached 218,885 thousand tons, with an average economic growth in 2011-2015 reaching 6% per year. Fourth is successes of the Bojonegoro star fruit and guava, East Java, Starfruit, red guava and crystal guava are the superior products that have continued to be developed, the Ministry of Village facilitates the cooperation of Bojonegoro Regency and Trans Retail Indonesia Company. To support Superior Village Product in selling the products, the Ministry of Village also conducted a business forum involving 28 districts, related ministries / institutions, state-owned enterprises and private parties. The benefits generated by superior village products are:

**Skilled Farmer**
If the Village already has one superior product, then other farmers will emerge to cultivate or develop certain commodities, it is supported by increasing capacity, joint learning between farmers will result in skilled farmers and experts.

**Simplify Capital Access**
Capital access will be easily affordable if a village already has one superior product and certainly has a sustainable production. Large and sustainable quantity of production, capital access will be easy to obtain (Bank or Cooperative).

**Attracting Investor Presence**
Investors will enter if the superior products produced have good selling value and quality, quantity and sustainability. This investment can be done by collaborating on farm (cultivation) off farm (commodity management) and market. Then with this will make economic growth faster and more evenly distributed.

**Job Opportunities**
The making of superior village products will be reflected in the opening of new employment opportunities and new business opportunities, with new employment opportunities and business opportunities automatically increasing employment and reducing unemployment in the village, improving welfare and overcoming rural poverty.

Pandeglang is a district in Banten province that use superior village product to alleviate the poverty. The focus problem in Pandeglang is about economic such as poverty number and disadvantages area. According to the data in 2014, 214 of 326 villages in Pandeglang is involved into disadvantages area means that most of the village is involve in disadvantages area. Also, Pandeglang district is the second biggest number of poverty in Banten province. Therefore, Pandeglang tries to apply four program of village fund, one of it is superior village product. From the application of superior village product program, Pandeglang district is success in reducing the number of underdeveloped areas.

**RESEARCH QUESTION**
Regarding to the data above, this paper would like to analyze how is the impact of Superior Village Products towards the number of poverty in Pandeglang district?
OBJECTIVES

This research aiming to know how the impact of village superior product to the number of poverty in Pandeglang district.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Concept of Poverty

Poverty is present when basic capability failure arises because a person has inadequate command over resources, whether through market or non-market sources. Poverty is defined by a poverty line, i.e. The minimum income needed to be able to satisfy minimum basic needs. (UNDP, 2006)

The main concept of poverty is when a person is unable to meet his basic or primary needs. In measuring poverty, usually using the poverty line. The poverty lines of each country differ depending on the economic conditions of the country itself. In Indonesia, there are national and provincial poverty lines.

World Summit on Social Development in Copenhagen 1995, the international community adopted and endorsed a multidimensional definition of poverty. Such as, absolute poverty or a condition characterized by severe deprivation of basic human needs, including food, safe drinking water, sanitation facilities, health, shelter, education and information. It depends not only on income but also on access to social services. (United Nations, 1995)

To determine the poverty, Development Initiatives have two alternatives. First is household demographics: the size of the household (number of people), the age structure, the dependency ratio and the sex of the household head) and geographical location – rural or urban – are known key determinants of household poverty. Second is individual characteristics: a person’s sex, age, employment status, level of educational attainment, property-owned and socio-economic profession are key determinants of poverty. (Development Initiatives, 2016)

Regarding to Berau of Statistics Indonesia, in calculate the poverty, Indonesia used basic needs approach which is the inability of economy to meet the food and non-food needs requested from expenditure. To know the percentage of poverty number, the government use Head Count Index as the percentage of people whose under the poverty line. (Central Bureau of Statistics , n.d.)

Indonesia now faces three fundamental problems in efforts to lift poverty, namely accelerate economic growth by stabilizing the economy, improving social services for the poor by increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of social service delivery and protection for the poor by providing social protection programs that are more beneficial to the poor. (World Bank Group)

According to the national development planning agency, in overcoming disasters Fulfilling the Basic Needs of the Poor for Education, Health and Basic Infrastructure, Social Protection and Increasing Opportunities for Business. (BAPPENAS, 2009)

Poverty is when basic needs cannot be fulfilled. Types of poverty is depending on social services people get. In determine the poverty, every country has different way such as Indonesia that use basic needs approach.

Concept of Village fund

Village fund is fund from state revenue and expenditure budget that allocate special for village. The use of village fund is described in the Law number 6 of 2014 about village. Regarding to the policy of decentralization, the village government has authority to regulate and set the distribution of village fund based on the priority. The main goal of village fund is welfare for the society through increase public services in the society, poverty eradication, develop the village income, alleviate the gap and strengthen the society as subject for development. The village fund is allocated to support the development of village product, community network, granary village and cultural circle. (Finance Department of Indonesia, 2017)

The Village Fund is calculated based on the number of Villages and is allocated by considering the Population Amount, Poverty Rate, Area and Geographical Difficulty Level. The principle of village fund including Justice which prioritizes the rights and interests of all villagers, Priority needs or prioritizing the interests of the village which is more urgent, Village Authority that prioritizes authority on the origin of village-scale rights, Participatory or prioritizing Community creativity, Self-Management and resource-based Village or Prioritizing the implementation of Village independently with the utilization of the village's natural resources, the Village Typology is
Considering the circumstances and reality of the geographical, sociological, anthropological, economic, and ecological characteristics of the Village. (Ministry of Finance Republic Indonesia, 2017)
The village fund program is intended for rural villages to develop as they should. The distribution of village funds is adjusted to the conditions and geographical location. This is so that the balance of equity or meet the needs in accordance with what is needed.
Now a day, the ministry of village has 4 programs priority village development. The village fund is confirmed can be used for those programs. They are superior village product, reservoir, small medium enterprises, and sport infrastructure. All these programs are expected to help the village to get out of problems such as one of the problems, namely poverty.

Concept of Superior village product
Superior village product is one of the priorities program from the ministry of village. Superior village product program is created to find the local source and become income generating for a village. Superior village product is a special local product which is expected to become an identity for the village.

In determining superior village products, you cannot be careless. This is because it needs to be adjusted to the reality of the village. The basic materials used must be from the village and processed by the village.

The benefit of having superior village product is to improve the skill of human resources, to improve the capital access, to gain the investor interest, increase job opportunities, improve the welfare and alleviate the poverty.

Superior village product (Prukades) as a form of cooperation between villages in partnership with entrepreneurs (Kementerian Desa PDTT, n.d.). This program merged some stakeholders to play the role together aims to get the welfare.

All parties involved play an important role in running the product superior village. For example, the private sector signs the MoU as a marketing or consumer partner, the bank which is the capital lender and so on. This certainly will greatly help the course of the superior village product. As is known that villages have their own limitations in organizing similar programs.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

As mentioned in the government regulation, after decentralization, regional development authority is no longer centralized, or all decisions will be returned to the area including the people's welfare. In the village funding program, there are 4 priority programs that are later expected to help overcome the problem of poverty. Superior village product is an independent variable that will later be examined for its effect on poverty levels as the dependent variable. Positive or not the condition of the impact, depending on how the program superior village products.

METHODOLOGY
This research is a qualitative study. Qualitative research is a type of social science research that collects and works with non-numerical data and that seeks to interpret meaning from these data that help us understand social life through the study of targeted populations or places (Crossman, 2019)
The data collection technique used is secondary data. Secondary data referred to in this case are books, newspapers or news, reports, journals and other writings related to this research.

This research takes place in Pandeglang sub-district which is one of the worst poverty or economic problems. In addition, Pandeglang is the biggest contributor to the poverty rate in Banten province, which is also the area where superior village product development is carried out for income generating purposes. Pandeglang is heard as one of the successes in using superior village products.

RESULT AND FINDINGS
Pandeglang is a district located in Banten province. The total area of Pandeglang is about 2,746.31 km² with 35 sub-districts and 339 villages (Statistics Pandeglang Regency, 2017). Based on the data of 2016, the number of population in
Pandeglang district is about 1,200,512 in 282,678 household. The main industry of Pandeglang is agriculture which cover about 42.86% and the others are trade hotel and restaurant, manufacture, personal and social community services, etc. Poverty condition in Pandeglang Pandeglang is one of the disadvantaged areas in Banten province. According to the data of 2014, about 214 villages in Pandeglang is involve as the disadvantages area. The total villages in Pandeglang is 326, means 214/326 is about 65%. Exceeding 50% should be a high awareness for the local district government. The total of disadvantages area that more than 50% makes Pandeglang exists as one of the disadvantages area. Pandeglang and Lebak is two district in Banten that support the biggest number of poverty for Banten Province. In addition, both regions are included in the list of disadvantaged regions of 2015-2019 Indonesia. Pandeglang is the worst one compared to Lebak. The poverty in Pandeglang is the highest among another sub-district in Banten province. The graph below will show how is the comparison level of poverty between Pandeglang and another sub district in Banten Province in 2010.

From the graph above, the percentage of poor people is increase in 2014. The major influence on the poverty line are food commodities and non-food commodities. The types of food commodities that have a major influence on the poverty line are rice, filter clove cigarettes, chicken eggs, purebred chicken, instant noodles, bread as well as ground coffee and coffee sachets. While non-food commodities are the biggest contributors to the poverty line in urban and rural areas, which are the same, namely the cost of housing, gasoline, electricity, education and toiletries.
Prukades in Pandeglang
As the bad economic condition of Pandeglang. This district is using the four priorities program to alleviate the poverty number. One of it is superior village product which is the local product as the main production to generate the income.

Pandeglang use corn as the local product for income generating. Corn is one of the main commodity in Indonesia. Since 1965, corn is the commodity to be export in international market. Time to time number of corn to export is decrease but the national demand is increase till now. This is becoming a good point to develop the corn production.

Pandeglang get help from ministry of Agriculture for the seed and tools to grow corn. Another help from stated-owned enterprises and private sector. Such as Ministry for Public Works and Human Settlements that help build infrastructure road and bridge to access the product of agriculture.

Private sector is playing important roles in developing the local product in way of marketing. Artha Graha, Japfa Comfeed, PT Seger Agro Nusantara, Carrefour and Indofood are the big companies that will help the marketing the local product by added value services in form of new product. Meanwhile the ministry of state-owned enterprises in help to give loan for the local people to process the local product.

Planting of corn in Banten Pandeglang, this uses an area around 50,000 Ha or exactly 51,446 hectares. From the total area, the planted area is 20,441 hectares (Departmen Kesehatan, 2017). The average of production is about 5 ton per hectare with the price about Rp. 3,000 per kilogram.

If the corn is planted in 20,000 hectares and the production 5 ton per hectare, the total production is about 100,000 ton for 1 time or 100 million kg. With the price Rp. 3,000/kg, Pandeglang can get 300 billion for 1-time production. It means they can get more than original village income that is only 120 billion.

Otherwise if Pandeglang can maximize the production through use all the total area or about 50,000 Hectares, they can get around 750 billion for one-time production. In one year, maximum is 2 times production, so 1.5 trillion is possible to reach.

Condition after prukades
According to Presidential Decree 131 of 2015 about the determination of disadvantages region of 2015-2019, article 1 stated that Disadvantaged Regions are regency areas less developed regions and communities compared to other regions in scale national.

That presidential Decree assign Pandeglang as one of the two districts from Banten Province that involve in disadvantages area. The program of superior village product in Pandeglang brings good impact for Pandeglang province. Last report stated that Pandeglang now out from the disadvantages area list. The graph below will show how the number of disadvantages area in Pandeglang decrease year by year.

![Disadvantages area graph](Sambas, 2017)

From the graph above clearly shows the improvement of superior village product impact. While the number of disadvantages area is decrease from 214 and last year become around 70. This is a good improvement for the welfare of Pandeglang.

The total number of villages in the Pandeglang district was 326. In 2014, the number of disadvantaged areas was 214 or 65%. Then in 2016, there was a significant decrease in that year which was the beginning of the superior village product. The decline reached 45%, apparently it did not end there, because in 2017, the number of underdeveloped villages was only 70 villages or 21% of the total villages in Pandeglang.

Current report shows that in the new list of disadvantages areas, Pandeglang is no longer there. Only in one period, Pandeglang is success
to bring out their name from the list of disadvantages area. Beside the disadvantages area, superior village product also impacted to the number of poverties in Pandeglang district. The graph below will show the percentage of poor people in Pandeglang after 2014, when in 2016 is the starting point of superior village product.

![Graph showing percentage of poor people in Pandeglang](image)

(Badan Pusat Statistik Pandeglang, n.d.)

In 2014 and 2015, it was clear that the percentage of poverty in Pandeglang was still above 10 percent. In 2016 it experienced a significant decrease of almost 1 percent. The decline coincided with the year in which the Pandeglang superior village product was developed. One year after that, the poverty rate increased by 0.07 percent and again dropped 0.13 percent in 2018. From this percentage change, the reduction in poverty rate is quite good. But since 2016 the changes have only been around 0.10 percent. So that changes are not so visible when compared to changes that occur in the number of disadvantages areas.

DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION
Based on the data presented previously, there are several important points which will be elaborated as follows.

The first is poverty level. Pandeglang is one of the districts with very high poverty rates. Besides the impact of the financial crisis, as time goes by there are obstacles to get out of poverty. The poverty rate that never goes out becomes a big problem for the local government.

Then in 2016 after superior village products were introduced, this became one alternative to reduce poverty in Pandeglang. However, from the results seen, the percentage of poverty initially appears to be significantly reduced but then is in a stable position which does not rise or does not go down. This position has two perspectives: good and bad. The good is that the numbers don't increase but the bad is that there is no improvement seen but the superior village product program is always running. Then is this a sign that there is no impact anymore for the program?

The second point is the number of disadvantaged areas. Disadvantaged areas describe how the development of the area is slow, so it is not in accordance with the era in terms of economic, social and others. Pandeglang is categorized as one of the disadvantaged areas. Banten province has two underdeveloped regions, namely Pandeglang and Lebak. Both are also the top two contributors to the highest percentage of poverty in Pandeglang. However, Pandeglang is one of the highest positions, this indicates an urgency for it.

After undergoing the superior village product program. Now Pandeglang feels quite extraordinary impact. In 2014, 65% of villages were classified as disadvantaged. But 2016 to 2017 showed good progress until the remaining 70 villages are left now out of a total of 326 villages.

The decrease in the number of underdeveloped villages from 214 to 70 is one of the best achievements. It can reduce the number of underdeveloped regions more than 100 just in a year. Reduction of 144 villages managed to survive from the category of lagging. This is a success that is very clearly seen from the decline in the number of underdeveloped districts of Pandeglang district. The success of the superior village product was able to help reduce the number of disadvantaged areas.

Last is the status as a disadvantaged area. Every five years, the national government will determine which areas are included in the lagging category. In 2015-2019, Pandeglang was one of the two regions originating from Banten province, including the lagging regions. Now seen in the latest report, Pandeglang successfully escaped the status of disadvantaged areas.
Certainly, becomes a link with the implementation of village fund products, one of which is a superior village product. The results of the discussion concluded that, first superior village products affect the poverty level of an area both directly and indirectly. Both impacts can be positive or negative depending on local conditions. In the Pandeglang case, the program supporting not only the superior village product but also other village fund programs, besides that, the percentage of poverty rates in the last two years have not experienced significant changes, a sign that the positive influence has not been maximized.

Third is to successfully change the status of disadvantaged areas, which determines the status of disadvantaged regions also raises economic problems as root. Therefore, we can mention that there are impacts that are given but the form of positive or negative impacts depends on village conditions.

The barrier found in this research is the difficulty of accessing information as the main data to be processed and the difficulty in classifying the types of village fund programs. So, it is expected for further research to be able to explain in more detail about village funds and their classification because Pandeglang runs all priority programs for village funds about 4 programs.

References


eb.pdf

Development Policy Kampung Bantar in Realizing Smart City in Jambi City, Indonesia.
Hartati
E-mail: tatiek_dr@yahoo.com
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Jambi

Makmun Wahid
E-mail: makmun.wahid90@yahoo.com
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Jambi

Abstract
This paper discusses the emergence of smart city as a new direction for city development. Today, smart cities are increasingly popular among local governments in Indonesia, including the Jambi City government. This paper intends to describe the policy of the Jambi city government in realizing smart city with a focus on the utilization of RT-based urban villages (Kampung Bantar) and their meaning for the welfare of urban residents. To explain this case, qualitative research methods are used. This approach was chosen because this research is related to the complexity of the understanding of the local government regarding smart city. This research requires secondary data in the form of official government documents such as several regional regulations, mayor decisions and regulations, as well as various documents related to the city development policy towards smart city. Primary data is also used in the form of interviews with informants obtained through in-depth interviews. This article will answer the general question: how is the smart city in Jambi city implemented? Specifically, it will answer: how is the role of the village in realizing smart city and giving meaning to the welfare of urban residents. The findings show that the success of the Jambi City government in implementing smart city is a strong commitment from the local government by initiating innovations in utilizing RT-based settlements to face the city development towards smart city.

Keywords: Kampung Bantar, Smart City and Welfare
Introduction

Urban problems are increasingly complex, can not be solved in the usual way, but methods that are totally different from the previous one are needed, one of which is the application of smart city. Smart city is increasingly popular among local governments in Indonesia. This phenomenon is related to the increasing understanding of the importance of smart cities in urban development. The success of smart city implementation is influenced by geographical conditions, changes in demographics and understanding of the city community on the importance of smart city in the development.

Jambi City is one of the big cities on the Sumatera island with the development of the city towards smart city. One of the things that dominated the development of a city was settlements. Today, settling disparities are often found due to misperceptions about informal settlements. Meanwhile, the urban village (Kampung Bantar) is a distinctive feature of the city of Jambi to be maintained by utilizing the development conditions of the city which is currently quite rapid towards smart city.

There are two general approaches in smart city, namely: (1) Smart City is part of developing and managing cities by utilizing information and communication technology (ICT) to know (sensing), understanding (understanding) and controlling (controlling) various existing resources in the city more effectively and efficiently to maximize service to its citizens and support sustainable development (Supangkat & et al., 2015). (2) A city that connects physical infrastructure, information technology infrastructure, social infrastructure, and business infrastructure to collectively utilize city intelligence (Harrison, et al., 2010). Bandung, for example, under the leadership of Mayor Ridwan Kamil, Bandung City looks very serious about bringing smart city and focus on IT (Bisnis Tempo, 6/10/2017)

The choice to prioritize smart technology-based cities can be seen as a static way of managing city development. This perspective places urban development only as a matter of digital use, and ignores socio-economic aspects. This method merely leads to a strategy of adjusting to the conditions of technological progress, not with a more humanist approach. Development of cities are more focus on digital-oriented and tend to ignore human development and settlements of this kind will certainly be a new problem, because development does not grow together and is in accordance with the needs of the people. In the past, we have often heard about the development of a region unilaterally by the government, without involving the public who have interests (Rosyadi, 2010: 2).

According to these conditions the Jambi City government is highly demanded in realizing smart city in its city. Innovation is then a form of capability that must be owned by the local government in facing the progress of the city as happened in Jambi City. Including how to involve the community in the development process through the Kampung Bantar policy. Meanwhile, since 2014 the Kampung Bantar program has been initiated, this program is present as a solution to the limited funds for the construction of utilities and infrastructure, which are almost faced by all local governments in Indonesia (Koran Sindo, 08/30/2018).

When discussing about innovations in the administration of regional governments in the current era of autonomy, there is important to be explored is systemic change, not merely the product of innovation. It means the things that need to be studied carefully are not only whether the regional head can offer innovative programs such as the previously mentioned Bantar Village, but also more importantly in the innovation process, which involves the acceptance of change as a consequence of the development innovation, both of them by the community and government apparatus.

Accordingly, in simple terms the implementation practice of Kampung Bantar actually has acceleration, if the leader from the Camat level to the RT be able to carry out his role as an example or be an inspiration to the community to take part in better city development. Kampung Bantar as

---

1Kampung Bantar is an Acronym of the Kampung Bersih (clean), Aman (safe) and Pintar (smart)
the flagship program of the city of Jambi later became a manifestation of a change in the direction of city development. In its changes, the community is present in providing applicative implications and encouragement in a more quality development.

The settlement-based smart city approach referred to in the Kampung Bantar program can be a solution to the various challenges and negative impacts of implementing conventional development. The implementation of Kampung Bantar is appropriately believed to be able to meet the needs of urban communities today. In the context of national development, the expected goals of the development of Kampung Bantar are in line with the pillars. The concept of smart cities is a big issue in big cities around the world, which encourages active roles and community participation in urban management using a citizen centric approach. So, there is a more dynamic and close interaction between citizens and service providers, in this case the local government. This two-way interaction will continue to develop and process. After that later the city will be a comfortable place to live and be strong in responding to new changes and challenges more quickly (PSPPR UGM Team, 2016). It means, the role of the community in the management of Kampung Bantar becomes crucial in maximizing the implementation of the smart city.

Through the development of the Kampung Bantar policy, the Government of Jambi City has succeeded in supporting environmentally sound investments such as renewable waste management which aims to address the problem of municipal waste. On the other hand, the Jambi City government can also implement a community-based security system with all the values of local wisdom contained in it. The development policy of Kampung Bantar can also encourage public participation in funding for investment in creative economy in each region where he lives. Therefore, there needs to be a harmonious synergy between the government and the community in supporting the development of smart cities in Jambi City.

According to the problems, this study aims to see the extent of the strategy and development policies of Kampung Bantar in Jambi City in realizing the smart city concept. In addition, it also explores the potential of Kampung Bantar in applying the concepts of Smart Environment, Smart Living, and Smart People. In short, this research contributes to the understanding of the direction of settlement-based city development and its meaning for future participation and welfare of the people of Jambi.

**Method**

The research method is basically a scientific way to get information with academic goals and benefits. In deciphering the smart city development policy in Jambi City, the method applied in this study uses qualitative research, which to understand what is experienced by the subject of this research is to describe the results in the field. Whereas the main object is humans or everything that is influenced by humans (Indranata, 2008: 4). This approach was chosen because this research is related to the complexity of the understanding of the local government regarding smart city. Qualitative is considered appropriate in helping the writer analyze the problems that occur. The collection method carried out in this study was in-depth interviews and FGDs involving several OPDs in the city government which were directly related to the development of smart cities in Jambi City. This research requires secondary data in the form of official government documents such as several regional regulations, mayor decisions and regulations, as well as various documents related to the city-based smart city development policy. Primary data is also used in the form of interviews with informants obtained through in-depth interviews. To analyze secondary and primary data as mentioned above, researchers used two methods namely triangulation and interpretative. The analysis is carried out in a macro and micro context by exploring the objectives and policy directions of the Jambi City government in developing smart cities.

In this paper, the purpose of the discussion and research results is the articulation of the strategic steps of the Jambi city government in developing Jambi city as a smart city. The view from this sub-chapter is that this paper will be directed at several models of government programs that support smart city can be realized in Jambi City.
Results

The Kampung Bantar Program (Clean, Safe and Smart) is an initiative program of the Jambi City Government aimed at accelerating the acceleration of development. This program is expected to reduce development inequality between regions, improve the quality of welfare and improve the quality of the economy of the community, especially in the location of the Kampung Bantar RT-bassed.

Based on the Mayor Regulation Number 47 of 2014 concerning Technical Guidelines for Clean, Safe and Smart Village Arrangement, it is stated that the Kampung Bantar program’s objective is to make the neighborhood the smallest neighborhood in the RT in a clean and healthy environment, then provide sanitation facilities and infrastructure adequate, habitable and comfortable, safe and orderly settlements, a fairly (productive) level of socio-economic life of the community, and always maintaining the spirit of mutual cooperation, religious values, national solidarity, customs and norms law in the life of a community, based on a more moral, civilized and cultured.

In the context of this study Kampung Bantar has Clean, safe and Smart keywords. These 3 dimensions will be developed as the goal of developing smart cities in Jambi City based on RT. If further explained the village of Bantar can be achieved through the principle of community participation.

The concept of smart city in the city of Jambi can be described in the pattern below:

Picture.1. Scheme Smart City in Jambi City

Source: Processed by author

That is, at the level of implementation, the smart city of Jambi city can be achieved if the indicators in the Kampung Bantar program are fulfilled. Clean, has several main achievements, namely: First, having residential facilities and infrastructure and healthy and well-organized housing. Second, have adequate environmental facilities and infrastructure. Third, it has a level of participation and community awareness in maintaining environmental cleanliness. Fourth, has a green open space, free from pollution. Fifth, have a level of awareness in utilizing idle land for household and community needs. Sixth, have healthy and good environmental sanitation. Seventh, has the spirit and spirit of mutual cooperation, as well as the values of social solidarity in the life of the community, nation and state.

While safe, it has several objectives to be achieved, namely: First, an environment free from the dangers of drugs and alcohol. Second, an environment free from crime. Third, an environment free from prostitution and immorality. Fourth, an environment free from domestic violence, household divorce, discrimination and exploitation of children. Fifth, the environment in which the community continues to maintain the spirit of deliberation to reach consensus in completing community activities, especially in the fields of government, development, community, security and order. Sixth, having a high level of political and legal awareness. Seventh, the environment that is always guarding and upholding the values of customs, national culture and legal norms in the community.

And the last one is smart with 6 main indicators, namely: First, having a community economic empowerment institution. Second, having educational institutions and groups in improving human resources. Third, having a group of social, community, youth and religious organizations. Fourth, the environment is free from illiteracy and drop out rates. Fifth, an environment free of unemployment. Sixth, an environment that is free from the death rates of pregnant women and toddlers. Sixth, the environment is able to explore managing the potential of human resources in improving the social and economic welfare of the community.

With the variety of achievements that want to be produced by Kampung Bantar, the writer wanted to do a mapping related to the implementation of Kampung Bantar in realizing the Jambi City Smart...
City by using the indicators found in Boyd Cohen Smart City Wheel. To find out the current status, the benchmark or benchmark that will be used to map this is the efforts made by the government and the people of Jambi City. With the results of this mapping, it is expected that the program position of Kampung Bantar in realizing the smart city of Jambi City, with all its potential, as well as the existing problems related to Kampung Bantar can be known. In the process of collecting data in Jambi City, three dimensions were found that met Boyd Cohen's Smart City Wheel requirements, namely as follows:

Table 1. Mapping the Efforts of Jambi City in Meeting Smart City Indicators in Jambi City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions / Indicators</th>
<th>Effort</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environment Dimensions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Quality</td>
<td>Protection of air quality through greening of villages; make family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>medicinal plants in every home garden, waste management without</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>burning, use empty land for village parks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Management</td>
<td>Development of Waste Banks starting from the RT level to the kelurahan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>that are managed independently by the community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People Dimensions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Read Corner</td>
<td>Utilization of security posts during the day for children's reading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>rooms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Index</td>
<td>Establish an informal educational institution such as the Qur'an</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reading Park, Tahfidz house to a joint learning forum.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living Dimensions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Security System</td>
<td>Development of a village security system with community self-help,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>through a scheme of squatting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Access</td>
<td>Utilization of family medicinal plants for residents in need. Carry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>out elderly gymnastics on weekends</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resource: Research Smart City in Jambi City (2019)

From the results of the mapping above, it can be seen that Kampung Bantar's position has the advantage of implementing smart environments, smart living and smart people. 3 other dimensions; Smart economy, smart mobility and smart government then need to be considered specifically because if these 3 dimensions can also be applied with RT-based settlements, the smart city in Jambi City will be more easily realized.

This possibility is even greater when in some districts the government confirms the increase in the number of Kampung Bantar from year to year. In the District of Paal Merah for example:

Table 2. Data on the Number of Kampung Bantar in the District of Paal Merah, Jambi City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kelurahan Name</th>
<th>Total RT</th>
<th>Total Kampung Bantar in 2016</th>
<th>Total Kampung Bantar in 2017</th>
<th>Total Kampung Bantar in 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lingkar Selatan</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paal Merah</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talang Bakung</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eka Jaya</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payo Selincang</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Paal Merah District

The increase in the number of Kampung Bantar from 2016 which was only 12 then to 45 in Paal Merah Subdistrict was the main capital to strengthen the implementation of smart city in Jambi City. The table above shows that the people of Jambi city are aware of the importance of Kampung Bantar as a strategy in realizing prosperity in Jambi City.

Discussion
Volunteering in Kampung Bantar

The Jambi City Government has realized the importance of organizing smart city-based city
development. The commitment of the Jambi City Government has been demonstrated through the Kampung Bantar's program, in the form of implementing the smart city concept described in the previous section, namely, Clean, Safe and Smart Villages. Through Kampung Bantar, the community has a very open opportunity to be involved in development as a space to develop their activities in community empowerment. The community as the supervisor of the running of the government made Kampung Bantar an interaction space for synergy with the government. Kampung Bantar is not looked at it like just a "lipstick" program of the ruling regional heads, but as a tool to respond to problems that exist in the community and seek community support and conduct activity as directly and actively.

The city of Jambi from the beginning had a problem with the lack of funds for development, but the city of Jambi had a community that loved its area, who wanted to participate in supporting the limited funds with mutual cooperation. At that time the presence of the Kampung Bantar innovation as a development solution that cannot be completed so far. (SY Fasha, Mayor of Jambi)

With the existence of Kampung Bantar, urban communities can easily discuss and consolidate with fellow community members to the government, especially supported by the increasing trust in the Kampung Bantar program. With the existence of a binding participation space, it is expected that the community can develop opinions and express criticism of the direction of city development.

The activity of Kampung Bantar which is centered on volunteerism by emphasizing the awareness to jointly "participate" in urban development, this can already be said to be part of citizen participation. P.Krina., Lalolo Loina (2003) in Kurniadi, Dkk. (2009: 18) say the importance of emphasizing the element of willingness in participation. Participation is understood as the principle that everyone has the right to be involved in making decisions in every government administration, including having the right to participate in carrying out changes in society. That means, Kampung Bantar activities that prioritize the interests of volunteer-based development are good enough to play a role in realizing Jambi smart city.

In reviewing the explanation above, we can say that the increase in the number of Kampung Bantar from over the year in each Kelurahan is one of the effects of the successful use of the principle of volunteerism in the community. Indirectly, the institutionalization of Bantar Village has succeeded in forming community volunteerism to be able to join in the development of the city. This is also supported by Novi's informant's opinion. He said that using Kampung Bantar in city development to become a smart city was more effective, in Kampung Bantar there were many "features" that could make the issue of urban development more attractive. Therefore, it is not surprising that the number of Kampung Bantar is increasing when volunteerism continues to be fostered and maintained together in the community.

We RT residents feel encouraged by the existence of Bantar Village. This way we want our village to be better than other villages. It has become a healthy competition for every RT that wants to be designated as Kampung Bantar. Moreover, the Sub-District Head and the Head of the Village are more often visiting our village after our village was designated as Kampung Bantar. It makes the spirit of success and safeguarding the Kampung Bantar grow by itself. (Novi, Citizen RT 41)

This point of view then helped to encourage volunteerism in the city of Jambi. In this context, the majority of informants said that they were first involved in the Kampung Bantar program after learning that the City government was contending every proposed Kampung Bantar. They consider that this method is very effective in forming citizen volunteerism through the prestige of fair competition in every RT. The formation of volunteerism carried out by the City government was also seen in building awareness of government apparatus such as sub-district heads, village heads and RT heads. The increasing number of Kampung Bantar that appear every year can be an indicator of the success of the City government in utilizing volunteerism and citizen participation in building Jambi city as a smart city. From not knowing, he became aware of being involved in the voluntary movement of the Kampung Bantar movement.

With that awareness, the community should realize that every move and sustainability
determines the success or failure of the smart city in Jambi City. Kampung Bantar is a smart city support tool that aims to improve city development. In this case, the government needs to be able to intervene at any time to bind the basic principles and joints of the Kampung Bantar in the development of the city which is centered on volunteerism of the residents. The model of government involvement, for example: disseminating public information, providing consultation mechanisms in Kampung Bantar activities, encouraging independent community initiatives to participatory monitoring.

In order for the development of Kampung Bantar to run well as one of the supporting cities of Jambi as intended, then what is important in this case is the protection of the Kampung Bantar movement. The protection in question is to provide security and sustainability of Kampung Bantar activities, for example the misuse of reward funds given to Kampung Bantar with high achievements. In terms of the protection of Kampung Bantar from the abuse, it means that the presence of the Kampung Bantar program does not create conflict in the community. Given the circumstances that have an effect on the change in Kampung Bantar to Kampung Bantar is something that might arise if the conflict occurred. This conclusion is reinforced by the following opinion:

For me, Kampung Bantar is a good program from the city government in fostering community participation. All build on volunteerism and self-help from community members. However, there are many challenges for the future. Many Kampung Bantar are a village for a while. Conflicts often arise after the determination of the winner of the Kampung Bantar. The lack of transparency in managing the awards given can arouse people's suspicion and the growth of the seeds of conflict. So that there are some Kampung Bantar that were initially very prominent then disappeared without a trace. (Ahyat, Chairperson RT 41)

In addition, with the development approach of Kampung Bantar as one of the smart city supports, the other important thing is that the voluntary movement must be able to enter the dimensions of each generation. That is, the Kampung Bantar voluntary movement must build good character and regeneration. This process is necessary because the Kampung Bantar movement must reflect volunteerism as a whole not only from the older generation but also from the young. In other words, this is intended so that in the short term Kampung Bantar can develop public participation as a whole, while in the long term it aims to ensure that the development of the city of Jambi is in the hands of the volunteerism of its people.

This voluntary system needs to be nurtured and maintained because the existence of this system clearly tends to provide positive benefits for the government, as stated by Thoma, John Clayton (1995) in Kurniadi (2009: 22) that voluntary public participation will contribute greatly to the realization of governance. well. According to him, various experiences show that there are at least some advantages that can be obtained, namely: First, there is a good communication channel. Second, bring up creative ideas and minimize citizen criticism. Third, the birth of responsive and contextual policies. Fourth, effective and efficient policy implementation. Fifth, can strengthen social capital.

Understanding Kampung Bantar from Smart City Perspective

The Kampung Bantar Program was created because of the limited budget of the Jambi City Government in accelerating development. From this program which was initiated in 2014, the Jambi City government intervened in policy. The intervention is carried out in the form of: socialization, establishment of local institutions, capacity building of institutions, implementation of village surveys, preparation of activity plans, implementation of infrastructure development, provision of rewards, and establishment of Kampung Bantar classification from one RT to Kampung Bantar Kencana, consisting of several RTs.

The core development of the Kampung Bantar program is the equitable distribution of urban development that involves direct community self-reliance with the intention that a strong sense of ownership of development results will grow by itself. To accelerate the transformation process of people's understanding of the substance of the Kampung Bantar program in realizing the Smart City, in its implementation, the Jambi city government provided a companion team to the
Kampung Bantar which was coordinated directly by the Jambi City Community Empowerment Agency. The number of community assistants is as many as one person for each village. The existence of community assistants is a supporting factor or precondition to be able to encourage the community development process in planning the direction of the development of Kampung Bantar. The companion team is a volunteer who works on the basis of volunteerism of highly motivated communities to help develop city government programs. In addition, assistants also have the potential to be trusted by the community and understand the social characteristics of the local culture and are able to voice the real aspirations of the community. As explained by the informant to the researcher, namely:

I as RT do not have a deep understanding of the Kampung Bantar program. The Kampung Bantar program in this RT was not only for the cooperation and mutual cooperation of the residents, but also because of assistance from the assistance team of Kampung Bantar. The accompanying team presented here really understands what is the potential of our village, making it easy for residents to develop superior activities in Kampung Bantar. They know no time, sometimes on weekdays even at night. (Herman, Chairperson RT 41)

This phenomenon then invites us to note that the emergence of various awards at the national and international scale for the City of Jambi is a form of recognition produced by the Jambi City government policy in developing Kampung Bantar as an instrument to realize Jambi as a smart city. The meaning of Jambi as a smart city can be interpreted through the establishment of the Kampung Bantar and then has implications for the widespread management of RT-based cities with Clean, Safe and Smart insight. The smart city values offered by Kampung Bantar as well as the Clean, Safe City and Smart City residents are examples of the implementation of smart city praxis. The growth in the number of kamling posts, family medicinal plants, reading parks, mini waste banks to flower gardens in each RT area is a real manifestation. However, in practice, the head of the RT then became a figure that binds the layers of society to then unite in a development participation movement. This is actually very rare in the case of city development towards smart city where city residents are often known as apathetic classes on governance at the local level.

Some reflection points above, suggest that this is in line with what Widyaningish (2013) stated that the application of the smart city concept in urban planning is to realize sustainable development by improving community services by integrating several elements in urban areas such as government, economy, quality of life, environment, human resources, and transportation.

If seen from the implications, Kampung Bantar is important to develop so that the city of Jambi smart city is able to compete with other cities in Indonesia. For example, the City of Yogyakarta, Bandung and Surabaya, which had already implemented the smart city concept. Considering this, the main thing that must be done to realize Smart City in Jambi City is ideally through Kampung Bantar, namely in the future the city government needs to apply the other 3 smart city dimensions into Kampung Bantar policy. The 3-dimensional function, such as smart governance, smart economy and smart mobility, is presented as a complement to the ongoing policies of Bantar Village in creating a smart city based on settlements.

Whereas, if this offer is placed in the context of an actor, then the 3-dimensional approach used to perfect the Kampung Bantar in realizing Jambi smart city, all three of them put forward the role of the government. With the provision of government services at the RT level based on excellent service, the development of a creative economy based on local wisdom to provide accessible modes of transportation and communication and internet networks is expected to improve the achievement of the Kampung Bantar program as a smart city support. However, it should be noted that the implementation of the three dimensions mentioned earlier, in addition to the role of the government, the presence of the private sector, academics and the media has become important so that future development is aligned and there is no conflict of interest in it.

In addition, the more detailed phases of each dimension in question are then needed, given that Kampung Bantar is a superior program which has been an important aspect for the Jambi City
government in realizing smart cities in the region. One important argumentation base that explains this is that there have been implementation of wastewater management and solid waste activities, the existence of programs to improve environmental quality, adequate infrastructure, the existence of household-based economic activities, the creation of security and comfort, criteria for affordability of public facilities, and the quality of life of the people increases in daily life. Giffinger et al. (2007) also emphasize that the definition of smart city is a city that improves the quality of people life.

Bridges for City Welfare: The Role of Kampung Bantar

Is it true that Bantar Village is only the "lipstick" of the regional head? Or can it be present as an alternative welfare for the citizens of the city? In this session we must try to figure it out of general expectations about the local government program in realizing smart city. To understanding of the Kampung Bantar must be directly linked to the efforts of the Jambi city government to realize Jambi as a smart city. Considering that every product produced by Kampung Bantar starting from the activation of the security post as a city security knot, family medicinal plants as a support for residents' health to the RT reading park will result in the realization of Smart City dimensions, an indicator of Griffinger (2007) cities that implement smart city concepts, such as; smart people, smart living and smart environment.

In this position, he explained, the Jambi City Government realized that the welfare of urban communities could only be overcome by developing infrastructure and developing human resources. One of these developments is taken through Kampung Bantar which can organize and provide community needs to adequate and affordable security facilities. In fact, urban society has been so far, because various factors have not maximally obtained rights in services of security, cleanliness, education, and good government services.

In the context of Kampung Bantar, the Jambi City Government is well aware that the needs of the community in these dimensions are important, where the general public cannot easily access because of financial factors. The implementation of the Kampung Batar program initiated by the government which was then managed voluntarily by the community was a concrete action in overcoming the limited access. Moreover, this RT-based residential program will be easier to access in distance. In fact, it can be said that the role of Kampung Bantar in Jambi city is quite significant in encouraging the emergence of regional superior products through constructive collaborations of various elements. Data in the field indicates that the role played by Kampung Bantar can be said to have characterized the representation of participation and welfare.

How can this be explained? Democratic welfare management reflected in the Kampung Bantar program is in line with instrumentalist definitions by Harriss et al. (2005), namely the fulfillment of values of participation, accountability and transparency.

Moreover, the existence of Kampung Bantar has become a kind of lighter and stimulates growth and development, strengthening the awareness, empowerment and resilience of the people of Jambi city. This is supported by interview data, for example related to issues of quality of cleanliness, education and security of the region. That is, this quality issue becomes important and strategic because it is characterized by being complex and multidimensional, even very influential on the daily lives of all urban communities in Jambi. This is what stimulates the emergence of a shared awareness to grow Kampung Bantar as a means of joint welfare creation.

Conclusion

In general, major cities in Indonesia change the function of the dominant land, namely settlements to be used as public land functions that provide more economic value to groups and individuals. Seeing the trends that occur, urban villages are the target of a shift in the function of land to make room for this development. In contrast to the City of Jambi, we see the village of Bantar as a representative character of a unique and unpretentious community with village development that was built traditionally and outside the academic tradition and utilizing local materials. With this, urban villages or what are
called in Jambi as Bantar villages that already have this intelligence need to be maintained by adapting to the development of the city. This includes strengthening the dimensions of economy, government and mobility in supporting smart city instruments that have been met by the City of Jambi.

According to the description and findings of the research results, as well as the explanation and reflection stated above, there are several recommendation points to be followed up by the Jambi city government in the future. First, the development of smart residential-based cities in Jambi City in the future will not only focus on three dimensions of clean, safe and smart, but also directed to encourage the other 3 dominant dimensions, namely economy, governance and mobility to be implemented in every existing Kampung Bantar. Second, the need for strengthening network-based action strategies and partnership cooperation between various actors to fill the gaps in limited community self-reliance.

References


“Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” (Report It To The Governor): A Case Study Of Local Chief Executive’s Public Service Delivery In Bukidnon, Philippines

Andy N. Lanayan  
andylanayan007@gmail.com  
May Alnie Postrano-Butalid, MPoSc  
myebutalid@gmail.com  
Central Mindanao University  
Musuan, Maramag, Bukidnon, Philippines

ABSTRACT

Isumbong mo kay Governor (Report it to the Governor) is a radio program of the governor of the province of Bukidnon that is aired simultaneously by the radio stations present. This aims to address complaints, issues and concerns raised by the constituent-listeners of the province. Bukidnon is the only province in the Philippines whose local chief executive directly handles complaints of the constituent-listeners and addresses these complaints through the most accessible medium, the radio.

This study aimed to determine the perceptions of the constituents-listeners to the radio program in public service delivery of the most populated city in the province, Valencia City. Data was gathered in two different ways, first was through a survey which used purposive sampling in selecting the survey respondents. Second, was through interviews of the key informants from the Supervising Administrative officer of Provincial Governor’s office and the Governor. The tools used in data gathering were structured interviewing and opinion survey.

The study revealed that the respondents perceived the radio program as significant in public service delivery in Valencia City (the radio program acted and helps in facilitating the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners) as the program responded to their number one issues/concerns which is the waste management problem. The key informant, agreed that the program fulfills its duty to respond to the issues/concerns raised and it bridged the gap between constituents, governor and service providers. Also, that the radio program informs the constituents about their obligations to resolve the issues/concerns raised. However, the constituent-listeners recommended that the radio program should conduct an ocular observation in the area of concern to get the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners who have difficulties reporting their needs. Additionally, the program should conduct an after care evaluation from the action taken to the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners to validate whether the concerns are indeed addressed.

Keywords: Perceptions, Delivery of Public Services, Local Executive Management

INTRODUCTION

Within the development community, interest in the potential for citizens to hold service providers accountable is closely linked with an increased focus on governance and its role in achieving better service delivery. There have been spectacular successes and miserable failures. Both point to the need to strengthen accountability in three key relationships in the service delivery chain between citizens and providers, between citizens and politicians and between politicians and service provider. Improving the responsiveness of service providers to deliver public services to users efficiently and effectively, particularly the poor, is an ongoing challenge for developing countries. These challenges have driven the agenda for better governance and accountability. Governments, civil society, and donors have become increasingly interested in the idea that citizens can contribute to improved quality of service delivery by holding policy makers and providers of services accountable (Ringold et al., 2012).
In the past years the governor with other provincial officials and other government agencies personnel went to every towns and barangays in the province of Bukidnon to find out the real situation of the constituents and asked about the issues/concerns in their community. Later on, the governor found an idea of creating a radio program in which the constituents could report their issues/concerns, thus, cutting his travel to towns and barangays and providing himself enough time to do his other job as a governor. The radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in public service delivery is handled by the governor himself and started to be heard by the listeners on the air on the 8th day of January, 2014. The radio program had a duration of two hours every Wednesday of the week but was shortened to only one hour and was moved to Tuesday every week in the year 2017. The governor assigned a supervising officer in the person of Mr. Hanzel Echavez to handle the program when the governor is not around but the issues/concerns of the constituents must have an approval from the governor before being heard on the air.

This study determined the perceptions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in public service delivery in Valencia City. Also, the study determined the constituent-listeners issues/concerns raised to the radio program, the manner and the efficiency of the actions taken by the radio program in giving response to the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners. Moreover, the study determined the improvements in the public service delivery in Valencia City from the actions taken by “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor”

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The study determined the perceptions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in Public Service Delivery in Valencia City.

Specifically, this paper achieved to:

1. Determine the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners raised through the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in Public Service Delivery.

Social
Political

Environmental
Ethical

2. Determine the actions taken by “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” about the issues/concerns of constituent-listeners.

3. Determine if the “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” help constituent-listeners in facilitating their issues/concerns.

4. Determine the suggestions of the constituent-listeners as to how “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” can help improve the service delivery.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Figure 1. Conceptual Framework

The figure above shows the perceptions of the constituent-listeners in Valencia City, Bukidnon about the presence of “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in the said locale. The flow of the study starts with the constituent-listeners voicing out their issues/concerns to public service delivery through the radio program, then “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” acts towards the issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners through calling the attention of service providers in call/text; communication letter, then the service providers will act upon the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners that is how the radio program do help in the issues/concerns, and afterwards, from the actions taken by the radio program the constituent-listeners and how it helps facilitating
their issues/concerns and then they will now give their suggestions on how do the “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” could help in improving the public service delivery of the service providers in Valencia.

**METHODOLOGY**

This section contains the flow and methods of data gathering and discusses on how the data were gathered, interpreted, and analyzed.

**Research Method**

This study used the qualitative-quantitative descriptive method in which the researcher made an analysis base on the information that were collected from the response from survey questionnaires. To qualify the data that would be gathered for this study, the Likert rating scale was used. In describing the data, frequency counts, and mean was utilized.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Rating</th>
<th>Qualitative Descriptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>1.0-1.5: means that the respondent extremely opposes the statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Disagree</td>
<td>1.51-2.5: means that the respondent disapproves with the statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Undecided</td>
<td>2.51-3.5: means that the respondent disapproves with the statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Agree</td>
<td>3.51-4.5: means that the respondent neutral and do not have a stand on the issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Strongly Agree</td>
<td>4.51-5.0: means the respondent were utmost favor with the statement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This satisfaction rating was used to get the satisfaction of the constituent-listeners to the public service service delivery in Valencia City from the actions taken by the service providers Public (LGU) and Private service providers through the radio program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction Rating</th>
<th>Qualitative Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>Means that the respondent beyond satisfied with the public service delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Good</td>
<td>Means that the respondent is more satisfied with the public service delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>Means that the respondent is satisfied with the public service delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>Means that respondent is not satisfied with the public service delivery</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Research Instrument**

The study utilized research questionnaire and an interview guide in collecting information. Data from the selected constituent-listeners in the locale were gathered through a survey questionnaire using Likert Scale in which respondents chosed if they strongly disagree, slightly disagree, agree, slightly agree and strongly agree.

The interview guide was utilized by the researcher in conducting an interview with the key informants from radio personnel. The questions were mainly about determining the issues/concerns raised on the radio program, actions taken by the radio program, how do the radio program help in facilitating the issues/concerns raised on the radio program and suggestion to the action of the radio program to further improve the public service delivery of the local government unit and service providers.

**Locale**

The City of Valencia is the locale of the study. The researcher chose the said locale for it is classified as a component city in the province. Valencia City is said to be the center of commerce and trade and one of the most improving cities in the province. Also the researcher chose to study in the said locale since one of the radio stations which aired the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” is situated in the said city; this radio station is Radyo Commando. The said radio station is identified as privately-owned radio station. Furthermore, the study wanted to find out
the relevance of "Isumbong Mo Kay Governor" in the area.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

This presents the results and analysis and discussion of the study on the perceptions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program "Isumbong Mo Kay Governor" in public service delivery in Valencia City specifically on issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners, actions taken by the radio program, actions that helps the issues/concerns raised, and suggestions of the constituent-listeners on the radio program.

It discusses how the radio program "Isumbong Mo Kay Governor" affects the constituent-listeners in terms of public service delivery.

A total of 100 respondents were selected using a purposive simple random sampling in the City of Valencia who answered the survey questionnaires. The data gathered were discussed, analyzed, and interpreted. They are presented in tables followed by analysis and discussion.

Table 1: Social issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate water and electric services</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace and order in the province</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of adequate health care services</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal Drugs</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table presents the social issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners to the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table reveals that they were 32 respondents who affirmed that the inadequate water and electric services were raised by the radio program, followed by peace and order which has 21, then lack of adequate health care services has 19 respondents, and illegal drugs has 10 respondents.

Inadequate water and electric services ranks 1st, according to Judy L. Baker Lead Urban Development Economist of World Bank that rapid urbanization has brought increased demand for basic infrastructure and services, particularly in low income marginal areas where traditional service providers do not always go.

This was also mentioned by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that the number one problem in the province is the inadequate water and electric services because of the increasing demand, particularly in some barangays in Valencia City.

Peace and order constituted 21 respondents, this is not surprising as crime remains a significant concern in urban areas throughout the Philippines and Valencia City is not an exception. According to the Philippine National Police (2017) Directorate for Investigation and Detective Management, theft, physical assault, and robbery were among the most common crimes reported to local authorities in 2017.

This was also stated by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that they received reports about peace and order particularly gang riots in Valencia City.

Lack of adequate health care services issues/concerns in the province of Bukidnon according to the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that reports about rude and strict staffs were the usual issues/concerns in the the province.

The lowest is illegal drugs as indicated by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that the governor was already implementing his own version of campaign against illegal drugs before the President launch his Anti-Illegal Drug war, also before the governor receives significant numbers of reports about illegal drugs and the governor responded to the such issues/concerns with the help of the government authorities such as PDEA and PNP.

The issues/concerns about illegal drugs was the 5th as there is a massive efforts, both national and provincial government to solve the problem and resulted to the decrease in such issues/concerns. That is why it is not surprising that the issues/concerns involving illegal drugs decreases.
as one of the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners in Valencia City.

Table 2: Political issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corruption of Public Elected Officials (Bribery of government officials and Red Tape)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patronage System</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table presents the political issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners to the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table reveals that they were 35 respondents who affirmed that the Corruption of Public Elected Officials gained 35 respondents (Bribery of government officials and Red Tape) were raised, and followed by Patronage System which has 25 respondents.

Corruption of Public Elected Officials is a decades-old problem in the Philippines. The country ranks 101 out of 176 countries on the 2017 Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI), which evaluated the countries’ corruption levels on a scale from 0 to 100. The Philippines scored 35 out of 100, and the evaluators noted that any country with a score below 50 had a serious corruption problem (Philippine Star, 2017).

As affirmed by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that the constituents in the Bukidnon have faced significant difficulties in receiving prompt and efficient service from government departments and agencies. For example, in order to start a business the constituents had to complete 11 individual procedures and wait for at least 48 days for governmental approval.

There are a lot of cases of corruption in the Philippines as corruption comes in many forms that is why issues/concerns like this still exist in the Philippines.

The one that ranks 2nd is patronage system, as the widespread poverty are the deepest reason why the system of patronage politics still exists in the Philippines.

This is why the patronage system continues to exist in Valencia City because it is rooted in history and with the presence of poverty.

Table 3: Environmental issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global Warming (Flash Floods)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noise Pollution</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Management Problem</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table presents the environmental issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners to the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table depicts that there were 50 respondents who affirmed that the waste management problem were raised, followed by noise pollution with 18 respondents, flash flood gained 13 respondents global warming has 10 respondents, and 0 respondents for illegal logging.

The data reveals that Waste Management Problem got the biggest frequency in the data which ranks 1st. The population of Valencia City increases because its growing in such a way that waste management is also affected because of the increase in waste. As Remo (2018) writer of Inquirer indicated that as cities continues to develop, people from rural areas migrates to find job opportunities and as population increases waste management is also affected.

The local government unit of Valencia City is not strict in implementation of the rule of segregation in waste disposal so most of its constituents do not follow the rule which is one of the problems in waste management.

Noise Pollution ranks as 2nd this was supported by Atty. Genaro Cadigal of Valencia City, who stressed this has been the complaints of his constituents particularly by the senior citizens

Global Warming as supported by Department of Science and Technology (n.d.) that Global Warming is happening now. Evidences being seen support the fact that the change cannot
simply be explained by natural variation. The most recent scientific assessments have confirmed that this warming of the climate system since the mid-20th century is most likely to be due to human activities. Flash flood, according to the respondents that it is the most common issues/concerns of the respondents especially constituents who are living in the river side or in the catch basin areas.

Table 4: Ethical issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lesbian Gay</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisexual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transgender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Queer Questioning stigmatization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequality between women and men</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous People discrimination</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table indicates the ethical issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners to the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table shows that they were 7 respondents who affirmed that the LGBTQQ stigmatization were raised, followed by hostile working environment for women with 4 respondents, then racial discrimination with 2 respondents and inequality between women and men and marginalization of women in work has 0 respondents.

LGBTQQ stigmatization is present in some places in the Philippines as stated by the Human Rights Watch (2015) that members of the LGBTQQ groups often experience bullying at school and in some working environment. However, here in Valencia City there are members of the LGBTQQ community who were accepted at school and at work as a normal being and accepted to enjoy their rights like any other human beings do.

In the offices of the local government in there are members of LGBTQQ community working especially in the department where their skills are more useful. In some private offices and business establishments members of the LGBTQQ groups are also hired because of their skills in sales talk. This explains that although there are still issues/concerns about LGBTQQ stigmatization, some were still given the chance to prove themselves.

Inequality between women and men was not raised by the constituent-listeners as an issue/concern because in Valencia City, women are given equal opportunities with men in terms of job opportunities and position in the local government unit. The City Mayor of Valencia Azucena P. Huervas and Barangay Captain Ana Apostol Rempohito of barangay Poblacion, are both women and yet they have done great jobs for the good of the constituents. In fact, the Philippines is the only country in Asia to rank in the top 10 in this years rankings according to World Economic Forum (2018) being most gender equal country in Asia and maintained its ranking in the educational attainment and in the political empowerment category.

By this, it can be said that none among of the respondents reported the said issues/concerns in the city because of the high level of the gender equality and sensitivity in the locale.

Then, in response to the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners the radio program takes actions to the issues/concerns raised. The table below determined the perceptions of the constituent-listeners in Valencia City regarding the actions taken by “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” about the issues/concerns of constituent-listeners that will answer the main problem number two.
Table 5: Perceptions of the constituent-listeners in terms of radio program taking actions to the issues/concerns raised on the program.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Numeric Value</th>
<th>Qualitative Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The radio program informs the public on the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners on the program.</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The radio program gets community voices about the issues/concerns raised on the program.</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The radio program conducts investigations on the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners.</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The radio program creates a public discussion where the government officials and service providers were invited to address constituent-listeners issues/concerns and to reached an agreement.</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The radio program informs the constituents about their obligations to the solution to resolve the issues/concerns raised on the program.</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

General Mean 4.20 Agree

Legend: 1.0-1.5 Strongly Disagree 1.51-2.5 Disagree 2.51-3.5 Undecided 3.51-4.5 Agree 4.51-5.0 Strongly Agree

Table 5 shows that the respondents agree that the radio program is taking action to the issues/concerns raised on the program. The data reveals that the radio program informs the constituents about their obligations to the solution to resolve the issues/concerns raised on the program (4.38). This was supported by Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) the key informant that is the objective of the program to inform the public about the prevailing issues/concerns in the province of Bukidnon.

This means that the people believed in the strong partnership between constituent-listeners and the governor as what is mentioned that the radio program informs the constituents about their obligations to the solution to resolve the issues/concerns.

In addition, the radio program gets community voices about the issues/concerns raised on the program (4.32).

This was emphasized by Role of Radio in Social Development (2014) that the government could use radio as an arena to let the voices of the constituents be heard. This was affirmed by key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that issues/concerns that are reported by the constituent-listeners are given immediate attention and details of the report from the texters or callers and to the one reported to verify the complaint. That is mainly because the radio program make transcriptions about the reported issues/concerns that were verified from text or call of the constituent-listeners before the radio program publish the report.

On the other hand the respondents observed that the radio program conducts investigations on the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners (4.13). This relates to the report of OECD (2018), that the media and investigative journalism plays a crucial role in bringing financial and economic crime to the attention of the public and law enforcement authorities. This was affirmed by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that they relay the informations that were gathered from the reports of the constituent-listeners to the PNP or PDEA for them conduct investigations and then later raid the location with the warrant of arrest.

Also, the radio program creates a public discussion where the government officials and service providers were invited to address constituent-listeners issues/concerns and to reached an agreement (4.1). The above result is validated by the statements of the key informant. Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that most of the time heads of DOLE involving minimum wage, 4 P’s financial assistance was not deposited and SSS unclaimed
monthly pension were the usual guest to the radio program.

Furthermore, the radio program informs the public on the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners on the program (4.1). The lowest among all indicators obtaining only 4.1 are the radio program creates a public discussion where the government officials and service providers were invited to address constituent-listeners issues/concerns and to reached an agreement and the radio program informs the public on the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners on the program. This is mainly because most of the moment the radio program lacks the time to inform the public about all the issues/concerns raised to the program and to invite government officials and service providers to discuss and solve the issues/concerns they are involved.

Though all indicators obtained an Agreed descriptive value which signifies the perceptions of the constituent-listeners about the radio program "Isumbong mo kay Governor" is taking action in Public Service Delivery in is present in Valencia City.

This shows that the Provincial Government Office-Supervising Administrative Officer and the respondents have the same perceptions that the radio program is taking action on the issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners. The respondents agreed that they must also take actions from the issues/concerns raised to the program, while the PGO-Supervising officer feels the need for the service provider to give special attention to the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners. This implies that the radio program can be used as a tool to effectively inform and alert both the constituent-listeners and service providers about their obligations to the issues/concerns raised on the program. In the study of Omenessa (1997), stated that the radio program keeps the people inform as well as the service providers about their responsibilities as an effect they act upon the problem and take necessary steps. Proving that the radio program fulfills its purpose which is to inform, take appropriate and immediate actions to the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners.

Omensa (1997) further added that the radio program plays a great role in informing the constituents of the issues/concerns thus allowing the service providers to make immediate and appropriate actions concerning the issues/concerns.

After the radio program together with its partners (government authorities) acted on the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners. Table 6 below determines the perceptions of the constituent-listeners in Valencia City regarding the answer to the third main question that do the "Isumbong Mo Kay Governor" helped in addressing their issues/concerns.

Table 6: Perceptions of the constituent-listeners in Valencia City in terms of radio program do help in the issues/concerns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Numeric Value</th>
<th>Qualitative Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The radio program serves as a bridge between constituents, governor and service providers (LGU and Private institutions) in articulating the complaints to improve the service delivery.</td>
<td>4.45</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The information from complaints of constituents served as a reference by the local government unit to address the issues/concerns raised on the radio program.</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through the radio program an action (ordinance, allocation of budget and punishment or rewards to the service providers) by the local government unit was initiated.</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The radio program notifies the constituent-listeners about the improvements of the</td>
<td>4.04</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
public service delivery based on the previous complaints of the constituents.

Through the radio program there is an enhancement of quality and accessibility of the services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Mean</th>
<th>4.124</th>
<th>Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Legend:** 1.0-1.5 Strongly Disagree 1.51-2.5 Disagree 2.51-3.5 Undecided 3.51-4.5 Agree 4.51-5.0 Strongly Agree

Table 6 reveals that the respondents agree that the radio program do help in the issues/concerns. All of the respondents agreed on all the indicators. The data reveals that the radio program serves as a bridge between constituents, governor, and service providers (LGU and Private institutions) in articulating the complaints to improve the service delivery (4.45). This was validated by Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) the key informant that the radio program connects the constituent-listeners especially from the far flung areas to the governor through its mobile number, facebook accounts/pages, and email.

This is mainly because the radio program is just one text, call, and facebook private message away to report their issues/concerns; it also accepts issues/concerns every day 24/7.

This means that the constituent-listeners could sense the improvement in the public service delivery due to the efforts put up by the radio program. This shows that the radio program served as bridge between constituents and Governor in articulating the complaints to improve the service delivery. Through the radio program there is an enhancement in quality and accessibility of services it is evidently present in the city of Valencia. The radio program do help in the issues/concerns raised on the program and were firmly supported by the key informant and the respondents.

The respondents see that the radio program notifies the constituent-listeners about the improvements of the public service delivery based on the previous complaints of the constituents (4.04). As eloquently indicated in Role of Radio in Social Development (2014) the radio program could be used by the government in updating the constituents of their programs, services and policies.

This was validated by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that if there is an improvement or an action that was made to solve the issues/concerns they inform the person involve and the public.

Also, the information from the investigation of constituents voices serve as a reference by the local government unit to address the issues/concerns raised on the radio program (3.97).

Furthermore, through the radio program an action (ordinance, allocation of budget and provide punishment or rewards to the service providers) by the local government unit was initiated (3.85). The above result was confirm by Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that when they encounter issues/concerns pertaining to environmental degradation, the radio program forward the report to the DENR to deal with such issues/concerns. Then the DENR will make an agreement with the, and if they comply to the agreement then they are allowed to continue their operation, if not then temporary closure order will be issued, until the DENR will issue Environmental Compliance Certificate for them to operate again.

Though all indicators obtained an “agreed” descriptive value, this showcases the perceptions of the constituent-listeners that the radio program do help in facilitating the issues/concerns raised on the program for these to address in the LGU. This shows the good relationship between the constituent-listeners, radio program and the Governor in facilitating the issues/concerns raised to the program since the radio program serves as a channel for the constituent-listeners to report their issues/concerns to the Governor directly. The PGO Supervisor officer said that the radio program coordinate with other government agencies to act to the issues/concerns raised to the program to enhance the public service delivery for the constituents.

This implies that the radio program is useful in facilitating issues/concerns raised on the program.
Radio program gathers feedback from the constituent-listeners regarding the services providers thus, allowing there to get some ideas which of their services needs improvement. The radio program of Governor Jose Ma. R. Zubiri “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” provides access to the constituents of the province of Bukidnon to let the Governor know of their issues/concerns. The governor could take immediate actions on the issues/concerns of the constituents by informing the services providers of the issues/concerns and could monitor the development of their services easier with the aid of radio program.

From the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners raised to the radio program, the actions taken by the radio program in facilitating their issues/concerns such as social, political, environmental, and ethical issues/concerns. This table sums up the three main questions of the study to support the respondents’ satisfaction rating to the current public service delivery in Valencia City in the next table.

Table 7: The radio program responded to the social issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate water and electric services</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace and order in the province</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of adequate health care services</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illegal Drugs</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table depicts the social issues/concerns that were responded by the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table shows that they were 21 respondents who affirmed that the inadequate water and electric services and peace and order were responded by the radio program, then lack of adequate health care services has 22 respondents, 11 respondents for unequal distribution of wealth and illegal drugs gained 5 respondents.

**Inadequate water and electric services** ranks 1<sup>st</sup>. According to the statement of the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that the constituent-listeners raised issues/concerns involving inadequate water and electric services. The radio program responded by urging the service providers to include remote areas in the province and particularly in Valencia City in the Sitio Ratification Program of First Bukidnon Electric Cooperative (FIBECO) and the Water District. For these basic public services such as water and electric services could reach far flung barangays in the City of Valencia and in other barangays in the province of Bukidnon.

This means that the radio program has served as a mechanism in urging the service providers in the Province of Bukidnon to provide appropriate actions to improved the public services delivery in Valencia City in the sense that in can reached the far flung barangays and other barangays in the province.

**Illegal drugs** received the lowest rank as 4<sup>th</sup>, as stated by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that when an issues/concerns were raised to the radio program involving illegal drugs. The radio program responded with the cooperation of the governor and the PNP or the PDEA, and constituent-listeners who got the information about the target, the governor who relays the information to the government authorities and the PNP and PDEA who have the capacity to enforce the law.

This means that the radio program has created a mechanism to help solve the top most priority social issues/concerns of the national government and the Local government unit by getting the information from the constituents and actions from the government agencies and it resulted to the decrease of the reports for the said issues/concerns in the city.
Table 8: The radio program responded to the political issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Ranks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corruption of Public Elected Officials (Bribery of government officials and Red Tape)</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patron-Client System</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table shows that there were 18 respondents who affirmed that the corruption of public elected officials were responded by the radio program, and followed by patronage system which has 16.

**Patron-Client System** which ranks 1st among all the other political issues/concerns, as indicated by Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that they agree that Patron-Client System still exist in the province especially in Valencia City wherein the government services provided by the governor to the different municipalities and cities in the province. The government assistance that is supposed to reach all constituents, only those who have the close ties with barangay captain or the purok leader can benefit from the assistance given by the office of the governor. Now, to provide solution to this Patron-Client System, the governor coordinates with the Provincial's Discipline Committee to act and solve the issues/concerns.

But even with the actions taken by the governor and Provincial’s Discipline Committee, the existence of Patron-Client system will continue to exist as this is part of the Filipino culture from the legacy colonization period and widespread poverty and it couldn’t change overnight.

**Corruption of Public Elected Officials (Bribery of government officials and Red Tape)** according to the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that when the constituent-listeners report such issues/concerns, the radio program responded by forwarding the issues/concerns to the national government agencies like Civil Service Commission for them to deal with such issues/concerns and for them to provide solution for it.

This implies that it is not the radio program who responded to the issues/concerns but through the radio program the government agencies acts on the issues/concerns raised to the radio program.

Table 9: The radio program responded to the environment issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environmental Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Noise Pollution</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste Management</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Degradation (Global Warming and Flash Floods)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table details the environmental issues/concerns that were responded the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table reveals that they were 25 respondents affirmed that the waste management problem were resolved, followed by noise pollution with 11 respondents, flash flood gained 9 respondents, global warming has 7 respondents, and 0 respondents for illegal logging.

**Waste Management Problem** occupies the highest rank in 1st, as mentioned by the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that when it pertains to issues/concerns relating to waste management the Governor through the radio program calls the attention of the LGU Valencia to act on the said issues/concerns raised to their program.

This means that because the LGU Valencia and Provincial Governor’s Office take actions to improved waste management in their area such as sending or assigning the garbage truck to reach their purok or sitio and for constituents to be educated about waste management and incentives, and penalties for acts in violation of Ecological Solid Waste management. That is why it was perceived by the constituent-listeners as the issues/concerns the radio program is highly responsive.

**Environmental degradation,** according to the key informant Echavez, (personal communication,
February 04, 2019) that when they faced issues/concern with regards to environmental degradation the radio program responded to the issues/concerns by coordinating to the Department of Environment and Natural Resources. Then the DENR will respond by making an agreement to the one who got reported because of degrading the environment to comply with the environmental standards to protect the environment.

Table 10: The radio program responded to the ethical issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Issues/Concerns</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LGBTQQ stigmatization</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inequality between women and men</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous People discrimination</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table presents the ethical issues/concerns that were responded the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

The table reveals that there were 3 respondents who affirmed that the LGBTQQ stigmatization were responded by the radio program, followed by inequality between women and men, and racial discrimination.

LGBTQQ stigmatization rank 1st as the issues/concerns that was responded by the governor through his radio program by promoting awareness about LGBTQQ and how they are significant in the society (H. Echavez, personal communication, February 04, 2019).

While inequality between women and men has zero respondents and in rank 3rd, that is because most of the respondents were high school level and high school graduates who are less oriented by such issues/concerns. Also, they are not aware that these ethical issues/concerns are present in their area due to the fact that they are still living in a patriarchal society who reinforces this behavior.

Based on the actions taken by the radio program to the issues/concerns raised and how do it helps in facilitating the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners. Table 11 determines the satisfaction rating of the constituent-listeners on the current public service delivery in Valencia City to gauge the suggestions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program in the next table.

Table 11: Respondents satisfaction rating to the current public service delivery in Valencia City.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Excellent</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Very Good</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table reveals that among the 100 respondents, with the efforts that were put up by the Governor, LGU, and the private service providers the constituent-listeners rated Valencia City public service delivery there were 5% who rated Valencia City public service delivery as excellent, followed by very good which constituted 17%, then average gained the highest percentage of 74% and 4% of the respondents who rated poor.

The huge percentage constituent-listeners rated the current public service delivery in Valencia City as average because they are just satisfied with the governor and the public and private service providers actions due to the fact that some issues/concerns still persist the locale of the study. It fails to put an end to some issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners to the radio program. Furthermore, other service providers only acts when the governor require them to act to the issues/concerns but after that the issues/concerns will keep on coming back because the service providers go back to what was the status quo before. Also, there were some issues/concerns that were raised on the radio program but were not acted by the service providers even if the governor requires to them to act on it. In addition, the constituent-listeners are afraid to report their issues/concerns because it may put them to the jail or get penalize as they
were not aware of the policies/laws/ordinances that protects them from being punish by reporting their issues/concerns. Lastly, the respondents rated the public service delivery in Valencia City as poor because some of the constituent-listeners issues/concerns who have difficulties reporting their needs to the governor that is why there are still a number of issues/concerns that continue to exist because these were not given any solutions as caused by constituent-listener not able to report their issues/concerns.

From the actions taken by the radio to the issues/concerns raised and how do it helps facilitating such issues/concerns and based on the satisfaction rating of the constituent-listeners to the public service delivery in Valencia. Table 12 presents the suggestions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” help improve the service delivery in Valencia City.

Table 12: Suggestions of the constituent-listeners on how “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” can help improve the service delivery in Valencia City.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ensure impartiality in delivering the issues/concerns raised.</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>3rd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitors the service providers actions/ performance.</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>4th</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct an ocular observation to the area of concern.</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>1st</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct an after care evaluation from the action taken to the issues/concerns raised.</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2nd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Give opportunity to constituents to use access to information policies/laws to demand action.</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5th</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 12 presents the respondents suggestions to the radio program based on the perspective of the 100 household heads interviewed.

Each suggestions is discussed individually to wit;

(1) Conduct an ocular observation to the area of concern.

According to Levy (2009) that the elected officials (in this case the governor/radio program) should observe the current situation in the area where the issues/concerns emanates to get the issues/concerns of the constituents who have the difficulties communicating their needs. They may sometimes lack self-confidence in approaching an elected official or may feel inadequate in expressing their issues/concerns.

This is in contrast with the statement of the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) stated that it is not a necessity to conduct an ocular observation, since they can get the details and verifies the issues/concerns by asking questions to the constituent-listeners who reported the concern. But if it involves illegal drugs wherein an investigation/observation should be conducted it is now the task of the governor to coordinate with the PNP or PDEA to act on such issues/concerns.

This means that ocular inspection of the radio program is necessary on serious cases like crimes on illegal drugs with the coordination of an appropriate government agencies (PDEA) and to get the issues/concerns of the constituent-listeners who have a hard time reporting their issues/concerns.

The table reveals that they were 46 respondents who suggested that the radio program must conduct an ocular observation to the area of concern. And there were 38 of the respondents who suggested that the radio program must be conduct an after care evaluation from the action taken to the issues/concerns raised. This means that the almost half of the respondents suggested that the radio program must conduct an ocular observation to the area of concern. That is because the respondents feels the need for the radio program to conduct an ocular observation to their purok or sitio where the issues/concerns eminates rather than just settling in verifying the issues/concerns raised to the program by asking questions from the constituent-listeners.

(2) Conduct an after care evaluation from the action taken to the issues/concerns raised.

According to the respondents that the radio program should assure that the issues/concerns
raised have been acted and resolved because some service providers fails to act on the issues/concerns raised.

But in the statement of the key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) that they are informing the constituent-listeners to any improvements of the actions made by the service providers (LGU & Private Institutions) to the issues/concerns raised to the program. Also, the radio program receives reports from the constituent-listeners if the issues/concerns persist then the radio program intervenes by coordinating to the government authority or they will remind the the service providers to act upon the issues/concerns raised by constituent-listeners.

(3) **Ensure impartiality in delivering the issues/concerns raised.**

In the Philippine government, the media system is perceived by the constituents as biased for whatever administration is in power (Teodoro, 2016).

But the statement of Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) indicates that the radio program gets the side of the parties involved in the issues/concerns before they publicize it. To be fair to the one reported, to defend itself from the issues/concerns raised by the constituent-listeners, for the governor to provide solution based on the statements of both sides that represents their demands and support to make an efficient public service delivery.

(4) **Monitors the service providers actions/performance.**

According to the respondents that the radio program should serve as a watchdog to the services providers to investigate if the actions have been taken.

The key informant Echavez, (personal communication, February 04, 2019) stated that the constituent-listeners report to them about what is happening to or from intervention of the governor’s office because if the issues/concerns came from their area the constituent-listeners will be able to see and feel the solution provided to the issues/concerns and then it is a cooperative resolution to help the the governor in checking the performance/actions of the service providers.

This means that it is not a necessity for the radio program to monitor the service providers actions/performance because the constituent-listeners are the one monitoring them. They are the one who reported the issues/concerns especially if it emanates from their area, if they sensed that there is no improvement in the public service delivery or the service providers fails to act on the issues/concerns raised then the constituent-listeners report it again to the governor through the radio program.

(5) **Give opportunity to constituents to use access to information policies/laws to demand action.**

The public information creates awareness and generates acceptance of government policies and programs if used effectively. It also mobilized public participation in development works and improve the image of government. The Government media are mandated to help and create an image of efficient and effective bureaucracy. In performing their task, they are also expected to be objective fair in their reportage. Thus, in the spirit of transparency, weaknesses or gaps in public service may be identified to call the concerned government official’s attention to address such problems (The Role of Radio in Social Development, 2014).

**CONCLUSION**

The study reveals that the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” has drawn plenty of constituent-listeners not only for those who have issues/concerns but also for those curious constituent-listeners who wanted to know the actions taken by the governor. This radio program serves as a bridge between the governor, the constituents of the province, the service providers and the concerned government agencies.

Most of the respondents agree that the radio program is very helpful to them because their issues/concerns could reached to the governor and could be acted in a fast way unlike before when their issues/concerns could only be heard by the governor when they would go to the office of the governor or wait for him to visit their barangay.

Most of the respondents stated that their issues/concerns about inadequate water and electric services, problems on waste management and other issues/concerns in Valencia City were responded upon the radio program. The study
further shows that the radio program is beneficial on the part of the governor to be able to hear the issues/concerns of the constituents and on the part of the constituents it is beneficial in such a way that they could easily be heard by the governor.

The radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” is a manifestation of the governor’s concern for his constituents in the Province of Bukidnon which the constituents hope to continue being aired in the years to come. The radio program provides a partnership between the governor, the constituents and service providers in imposing social and economic aspects towards sustainable development goals.

Recommendation:

Given with the findings and conclusions we can draw the following recommendations:

1. **To the Provincial Governor.** Since it is the Provincial Governor’s radio program, the governor must make time to handle the radio program on his own.

2. **To the constituent-listeners.** The constituent-listeners must be active in participating in the program such as reporting their issues/concerns without hesitation, help the radio program by valuable information and in monitoring the service providers or the reported one to ensure that an appropriate actions has been made to solve issues/concerns. Furthermore, the constituent-listeners should make initiatives or fulfill their obligations in solving issues/concerns raised to the radio program from their community.

3. **To the radio program.** “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” must conduct an ocular observation to the area where the issue/concern originates so that they can ensure that aside from verifying the issues/concerns by asking details of the problem, they also should go to the area and asks the constituents if the issues/concerns are true.

4. **To the researchers.** This study is recommended for the future researchers who want to study the perceptions of the constituent-listeners to the radio program “Isumbong Mo Kay Governor” in public service delivery in Valencia City to increase the the number of key informants to get different perspective from other credible people. There should be a representation coming from each sectors such as radio stations, LGU in the local of the study, and other Provincial Governor Officers to generate the best data coming from their experiences in fields respective positions. In addition, a similar study must be conducted in all 31 barangays in Valencia City including far flung areas to have a comprehensive grasp of the perceptions of the constituent-listeners regarding the radio program.

References


THE REVITALIZATION OF TECHNICAL COMPETENCY DEVELOPMENT OF THE
STATE CIVIL APPARATUS (ASN) AT THE STATE CIVIL SERVICE AND HUMAN
RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AGENCY OF BIAK NUMFOR, PROVINCE OF
PAPUA

Fatmawada Sudarman (fatmawadha@gmail.com),
Djamil Hasim (djamil.hasim1964@gmail.com)
The Institute of Social and Political Science (IISIP) of Yapis Biak
Jalan S. Condronegoro (Samofa), Biak-Papua Province 98156, Indonesia

Abstract
This study aims at analyzing the revitalization of the technical competency development of the State Civil Apparatus
(ASN) at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua
Province. The research employ a descriptive research with a qualitative approach. Primary data was collected
through observation, interviews and Focus Group Discussion (FGD); the respondents were the State Civil
Apparatus at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua
Province. Secondary data was obtained through documentation studies. The data were analyzed using interactive
models. The results showed that the revitalization of the development of the technical competency of the State Civil
Apparatus at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency was carried out through
strengthening the knowledge and skills. More specifically, the results of this study indicate that the pattern of
competency development of the State Civil Apparatus is still dominated by its irrelevance between types of
development and the competencies of skills and knowledge of State Civil Apparatus who delegated to join the
development program, so that it affects the ability and performance of the State Civil Apparatus who have not been
able to answer their duties and functions in the organization.

Keywords: Revitalization, Development of Technical Competency, State Civil Apparatus
INTRODUCTION

The Republic of Indonesia which was proclaimed on August 17, 1945, is an "independent" and "sovereign" country in national ideals, and being the part of a global system that cannot be separated from the influence and impact of the region state, both economic, political, social, culture, education, science and technology, and Human Resource (HR). The globalization, on one side, can have a negative impact such as: increasingly strengthening the dependency of weak countries against the strong one. On the other hand, it can have positive effects such as: the governance is more democratic, transparent and accountable in fulfilling social services.

In the new order era starting in 1971 until the reform era, the government never stopped vocalize the need for efforts to foster, improve and control the government officials both at the central and regional levels, which were intended to be efficient, effective, clean and authoritative and capable to carry out the general duties of government and to carry out the development smoothly, based on enthusiasm and attitudes towards the community.

Human resource as one of the elements in the organization can be interpreted as human beings that working in an organization, and to support the realization of a quality human resource process a variety of superstructure and infrastructure need to be prepared. Human resource is the whole people who work in organizations that contribute to the running of the organization. Human resource is the power of thinking and human work that is still stored in oneself, which needs to be developed, in order to be utilized as well as possible for the welfare of human life. Potential abilities possessed by humans, which consist of the ability to think, communicate, act, and be moral to carry out a technical and managerial activity. Human resource in the organization must be given full attention, especially in an environment that is completely uncertain because human resources have an important role that determines the life and death of the organization. The human resource that referred to in the context of this study is the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) who work in the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province. The mandate of Law Number 5 of 2014 concernin the State Civil Apparatus, the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia of 2014 Number 5494 confirms that the State Civil Apparatus, hereinafter abbreviated as ASN, is a profession for civil servants and the government employees with work agreements that work for the government agencies.

The State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province, has a job description and functions that refers to the Regent Regulation Number 120 of 2017. The description of the tasks and functions are including:

The State Civil service and Human Resource Development Agency has the task of helping the Regent in carrying out the supporting functions in the sector of staffing and developing the human resource which is the authority of the regional government.

In carrying out the tasks as referred to in paragraph (1), the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency shall carry out the functions to:

Formulate the technical policies in the field of staffing and human resource development. Carry out the technical support tasks in the field of staffing and human resource development. Do monitoring, evaluating and reporting on the implementation of tasks of technical support in the field of staffing and human resource development. Guide and direct the technical policies in implementing functions supporting regional government affairs in the field of staffing and human resource development. Do other functions as being ordered by the Regent in accordance with their duties and functions.

The description of the tasks and functions mentioned above is not only positioned as a handbook of guidance for members of the organization of the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of the Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province but also as one of the guidelines in the realization of work productivity. In addition, in carrying out the duties and functions of the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province. Of course, it must be supported by professional and reliable human resources so that better quality public services can be achieved. Organizations or agencies that want to stay progressive, developing and have a positive image in the eyes of the public will not ignore the aspect of developing the quality of their human
resource. According to Akib (2011:241) that the expected organizational transformation is not like what was allegedly "just old wine in a new bottle", only as old wine in a new bottle. However, organizational transformation actually occurs as a heuristic, that is, a scientific process to normalize human creative behavior in knowledge-based organizations. Akib (2011:227) also argues that organizational transformation can be achieved through organizational transformation models, and one of them is through revitalization that strengthens or enforces functions and elements within the organization. According to Danisworo (2002) revitalization is a process for re-strengthening something that previously had significant influence and role but has experienced a decline/degradation. Whereas according to Okilanda (2018:90) that revitalization in general is attempts to make something important and necessary. Through this statement, it can be confirmed that transformation can be carried out in various ways that can have an impact on organizational change and renewal.

One of the targets that can be used for leaders in order to carry out the investments and attention to human resources within the organization is to develop these human resources. Development is a learning process that is designed in order that the employees can develop, the purpose of development is not only to improve the employees' performance now but also to focus on the long term and to help employees prepare the jobs in the future. "Development represents an inventory that is oriented to the future in employees and emphasizes on improving the ability to carry out new tasks in the future" Siagian (2007:183).

Furthermore, Fathurrochman (2007:124) suggests that development is an attempt to increase knowledge, skills, and abilities and maturity of thinking which is automatically accompanied by changes in morals and behavior in carrying out government and development tasks. Whereas according to Sedarmayanti (2009:48) that efforts to improve the quality of human resources apparatus can be done through the process of education, training and development program.

Furthermore, Sudarmanto (2009:229) argues that development is a learning opportunity to help individuals/employees develop in the long term”. Suwato & Priansa (2016:103) suggests that "development is defined as the preparation of individuals to assume different or higher responsibilities within the organization". Development is usually associated with an increase in intellectual or emotional abilities needed to do a better job. Development stand on the fact that an employee needs knowledge, expertise, and abilities that develop in order to work well in the succession of positions he has undergone during his career.

The development of human resource refers to the problems of staff and personnel which are to maintain and improve the employees' competencies in order to achieve organizational effectiveness. Development is a systematic and organized procedure with general and conceptual and theoretical learning processes for general purposes. Swason & Holton (2001:4) suggest that human resource development is "a process for developing and unleashing human expertise through organizational development and personnel training and development for the purpose of improving performance". Whereas McLean & McLean (2001:10) suggest that human resource development as "process or activity that, either initially or over the long term, has the potential to develop adult's work-based knowledge, expertise, productivity and satisfaction, whether for personal or group, team gain, or for the benefit of an organization, community, nation, and ultimately, the whole of humanity ".

Human resource development includes activities directed towards organizational and individual learning. Human resource development is manifested in activities aimed at changing organizational behavior. Human resource development shows an intentional effort with the aim of changing the behavior of organizational members or at least increasing the ability to change. So, the main characteristic of human resource development is activities that lead to behavior change. Human resource development is all activities carried out by organizations in facilitating employees to have the knowledge, expertise, and attitudes needed to handle current or future work. The activity in question, not only in the aspects of education and training, but involves aspects of career and organizational development. In other words, the development of human resources is closely related to efforts to improve the knowledge, abilities, and / or attitudes of organizational members and the provision of career paths that are supported by organizational flexibility in achieving organizational goals.
In article 70 of Law Number 5 of 2014 states that "every ASN has the opportunity to develop their competencies". Elkin (1990:22) suggests that "Competence is a wide concept which embodies the ability to transfer skills and knowledge to new situations within the occupational area". Whereas Hammod (1989) suggested that "competencies can be deep-seated qualities of people (motivation, traits, etc.)".

Competency development is the development given to employees to increase the knowledge, skills, abilities, attitudes, and appreciation needed in carrying out their duties professionally, effectively and efficiently. In this study, the focus was more on ASN with Civil servant status. Article 69 of Law Number 5 of 2014 confirms that one of the Civil Servants competency qualifications is technical competency, which is measured by the level and specialization of education, training, functional technicality.

Based on what happen currently, it shows that the technical competency possessed by the ASN at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province has not supported the employees yet to carry out their functions within the organization. From the illustrated data, the level of education of the State Civil Apparatus at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province shows that as many as 56 employees, 22 employees (39.28%) have relatively low educational background, 3 employees (5, 35%) of whom are employees who occupy positions as Head of Sub-Sector, (Data Source: the Sub-Sector of Data and Information of BKKDM Biak Numfor Regency in 2018).

These problems have an impact on the implementation of operational activities where there are still some ASNs that have not been responsive in providing services, as well as the low level of discipline of ASN such as ASN who often arrive late and leave the place during working hours. As a result, it has an impact on public services. As often as people can be seen waiting for a long time to get the desired service. From the description of the condition of the human resource of the apparatus at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) above, this study analyzes the revitalization of technical competency development at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province.

Revitalization is the process of reinforcing an important aspect of the organization so that it can have an impact on its roles and functions. Revitalizing the development of human resource competencies is a very important aspect in organization as a process of forming a new paradigm in strengthening the function of developing human resources in organizations.

METHOD

This type of research is a descriptive study with a qualitative approach. This approach is used to find in-depth information and understand phenomena that are occurring naturally regarding the development of technical competencies in the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province. The type of data used in this study consists of primary data and secondary data. Primary data through direct observation to the location of the study conducted from September 2017 by looking at matters relating to the object of research such as the implementation of the development of technical competencies and then making notes to obtain a clearer picture and providing clues to support further processed data. Furthermore, interviews conducted in the pre-study from September 2017 and in-depth interviews conducted by researchers in the research process to obtain information from competent informants related to the development of technical competencies using the guided interview technique conducted by the interviewer in July 2018 with a series of complete questions and in detail, the informants were 10 State Civil Apparatus and 1 of them was the key informant. The selection of the 10 informants was based on the criteria that the informant was an employee who worked long enough for the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency and had direct activities with the objects to be studied so that they were believed to be able to provide the information needed related to research. The informants in this study consisted of Head of Subdivision, Head of Division, Head of Sub-Sector, Secretary, Staff and Head of Agency who acted as key informants. The election of the Head of the Agency as a key informant on the grounds that the Head of the Agency is the highest leader who can provide more accurate information related to the development of technical competencies in the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency. In addition to through direct observation and interviews, primary data was also obtained.
through questionnaires related to the development of cultural social competencies that were shared with respondents during interviews. Data collection techniques were also conducted through Focus Group Discussion (FGD) to draw conclusions on subjective meanings that are difficult to give their own meaning by researchers related to the development of technical competencies in BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, while participants were active in Focus Group Discussion (FGD) is a Civil Apparatus that rarely even has ever received the development of technical competencies consisting of 6 State Civil Apparatus. For secondary data, the researchers collected data from the State Civil Apparatus at the BKPSDM in Biak Numfor Regency, the data collected from the Head of the Data and Information Sub-Sector, and the Head of the General and Employees Subdivisions. In addition, secondary data is also obtained from scientific writing (related books / literature, reports, scientific works and relevant research results).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION
Development of human resources is a condition that must exist within an organization. The development of human resources is an effort carried out in an organization to improve performance and for employee growth, as well as increasing intellectual capacity needed to carry out better work in the organization. Chalofsky (2014) argues that "human resource development is interpreted as a study and practice of increasing the learning capacity of individuals, groups and organizations through the development and application of learning-based interventions with the aim of optimizing the growth and effectiveness of people / employees and organizations".

Article (69) of Law Number 5 of 2014 affirms that one of the ASN competency qualifications is technical competency that measured from the level and specialization of education, training, functional technical. Covey, Merrill, & R. Merrill (1994:7) suggest that technical competencies include knowledge and expertise to achieve agreed upon results, the ability to think about problems and look for new alternatives. Based on the results of interviews with informants (IA) as a Staff for Employees Development at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 09 July 2018) states that the development of technical competencies that have been provided such as training in functional positions, employees auditors and functional team and education auditors.

In addition, (FDS) as Staff for Procurement and Dismissal of Employees at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 10 July 2018) said that the development of technical competencies that have been given to employees is through education (study delegation and learning assignments), and specifically for study assignments that are funded by the Regional Government (PEMDA) because there are some Universities that are outside the region in collaboration with the Regional Government (PEMDA) of Biak Numfor Regency so that employees can be sent to study at the University. Furthermore, the development of technical competencies such as the use of Information and Technology (IT). Furthermore, the opinion of (BAE) as the Head of the General Subdivision of Staffing at BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 10 July 2018) said that the development of technical competencies has been given to several employees at BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Papua Province, like functional technical training, with a development model adapted to the rules or regulations of the Institute of Public Administration (LAN) such as using a new pattern, the development has gone well but returning to employees how they are given development can apply what which they get in the process of developing these competencies into their jobs.

Similarly the interview with (JRW) as the Head of the Sub-Sector for Competency Development at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 11 July 2018) said that so far the development of technical competencies had been given to employees through training level leadership the first, the second, third and fourth level, which can be known as the PIM, the third level of PIM for the head of the Division or Secretary and the fourth level of PIM for the head of the Sub Division.

The same opinion from (JR) as Secretary of the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 11 July 2018) said that the development of technical competencies that have been provided is structural training given annually to employees, in structural training there some parts of the government's financial technical mission, technical expenditure on goods and services. Furthermore, the development of
technical competencies such as education and training, but the implementation is not optimal because there are several employees who are given the development of education and training that are not in accordance with their field of work. Similar with (JR), (PO) as the Head of Apparatus Development Division at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 09 July 2018) said that the development of employee technical competencies which had been implemented in 2016 was technical training staffing, financial technical training and Technical Guidance (BIMTEK). The development has been given but the implementation has not yet been optimal and there should be monitoring for its main employees at the level of discipline in terms of time and that are still low in performance. Furthermore, the opinion of (DF) the Staff of the Mutation Division at BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 13 July 2018) said that the development of technical competencies which had been provided in the form of seminars and workshops. Although the implementation sometimes does not touch on the understanding of each employee, so far, the material given when training is good, but sometimes the employees who are sent to participate in the training activities are out of sync with the type of training being implemented. Other problems such as the implementation of development should consist of theory and practice, but so far the implementation of development is not run so because of constraints with support such as Wi-Fi networks and the presence of several employees who do not carry facilities such as laptops during the development program, so that what is given during development cannot support the implementation tasks and functions in the organization.

A different opinion by (AM) as the Head of the Procurement Data and Information Sub-Division at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 09 July 2018) said that for the past 2 years there had never been a development of technical competencies. Regarding this development, it has been given to other parts, such as in the ranks there are three employees who follow the employee auditor this year. But in our field the field of procurement of data and information for the implementation of this development has never been carried out again, and so far we have worked according to what we know only or self-study to develop capabilities related to our Main Tasks and Functions (TUPOKSI) especially related to the employee information.

Agree with (AM)'s opinion, (AR) as the Head of the Mutation Sub-Division at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 10 July 2018), said that the implementation of technical competency development since a few years ago was often carried out and given to employees but for now the development has never been given. To obtain the validity of the data, the researcher then triangulated by conducting interviews with (IPW) as the Head of the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province (interview, 18 July 2018) which stated that the development of technical competencies given to employees was through assignments study, seminar and Technical Guidance (BIMTEK). The development is right even though the implementation has not been maximized. However, in order to make the employees to work better, I, as a leader of the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province applies a pattern of guidance in the form of reward and punishment for employees so that they can be more active in their work, even though the implementation is not optimal.

The same thing was stated by several State Civil Apparatus in the BKPSDM through a Focus Group Discussion (FGD) which said that "the development of technical competencies has been given to the State Civil Apparatus at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency Province Papua such as training, seminars, workshops, and Technical Guidance (BIMTEK), as well as formal technical competency development through education which consists of study delegation and study assignments. However, to form the technical competency of the State Civil Apparatus at the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, it must pay attention to the relevance between competencies possessed by the State Civil Apparatus that assigned to join the development program with the type of development that is implemented using the appropriate development model with rules or regulations so that the development pattern is able to answer the tasks and functions of the State Civil Apparatus in the BKPSDM of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province. In relation to the data obtained at the research location, it has been shown that so far there have been efforts made in developing the employees'
technical competencies in BKPSDM, by strengthening the skills and knowledge. Skills are demonstrated by the implementation of training, namely functional technical training and government financial structural technical training and structural technical training, staff auditors, seminars, workshops, Technical Guidance (BIMTEK), and courses on Information and Technology (IT). Furthermore, the development of technical competencies that have been provided by strengthening knowledge is demonstrated by the implementation of formal competency development through education which consists of study permits and study assignments.

In the theory of competency proposed by Spencer & Spencer (1993:9-11) it indicates that the dimensions of competency that are easier to develop are knowledge and skills, because they tend to be more observable and relatively on the surface of a person's characteristics. Competency is a determining factor for someone in producing good performance and also the success of the organization in achieving the goals of Sartika & Kusumaningrum, (2017:134).

The importance of the competency of the apparatus in an organization is basically related to the problem of human resources (human factors) in the life of the organization. In any organization, including public organizations (government organizations), the existence of elements of human resources will determine the ability of the organization in optimizing the achievement of the goals and objectives of the organization. Therefore, the important role of human resources in the organization will only be optimal if the existing resources have sufficient competence to carry out the functions carried out by the organization.

Theoretically, the existence of competence as a potential factor influences organizational performance in providing public services as explained by Krausert (2009:188) that "competencies are defined as demonstrable abilities to display behaviors that contribute to organizational performance". Competency-based human resource development is carried out in order to provide results in accordance with the goals and objectives of the organization with predetermined performance standards. Competencies possessed by an employee individually must be able to support the implementation of the organization's vision and mission through the organization's strategic performance. Therefore, individual performance in the organization is a way of increasing the productivity of the organization itself. As stated by Radhakrishna & Satya (2010: 33) that "performance is the key driver of success, which will lead to survival of organizations".

In simple terms, competency is defined as a set of abilities that include knowledge, attitudes, values and skills that must be possessed by a person in order to carry out the main tasks, functions and responsibilities of the job and / position he carries. The word basically is competent, means capable, qualified or skilled.

Competency as a person's ability to produce at a satisfactory level in the workplace, including a person's ability to transfer and apply these skills and knowledge in new situations and increase agreed benefits. Mitran, Dalziel, & David (1992) and Spencer & Spencer (1993); "An underlying characteristics of an individual which is related to criterion-referenced effective and superior performance in a job or situation". Based on this opinion that the word "underlying characteristics" contains the meaning of competence is a part of personality that is deep and inherent to someone and behavior that can be predicted in various circumstances and work tasks. While the word "casually related" means competency is what causes or predicts behavior and performance. While the word "criterion-referenced" implies that competence actually predicts who is performing well and is not good, measured by the criteria or standards used.

In the Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants of the Republic of Indonesia State Gazette of 2017 Number 63 confirms that technical competency is knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behaviors that can be observed, measured, and developed specifically related to the technical field of position.

The development of technical competencies is very important in increasing the productivity of the State Civil Apparatus which can have an impact on the quality of better performance. In the results of the study indicate that efforts in improving the technical competency of the State Civil Apparatus in the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency have not shown tangible results for the improvement of the technical competency of the State Civil Apparatus.

Generally, the implementation of the development of technical competencies related to structural training in education through training and
education is in accordance with the duties of the State Civil Apparatus at the BKPSDM as indicated by the implementation of third level leadership training for heads of fields or secretaries and fourth level leadership training for heads the sub-section shows that the implementation of the development is not relevant to skill competency and know-how, so that it has an impact on the results of competency development that cannot be implemented in structural positions. In accordance with Article 9 of the Government Regulation Number 101 of 2000 concerning position education and training for civil servants, it is confirmed that leadership training, hereinafter referred to as Diklat PIM, is carried out to achieve leadership competency requirements of government rules that are in line with structural positions. On these issues also have an impact on the equitable development of competencies of the State Civil Apparatus in BKPSDM. Bryant & G White (1987:15) explains that one of the aspects contained in the development of human resources is equity. To improve the performance of the State Civil Apparatus at the BKPSDM, development should be provided with aspects of equitable development to avoid divisions within the organization, where such divisions can have an impact on decreasing the capacity of services provided. Meanwhile, the key to the success of competency-based human resource development is the leadership's commitment to creating conducive conditions for employees of Efendi (2015:9).

CONCLUSION
The development of technical competency has been given to the State Civil Apparatus at the State Civil Service and Human Resource Development Agency of Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province. However, the development program has not been able to answer the ability of State Civil Apparatus to have an impact on aspects of the equity of development. In addition, the quality of public services given to the public are not in accordance with competency standards of the State Civil Apparatus. Besides, the model of development between the implementation of development with the employees’ skills and knowledge competencies who delegated to take part in the development program must be relevance and become the important concern to improve the technical competency of the State Civil Apparatus that can form knowledge, skills or abilities so that the professional quality standards at work can be achieved.
Acknowledgement
The author would like to acknowledge to Indonesian Endowment Fund for Education (LPDP) for its support.

REFERENCE
Government Regulation Number 101 of 2000 concerning position education and training for civil servants.
Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus.
Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants of the Republic of Indonesia State Gazette of 2017 Number 63.
Regulation Number 120 of 2017 Biak Numfor Regency, Papua Province concerning a job description and functions.
AN EMPIRICAL STUDY OF KEY FACTORS INFLUENCING CONSUMER'S PURCHASE INTENTION TOWARDS ELECTRIC VEHICLE IN BANGKOK METROPOLIS, THAILAND

Korakrich Montian a, Dr. Nanthi Suthikarnnarunai b*

a Department of Logistics Engineering, University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce, Thailand. korakrich.m@gmail.com
b Department of Logistics Engineering, University of the Thai Chamber of Commerce, Thailand. nanthi_sut@utcc.ac.th

Abstract

Electric vehicle (EV) is becoming a trend of attention that has been discussed more widely about the perception of modern vehicle technology, along with the rapid development which will alleviate the energy problems, air pollution and global conditions that are becoming more severe also Thailand are currently facing critical environmental issues and challenges. This paper was aimed at the empirical study to investigate the key factors influencing customer’s purchase intention and finding the predicted of consumer’s purchase intention EVs that may be influential in towards EVs coming soon. This study considered seven main factors that affect the purchasing intention of EVs; Finance Factor, Infrastructure Factors, Technological Factors, Environmental Factor, Policy Mechanisms Factors, Psychological Factors and Car-dealerships factors. A quantitative study using questionnaire which is randomly distributed in urban areas. The sample size is 500 respondents who live in Bangkok metropolis, Thailand. The data were subjected to statistical analyses and several methods were used to analyze statistics such as frequency and percentage, the chi-square test and a logistic regression model which was used to explain the factors relationship and influencing purchasing intention of forwards EVs. The results illustrated that the key factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention are Finance factors, Technological factors, Infrastructure factors and Policy Mechanism factors in statistical significance at .05 level. For Environmental factors, Psychological factors and Car-dealerships factors are no significant the consumer’s purchase intention EVs (p<.05). Finally, this logistic regression model findings, the suggestions have been made more encourage the consumer's purchase toward EVs in near future.

Key Words: Electric Vehicle, Purchase intention, Factors influencing
INTRODUCTION

During the past years, many countries worldwide have begun to attach more importance to Electric Vehicle (EV). It has been anticipated that EV will have an important role in replacing the vehicle with internal combustion engine (ICE) that uses fossil (petrol, coal, natural gas) in the near future (IEA, 2017; J.P. Morgan Research team, 2018). The problem of using a large number of vehicles is that it emits air pollution which increasingly and severely affected the environment and human living. In 2019, UNEP (United Nations Environment Program) launched the World Environment Day campaign with the slogan “Beat Air Pollution” or “Beat Air Pollution for the Quality of Life and the Environment” so that all sectors worldwide will pay attention to the solution to air pollution that is harmful for people around the world and also affects their living and health. From the data of UNEP, it was found that nine-tenth of the world population inhale polluted air. Each year, approximately 7 million people had the untimely death and more than half of these (over 4 million) were in Asia-Pacific region. This accounts for US$ 5 trillion of global economic damage per year. At present, EV technology has developed rapidly to make it the car of the future; therefore, the developers have attached importance to increasing the capability and producing the model that is convenient for daily life use. Furthermore, production costs are speedily lessened due to the advancement of various research development (OICA, 2017).

According to the executive summary report 2019 of International Energy Agency (IEA), the market share of EV global sales is anticipated to reach 23 million or as high as 30% of the total global vehicle sales in 2030 and tends to rise continuously.

![Fig.1 Future global EV stock and sales by scenario, 2018-30](image)

As figure 1 shows, China leads with the highest level of EV uptake over the projection period: the share of EVs in new vehicle sales reaches 57% across all road transport modes (i.e. two-wheelers, cars, buses and trucks), or 28% excluding two/three-wheelers. It is followed by Europe, where the EV sales share reaches 26% in 2030, and Japan, one of the global leaders in the transition to electric mobility with a 21% EV share of sales in 2030 (IEA, 2019). In Thailand, EV has a tendency to grow, to be more publicized and promoted in the country. Foreign countries are interested in Thailand as an important base for regional vehicle production because it has the potential in significant competitions in terms of domestic production and being the exporter. Nowadays, EVs in Thailand have gone through the development of modern technology and performance efficiency to meet the demand of users and to be environmentally friendly.

Consequently, Thai EVs have begun to develop in the same direction as the global market. The report of Power, J.D. (2018) discovered that in 2018, the accumulative number of EV registration increased at a high level from the previous year. The accumulative number of registered PHEVs and BEVs during 2011 to 2016 increased by 32%, and HEVs rose to 13% in contrast to that of ICEs that continuously dropped to 4%.

However, the proportion of EVs in Thailand is relatively low compared with the total registered vehicles at the end of 2016. The combined number of registered PHEVs and BEVs was only 132 while the number of registered HEVs in Thailand from 2010 was 79,657 (49% of the total registered vehicles). The reason is BEV is a new technology for Thai consumers, so they are not confident in the efficiency and the price is still high due to the battery price (the battery price is approximately 50% of the vehicle price).

In addition, the number of charging stations is limited, and other factors also have an influence on the consumers' purchase intention to replace their current vehicles with the future vehicles. In order to study these factors, the researcher conducted the research on factors influencing purchase intention towards electric vehicles in Thailand in order to use them for anticipating the behavior of the consumers who intend to purchase EVs, forecasting the quantity of EVs that will grow in the future and helping to set the direction for planning and promoting the
use of more EVs in the near future.

LITERATURE REVIEW
Previously, there had been many multi-dimensional researches on factors influencing purchase intention towards electric vehicles such as the questionnaire survey, the in-depth survey by interviewing experts stakeholders and academicians (Delphi Method), who are directly related to EV. From the studies of pilot projects in smart cities where EVs are used, the studies of successful countries and the studies of many researches related to foreign countries, it was found that the studies were conducted expansively and most of them are in the developed countries where EVs are really used. From Reference, the research Rezvani et al (2015) reported that the adoption of EVs can be seen as behavioral responses incorporating purchase and use. Nayum and Klöckner (2014) explained to attitudes towards both environmental and non-environmental aspects of electric cars are important for adoption of electric cars. Reference Ozaki & Sevastyanova (2010) displaying the survey revealed that the fiscal policy and the related special privilege policy are the main incentives for the purchase. EV high purchase price is the main obstacle for the dissemination of EV. Reference Brownstone et al (2000) and Lai et al (2015) showed the study and inspection of the factors influencing each individual’s purchase intention towards the full use of EV. The study found that the acknowledgement of economic benefit is one significant factor that influences the complete acceptance of EV. Recently Liao & Van Wee (2017) the research on consumers' attitudes has reviewed the literature related to consumers’ demand for EV in 2016. Reference Constantinides (2014) displayed the classification and conclusion of the factors influencing the consumers’ satisfaction such as psychological factors, economic and social variables, social influences and the mobility condition and the fear that EV cannot go far; it showed that these factors are completely exaggeration. The real problems are the widespread charging station infrastructure and the charging time.

An interesting research Wang & Liu (2015) distributed the online questionnaire to 1,057 Chinese respondents and found that charging station infrastructure still influences the consumers’ demand. In addition, the interesting research of William Sierzchula et al (2014) discovered that charging station infrastructure is highly related to the use of EV. An increasing large number of fast charging stations along main highways and the sufficient supply for the second-leveled charging stations near people’s accommodations evidently boosted the increasing use of EV who used multiple linear regression analysis, explained a relationship between those variables and 30 national electric vehicle market shares for the year 2012. The model found financial incentives, charging infrastructure, and local presence of production facilities to be significant and positively correlated to a country’s electric vehicle market share. The final results suggest that of those factors, charging infrastructure was most strongly related to electric vehicle adoption. The research of Browne et al (2000) which studied the factors that obstructed the rising number of EV users found that charging station infrastructure is one of the main factors that hinders the growth of EV use.

The government’s policy mechanism is very important because it is the main driving force at promoting and encouraging people to use more EVs. For example, the Electric Vehicles Initiative (EVI) has the joint policy which encouraged many governments to devote themselves to accelerate the introduction and acceptance of EV all over the world and pushed forward the use of EV in their countries. The US, China, Japan, Spain, the Netherlands and Sweden gave financial support to persuade people to buy and use EVs. Germany, Denmark and India gave assistance by reducing vehicle tax and road tax. Some countries like Finland, France and Italy gave financial support to reduce electricity price directly and indirectly. The government of each country attached importance to the infrastructure and supported it. Denmark, Finland, the US, Spain, the Netherlands, France and Japan supported EV charging stations to increase the number of the charging stations to support the use of EV. Germany and India supported the infrastructure by setting the national policy and building the prototype regions for expansion to other cities as people began to use more EVs because of this policy. Furthermore, there are some researches that support the factors related to the policy such as (Yong & Park, 2017) the study and analysis of the factors influencing the use of EV. The research result found that there are neither any efficient policy instruments nor the situation of the country for the provision of EV; consequently, there should be a mixed policy to apply for the use of EV. However, some researches have the following different perspectives: Research Degirmenci & Breitner (2017). A new study by a team from Aarhus
University in Denmark (Gerardo et al., 2018) has found that car dealerships pose a significant barrier to electric vehicle adoption at the point of sale due to a perceived lack of business case viability in relation to gasoline and diesel vehicles. Dealers represent an important yet understudied intermediary between new innovations such as EV technology and consumers. Only three North America-focused studies exist as of 2017.

Based on the review of related researches, the monitoring and the analysis of the situation in Thailand in the past period until now. The objective is proposed to investigate key factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs in Bangkok Metropolis are summarized 7 factors as follows Finance factor, Technology factors, Infrastructure factors, Environmental factor, Policy Mechanisms factors, Psychological factors and Car Dealerships factors. Otherwise this study will give recommendations to consumer's purchasing intention for improvements to increase opportunities of purchasing EV in Thailand.

SCOPE OF RESEARCH

To determine the scope of this study, the researcher focused on empirical studying the key factors to obtain the main influencing factors to customer’s purchase intention towards EVs in Bangkok metropolis, Thailand. The Variable of research, each factor was presented the description of the factor categories, as obtained from the focus group, is given as shown in Table 1.

METHODOLOGY

This research is designed as a survey research. The results of the research will correspond with the objectives of the study.

Population and Sample

The focus population of this research are all people living in the Bangkok Metropolis region which consists of 4 provinces namely Bangkok, Nonthaburi, Samutprakarn, and Pathumthani who can purchase and drive cars. These densely-populated areas tend to use EVs before other provinces, and this is in accordance with Thailand Energy Efficiency Development Plan 2015 – 2036. These areas were given the support and promotion to make an experiment in building charging stations in Bangkok and vicinities. This research was conducted on the sampling of 500 respondents (Sang, Yew-Ngin and Hussain Ali Bekhet, 2015) by Stratified Random Sampling with a focus on the research objective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. The Factors variable table</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Geo-demographic Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation Type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Behavior Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car Ownership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car Useage Frequency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV's price willingness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Finance Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing price of EV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel price of EV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance Cost of EV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resale Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technology Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driving Range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety of EV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance of EV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charging Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime of Batteries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of charging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charging Station Networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charging conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenhouse effect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy Mechanisms Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tax policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecological Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Incentives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1st EV car policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Psychological Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecologic Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology Enthusiasm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Image/Social Influences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Car Dealerships Factors</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warranty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV Model Availability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charging Promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintenance Promotion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purchase Intention</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willingness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Plan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
scope of research, theory, the in-depth interviews of 6 EV’s stockholder groups in Figure 2. Hence, those discussions were interesting in terms of the dimensions that affect purchase consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs in Thailand. The questionnaire was designed based on the current literature results which consisted of 2 sections; the first section was covered the demographic variable and the second section was covered the factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs in Thailand also all items were measured by using a 5-point Linkert’s scale of importance for rating: 5 points, 4 points, 3 points, 2 points and 1 point.

The questionnaire survey was validated by reference to the existing mature scales and tested by empirical research and the experts who examined, evaluated, improved and used it with the sampling group.

The primary data was obtained from an online questionnaire a total of 500 respondents answered the questionnaire. All part was designed by using the close-ended portion of questionnaire which adopted items from relevant literature.

Data analysis methods
The descriptive statistics of this study uses percentage, means and standard division. The average score is an assessment of the results based on the analysis of five levels; the result of each factor is the analytical interpretation of Means Scores evaluation.

The cross-table analysis was applied to get the two-dimensional whether there are relationships between demographics variables and the purchase intention EVs using the Chi-square test.

Finally, this research model was tested to assess multicollinearity in the regression model. Then the logistic regression analysis was applied to examine how seven independent variables are related to a dependent variable which are investigated the key factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs.

RESULTS
Descriptive analysis
The demographic attributes of the respondents were shown in Table 2. In conclusion, the ratio of male to female respondents is rather close (51.2% to 48.8%). In term of age, the majority of respondents is 20-50 years old or 94.0%;
RESULTS
Descriptive analysis
The demographic attributes of the respondents were shown in Table 2. In conclusion, the ratio of male to female respondents is rather close (51.2% to 48.8%). In term of age, the majority of 77.4% have bachelor and master’s degrees; 55.2% are company employees; 36.8% earn 10,000-30,000 baht per month and 29.2% earn less than 10,000 per month; regarding their accommodations, 66.6% live in a house; 20.2% in a dormitory/condominium; 47.8% of the household has 1-2 family members. About vehicles type, 57.4% use fuel oils and 16.6% use NGV/CNG/LPG; 49.6% use the vehicles for a distance of less than 50 km. From the questionnaire results, 88.4% of the respondents have never driven EVs; nevertheless, 32.8% are interested in buying EV’s price 500,001-750,000 Baht and 32.6% are interested in buying EV’s price 250,001-500,000 Baht.
Table 2 (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>EV Experience</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>How much price to buy EV?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>Cumulative</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Cumulative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>11.60%</td>
<td>11.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>88.40%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&lt; 250,000</td>
<td>11.40%</td>
<td>11.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>250,001–500,000</td>
<td>32.60%</td>
<td>44.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500,001–750,000</td>
<td>32.80%</td>
<td>76.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>750,001–1,000,000</td>
<td>15.00%</td>
<td>91.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&gt; 1,000,000</td>
<td>8.20%</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reliability Analysis
Reliability test refers to the fact that a scale should consistently reflect the construct it is measuring the Cronbach’s alpha coefficient to check the internal consistency among the items. The acceptable value is above 0.70 (DeVellis, 2003). In Table 3 shows the variable factors; Finance factors (FN), Technological factors (TN), Infrastructure factors (IF), Environmental factors (EV), Policy Mechanism factors (PM), Psychological factors (PS), Car-dealerships factors (CD). The results illustrated the Cronbach’s alpha for overall scale in 0.852–0.882, suggesting a very strong consistency among the items for each factor in this research.

Table 3. Descriptive statistics and reliability analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FN</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>0.566</td>
<td>0.882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TN</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>0.563</td>
<td>0.855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>0.755</td>
<td>0.852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.34</td>
<td>0.519</td>
<td>0.870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.25</td>
<td>0.607</td>
<td>0.865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>0.428</td>
<td>0.877</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.22</td>
<td>0.553</td>
<td>0.864</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlations Analysis
The cross-contingency tables and chi-square test are used to analyze the correlations between the demographic variables and purchase intention EVs.

In terms of the age variable is not significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=69.242, df=64; p=0.305> .05).

With the proportion of the education highest is also significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=182.474, df=80; p=0.000< .05).

In terms of the occupation, overall it can be stated that the occupation is no significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=123.096, df=96; p=0.033> .05).

In term of the income is significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=16.035, df=5; p=0.007< .05).

With the proportion of the residence who live in home will purchase intention EVs. The residence is significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=115.778, df=80; p=0.006< .05).

In term of the family size is significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=70.381, df=48; p=0.019<0.05).

In term of the Car ownership is no significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=83.916, df=80; p=0.360> .05).

In term of the Car used Frequency is no significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=92.180, df=80; p=0.166> .05).

With the proportion of the EV Experience is no significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=57.372, df=64; p=0.708> .05).

Also, with the proportion of the Purchase behavior of prices is also significantly different in purchase intention by a Chi-squared-test (χ²=121.131, df=64; p=0.000< .05).

To summarize, we found the correlations between the demographic variables; gender, education, monthly income, the residence, family size and...
Purchase behavior of prices is significantly to purchase intention EVs.

**Logistic Regression analysis**

The logistics regression model of this study was used by all enter method which to investigate the key factors influencing purchase intention EVs. It’s imperative to test if there is the problem of multicollinearity between the independent variable. As shown Table 4 the Pearson correlative coefficient is calculated to determine the relationships each main factor.

Table 4. Pearson correlation coefficient matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FN</th>
<th>TN</th>
<th>IF</th>
<th>EV</th>
<th>PM</th>
<th>PS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FN</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TN</td>
<td>.694</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF</td>
<td>.605</td>
<td>.486</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>.628</td>
<td>.575</td>
<td>.517</td>
<td>.540</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>.608</td>
<td>.599</td>
<td>.478</td>
<td>.471</td>
<td>.511</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>.560</td>
<td>.543</td>
<td>.573</td>
<td>.583</td>
<td>.608</td>
<td>.533</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The correlation coefficients between variables are all factors lower than 0.7, when shows that there is no multicollinearity problem.

The logistic regression model is proposed with all factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs. From Table 5, all seven factors have a very high relationship with consumer’s purchase intention EVs with multiple correlation coefficients of .168 and can predict the consumer’s purchase intention EVs in 16.8% with statistical significance at the level of .05, with a standard error in the forecast equal to ± .301. In term of considering the regression coefficient of the forecast found that there are four factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs; Finance, Technological, Infrastructure and Policy Mechanism can predict consumer’s purchase intention EVs in statistical significance at .05 level. However, there are three factors; Environmental, Psychological and Car-dealerships cannot be predicted consumer’s purchase intention EVs (p-value<.05). The standard error is ±0.301 using the following equation.

\[ Y \text{ (Purchase Intention EV)} = 1.555 + 0.233 \text{ (Finance)} - 0.228 \text{ (Infrastructure)} + 0.178 \text{ (Policy Mechanism)} + 0.152 \text{ (Technology)} \]

Table 5. The reliability analysis of factors influencing consumer’s purchase intension.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FN</td>
<td>.233</td>
<td>.079</td>
<td>.198</td>
<td>2.962**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TN</td>
<td>.152</td>
<td>.076</td>
<td>.124</td>
<td>1.996*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IF</td>
<td>-.228</td>
<td>.080</td>
<td>-.177</td>
<td>-2.860**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EV</td>
<td>.051</td>
<td>.081</td>
<td>.038</td>
<td>.632</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>.178</td>
<td>.068</td>
<td>.157</td>
<td>2.633**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS</td>
<td>.125</td>
<td>.087</td>
<td>.081</td>
<td>1.434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD</td>
<td>.015</td>
<td>.080</td>
<td>.011</td>
<td>.187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>1.555</td>
<td>0.301</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.163</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ R^2 = .168, \text{SEE} = .682, F=14.17, \text{Sig.of F} = .000, \quad *P<.05, \quad **P<.01 \]

**CONCLUSION**

In this paper takes Bangkok Metropolis, Thailand as a case study to examine the key factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs. Base on literature review and summary analysis, the research model is determined. The research variables consist 7 factors; Finance factors, Technological factors, Infrastructure factors, Environmental factors, Policy Mechanism factors, Psychological factors and Car-dealerships factors. The questionnaire of the respondents were analyzed for the descriptive information by using the means and percentages. The data shows that 51.2% of the respondents are males, in term of age 94% are between 20-50 years old, 77.4% have a bachelor’s degrees and a master’s degree, 55.2% are company employees, 36.8% have the monthly income
of 10,000-30,000 baht and 30,000-50,000 baht, 66.6% of them live in a house; 20.2% in a dormitory/condominium; 47.8% of the household has 1-2 family members. About vehicles type, 57.4% use fuel of oil; 16.6% use NGV/CNG/LPG; 49.6% use the vehicles for a distance of less than 50 km. From the questionnaire results, 88.4% of the respondents have never driven EVs; nevertheless, 32.8% are interested in buying EV’s price 500,001-750,000 Baht. With the study we found the correlations between the demographic variables; gender, education, monthly income, the residence, family size and purchase behavior of prices is significantly to purchase intention EVs.

The logistic regression analysis was applied to investigate the key factor influencing which related to consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs. The conclusion of this study found that there are four factors influencing consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs; Finance, Technological, Infrastructure and Policy Mechanism can predict consumer’s purchase intention EVs in statistical significance at .05 level. When there are factors; Environmental, Psychological and Car-dealerships are no significantly (p-value <.05) that cannot be predicted the consumer’s purchase intention towards EVs.

**DISCUSSION**

At present, EVs in Thailand still encounter several limitations regarding the use of these vehicles (Krungsri Research, 2017). Many important factors are in line with the key factors in this study; Finance factors, Technological factors, Infrastructure factors and Policy Mechanism. Only the support and promotion but do not respond to the consumers’ demand as a result, EV may be just the trend of interest but it is not really used. For example, the development of charging station infrastructure is supported and the EV driving test is made on the road, but consumers or the public do not really drive EVs, so real EV driving does not exist. The other important factors are vehicle import taxes, charging station infrastructure and consumers’ lack of confidence and experience in using EV. Furthermore, the government should support EV research and development, particularly the efficiency, and it should give assistance in the building and opening of charging stations. The OEM of EV may see restrictions in many aspects of manufacturing and importing EVs to the market in Thailand. Therefore, the government should set a national policy by starting with the studies of important factors. These are the goal that will lead to the real use for all groups of consumers, and the government should also encourage EVs to replace ICEs in near future. This will help to solve the main environmental problems that have occurred nationwide and will partially assist in lessening global warming problems and climate changes that currently have a critical impact on the quality of life of all humans.

**REFERENCES**


Krungsri Research, "Thailand with technology development EVs," Research Intelligence, May 2017.


Constantinides, E. "Influencing the online consumer's behavior," Internet research, 14(2), 111-126, 2004.


Gerardo Zarauza de Rubens, Lance Noel & Benjamin K. Sovacool (2018) "Dismissive and deceptive car dealerships create barriers to electric vehicle adoption at the point of sale" Nature Energy doi: 10.1038/s41560-018-0152-x


Room 4

Overall Program 2019
Abstract

The urgency and significance of the research on the actualization of functions and roles of the Principal is based on the assumption that "school success is the success of the school principal" carrying out their main tasks and functions, as expected in the implementation of Minister of National Education Regulation Number 13 of 2007 concerning Standards Principal / Head of Madrasah. The article from this research explains the actualization of the functions and roles of high school principals in Luwu Regency, South Sulawesi Province, Indonesia. The research method used is a survey. Data was collected using observation, questionnaires, interviews and documentation techniques. Data were processed and analyzed using quantitative-descriptive statistics with the spider curve model. The results showed that the actualization of the function and role of principals in high schools in Luwu Regency on an average "effective category" was seen from the behavior performance of principals as educators, managers, administrators, supervisors, leaders, innovators, motivators and entrepreneurs.

Keywords: Function and role of school principals, school-based management, community-based schools.

INTRODUCTION

Re-actualization (realizing, re-manifestation) the function and role of the principal (Akib, 2008; Dharma & Akib, 2009; Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik, 2007; Sudrajat, 2008) is a consequence of the successful implementation of capacity building programs in educational organizations. The essence and orientation of the implementation are inspired and motivated by the positive assumption that "school success is the success of the principal" and vice versa, school failure is the failure of the principal to carry out the main tasks, functions and roles.

The need for the actualization of the functions and roles of principals (Akib, 2008) and mastery of the competence of principals (Dharma & Akib, 2009; Jufri, Akib, Ridjal, Sahabuddin, & Said, 2018; Saggaf, Salam, & Rifka, 2017; Salam, Rosdiana, Suarlin, & Akib, 2014; Sudrajat, 2008; H. Syam, Akib, Patonangi, & Guntur, 2018) in good school governance (GSG, Syam et al., 2018) relates to the negative impacts caused by interventions from various parties that often raise the symptoms of a kind of "learned disability" (Asumah & Nagel, 2014), namely the phenomenon of powerlessness at the level of the education unit and the principal. Therefore, efforts to reactivate the functions and roles of school principals need to involve a component of governance outside the country, especially the business sector (private) and the industrial world (DUDI) and the community. The direction and goals of governance are crystallized in the principle of "Community Based Schools" (Smith & Sobel, 2014; Warren, Hong, Rubin, & Uy, 2009) and the pillars of "School Based Management" (Cheng, 2013; Dimmock, 2013; Murphy & Beck, 1995). The pillars of school-based management include management, teaching-learning processes (learning) and community participation. Similarly, it is understood that the people in charge of education are parents, government and society. Besides that, the most important thing in this article is to actualize the main tasks, functions and roles of principals in the framework (acronym) of EMASLIMEF (Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dharma & Akib, 2009; Usman, 2015).

According to experts (Akib, 2008; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Wahjosumidjo, 2005) that school principals need to have the competencies required to
realize their school's vision and mission, what principals need is a reliable ability to carry out their tasks principal, function and role. Although the appointment of school principals is carried out in a planned and systematic manner, even appointed from teachers who are experienced or may have long served as vice principals, but it does not automatically make professional principals carry out their main tasks and functions.

Other reasons that underlie the need for re-actualization of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals are based on the views of experts (Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Dimmock, 2013; Dunham, 2003; Everard, Morris, & Wilson, 2004; Murphy & Beck, 1995; Smith & Sobel, 2014) that the optimal target of achieving educational quality improvement in each educational unit or school can be realized when the entire process includes the implementation of management functions, namely planning, implementation, monitoring, evaluation and reporting carried out intensively, comprehensively, measurably and scheduled. The principal should have competence by the Republic of Indonesia Minister of National Education Regulation Number 13 of 2007 concerning Competency Standards for Principals / Madrasas (Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik, 2007), namely managerial competence, entrepreneurship, supervision, personality and social. As managers, principals must have the ability and skills to create school-based quality improvement programs that are targeted and targeted by maximizing the strengths and opportunities they have and overcoming weaknesses and threats that might be a hindrance achievement of school goals. Therefore, the principal needs to implement the principles of a sustainable learning organization and build the participation of school people and the community through the school committee.

According to Syam et al., (2018) that strengthening the pillars of school-based management and community-based schools is needed because so far the involvement of education stakeholders (teachers, principals, students, parents, school committees, community members) is often only understood as a technical process administrative only, not as a continuous process of good school governance. Therefore, the article from this study explains the re-realization of the functions and roles of principals in senior high schools in Luwu Regency.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In essence, the importance of the function and role of school principals in good school governance/GSG (H. Syam et al., 2018) supports expert understanding and the assumption that, "school success is the success of the principal" (Akib, 2008; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Usman, 2015; Wahjosumidjo, 2005). Therefore, school principals need to have the competencies required to realize their school's vision, mission and goals. The actualization of functions and roles of principals is translated into the acronym EMASLIMEF, namely educators, managers, administrators, supervisors, leaders, innovators, motivators, entrepreneurs, formal leaders (Akib, 2008; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Wahjosumidjo, 2005).

**Principal as Educator.** Principals are teachers who are given additional assignments as principals (Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik, 2007). As educators, principals are the main actors in building school culture and learning culture of school organizations (Asumah & Nagel, 2014; Duhan, Levy, & Powell, 2001; Engels, Hotton, Devos, Bouckenooghe, & Aelterman, 2008; Everard et al., 2004; Singh & Dali, 2013). The principal seeks to improve his performance related to the quality of learning carried out by the teacher in his school by: 1) Engaging teachers regularly and proportionally in upgrading or training; provide opportunities for teachers to study further; 2) Move the student learning outcomes evaluation team to work actively and be announced; 3) Using study time effectively at school.

**Principal as Manager.** Management (as a function and process) is essentially an activity of planning, organizing, carrying out, leading and controlling the business of members of the organization, and utilizing all organizational resources to achieve the stated goals (Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dimmock, 2013; Duhan et al., 2001; Everard et al., 2004). As managers, principals must be willing and able to utilize school resources to realize their vision, mission, as a reference to achieving school goals. The principal must be able to deal with various problems in school, analytical thinking, conceptual and intermediary interpreters in solving various problems (conflicts), and making decisions that satisfy school stakeholders. Likewise, school principals must provide opportunities for education staff to improve their professional abilities which are carried out persuasively and from the heart to heart. In this case the principal is guided by the principle of purpose, principle of excellence, the principle of consensus, the principle of unity, the principle of unity,
the principle of empiricism, the principle of intimacy, and the principle of integrity.

Principal as Administrator. Principals as administrators carry out functions in managing the school administration system which includes office administration (administration), finance, facilities and markets, staffing, student affairs and alumni relations and so on (Akib, 2008; Cheng, 2013; Sudrajat, 2008). The principal needs the ability to plan, manage the curriculum, manage the administration of archives, financial administration and other school administration functions. This activity is carried out effectively, efficiently and sustainably to support school productivity. The principal must be able to describe the above abilities into operational tasks.

Principal as Supervisor. The principal supervises the work carried out by teachers and education staff. A number of education experts (Akib, 2008; Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Everard et al., 2004; Shermon, 2005; Sudrajat, 2008) agree that supervision is a process specifically designed to help teachers and supervisors learn the daily tasks at school, to use their knowledge and abilities to provide better service to parents of students and school residents, and try to make the school a more effective learning community. Supervision and control by the principal of the teacher through "clinical supervision" aims to improve the professional ability of the teacher and improve the quality of learning, so that it fits into the acronym PAIKEMB (pembelajaran/learning, aktif/active, inovatif/innovative, kreatif/creative, efektif/effective, menyenangkan/fun, bermakna/meaningful). The principal as a supervisor needs to pay attention to the principles: 1) consultative, collegial and not hierarchical relationships; 2) implemented democratically; 3) centered on teachers and education staff; 4) based on the needs of teachers and education staff; and 5) is professional assistance.

Principal as Leader. Principals as leaders are carried out through guidance and supervision, increasing the willingness and ability of teachers and education personnel, opening communication (multi-direction) and delegating tasks. The ability of principals as leaders is based on aspects of personality, knowledge of education staff, school vision and mission, ability to make decisions and communication skills (Akib, 2008; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Johnson & Short, 1998; Pihie, Asuimaran, & Bagheri, 2014; Singh & Dali, 2013). Then, the principal's personality as a leader is reflected in his nature which is: 1) honest, 2) confident, 3) responsible, 4) brave decision and moderate risk, 5) big soul, 6) stable emotions, and 7) can imitate. At the level of implementation, principals as leaders, at least seen from several types, styles or ways of leadership that are applied, namely democratic, authoritarian, free, transformational, transactional, developmental.

Principal as an Innovator. The principal in order to carry out his role and function as an innovator, has the right strategy to establish harmonious relationships with the environment (internal, external, events), create new ideas, integrate each activity, set an example to teachers and education staff and develop conventional learning models and modern or 21st century learning (Akib, 2008; Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dempster, 2001; Dharma & Akib, 2009; Dunham, 2003; Ichijo, 2007; Pihie et al., 2014). The principal as an innovator in increasing the professionalism of teachers and education staff is reflected in the way he does work constructively, creatively, delegatively, integratively, rationally, objectively, pragmatically, exemplary, disciplined, adaptive and flexible.

Principal as a Motivator. As a motivator, the principal must have the right strategy to motivate teachers and education staff in carrying out their duties and functions (Akib, 2008; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Mestry & Grobler, 2004; A. Syam, Akib, Yunus, & Hasbiah, 2018; Wahjosumidjo, 2005; Williams, 2008; Zahra, Nielsen, & Bogner, 1999). Motivation can be grown through the regulation of the school's physical environment, work atmosphere, discipline, persuasion, strengthening, effective appreciation and the provision of various learning resources through the development of a Learning Resource Center that is appropriate to the situation (physical, geographical, psychological, social, cultural) of the school environment.

Principal as an Entrepreneur. The principal as an entrepreneur is needed to direct school citizens as learners and their schools as effective learning organizations. The principal as an entrepreneur refers to nature, character and characteristics inherent in him in the form of a strong will to realize and develop the creative and innovative ideas that are held into valuable activities. Entrepreneurial spirit and attitude are not only owned by entrepreneurs, but also every school principal who thinks creatively and acts innovatively and productively in organizing education and managing his
Principal as a Formal Officer. Position or leadership in schools occurs through two forms, namely formal leadership and informal leadership (Akib, 2008; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Mestry & Grobler, 2003, 2004; Wahjosumidjo, 2005). Formal leadership occurs when formal positions or authorities in school organizations are filled by people (teachers) who are appointed or selected through a selection process. Whereas informal leadership occurs when the position of leader in a school organization is filled by people who appear and influence other people, because special skills or competencies possessed, or the resources they have been felt to be able to solve problems in schools and meet the needs of school residents.

RESEARCH METHODS

Survey research (Singarimbun & Efendi, 1996) focuses on re-actualization of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals (Akib, 2008; Engels et al., 2008; Johnson & Short, 1998; Mestry & Grobler, 2003, 2004; Singh & Dali, 2013; H. Syam et al., 2018) at the high school (SMA) locus as a learning organization (Gilley & Maycunich, 2000; Kuehn, 2008; Marquardt, 2011) in Luwu Regency, Indonesia. The focus of research on the main tasks, functions and roles of principals is as educators, motivators, administrators, supervisors, leaders, innovators, entrepreneurs abbreviated as EMASLIME.

The collection of primary and secondary data is carried out using data collection techniques as follows. Observation techniques, used by observing, identifying and recording the accuracy (quality, quantity) and suitability of quantitative data regarding all items in the re-actualization (re-manifestation) of the function and role of the principal in conducting good school governance. Questionnaire technique, used to collect primary data in the form of statements and written questions submitted to respondents (research subjects). Data collected is an assessment of subjects who express opinions, attitudes, experience individually or in groups. This technique is also used to ask important aspects regarding the mastery of the competency of the principal in carrying out their functions and roles. Documentation techniques, used to study important documents that support clarity of evidence regarding regulations, activity guidelines and written documents regarding the aspects studied. Interviewing techniques, carried out by researchers on the number of key informants determined and informants in general to obtain complete information. Interviews were conducted on information representing regional organizations (Organisasi Perangkat Daerah/OPD) in the education sector (Education Office, Education Department), Educational Quality Assurance Agency (Lembaga Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan/LPMP), private sector (community) and informants representing educational figures. Analysis of research data was carried out using descriptive statistical analysis techniques (Singarimbun & Efendi, 1996; Sugiyono, 2010, 2006) to be presented through the spider curve model.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

In general, the results of the study show that the actualization of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals in senior high schools in Luwu Regency is on average "good", judging from the behavior of principals as educators, managers, administrators, supervisors, leaders, innovators, motivator and entrepreneur. The presentation of the results of data analysis regarding the implementation of the function and role of the principal is presented in the order of the level of performance behavior categories.

Principals in senior high schools (public and private) in Luwu Regency are teachers who are given additional assignments as school principals (Menteri Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, 2018) after they fulfill the requirements and have passed the selection (test) as the principal. The implementation of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals as administrators occupies the first good category. The principal organizes various school administration functions which include arranging student administration that starts from planning the acceptance of new prospective students until students become alumni; organize the curriculum (including local content curriculum) so as to be able to follow the dynamics of the development and demands of the community; organize financial administration in a transparent and accountable manner; regulate the use of facilities and infrastructure as well as learning media in schools efficiently, effectively and sustainably; organize
staffing including the ratio of the number of teachers, employees and students proportionally; and other school administration functions in the "strict school company" activity unit. Reactualization of the function and role of the principal as administrator is carried out by a "head of business", as the expert views (Akib, 2008; Cheng, 2013; Sudrajat, 2008) that principals as administrators carry out functions in managing the school administration system which includes office administration, finance, facilities and markets, staffing, student affairs and alumni relations and so on. This activity is carried out effectively, efficiently and sustainably to support school productivity.

The implementation of the principal tasks and functions and roles of the principal as an educator is an embodiment of identity and the locus of developing managerial abilities of teachers who do additional tasks. The performance of the school principal's task as an educator is classified as "good and very good" because the principal can create the condition of the school as a center of formal learning and the school as the locus of inheritance of cultural values. Principals in senior high schools in Luwu Regency have experience as teachers or educators, so that the "character of educators" they have makes it easier to teach or give persuasion to teachers, school administration staff and students to be more aware of the task. Obligations and responsibilities of each. The teacher as an educator has been able to realize his mastery of personal, social, pedagogical and professional competence. School administration staff can serve and satisfy school residents. Likewise students are aware of the task of learning to pass and pretend. The behavior of principals as educators reinforces the views of experts (Asumah & Nagel, 2014; Dunham, 2003; Engels et al., 2008; Everard et al., 2004; Singh & Dali, 2013) that principals build a learning culture of school organizations. Principals improve their performance as educators by including proportional teachers in upgrading, training or further study and likewise motivating students to take advantage of their study time at school.

The implementation of the principal tasks, functions and roles of the principal as a leader, at least it can be seen from several types, styles or ways of leadership that are applied with generic characteristics, namely principals who are democratic, transformational and "fatherly" style for those of the male sex and "motherly" for the female sex. The fatherly or maternal characteristics of the principal are not only because they are called or called "Father / Mother" but also because the principal shows the character of behavior as a person who is "elder", "respected" and "imitated."

The implementation of the principal tasks, functions and roles of the principal as an entrepreneur is based on regulations concerning the principal/madrasah competency standards (Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik, 2007). Principals in senior high schools in Luwu are quite creative and innovative in carrying out their functions and roles, both in utilizing human resources (teachers, employees, students, parents) owned and in managing and utilizing environmental resources for the benefit of school residents. The principal gives an example of productive behavior by inviting parents of students and successful alumni to contribute to school activities. The principal empowers teachers and their students so that the local content curriculum is carried out according to the potential and the school environment. According to experts and researchers (Dharma & Akib, 2009; Dunham, 2003; Jufri et al., 2018; Pihie et al., 2014) that principals as entrepreneurs refer to the nature, character and characteristics inherent in themselves in the form of a strong will to realize and develop the creative and innovative ideas they have into valuable activities. In other words, principals who think creatively and act innovatively and productively in carrying out education and managing schools are the actualization of functions and their competency-based roles.

The implementation of the principal tasks, functions and roles of the principal as a manager can be seen through the duties and functions of the principal in planning, implementing, supervising, evaluating and following up on all activities in the senior high schools in Luwu Regency. The role of the principal as a manager is also seen through his ability to direct and account for the consequences of activities that are "in the name of his school". In principle, the implementation of the duties and functions of the principal is in accordance with the views of experts (Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dimmock, 2013; Dunham, 2003; Everard et al., 2004) that, as principal managers must be willing
and able to utilize school resources in order to realize the vision, mission, as a reference to achieving school goals. The principal must be able to deal with various problems in the school, think analytically, conceptually and interpreters of conflict, and make decisions that satisfy school stakeholders.

The implementation of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals in senior high schools in Luwu Regency as a motivator is the actualization of his identity as a teacher given an additional mandate or assignment. The teacher’s character inherent in the principal always gives motivation, persuasion and appreciation to other people (fellow teachers, employees or students). According to experts and researchers (Akib, 2008; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Mestry & Grobler, 2003; Akib et al., 2018; Wahjosumidjo, 2005; Williams, 2008; Zahra et al., 1999), that the motivational function of the principal can be actualized through the arrangement of the school’s physical environment, work atmosphere, discipline, persuasion, strengthening, effective appreciation and the provision of various learning resources that are appropriate to the situation and conditions (physical, geographical, psychological, social, cultural) school environment.

According to the informant (Interview, 2019) that, the principal tasks and functions of the principal as a motivator for school citizens are the actualization of the identity of the people of South Sulawesi who respect local cultural values: sipakatau (humanizing each other), sipakainge (reminding each other) and sipakalebbi (mutual respect) or better known as the 3-S philosophy. In this philosophy of life implied the meaning of "motivating each other" with each other as fellow human beings. According to Unru & Ismail (2018) that, sipakatau, sipakainge, sipakalebbi is the proverb of the ancestors of the Bugis-Makassaraese people who were used as culture in social life. Sipakatau is an attitude that humanizes a whole person in any condition regardless of one’s social status, education and caste. Sipakalebbi is a form of appreciation to someone or mutual respect for one another. Sipakainge has the meaning of reminding each other to achieve sustainability in life. Furthermore, the informant stated that, there is a life philosophy of the Bugis-Makassar people who are full of motivational meanings, as the description of the contents of Akib (2014) is titled: "Tellu Cappa" as the Organizational Motivation and Image Theory. According to Akib that tellu cappa means "three ends" namely "the ends/tip of the badik" (motivation to uphold honor), "the tip of the tongue" (motivation to show intelligence and diplomatic expertise) and "the tip of men" (underlying the drive to unite and expand relationships) family/kinship.

The implementation of the principal tasks, functions and roles of the principal as a supervisor is carried out with a "clinical supervision" approach, both concerning academic activities (learning) and managerial or administrative activities in his school. Clinical supervision was applied by school principals in Luwu Regency because they agreed with "collegial and professional principles" as fellow educators so that the learning process and results increased. It is understood that, supervision and control by the headmaster of the teacher through "clinical supervision" aims to improve the teacher’s professional abilities and improve the quality of learning. Principals as supervisors need to pay attention to the principles of consultative, collegial, democratic relations, teacher-centered and educational personnel, as needed, are professional assistance (Akib, 2008; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dunham, 2003; Everard et al., 2004; Sudrajat, 2008).

The implementation of the main tasks, functions and roles of principals as innovators in senior high schools in Luwu Regency showed the lowest good category. The behavior of principals is demonstrated through their ability to realize "new ideas" that are understood or adopted from other schools, principals’ best practices in supporting 21st century learning, the results of sharing in "Principal Working Group" activities or "Principal Working Meeting" activities. "A number of experts and writers (Akib, 2008; Cheng, 2013; Cranston, 2002; Danim & Suparno, 2008; Dempster, 2001; Dharma & Akib, 2009; Duhan et al., 2001; Ichijo, 2007) agree that principals as innovators in increasing the professionalism of teachers and education personnel are reflected in the way they do work constructively, creatively, delegatively, integratively, rationally, objectively, pragmatically, exemplary, disciplined, adaptive and flexible.
In the spider curve model it can be seen that on average the behavior performance of principals in senior high schools in Luwu Regency is "well categorized". The performance of the task and role of the principal in a tiered manner is best in its function, always administrators, educators, leaders, entrepreneurs, managers, motivators, supervisors and innovators. Without denying the quality of its performance it is clear that principals in high schools in Luwu Regency are actualized through the attitudes and behaviors played.

CONCLUSION

The snapshot of the actualization of the functions and roles of principals in the EMASLIM acronym in senior high schools in Luwu Regency is seen through the ability of personal academics to carry out the principles of "good school governance" in the schools led. The leadership performance of the school principal was not only actualized in the good category, but also able to build the image of the school community and the surrounding community regarding the success of the high school in Luwu Regency as proof of the success (performance) of the principal.

REFERENCE


family environment factors at Vocational high school in Makassar. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*.


Government Policy and Ngo Intervention for People Living With HIV (PLHIV) in the Philippines: The Case of PLHIV in an Urban Community in Southern Philippines

Marph Daryl O. Porras marphdaryl.porras@g.msuit.edu.ph
Myrna Jean A. Mendoza myrmajean.mendoza@g.msuit.edu.ph
Minndanao State University – Iligan Institute of Technology

ABSTRACT

Alarmed with the rapid increase of HIV cases in the Philippines, the government has instituted Republic Act 8504 known as Philippine AIDS Prevention and Control Act of 1998. Down south, an ordinance on policies and measures to prevent and control STI, HIV/AIDS infections was promulgated in Iligan City. A non-government organization, known as Northern Mindanao AIDS Advocates (NorMAA) was organized to extend assistance to People Living with HIV (PLHIV) in the area. With a very scarce if not nil local literature on PLHIV, it necessitates the conduct of this study. Conducted in Iligan city, Southern the study aims to find out social stigma and coping mechanisms among PLHIV members of the NorMAA.

Using a qualitative design of key informant interview which entails in-depth interview, the study conducted a personal and individual interview with seven informants who were identified purposively using a snowball or referential sampling method. Research ethics of informed consent and confidentiality are strictly observed by the researchers in the conduct of data gathering and data presentation.

Findings were analyzed using social stigma of Erving Goffman (1963) and social identity of Tajfel (979). Labeled as Person Living with HIV (PLHIV) and having joined the NorMAA, the key interview informants acquired the social identity as PLHIV. With such identity which implies a dreaded health condition, two courses of actions are found among the informants: disclosure and concealment of their social identity and health status as PLHIV. Those who disclosed their identity to their significant others had negative experiences which to them are a stigma. Those who preferred to conceal their identity as PLHIV attributed this to imagined stigma – forms of stigma which they imagined to experience once their health status is known by others.

NorMAA’s collaborative works with the local government agencies pave the way to recover and boost self-confidence of the PLHIVs. The continuous sustainable interventions that targeted not just on the individual level of the PLHIV but also the family members are significantly an evident. Despite their stigmatized social identity, most PLHIV maintained a positive outlook in life with better perceived life-chances.

Key terms: Social Stigma, Social Identity, PLHIV, NorMAA

INTRODUCTION

The Department of Health-Bureau of Epidemiology in the early quarter of 2017, reported that there are about 3,290 HIV antibody seropositive individuals recorded in the Philippines which are 13% higher compared to last year. Ninety-five percent of reported cases were male and the median age is 28 years old. Among the several modes of transmission, sexual contact remains the top causes with 609 cases and 87% of those transmitted through sexual activities were among the males who engage sex with males. From the first HIV infection case recorded in the Philippines in the year 1984, there have been 42,912 HIV AB sero-positive individuals. Ninety-one percent (91%) of the total populations recorded were asymptomatic which means it does not show any symptoms upon reporting and twenty-seven percent were young individuals aged 15-24 years old. A board member of Pinoy Plus Advocacy Pilipinas Inc., Noel Quinto, formulated an index on stigma among PLHIV in the Philippines. Several challenges as a result of stigma and discrimination were noted by Quinto (2011) which includes denial of HIV status individually, socially, and nationally, leading to delayed treatment, care, and support. There is fear, anxiety, depression, apathy, anger, suicidal attempts, and revengeful behaviors. Certain groups of People Living with HIV (PLHIV) are also marginalized with the resurfacing of old prejudices and the emergence of new resentment towards HIV-positive individuals.
Cognizant of the increasing rate of HIV in the country, the Philippine government has enacted Republic Act 8504 commonly known as the “Philippine AIDS Prevention and Control Act of 1998”. This act promulgates policies and prescribes measures on how to prevent and control HIV and AIDS in the Philippines. It institutionalizes the nationwide HIV/AIDS information and educational program, the establishment of a comprehensive HIV/AIDS monitoring, and the strengthening of the Philippines National Aids Council law. Free, confidential, and with consent counseling and testing services are likewise offered. In Southern Philippines, in Iligan city, it has come up with a City ordinance No. 11-5677 entitled, An Ordinance Promulgating Policies and Measures for the Prevention and Control of Sexually Transmitted Infections (STI), HIV Infections/AIDS in Iligan City, and the Iligan City AIDS Council and Providing Penalties for Violations thereof and for other Purposes. This city ordinance is a recognition of the existence of People Living with HIV (PLHIV) in the locality. This is substantiated in the report of Oyao (2017) that there are 52 individuals who have been diagnosed with HIV in Iligan City. From January to September 2017, 21 cases were recorded. Of this figure, 17 cases were assisted by the Northern Mindanao AIDS Advocate (NorMAA).

The alarming rise of Filipinos affected by HIV is a sociological interest. People living with HIV (PLHIV) need to be studied to shed light on their lifestyles, health conditions, and struggles. Despite the number of PLHIV in the country, they remain faceless and anonymous because they are seldom studied for fear of social stigma. In recent information on AIDS through mass media, Cagayan de Oro was identified as having a high rate of AIDS. The seeming absence of sociological study on PLHIV is noticeable in Region 10, hence this study. Conducted in Iligan, an adjacent city of Cagayan de Oro, the study’s two-fold objectives are to identify types of social stigma experienced by PLHIVs and to determine the coping mechanisms employed by the PLHIVs.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The framework of this study is drawn from the theories of Erving Goffman’s social stigma, and Tajfel and Turner’s social identity. Goffman (1963) defines social stigma as “deeply discrediting” attribute in the context of a set relationship. The disapproval of an individual by others in society is based on his social characteristics. It causes an individual to be mentally classified by others in undesirable, rejected stereotypes rather than in an accepted normal one. According to Kleinman (2009), the modern idea of stigma owes a great deal to Goffman, who viewed stigma as a process based on the social construction of identity. Persons who become associated with a stigmatized condition thus pass from a “normal” to a “discredited” or “discreditable” social status. Stigma in this study is manifested in the various negative experiences of the informants based on their PLHIV identity.

In this study, Key informants, being labeled as a PLHIV and as members of an organization NorMAA, have acquired such social identity as People Living with HIV or commonly known as PLHIV. For Tajfel (1975), in conceptualizing a group, it can be a collection of individuals who perceive themselves to be a member of the same social category, share some emotional involvement in the common definition of themselves, and achieve some degree of social consensus about the evaluation of their group and their membership of it. By being a member of the NorMAA, the PLHIVs then acquired a social identity with their common feelings of oneness and acceptance as described by Tajfel.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Erving Goffman’ Stigma (1963) is one of the early studies of stigma which concentrated on the “undesirable felt differences” and “negative attributes that convey devalued social identity”. Persons with stigma are those whose moral characteristics and personality do not fit to the moral identification based on the social norms which Goffman called spoiled identity.

Henri Tajfel and John Turner’s Theory on Social Identity (1975) stipulated that a person’s sense of how they identify themselves is based on the group they belong to. Tajfel (1979) explains that the groups where we belong give us a sense of social identity. Social identity as discussed by Tajfel (1979) is affected by in-group and out-group behavior. This intergroup behavior determines the kind of discrimination experienced as part of the group.
A study by Kleinman Hall-Clifford (2001), define stigma in terms of social, cultural and moral processes. They pointed out that stigma focuses heavily on psychological approaches and unable to acknowledge the moral context on the understanding of stigma and stigmatized individuals. In the study by Kamau (2012) in public schools in Kenya, three main types of stigma were identified: enacted or actual, internalized, and felt stigma. Stigma and discrimination involved parents, teachers and peers, who were synonymously referred to as “stigmatizers” (Kamau, 2012). Enacted stigma includes stigmatization by parents wherein parents determined the type of treatment pupils accorded Children Living with HIV/AIDS (CLWHA) while in school.

In terms of ordinances, there are national and local laws that protect and help the PLHIV. Republic Act 8504 is the law that provides protection to every PLHIV in the Philippines and has been approved since February 13, 1998, signed by President Fidel V. Ramos. It mandated everyone to not discriminate PLHIV thus protecting them by the 100% confidentiality. The discrimination of PLHIV in health institutions is also prohibited since they are the frontline offices in monitoring, providing care and support to PLHIV. At the local government unit, Iligan City passed City Ordinance No. 11-5677 entitled, An Ordinance Promulgating Policies and Measures for the Prevention and Control of Sexually Transmitted Infections (STI), HIV Infections/AIDS and created the Iligan City AIDS Council. The Social Hygiene Clinic shall serve as the frontline in delivery of reproductive health care services, thus they are the one who will ensure that children with STI, HIV/AIDS are given priority in treatment and are referred to concerned agencies for further assistance (CO 11-5677, Article III). In addition, the Iligan City also observes strict adherence to principles and guidelines on testing, screening, counselling following the conditions mandated in the state law. In article X, section 32 of the health and support services of the city ordinance, it says:

“Heath Care Plans for Persons with HIV – the city of Iligan, in coordination with the Philippine National AIDS Council, Department of Health and Commissioner of the Insurance Commission shall conduct feasibility of setting up a package of health care plans, and should the study warrant, implement the plan for persons with HIV.”

Iligan City has various plans and policies on PLHIV to provide the needed protection and care for them. Iligan City also has penal provisions for any person who will be found guilty for any means of violating the rights of PLHIV and appropriated budget for the operation of the AIDS council.

**METHODOLOGY**

This is a qualitative research design which employed a key informant interview method which entails an individualized interviewing of select informants who are well versed and familiar with the subject matter being studied. The researchers gathered information from seven members of a non-government organization called Northern Mindanao AIDS Advocate (NoRMAA) in Iligan City. NoRMAA has the advocacy of giving care, support, and hopes to people living with HIV. The sample group of 7 individuals was selected purposively based on their social identity as Person Living with HIV (PLHIV) and as members of the NoRMAA. One of the researchers in this study was once a peer educator and advocate on HIV and thus had access to NoRMAA and knew some of its officers. Through referral method or snowball sampling, the first few informants helped the researchers in identifying other members of the organization who eventually agreed to be included in this study. Strict research ethics on informed consent and confidentiality were observed.

Iligan City was selected as the research locale because of its nearness to Cagayan de Oro, known to have a high incidence of HIV and due to the establishment of the Northern Mindanao AIDS Advocates (NorMAA) organization in the city.

**FINDINGS OF THE STUDY**

There were 7 People Living with HIV (PLHIV) members of the NorMAA who served as informants in this study. The typical PLHIV in this study was a 30-year-old male Catholic, residing in Iligan City at the time of the study, has been diagnosed with HIV for 2.5 years and was continually undergoing Anti-retroviral Therapy (ART). As a result of ART medication, all of them experienced some physical reactions such as skin discoloration, sweating with an unusual odor or foul smell. Others reported feelings of numbness, weakness, irritation, and discomfort. PLHIVs also disclosed their
unhealthy lifestyle before being diagnosed with HIV such as having unsafe and casual sex, vices like smoking and drinking, and going out late at night. All of which were changed due to their health conditions.

**Forms of Social Stigma: Real and Imagined by PLHIV**

Focusing on stigma, it appears that there are two types found among the Key Informant-PLHIVs: real and imagined. Real stigma is those actual negative experiences of discrimination and non-acceptance from family members and friends upon disclosure of their HIV status. One informant suffered from being terminated from work due to his health condition. Their family members, mostly from their fathers, were angry and labeled them as dirty, gay, and dukerok (sex-maniac). However, sympathetic reactions from their mothers were also felt by the informants.

Some of the informants shared the following angry and ugly words hurled to them which stigmatized them:

- That's an ugly disease, it’s for the defiled!
- You’re a sex maniac, active in lustful things!
- That’s what you get for being gay, dirty, and keeps on roaming around.
- Stinker than shit!

Built within the strong negative reactions which stigmatized the informants include being blamed for being gay or homosexual, and heavy-laden labels such as being dirty and lust for sex. The families of the informants knew of their health conditions mostly voluntarily from the PLHIV themselves.

Fears of being an outcast, rejected, not accepted are what the PLHIVs could think of once their true PLHIV identity is known. Hence, these are imagined stigma, although not yet experienced these already caused inward troubles to the informants. Informants were full of fears as to what other people might do to them once they knew of their health conditions. It shows that the fear of rejection was among the foremost reasons of concealing their HIV identity. Rejection is showed in various forms to them: not accepted being avoided, discriminated, being the butt of jokes, name callings, fear that family will judge him as fond of sex and dirty. According to Goffman (1963), an individual with stigmatized identity is one who does not have full acceptance, struggling and striving to adjust to what is said to be normal to the society. In order to be among the “normal people”, they chose to keep their PLHIV identity confidential. Nevertheless, despite concealing their health status and identity, the informants already suffered from imagined stigma because they were already bothered as to the many possible negative reactions and treatments to them by other people. A related study conducted by Yeboah et al. (2017) in China, reported discrimination and stigmatization were strongly felt by PLHIVs.

**Support from Government and NGO**

Based on the accounts of the PLHIV informants, there were several forms of assistance from the national to the local government they received. This included transportation, financial and medical assistance. For transportation assistance, the DSWD has provided transportation allowance for medical check-up in Davao City. The PCSO has provided medical insurance for every PLHIV admitted in the hospital worth 50,000 pesos and 5,000 for laboratories. Such assistance was not however given automatically, only when the PLHIV has approached the government agency for support. The CSWD of Iligan City gives 5,000 pesos every 6 months as a form of financial assistance but informants claimed this was not given on a regular basis. Basically, the Northern Mindanao Medical Center (NMMC) is the main hub for providing medical treatment among the PLHIV. It is in NMMC where supply of ARV for PLHIV for medical maintenance is made available.

As for the local government of Iligan City, the City Health Office (CHO) has been designated as the main agency to provide support for PLHIV. However, according to the informants, the CHO lacks both medical and emotional forms of support. The informants felt that the local government unit of Iligan City was not willing to extend help to the PLHIV. They claimed there were rules and regulations in accordance to the city ordinance but were not properly implemented. Iligan City Ordinance No. 11-5677 is the ordinance that promulgates policies and
measures for the prevention and control of STI, HIV infections. It identifies Social Hygiene Clinic as the frontliner to cater the needs of PLHIV. This includes healthcare plans for PLHIV and referral of PLHIV to other government agencies in case they need other health and social services. In general, informants reported that they experienced deprivation of medical assistance from the local government and they felt the government is not sympathetic to their health plight. For detailed accounts of the informants as to the types of assistance they received from the local government and NorMAA in a related study conducted by Hormazd N. Sethna of Case Western Reserve University (2014), World Bank defines NGOs as important organizations in pursuing activities relieving suffering and most especially in prevention and treatment of HIV/AIDS. Particularly, NGOs and government agencies help set trends on advocacy of persons with HIV, targets specific vulnerable groups and improved access to health and emotional care.

NorMAA as an Emotional Support System to the PLHIV

Northern Mindanao AIDS Advocate (NorMAA), whose main office is based in Cagayan de Oro City, is a support group for PLHIV in Northern Mindanao. Its major aim is geared towards the overall wellness of PLHIV in Northern Mindanao because of the alarming increase of HIV in these localities.

All of the informants were very positive on why they became part of the organization. PLHIV have revealed that upon joining NorMAA it was able to create a sense of belongingness and they were able to accept their status easily. In addition, the self-confidence of the informants also improved when they have joined NorMAA. These positive responses were reflected in PLHIV’s accounts.

Miguel: As a chairperson, NorMAA had helped me a lot in accepting myself and on how I look at other PLHIV

Mark Knight: I need this (NorMAA), you are not fighting alone.

According to Miguel, the president of NorMAA, the organization’s vision is to create a loving and accepting society towards PLHIV and its main mission is to eradicate stigma and discrimination towards PLHIV. NorMAA also wants to create nurturing environment that promotes total wellness to PLHIV. Its goal by 2020 is to lessen stigma and discrimination among PLHIV and increase walk-in testing.

There were various support group sessions for members of NorMAA. This includes series of counsellings group-sharing sessions, home visit, retreat and recollections. This programs aims to earn the trust of every member. NorMAA also helps those non-members especially on treatment and care. One main program for members of NorMAA is to follow their medication religiously thus PLHIV should never missed taking ARV. NorMAA members have the duty to inform the family members of PLHIV who are already in serious health condition or dying due to complications of diseases. The NorMAA chairperson said during the interview:

Miguel: we believe that we are normal; we only differ in the status

In a study conducted by Sehgal (1991) entitled, “Prevention and control of AIDS: the role of NGOs, non-government organizations have long record of involvement in the field of health and social welfare and possess several advantages over government agencies such as:

• they have rich experience working at the community level;
• their autonomous nature allows them to respond more quickly;
• they have access to marginalized groups;
• they generally work with the target groups to raise their self-esteem;
• they can act as a bridge between the community and the national level;
• they often employ innovative methods;
• their method of operation allows for cost-effectiveness.

Furthermore, NGOs were very effective in providing trainings, counselling, and other assistance to PLHIV. This has been proven by Alagad Mindanao, Inc which supervised NorMAA’s handling and running the operations of the positive community.
In relating the findings to the social identity framework, Tajfel (1979) explains that a person believes and assumes of who they are based on the groups to which they belong. PLHIV perceives themselves to be part of the NorMAA, an organization suited for their health conditions which can be referred as their ingroup. Because of their health conditions, PLHIVs were drawn to join NorMAA, not only for medical assistance but also for social acceptance and emotional support. Being members of NorMAA, they identified with the organization and thus acquired a social identity, dreadful as may be, being a Person Living with HIV or PLHIV.

The summary table below identifies major themes from the informants’ accounts on what they considered as emotional and psychological support system they received from the NorMAA.

Table 1. Summary of themes on PLHIVs’ Emotional support as NorMAA member

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Informant/ Year diagnosed with HIV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sense of Belongingness</td>
<td>SOFIA (April 2013)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-acceptance</td>
<td>MIGUEL (February 2015)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence</td>
<td>ANDREW SIN (October 2012)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence</td>
<td>MARK KNIGHT (January 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence</td>
<td>SON (December 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of Belongingness</td>
<td>JOHN (September 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confidence</td>
<td>DRAGON (October 2015)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Common theme that arises out from being a member of the NorMAA includes sense of belongingness and improvement on self-confidence. These were the result of series of programs and interventions not just focusing on the PLHIVs but also to their family members.

Validated by the study of Alana Rosenberg in 2008 entitled Government-NGO collaboration and sustainability of orphans and vulnerable children projects in southern Africa, that the collaboration works of NGO and government agencies is sustainable when in particular build a strong partnerships towards a sustainable HIV intervention programs and projects. Thus, helping PLHIV in rebuilding their selves.

Their Coping Strategies

PLHIV informants further detailed their coping strategies and mechanisms which helped them in their health ordeal. Having a good support system such as their family, friends, and NorMAA, proved to be an effective coping mechanism for the informants. They also had personal strategies to deal with their stigmatized health identity such as self-determination, positive mind setting, focusing on self and family, and avoiding negative people. Similarly, the study of Ying-Xia Zhang from China (2014) which tackled the importance of interpersonal and intrapersonal approaches in coping mechanisms like consistent avoidance or being passive and the problem-focused approach. These two coping mechanisms were also among the informants’ responses which help them deal with the stigma and discrimination from different individuals and social groups.

CONCLUSION

The findings include that the typical PLHIV in this study is a male homosexual whose fragile health condition left him two options: disclosure and/or concealment of his health status to the important persons in their lives – family members, friends, and workmates.

Goffman’s (1963) theory of social stigma emphasized how other members of society discredit the status of an individual which in return affected the behavior of that individual. This framework lends support to the PLHIV informants who, upon disclosure of their health status and identity to their family, friends and workmates, discrimination, suffered from stigma. This stigmatized condition
produced an act of devaluing one’s self among informants. However, the disclosure of status also provided the informant’s words of relief and encouragement among other family members, friends, and workmates. Goffman’s (1963) theory of social stigma also delved into individuals’ ways of coping which varies across social groups, time, and situations. Those who opted to conceal or hide their health conditions from their significant others attribute it to imagined stigma, the fear of being outcast, discriminated, rejected.

Various support provided by the government, non-government, loved ones and friends provided the PLHIV with coping strategies in meeting their health, emotions, financial, and medical needs. With NorMAA’s intervention, PLHIV were able to improve their self-confidence and acceptance. These findings are supported by Tajfel’s (1979) notion of positive social identity with NorMAA as part of the in-group that develops self-esteem.

The PLHIV in this study lacks the appreciation of the local government’s support for their health plight. While there are city ordinances on AIDs already in place, the informants felt they have not received the assistance due to them from the local government.

RECOMMENDATION

The increasing cases of HIV in Iligan City are undeniably needs comprehensive and sustainable collaborations between government and non-government organizations. Since Iligan City is identified as one of the high burden areas because of numerous cases of HIV based on the Department of Health-Bureau of Epidemiology report of 2017, there is a need to respond and create sustainable measures focusing primarily on the reducing social stigma. This can be realize through defining particular measures based on the account of the respondents on how they had experienced and imagined the stigma from different social groups. Relying on several studies and frameworks in the field of sustainable community development, possibly create interventions that will encompass socio-cultural approaches suitable in combating social stigma within the in and out groups of PLHIVs.

Since stigma has been a long problem not just locally but also on both national and international society, the collaborative works of the government and non-government agencies shall adopt successful frameworks/action plans from other country in which positively managed HIV cases such as Thailand. Thailand National Operating Plan Accelerating Ending AIDS 2015-2019, is an action plan to continue peven and control HIV/AIDS epidemic in the past 3 decades. Thus, an urge to adopt and study Thailand’s action plan. Also, local government policy makers shall look into the revision of the city ordinance so that it will be parallel with the newly signed HIV law of the Philippines. In addition, it is recommended that ordinances on financial and medical support to PLHIVs be reviewed regularly for relevance. It is also recommended that its local health units be active in monitoring PLHIVs and in conducting a free test of HIV and come up with measures in preventing the spread of the dreaded disease.

REFERENCES

Antipolo, April, and Burgos B. Charcos . 2012. The Other Family: A stigmatized Social Identity. Undergraduate Thesis


Kurzban, Roland. 2001. Evolutionary Origins of Stigmatization; The Functions of Social


Miller, C. T. & Kaiser C. R. 2001. A Theoretical Perspective on Coping with Stigma


Sethna, Hormazd N. 2003. The role of non-governmental organisations (NGOs) in HIV/AIDS prevention and care. MPHP 439, Department of Public Health Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, OH 44106. https://case.edu/med/epidbio/mphp439/NGOs_AIDS.htm


INFLUENCE OF INFORMATION CONTROL ON USER SATISFACTION IN CENTRAL LIBRARY OF IAIN TERNATE

By:
IsjiHardi, A.Md., S. Sos., M.Si.
Alfian, S.Si., M.Sc.
Dra. Adiyana, M.Pd.

Abstract. This research was conducted to analyze the effect of information control on user satisfaction and community conditions in accessing library materials in the central library of IAIN Ternate. The study used a combination of quantitative and qualitative approaches with survey methods, using questionnaire, and logbook instruments. The sampling technique uses Stratified Random sampling with a sample of 100 respondents. There are five independent variables to declare Information Control: availability of collections, Timeline, Equipment, Convenience, and Self Reliance while the dependent variable is user satisfaction. From data analysis using multiple regression analysis techniques using SPSS 17 program shows that the availability of collections, Timeline, Convenience and Self Reliance have a significant effect on user satisfaction while Equipment has no significant effect on user satisfaction. As for the condition of the community, unable to optimally access library materials in the library due to lack of promotion and educative information about the use of information technology (e-library) and the speed of accessing the internet is still slow.

Keywords: e-library, information control, user satisfaction

INTRODUCTION

One of the Indonesia goals is to develop the nation's intellectual life as has been mentioned in the preamble the constitution of 1945. That also as the main goal of education formal or informal. By the chance of free information exchange, culture and art can be appreciated fastly and transparency, also the economic transaction is more open and many other things that assign the nation to be wise and competitive in dealing with.

Education institution from primary to the high school produce and develop the curriculum and learning program based on the needs of the related stakeholder. One of the programs that have been developed is literacy information. As has been mentioned by Hasugian:

"Information literacy which is a translation of information literacy in a concise sense is interpreted as information literacy or information mischief."\(^2\)

For someone who has been literate, it is considered that the person is able to explore the wilderness and ocean of the information which will gradually expand and be difficult to find again, whether the source of information comes from printed work or electronic works. As Webber and Johnston stated that:

"Skills-based literacy as the program of mastering information literacy that considered to be able to engage in literacy, which includes the ability to find information, use and present information ethically."\(^3\)

In the development of literacy, librarians, especially college and school librarians, in general library service skills should be developed into the information literacy program itself with aims to non-problematic which is skills that do not contain problems. Such as Hasugian statement:

"Information literacy is closely related to the main tasks of library services."\(^4\)

This means that a person's ability to find the information is a series of skills that librarians transfer to readers aims to facilitate services and information retrieval. However, there are many colleges and schools that do not maximize the main tasks and functions of the library in supporting the vision and mission of the institution.

Service and quality are two inseparable elements. The services activity provided by the library will lead to a quality assessment of users. User assessment of quality is the most important essence in knowing the quality level of the library.

"Service quality is a gap between the library services with the user's expectations of services."\(^5\)

---

\(^4\) Ibid.
Studies on service quality continue to develop in various fields. In the library study of service quality is produced by the ARL (Association of Research Library), namely "LibQual" which stands for Library Quality that use to assist libraries in assessing and improving library services, as well as testing the quality of library services throughout the institution. The meaning of quality will be different depending on the context.

So, the strategies to measure service can be known by using several instruments such as to measure the quality of services in the library, the measurement tool that would be more appropriate is to use the LibQual concept. The concept is the development of the ServQual concept that has been developed by Parasuraman, Berry and Zeithami. The Service Quality concept is guided by the concept of customer satisfaction through a review of their expectations and perceptions of services by five dimensions of quality services. While the LibQual concept is used to measure the quality of library services based on three dimensions that can be used as measurement indicators, namely first, Effect of services, abilities, attitudes and mentality of library officers in service users, which include: a) Assurance, knowledge of insights, abilities and friendliness/library staff in serving users. With that knowledge, insight, ability, and friendliness, the user puts trust in library services, b) empathy, caring and giving attention to each individual user, c) Responsiveness, always ready/responsive to help visitors who have difficulties and always open themselves to help, d) reliability, namely the ability to give promises and expectations in service and fulfill them appropriately and accurately.

Second, Information control, which concerns the availability of adequate collections, the strength of collections held the scope of content, ease of access to find collections, ease of navigation, timeliness, the time needed to obtain information, the absence of obstacles in accessing information when needed, equipment, convenience, and confidence.

Third, Library as a place, taken from the concept of tangibles in ServQual, namely the ability to display something in form of physical facilities and how the utilitarian space as a symbol and place protection (refuge).

The IAIN Ternate Central Library is a college library that is under IAIN Ternate as the institution. The IAIN Ternate Central Library is one of the oldest Islamic state university libraries in North Maluku with library building, various types of services, the largest number of Islamic collections and general collections even not as complete as other public colleges, visits and collection collections increase. The number of libraries in IAIN Ternate is as many as 2654 active students in 2017.

From the perspective of the user, students, as the biggest users of the library. The researchers’ initial observations revealed that they were unwilling to visit the library because most of the library books were oriented to Islamic books meanwhile lack of general books and membership, whereas not all students became library members.

Then the Central Library of IAIN Ternate provided services to users with an open system, through the user looking for references and other books on the library by themselves, and there were also serving students with closed systems specifically for short loan collection services. So that many books are located not in accordance with the calling code. That problem is complained by the user, even though the user himself often does it. The following circulation service staff (borrowing, returning, membership, and statistics) were felt to be less friendly, and the storage bag section of the library placed the bag in the place provided by the library, felt not safe because it had experienced lost bags and valuables.

Visiting time, the IAIN Ternate Central library was carried out with the open-closed system. This was not in accordance with what was promised, received complaints from the user. There were also complaints about library facilities, especially AC, which were always off, electrical installations were a short circuit.

Furthermore, what they complained about finding information of collections/library materials in the library, even though there were SLIMS (Senayan Library Information Management Systems), one of the information search programs incental library of IAIN Ternate, which may not have many users use. Part of the complaint problem is a form of dissatisfaction of the users, especially students. Whereas an agency providing services, the library is required to be able to fill the needs and expectations of users. If the expectations of users are in accordance with the performance provided by the library, the users will satisfy.

Based on previous studies that measure quality of service is dominated by measurements using a disconfirmation paradigm, as the research conducted by ZurniZaharaSamosir with the results showing that:

“Service quality (reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and direct evidence) directly influences student satisfaction. However, specifically, the most influential
dimensions are reliability, responsiveness, empathy, and direct evidence, while the guarantee dimension is less influential significantly. The dimensions of direct evidence (tangibles) are dimensions that most influence student satisfaction. The contribution of service quality variables to student satisfaction using the library amounted to 56.3%, the rest 43.7% satisfaction of students using the library was influenced by other factors outside the research.⁶

Rahayuningsih's research, producing the most contributing dimension to user satisfaction is Affec of Services. Satisfaction of users of the quality of Library Services in Sanata Dharma University Yogyakarta influenced by the attitude and mentality of librarians in serving that include assurance, empathy, responsiveness and reliability.⁷ Rohman and Yulianti said based on the three dimensions of service quality according to the LibQual Model called Information Control, Effect of Services and Library as Place, user satisfaction is determined based on the gap analysis between user perceptions and expectations. The approach used in this study is quantitative descriptive with survey methods. Population and sample in this study are library users and the results of the study indicate that the quality of library services in general has not been able to provide satisfaction for the users. So that the library is expected to work better to achieve customer satisfaction by improving the quality of its services.⁸

**RESEARCH PROBLEM**

Based on the background above, the problem formulated in this research as follows:

1. Does the availability of collection partially affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
2. Does the timeliness (time to get the information) partially affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
3. Does the equipment partially affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
4. Does the convenience partially affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
5. Does the self-reliance partially affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
6. Do the availability of collection, timeless, equipment, convenience and self-reliance simultaneously affect to the user satisfaction in Central Library of IAIN Ternate?
7. How the community can access materials in Central Library of IAIN Ternate use information technology maximally?

**INFORMATION CONTROL (IC)**

Information control, this dimension concerns the availability of adequate collections, the strength of own collections, scope of content, ease of access to collections, ease of navigation, timeliness, time needed to obtain information, lack of obstacles in accessing information when needed, equipment, convenience and self-reliance.

Rahayuningsih (2015: 36) defines Information control as: Information control (quality of information and access to information), which is the availability of quality information and access to information, consists of aspects scope, convenience, ease of navigation, timelines, equipment, and self-reliance. The scope is concerns about the availability of adequate collections, the strength of the own collection, the content. Convenience, the user convenience in accessing information, which is related to the convenience of the user in accessing information without come to the library and clarity of the instructions. Ease of navigation is the ease of the library users to access own information by the library through digital catalogs or directly on the collection shelf. Timeliness, the speed of the user to access the information, which is strongly supported by the compatibility of the data in the digital catalog with collection data in a row of shelves, the orderly arrangement of collections on a shelf. Equipment, library tools for accessing information, in this case is the availability of quality information and access to information, consists of aspects scope, convenience, ease of navigation, timelines, equipment, and self-reliance.

Restuti (2013:205) defines that the library is expected to work better to achieve customer satisfaction by improving the quality of its services.⁹
Based on the opinion above that the relationship of information control with library user satisfaction can be known based on the results of previous research by Adin (2013: 14) where the information control affects library user satisfaction. This is proven by the statement that the null hypothesis ($H_0$) is rejected which means there is influence of information control variables on satisfaction ($Y$).

**CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

Information Control is closely related to the user satisfaction who apply Information Control indicators, such as the availability of collections, Timeliness, Equipment, Convenience and Self Reliance can increase user satisfaction. Research design of Information Control for satisfaction as shown below:

![Research Design](image1)

Hypothesis model in this research is Information Control towards user satisfaction as shown in the figure below:

![Research Hypothesis Model](image2)

**RESEARCH METHOD**

This research use combination of quantitative and qualitative approach with survey method, use the questionnaire instrument and logbook, where this research is the replication of some previous researches. Then the technique is structure techniques to get the data through a series of questions verbally or written based on the question of respondent. Here is the table of data that shows the allocation of calculation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Control</th>
<th>User Satisfaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Availability of Collection X1</td>
<td>H1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timeliness X2</td>
<td>H2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment X3</td>
<td>H3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convenience X4</td>
<td>H4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self Reliance X5</td>
<td>H5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**USER SATISFACTION (Y)**

1. Attentive
2. Helpful
3. Considerate
4. Polite
5. Respectfull

Information:
- Partially affected
- Stimulantely affected
Table. 3.1
Number of Active User Population
In Central Library of IAIN Ternate 2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Faculty</th>
<th>Number of Active User</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Faculty of Ushuluddin, Adab and Dakwa</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Faculty of Tarbiyah and Ilmu Keguruan</td>
<td>1258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Faculty of Syariah and Economic Islam</td>
<td>1152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Graduate Program</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total Number of Active User</td>
<td>2654</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed Data 2018

Respondents determination who will be the samples for each faculty is done by asking directly for those who visit the library about their situation, this is one of the ways that can be done in attracting samples using proportional random sampling Nazir (2005) in Silvia (2009: 26).

DISCUSSION

Central Library of IAIN Ternate was establish in 1982 along with the construction of Faculty IAIN Alauddin in Ternate. Central Library of IAIN Ternate placed in a two floor building with the total area 1.200 M2 in the central of university. Central Library of IAIN Ternate building can accomodate around 50 readers in the same time.

The respondents as sample in this research is the student of IAIN Ternate start from gender, age, faculty, department, level of term. Table below shows the respondents detail:

Table. 4.1
Number of Respondent based on Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>User</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed Data 2018

Table. 4.2
Number of Respondent based on Age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>User</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>18 years</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>19 years</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>20 years</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>21 years</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>22 years</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>23 years</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>24 years</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>25 years old above</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed Data 2018
### Table. 4.4
Number of Respondent based on Department

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Faculty</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>User</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Syariah Economic Islam</td>
<td>S1 Ahkwal'asyisiah (AS)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Mu'amalah (MM)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Islamic Criminal Law (HPI)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Islamic Constitutional Law (HTNI)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Accounting Syariah</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Economic Syariah</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Financial Management Syariah (MKS)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Banking Syariah</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D3 Banking Syariah</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ushuluddin Adab and Dawah</td>
<td>S1 History of Islamic Civilization (SPI)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Knowledge of Alquran and Tafsir (IAT)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Islamic Broadcasting Communication (KPI)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Tarbiyah and Ilmu Keguruan</td>
<td>S1 Islamic Education (PAI)</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Islamic Education Management (MPI)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Arabic Language Education (PBA)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Biology Education</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Mathematics Education</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Pend. Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah (PGMI)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Pend. Guru Raudathul Atfal (PGRA)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S1 Counseling Guidance</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Graduate School</td>
<td>S2 Islamic Education (PI)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S2 Islamic Family Law (HKI)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>S2 Syariah Economic Law (HES)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 100 100


### Table. 4.5
Number of Respondent based on Term

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Semester</th>
<th>User</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
<th>Cumulative percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>II</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>IV</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>42.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>VI</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>56.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>93.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>97.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>XII</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>97.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 100 100

Source: Processed Data (2018)

Based on table 4.5, above the number of users who are sampled by term, greatly affect the value of library visits. Where the highest number of respondents visited first was VIII semester, arround 37 users or 37%, this was because in this semester the library conducted a final research. And the second highest number of respondents is the second semester total 24 users or 24%, this is because of library curiosity and assignments by the lecturers. The following is the third highest respondent, the fourth semester, arround 18 users or 18%, this is caused by the assignments by the lecturer. Then the fourth highest respondent, namely semester VI about14 users or 14%, then the fifth highest
respondent is semester X about 4 users or 4%, then the highest respondent was sixth semester XIV about to 3 users or 3%, and the lowest respondents is semester XII where there were no visiting visitors in this semester, due to the fact that the average user in this semester had already become an alumni.

Then the research refers to the discussion about influence of Information control towards user satisfaction (Y) in Central Library of IAIN Ternate. The discussion of the research result guided by the descriptive data, analysis result and hypothesis testing that has been done based on the studies and theories that support this research.

LINEAR DATA

Figure 4.1. matrix scatter

By matrix scatters as shown in figure 4.1 shows that lowest dot placed around linear line, means each of variables X1, X2, X3, X4, X5 and Y related linearly. The bigger value of each X1, X2, X3, X4 and X5 the bigger Y.

HYPOTHESIS TESTING PARTIALLY

Result of regression analysis for partially testing shows in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>4.207</td>
<td>1.235</td>
<td>3.407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X1</td>
<td>1.452</td>
<td>.452</td>
<td>.336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X2</td>
<td>.938</td>
<td>.400</td>
<td>.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X3</td>
<td>-.196</td>
<td>.367</td>
<td>-.050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X4</td>
<td>.842</td>
<td>.298</td>
<td>.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>X5</td>
<td>1.006</td>
<td>.312</td>
<td>.255</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Primary Data processed by SPSS ver 17,2018

In the partial test divided into 2 parts which are feasibility test coefficient independent variable and feasibility test of constant. From the table above shows that the p-value (sig) for constant and independent variable is less than 5% except for variable X3, it show that Ho is rejected, means constant and coefficient X1, X2, X3, X4 and X5 is feasible to use. This result conclude that:

a) Availability of collection affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate

b) Timeliness affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate
c) Equipment **not** affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate
d) Convenience affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate
e) Self-Reliance affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate

HYPOTHESIS TESTING SIMULTANEOUSLY

Result of regression analysis for simultaneously shows in the table below:
### ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>1032.203</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>206.441</td>
<td>25.852</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>750.637</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>7.985</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1782.840</td>
<td>99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), X5, X2, X4, X3, X1
b. Dependent Variable: Y

From the table above, obtained that the p-value (sig.) = 0.00 that less than 5%, it is shows that Ho rejected, means simultaneously all the independent variable affected to the dependent variable or user satisfaction.

### COEFFICIENT OF DETERMINATION

Result of determination test below obtained that $R^2$ (Adjusted $R$ square) about 0.579 or 57.9%. It is shows that the percentage contribution of influence X1, X2, X3, X4, and X5 towards (Y) in Central Library of IAIN Ternate about 0.579 or 57.9%.

### Result of Determination Test ($R^2$)Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.761</td>
<td>.579</td>
<td>.557</td>
<td>2.826</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), X5, X2, X4, X3, X1

### CONDITION OF COMMUNITY IN ACCESSING LITERATURE

To maximize the role, Central Library of IAIN Ternate make some improvements. Such as the use of information technology in form of SLIMS and digitizing collection. SLIMS is Senayan Library management Systems, a software/program used information retrieval of information library collections in the central library of IAIN Ternate. There is also digitizing collection as doubling collection from hardcopy to be softcopy, and additional some previous collection soft files. To access some literature collection from Central Library of IAIN Ternate, can be seen on the web address: [http://www.iainternate.ac.id/perpustakaan.php](http://www.iainternate.ac.id/perpustakaan.php).

To find out how far the role of the library as the source of information and literature, so that conduct the surveys and interviews in several places especially in Ternate and Tidore held in September 2018. The survey and interview moments were also used as a socialization of library collections in the Central Library of IAIN Ternate and the ease of access via internet. From the survey results it is known that the community literacy interest in using the library is still low. This can be seen from the visit library list book with a small number of visits and lack of costumer.

From the interview with the employees of Tidore library, mentioned that the community still not understand yet about the information services in Library so that a lot of people not interest to visit library. As the solution, there is a need to do educative promotion and socialization to the people about the importance of library and benefits that can be gain from the people by the existence of library.

So that the result of the interview in the high school such as head of Senior High School of 1 Ternate and the manager of library in Senior High School of 1 Ternate, that in the school already conducted integration literature collection to the program of SLIMS so the people can access literature information through internet everywhere. But it does not work optimally because not supported by the proper internet connection. As the solution there should be assistance from the local government especially the free internet assistance in the area of library in order to help the fluency and access the literature materials.

### CONCLUSION

Based on the research and discussion, the conclusion that can be deliver about the influence of information control towards user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate, such as:

1. Availability of collection affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate;
2. Timeliness affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate;
3. Equipment not affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate;
4. Convenience affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate;
5. Self-Reliance affect the user satisfaction Central Library of IAIN Ternate;
6. Simultaneously all the independent variables such as availability of collection, timeliness, equipment, convenience and self-reliance;
7. Lack of educative promotion and socialization about the use of information technology from the library manager, the community cannot maximally access library materials in the library.

SUGGESTION

To fulfill the user satisfaction towards quality of services, collection, facilities and infrastructure Central Library of IAIN Ternate, so that can be suggest for:
1. Services quality that consists of assurance, knowledge, insight, ability and friendliness of librarians. Empathy, caring and giving attention, responsiveness, always ready to help, and reliability can affect student satisfaction, it is recommended that the Central Library IAIN Ternate can improve service quality for student’s satisfaction;
2. The library makes promotion program by share the information of new literatures in the display board. Give the rewards to the user who often visit the library and introduce the library services intensely.

REFERENCES

Cook, Colleen, and Fred Heath. "Users’ Perceptions of Library Service


Croll, Jennifer Anna, 2014. The effect of personality and culture in client/provider interactions and its effect on customer relationships, Johannesburg.


Dewi, Dimika Sari, 2015. pengaruh the big five personality dan Kepemimpinan transformasional terhadap Kinerjakaryawan di karana jimbaran villa. Unud, Bali


Fatmawati, Endang. 2011 Jurnal Ilmiah Kepustakawanan "Libaria": Kajian Teoritis Mengenai Metode LibQUAL+ untuk Mengevaluasi Kualitas Layanan Perpustakaan


Gerson, Richard F (2002). Mengukur Kepuasan pelanggan, Cet. 2. PPM. Jakarta


Layanan Digital Library Terhadap Kepuasan Pengguna Menggunakan Metode Libqual, (Studi Kasus: Perpustakaan Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Riau) Riau


PNRI 2002, Pedoman Umum Perpustakaan Perguruan Tinggi, Jakarta
Rahayuningsih, Fransisca. 2013. Analisis Kepuasan Pemustaka Terhadap Kualitas Layanan Menggunakan Metode LibQual; Studi Kasus di Perpustakaan Universitas Sanata Dharma Yogyakarta, hal 74 – 90


RohmandanYullianti 2016, Effect of Library Service Quality on Users Satisfaction in The Library of The Faculty of Communication, Unpad. Bandung

Robert Half selasa 27 Maret 2018, Riset bertajuk Happines Workpadansebuahperusahaanaperikra utentenagakerjapadaharahan tribunMedan.com,


Undang-Undang No. 43 tahun 2007 Tentang Perpustakaan Badan Standarisi Nasional. 2009 Perpustakaan Perguruan Tinggi. Jakarta


Wang, Fang, 2010, Individual Characteristics in Performance Appraisal, Concordia University Montreal, Quebec, Canada


SNAPSHOT OF THE COMPETITIVENESS OF SENIOR HIGH SCHOOLS (SMA) IN TORAJA UTARA REGENCY, INDONESIA

Rede Roni Bare¹, Haedar Akib², Anshari³, Hasnawi Haris⁴, Rudi Salam⁵
¹-⁵ Universitas Negeri Makassar
Email: rederoni19@gmail.com¹, haedar652002@yahoo.com.au², anshari@unm.ac.id³, hasnawi.haris@unm.ac.id⁴, rudisalam@unm.ac.id

Abstract

This article aims to explain the results of mapping competitiveness (institutional) senior high school with individual school citizens (Principals, Teachers, Education staff, Students) in Toraja Utara Regency. The research method used is a survey. Data was collected using observation, questionnaires, interviews and documentation techniques. Data were analyzed using descriptive-quantitative statistics. The results showed that senior high schools (SMA) in Toraja Utara Regency had a high level of sustainable competitiveness in terms of the following aspects: 1) Institutionally (senior high school) and individually (school citizens) were used as focus and effective locus of benchmarking, accredited schools, partner schools and some achievements. 2) High school students attend and win various types of regional, reginal, national, international competitions; 3) High school teachers participate and win in regency, provincial and national level competitions. Furthermore, participating in various benchmarking programs at home and abroad. 4) Education staff (principals and school administration staff) participate in the regency, provincial and national level competitions. 5) Achievement of these school achievements is evidence of institutional building, capacity building, and the actualization of the pillars of school-based management and community-based schools.

Keywords: Excellence in competitiveness; school achievement; good school governance (GSG)

INTRODUCTION

The superiority of a nation's competitiveness, including Indonesia, can be seen from the quality of education and human resources (HR) owned (Ali, 2009; Ali, 2013; Bacchus, 2008; Brown & Lauder, 1996; Hanushek & Kimko, 2000). The results of the research show that the average quality of Indonesian human resources is relatively lower compared to other countries in the world. The World Agency for Development Program (UNDP) placed Indonesia in the 111th rank out of 182 countries in the development of the human development index / HDI (Sadono, 2010). Then the 2016 Human Development Report (UNDP, 2016) notes that Indonesia's HDI in 2015 was ranked 113, down from 110 in 2014. The rating was lower compared to several Southeast Asian countries.

The Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System (Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, 2003) formulates the functions and objectives of national education that must be used as a reference in developing and enhancing educational competitiveness in Indonesia. Article 3 of the National Education System Law states that, "National education functions to develop and shape dignified national character and civilization in order to educate the life of the nation, with the aim of developing potential students to become human beings who believe and fear God Almighty, noble, healthy, knowledgeable, competent, creative, independent and a democratic and responsible citizen. "The aim of national education is the expected ideal of the profile of the quality of Indonesian people...
that must be developed by each education unit. Therefore, the formulation of the objectives of national education is the basis for the development of competitive cultural education and national character.

Based on the normative foundation above, it is clear that education in every type and unit of education must be carried out systematically and sustainably to achieve that goal. The education system in Indonesia must be developed by the demands of current needs and developments, both at the local, national and international/global levels. The problem according to Hakim (2012) is whether education in each education unit has been carried out properly and achieved the results as expected. To see the quality of education implementation can be seen from several indicators. Indicators of the quality of educational outcomes that have been used so far include the National Examination score, the percentage of graduation, the drop out rate (DO), the number repeating the grade, the percentage of graduates who continue to pursue higher education (Raharjo, 2012; Surakhirmand, 2009; Tilaar, 1992, 1998). These indicators tend to be quantitative, easy to measure and universal. Also, qualitative indicators are used which include: believing and fearing the Almighty God, noble, physically and mentally healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, innovative, independent, being a democratic and responsible citizen. Qualitative indicators are related to the formation of character, attitudes and skills in entrepreneurship of students so that they can compete, ethical, moral, courtesy (Departemen Pendidikan Nasional, 2003; Menteri Pendidikan Nasional, 2013; Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, 2003).

To realize competitive education, it is demanded that the application of superior programs focus on efforts to improve quality for all components and educational activities (schooling). In the view of experts (Akib & Gana, 2002; Oktarina, 2007; Raharjo, 2012; Rahayu, 2010; Tilaar, 1992, 1998) (Niswaty, Rusbiati, Jamaluddin, & Salam, 2017; Saggaf, Salam, & Rifka, 2017), improving the quality and competitiveness of educational institutions can be done by improving the quality of human resources "school members "who are members of it, including improving the quality of their management through school-based management approaches (Akib & Gana, 2002; Cheng, 2013; Dimmock, 2013; Surakhirmand, 2009; Tilaar, 1992) and community-based schools (Antrop-González & De Jesús, 2006; Smith & Sobel, 2014).

The low quality of Indonesian human resources is thought to be caused by the low quality of management of its education system (Akib, 2005; Akib & Saleh, 2015; Muhamad Ali, 2013; Rahayu, 2010; Rahmawati & Amri, 2013). The low quality of education, both at the elementary, secondary and high levels of education is one of the four main educational problems that many parties complain about. Senior High School (SMA) as one of the educational institutions that produce graduates is one that is highlighted by various groups and is considered necessary to improve quality and competitiveness sustainably. The government as a regulator in the field of education constantly strives to improve the quality and competitiveness of senior high schools through changes in laws, policy formulation and program breakthroughs. One of the government's efforts to improve the quality of education in senior high schools is through improving the quality of governance of system components (context, input, process, product, outcome) schooling (Akib, 2008; Ali, 2013; Jufri, Akib, Ridjajl, Sahabuddin, & Said, 2018; Mutohar, 2013; A. Syam, Akib, Yunus, & Hasbiah, 2018; H. Syam, Akib, Patonangi, & Guntur, 2018) - influential students, teachers, curriculum, learning, buildings and learning facilities and so on towards improving school accreditation status.

According to Rahayu (2010) that increasing public awareness of quality education will open up opportunities for actors or actors in the education industry to develop an education system that offers a wide variety of weaknesses or excellence. In this case, the school management is required to continually revitalize its strategy which enables the schools it manages to have high
competitiveness sustainably. The flagship school was established as a vehicle to create quality and competent human resources, because with high ability and competitiveness, they are more ready to appear and be ready to use in the face of life full of competition. Therefore, to be a competitive and superior school, school management is faced with the problem of the ability to create and or offer various programs that are relatively better than others. This capacity gap can occur because the resources owned by several schools are quite diverse and not strong enough to be able to respond to the demands of the school environment and or competition. The article results of this study explain the snapshot of high school competitiveness in Toraja Utara Regency.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The development of an institution (public, business, non-profit) to maintain or enhance its competitive advantage is based on the applied strategic approach (Luo, 2007; O'Shannassy, 2008; Ritala & Ellonen, 2010; K. G. Smith, Grimm, & Gannon, 1992). Excellence is the relative position of an organization against other organizations, both to one organization, some organizations or whole organizations in an industry (O'Shannassy, 2008; Porter, 1996, 2008; Prahalad & Hamel, 2000). According to Akib (2003), the strategy for achieving the competitive advantage of an organization is based on the application of a knowledge management approach, because this approach synergizes market-based approaches or perspectives (Porter, 1996, 2008) and organizational resource-based approaches (Prahalad & Hamel, 2000).

In a market perspective, the relative position is generally related to customer value. Whereas in the perspective of organizational resources, the relative position is generally related to better or higher organizational performance. According to Ali (2013), Mutohar (2013) and Rahayu (2010), an organization including education units that have the potential to have an advantage if they can create and offer more customer value (superior customer-value), or better performance than others. The phenomenon of superior schools or ‘claiming’ as superior schools can be traced/found both at domestic and international levels.

Excellence, both from a market perspective and organizational resource perspective, can be achieved or achieved by two basic strategies, namely competitive strategies and collaborative strategies (Rahayu, 2010), or by coopetition strategies (Akib, 2005; Bengtsson & Kock, 2000; Luo, 2007; Tsai, 2002) which is understood as a form of competition that results in collaboration. The question is, how can an educational unit compete (competitive strategy) or collaborate (cooperative strategy) to achieve excellence? The answer is a decision on the type of strategy chosen and applied based on the competency of the resources that are owned. Competitive strategies are effectively applied if an organization has better resources than its competitors. Whereas when the resources that are owned are not good or inferior resources compared to their competitors, the cooperation strategy is more appropriate to be chosen. Whereas in situations where resources are relatively the same as others, consideration of the right choice of strategies is more focused on market attractiveness.

A number of experts (Akib, 2003; O'Shannassy, 2008; Porter, 1996, 2008; Prahalad & Hamel, 2000; K. G. Smith et al., 1992; Sulaiman, 2015) agree with Porter's view (1990) that in the design and implementation of competitive strategies there are three scenarios which can be selected and applied together, namely the cost strategy, differentiation strategy scenario and focus scenario. The cost strategy substance is related to the creation and supply of products, for one unit of benefits that is relatively the same at a lower price. In this case, a school offers certain programs and benefits (relatively the same as those offered by similar schools) with lower prices or benefits. While the differentiation strategy substance is related to the creation and supply of products, for one unit of benefits that is more unique, with relatively the same price,
in this case, to achieve excellence a school can offer programs and benefits that are more unique than those offered by similar schools at relatively the same price. While the focus strategy is related to determining focus choices that are appropriate to the needs of the locus, so, to achieve excellence, a school can choose the focus of the field of study, both as the main focus of study and as a focus of its development, for example Natural Sciences, Social Sciences, humanities, languages and literature to be developed sustainably.

Based on the conceptual framework made, the focus of the discussion of this article is the existing conditions regarding the competitiveness of senior high schools in Toraja Utara Regency viewed from institutional, structural and individual good school governance / SSG and institutionally carried out through institutional building elements of the school system and structurally carried out through structuring the system, procedures and methods of activities (curricular, intra-curriculum, extracurricular) of school organizations. While individually carried out through capacity building programs for school residents (principals and employees, teachers and students). Good school governance is carried out to realize the vision and mission of the school goals and to create value for the public that supports school competitiveness in a sustainable manner.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research is survey research that aims to explore and explain the phenomena that are interesting to discuss in society, namely the competitiveness of senior high school (SMA) competitiveness, especially in preparing students to take part in competitions and face college entrance examinations and improve accreditation status school. The discussion about the status of school accreditation is important because there are schools that are accredited A (Very Good / Superior), B (good), C (sufficient) as a regular school. It is assumed that A-accredited schools are considered superior to B-accredited or C-accredited high schools. Likewise, people's views on the status of these schools affect the interest of prospective students and their parents to choose to send their children to A-accredited schools compared to B-accredited schools or accredited C.

Data was collected using observation techniques, questionnaires, interviews and documentation. Observations are focused on all indicators that characterize school competitiveness in a sustainable manner. Then, interviews were conducted with key informants, Head of Toraja Utara Regency Education Office, eight school principals or deputy principals in the school studied, sixteen permanent teachers teaching in the school, sixteen outstanding students representing eight schools, eight staff each school administration represents the school, three school supervisors, two education leaders and one member of the Toraja Utara Regency legislature.

The sample schools studied were SMAN 1 Toraja Utara, SMAN 3 Toraja, SMAN 6 Toraja Utara, 1 Rentepao Christian SMA, Rantepao Christian SMA 2, Barana Christian SMA, Rantepao Catholic SMA and Rantepao SMA Pelita. Data collection techniques used were observations, questionnaires, interview and documentation. Data analysis using quantitative descriptive statistics (Liu, Parelisius, & Singh, 1999; Stone, Sidel, Oliver, Woolsey, & Singleton, 2008; Yusuf, 2016) with the support of qualitative data from the results of observations, interviews and documentation. Data analyzed relates to a snapshot of the competitiveness of senior high school competitiveness. The object of research is high school, both state and private in Toraja Utara Regency.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The existing conditions of the schools studied (State and Private Senior High Schools in Toraja Utara Regency) can be described as follows. In general the situation of school resources includes educators, education staff (including among others school supervisors, principals, school administration staff, librarians, laboratory staff), education/learning facilities and infrastructure,
and relatively diverse management/school administration systems. The situation of school resources related to educators/teachers shows that the level of suitability of the teacher's formal/academic education background with the subjects that are given is relatively high, meaning that teachers teach according to their main areas of expertise obtained from educational personnel education institutions. While the number of "certified educator" teachers as teachers or professional educators is relatively large, because it has exceeded 35 percent of the expected minimum standards (Observations and interviews, 2018-2019).

Then, regarding the educational staff related to the suitability of the number of administrative staff with school needs, administrative / academic qualifications of administrative staff, administrative staff experience in administrative activities or technical services and the ability of administrative personnel to carry out administrative tasks to support the education / learning process in school in general, relatively adequate or of sufficient quality. Likewise, the number of administrative staff / technical personnel who are by the needs of the school looks quite good. While the academic qualifications/education of administrative staff / technical personnel are by the needs of the school, when compared with the average level of teacher education in the school it also looks quite adequate and of sufficient quality (Observations and interviews, 2018-2019).

The situation and condition of the infrastructure and facilities of education or learning that covers the land area, school buildings, classrooms/laboratories/libraries/offices and learning facilities look quite adequate and well-maintained. Only the school building infrastructure is considered inadequate because there are several schools built/located in hilly areas, while other infrastructure such as classrooms, laboratories, libraries, meeting rooms and other facilities also look adequate and well-maintained.

Meanwhile, the management/school administration system looks adequate or high quality, because it is led by experienced school principals, especially since school principals are selected and appointed through competency-based principals' appointment procedures. The quality of school management is also based on a clear vision, mission and school goals as well as a good school governance / GSG system. Likewise, quality assurance and or standard operating procedures (SOPs) carried out on each activity are clear and effective (observations and interviews, 2018-2019).

Value creation programs are activities or programs designed and implemented by schools that are oriented towards meeting the needs of school members. This is in accordance with the views of experts (Hillman & Keim, 2001; Lorange, 2005; Priem, 2007) that value or benefit is the extent to which customer organizations feel an item, service or service has fulfilled their desires or needs, as measured by the customer's willingness to pay such goods, services or services. This measure is usually more dependent on customer perceptions of product value than its intrinsic value. Definition of value creation itself is a process of creating value that is carried out by the organization efficiently to make a profit. Values are created through activity, such as cutting a tree then making it a wooden board, or creativity, for example making a logo or writing a scientific work. Of course not all activities create value, for example moving stones from one place to another. Value creation is the organization's core activity. The creation of superior value will open opportunities for high profits (Hillman & Keim, 2001; Lorange, 2005; Priem, 2007).

The value creation program in this article is measured through the situation under consideration or the benefits and sacrifices and the compatibility between benefits and sacrifices (Moore, 1994; Tuan, 2008; Wiseman, 1965). The external situation that is dominantly considered in the design and implementation of activities or customer value-oriented school programs is the demands/learning needs and or student
learning while other aspects such as other similar school situations and the competitive environment between schools are not considered. Regarding the internal situation of the school that is dominantly considered, namely the availability of land/school building infrastructure and learning facilities, followed by consideration of the state of education (teaching) and education staff.

Programs or activities designed and implemented by senior high schools in Toraja Utara Regency offer functional benefits and emotional benefits at the same time. The benefits of academic services or learning with professional teachers are most often offered in school programs or activities, then the support of building/room infrastructure and learning facilities are optimally used using a contextual learning approach. Likewise the benefits of pride in school, self-confidence, optimism and other emotional benefits, although walking "naturally" according to the character of the school community, but also positive consequences for efforts to increase school competitiveness sustainably. Interviews with a number of informants (2019) agreed that the character of a strong community in facing challenges, also internalized into students in senior high schools in Toraja Utara Regency, moreover it was seen that the "awareness" of third grade students was also higher, because they felt "briefly again "they will graduate from school, where among them there are plans to go on to higher education and some will seek work by "armed with" a senior high school diploma. Therefore, to get the desired benefits, students and other stakeholders bear a lot of time and energy to attend the learning / academic process or other activities (extracurricular), as well as additional costs to meet their school needs. The degree of conformity between benefits and sacrifices in the program or activity carried out at school is relatively optimal.

The results showed that high schools in Toraja Utara Regency had sustainable competitiveness that was "quite high" seen from the following aspects: 1) Institutionally (senior high school) and individually (school citizens) were used as focus and effective locus of benchmarking, accredited schools, partner schools (pengimbas) and some achievements. 2) High school students attend and win various types of regional, reginal, national, international competitions; 3) High school teachers participate and win in district, provincial and national level competitions. Furthermore, participating in various benchmarking programs at home and abroad. 4) Education staff (principals and school administration staff) participate in district, provincial and national level competitions. 5) The achievement of school achievements is evidence of the existence of good school governance (GSG), institutional strengthening and actualization of the pillars of school-based management (management, teaching-learning processes, community participation) and community-based school strengthening.

Institutionally, many high schools in Toraja Utara Regency were chosen as focus and benchmarking locus (comparative study, study visit, teaching practice place for prospective teachers) because besides being in the "heart" of one of the national tourism destinations (Tanah Toraja), high schools in Toraja Utara is also considered a school where students and alumni are relatively "superior" in the fields of natural sciences and mathematics (Interview Results, 2018). Similarly, individually, high school students from Toraja Utara are known to have high achievement motivation, diligence in learning, resistance to migration and compactness in conducting academic activities (Results of interviews and observations, 2018-2019).

Capitalizing on the personal character of Toraja Utara high school students who are known to be tough and diligent, a number of their students regularly follow and win various types of regional, reginal, national and international competitions. This is evidenced by the many achievements that have been achieved, including champions in various competitions in various fields and levels, as shown in diagram 1.
The achievements of high school students in Toraja Utara Regency in detail and gradually in the last four years, can be read in table 1.

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Level of achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition to the achievement indicators of these students, another indicator that shows the achievement of high school achievements in Toraja Utara Regency is the number of alumni who continue their education to tertiary levels, both domestic and foreign tertiary institutions, as shown in diagram 2.

### Diagram 2

**Percentage of Senior High School Alumni (SMA) in Toraja Utara Regency Entering Higher Education**

High school teachers in Toraja Utara Regency participated and won championships in various types of competitions at the district, provincial and national levels. Furthermore, participating in various benchmarking programs at home and abroad. The domestic benchmarking program is in addition to fellow teachers visiting schools at the South Sulawesi Provincial level, so study teachers and educational staff is also involved in programs such as this whereas the benchmarking program abroad which is attended by high school teachers from Toraja Utara is to neighboring countries, such as Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand (Interview results, 2018-2019).
Teacher Achievement of Senior High School at the Toraja Utara Regency in 4 (Four) Last Years

The achievements of high school teachers in Toraja Utara Regency in detail and gradually in the last four years can be read in table 2.

Table 2

Teacher Achievement of Senior High School at the Toraja Utara Regency in 4 (Four) Last Years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Level of achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education staff, especially school principals and administrative staff of the senior high school in Toraja Utara Regency also showed active participation in regency, provincial and national level competitions. Particularly for high school principals, whose data is presented in diagram 4, it appears that they are very active in participating in activities and some of them win, including at national level competition activities.

In addition to achieving the above achievements, in the process of organizing high school education in Toraja Utara Regency, for example SMAN 2 Toraja Utara also collaborates in the following forms: Collaboration with parents of students, forms of cooperation that have been established so far include donors in supporting operational activities and provision of school facilities (SPP and DPP), school partners in education development, partners in guiding the activities of students and dialogue partners in improving the quality of education. Likewise, cooperation with other agencies in the form of: cooperation with the Office of JAMSOSTEK (Workers' Social Security) for teachers and employees; Collaboration with Teacher College (Technical Implementation Unit) UPT, TC graduates supply teachers' needs in Lentera Harapan; Collaboration with UPH (Daily Implementation Unit) in the form of regular and special scholarships (teacher education, nursing, psychology, and other faculties); Collaboration with public and private universities.

The perspective of a good school governance strategy in realizing the senior high school vision and mission in Toraja Utara Regency is, for example, in Rantepao Christian Senior High School 2 to hold worship activities, treat 3R (Respect, Responsibility, Readiness), develop students' potential in extracurricular activities, develop student potential in OSN, FLS2N, O2SN and other activities, holding training and workshops for teachers and employees, selecting students to be recommended to receive scholarships at UPH in general (regular) and special programs (Teacher Colege, Nursing, Psychology, Theology), additional facilities and learning infrastructure as needed (observations and interviews, 2018-2019).

The achievements of students, teachers and education staff (especially principals) of high schools in Toraja Utara Regency, as
presented above, show a snapshot of the superiority of senior high school competitiveness. Likewise, this achievement of school students at senior high school in Toraja Utara supports the acquisition of school accreditation status, as shown in diagram 5.

Diagram 5
Accreditation status of Senior High School in Toraja Utara Regency

Referring to the views of experts (O'Shannassy, 2008; Porter, 1996, 2008; Prahalad & Hamel, 2000), as stated, it is clear that excellence is the relative position of an organization for other organizations, both for one organization, for some organizations or the whole organization in an industry. In this case, the governance of institutions or organizations (schools, educational units) in the education sector cannot be understood by the same as "industrial sector", even though the industry competition concept is applied in its governance to be competitive. Schools, more specifically senior high school (SMA), are a formal educational organization that is deliberately established and managed by the government together with all elements of civil society as "a place to educate the nation's children." This reality underlies the understanding of "school-based management" (Cheng, 2013; Dimmock, 2013; Murphy & Beck, 1995) and "community-based schools" (Smith & Sobel, 2014; Warren, Hong, Rubin, & Uy, 2009), such as only the views of society (social learning, Wenger, 2000) and experts regarding the existence and orientation of school development as - one - continuous learning organization (Gilley & Maycunich, 2000; Marquardt, 2011; Senge, 2014).

The success achieved by SMA in Toraja Utara Regency is based on the results of good school governance because it applies the concept or principle of school-based management with three pillars, namely management, learning and community participation. Realization of institutional building programs and capacity building at the focus of educational institutions. Likewise, success is achieved because it has applied a knowledge management strategy approach (Akib, 2005) that synergizes the application of a school-based perspective of resource organization with a market-based perspective characterized by its unique focus and locus.

CONCLUSION

The superiority of high school competitiveness in Toraja Utara Regency is quite high seen from institutional (high school) and individually through the achievements that have been achieved by the residents of the school. His achievements have impacted on improving the school's image as a focus and benchmarking for effective schools, accredited schools, partner schools and leading schools. The achievement of school achievements is evidence of institutional building, capacity building in educational institutions and as a re-actualization of the pillars of school-based management and community-based schools.

REFERENCE


Akib, H., & Gana, F. (2002). Transformasi manajemen sistem pendidikan di era


145


Tuan, M. T. (2008). Measuring and/or estimating social value creation: Insights


Room 5

Overall Program 2019
DISCRETION AND DILEMMA STREET-LEVEL BUREAUCRATS IN PUBLIC SERVICES: Home Cara *Dottorotta*

Hasniati
Lecturer in Public Administration Department
Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar, Indonesia

Abstract

This article aims to describe the discretion and dilemma faced by street-level bureaucrats (SLBs) in the implementation of *dottorotta* home care programs in Makassar City, Indonesia. This study used a qualitative descriptive approach with data collection techniques in-depth interviews, observation and analysis of documents relevant to the research. The results showed that in implementing the *dottorotta* home care program, SLBs were often faced with scarcity of resources, both human and financial, and limited service time. To deal with the scarcity of these resources, SLBs use their discretionary authority, but in reality they are often faced with ethical dilemmas and psychological dilemmas. In this situation, SLBs use their experience and expertise so that the decisions taken do not harm the organization and the community it serves.

INTRODUCTION

“Unlike lower-level workers in most organizations, street-level bureaucrats have considerable discretion in determining the nature, amount, and quality of benefits and sanctions provided by their agencies. Policemen decide who to arrest and whose behavior to overlook. Judges decide who shall receive a suspended sentence and who shall receive maximum punishment. Teachers decide who will be suspended and who will remain in school, and they make subtle determinations of who is teachable.”

Michael Lipsky (1980: 13)

The Makassar City Government’s initiative to launch a home care program is a manifestation of the government’s responsibility in providing health services to its citizen. Home care is a health care program that is provided for individuals and families in their homes with the aim of promoting, maintaining or maximizing the level of independence and minimizing the effects of disability and pain for residents of Makassar City. This program does not look at the status of citizens. Anyone from Makassar who contacted the Home Care Call Center of the nearest health center from his home will be visited by a medical team for a quick reaction according to the condition of the residents’ disease. This program combines the components of home care which include patients, families, professional service delivery (multidisciplinary) and the aim is to help patients return to optimum levels of health and independence.

In implementing programs, SLBs are often faced with limited resources (Lipsky, 1980, 2010; Tummers, 2017; Hill & Hupe, 2009), while the number of clients to be served is unlimited. To overcome the problem of limitations and scarcity of these resources, they make discretion which often creates individual dilemmas for them (Lipsky, 1980, 2010). The ethical dilemmas of the health sector include secrecy, disclosure of personal information, and patient autonomy (Wilkins, 2012; Endradita, 2017). Policy implementers crucially need the freedom to adapt the program to local conditions for being motivated to implement a policy (Thomann, Van Engen & Tummers, 2018).

Street-level bureaucracy is a bureaucracy that interacts directly to provide services to the community and is the executor of the policies of the ruler (Lipsky, 1980, 2010; Alden, 2015). Whereas people who work in street-level bureaucracy are called street-level bureaucrats (SLBs). Public service directly means that these bureaucrats provide services directly to the community (patients). The executor of the ruling policy means that each of the frontline bureaucrats is carrying out the policies of the central or regional government, and they also strengthen the policy. Because street-level bureaucracy is directly dealing with the public
and also as executors directly from public services, so that all complaints and responses from the public (patients) regarding the actions in organizing the program are addressed to them. As a result, SLBs often conflict with the community. Lipsky argued that street-level bureaucrats engender controversy because they must be dealt with if policy is to change (Lipsky, 1980, 2010).

As individuals in groups, SLBs have regular interactions directly with community members or service recipients. As well as having the power to implement policies in the form of services, demands and witnesses to service recipients. Every SLBs decision and action actually becomes or represents a policy. SLBs focus on the dilemma felt by SLBs in providing public services (Lipsky, 1980, 2010). The dilemma of SLBs is the interaction with citizens or recipients of services which makes work pressure increase for SLBs in implementing a policy. This direct interaction makes the decisions and actions of the SLBs become or represent a policy issued by the government. Meanwhile, what happens is that frontline bureaucrats sometimes take deviant actions to reduce the work pressure they experience (Lipsky, 2010). These deviant actions carried out by SLBs make people lazy to use the service. For example, playing with the cost of service to the community, being unresponsive in providing services, providing incomplete service information and taking discriminatory actions to service recipients (Lipsky, 2010).

In conditions of increasing work pressure felt by SLBs, discretion is a way that can be used by SLBs to describe and formulate the right decisions in implementing a policy (Lipsky, 2010). In policy implementation research specifically, discretion concerns the extent of freedom that frontline workers have to choose among possible courses of behavior when implementing policies (Davis 1969; Hupe 2013). The discretion gives access to frontline bureaucrats to strengthen a government policy and choose existing alternatives to improve the course of a policy. The discretion taken by SLBs is a fact that occurs because SLBs are professionals in their field. However, the reality found by SLBs is sometimes detached from the supervision of organizational authorities in carrying out complex tasks and cannot be fully written or reduced in policy formulations (Lipsky, 2010).

The low quality of public services is partly due to the low discretion of the bureaucracy, especially at the SLBs level, so that the services produced are less flexible and do not respond to people's needs in real terms. This article aims to describe the discretion and dilemma faced by SLBs in implementing the home care program.

**Health services: Home Care-Dottorotta**

Home care is a service that has actually existed in the world since the beginning of the 19th century. In the history of Home Care in America, all activities of caring for patients is an activity commonly practiced by society in general, because in that century everyone still handled sick family members alone, even at that time family or neighbors from families whose family members died doing preparations for their own burial or mutual cooperation (Kompasiana, 2017).

Home care is one form of innovation in public services launched by the Mayor of Makassar City, Moh. Ramdhan Pomanto since 2015 (Saenab, 2017). Home Care is a continuous and comprehensive health service that is given to individuals and families where they live which aims to increase, maintain or maximize the level of independence and minimize the consequences of disease. Home care health services are given the name Dottorotta, which means our doctor. This program has received much appreciation from both the community and the Government of the Republic of Indonesia. People feel greatly helped by the existence of health care programs that visit patients to their homes. Dottorotta Home care as a form of government responsibility towards the community to provide health services easily and for free. This home care program has received the Top 35 Public Service Innovation award submitted by the Vice President of the Republic of Indonesia to the Mayor of Makassar. This program has become a national telemedica program so that every city in Indonesia can follow it. Home care is a health
service carried out in a patient’s home by government medical personnel. This program is carried out because there are parts of the community that are not served through conventional services carried out by 46 Puskesmas for 1,398,804 residents (Saenab, 2017). One Community Health Center (Puskesmas) on average serves around 30,409 residents. With this ratio, many residents of Makassar City do not get good health services. There are complaints from people who find it difficult to access health services that are fast, close, and cheap. This causes them to be lazy to go to health services at the Puskesmas. The number of patient visits in 46 Puskesmas in 2014 was 1,316,693 patients, then 1,367,787 in 2015, and 1,243,437 in 2016. Based on these data, a Home Care program is needed to expand access to services, so that city residents can be well served in their homes. The Home Care Program has been implemented since January 2015 by the home care team, which consists of Doctors, Nurses, Physical Therapists, and Speech Pathologists.

Services are carried out 24 hours, through the 112 Call Center which can be accessed by all patients who need it. Then the call center contacts the Puskesmas call center according to the patient’s address area, complete with the patient’s personal data and telephone number. Furthermore, the nearest Puskesmas contacts the patient’s family by telephone to obtain the necessary health service confirmation. The next stage, the home care team visits patients in their homes and provides health services as needed. Each patient receives Home Care services through a doctor in charge or through other Home Care officers, in accordance with the Home Care procedure. If you need to be referred, then the patient is referred after receiving standard treatment. Home Care has the output of the program as follows the fulfillment of health services that reach all levels of society quickly by increasing the independence of patients and families in conducting health care and cheaper financing. The number of patients treated increases sharply over time. The number of patients handled by the Home Care Program since the launch until the end of 2015 is 2,266, and at the end of 2016 there were 4,685. And to support the effectiveness of the program, the Makassar City Government has added a Home Care fleet named the Dottorotta Car. In 2015 up to now the number of Homa Care fleets was 48 vehicles/car for 46 Puskesmas or an average of 1 Dottorotta car for one Puskesmas (Saenab, 2017).

In terms of the target program, Dottorotta home care does not look at the status of citizens. All residents of Makassar City have the same rights, regardless of social status (rich and poor). The patient does not need to have any health insurance card, but it is enough to show the identity Card (KTP) or the domicile information card to get Dottorotta home care health services. Anyone from Makassar who contacted the Home Care Call Center of the nearest health center from his home will be visited by a medical team for a quick reaction according to the condition of the residents’ disease (Abdurrahman, 2016).

Home care consists of 3 forms of services, namely Home Care Visited, Home Care Emergency, and Home Care Follow Up. The cost for accessing home care for the community is free and for all communities regardless of social status. The mechanism of easy home care services is enough with 112 call center parties from the Puskesmas going to home and 24-hour home care services (Putra, Usman & Abdi, 2017).
Patients who are entitled to *Dottorotta* home care health services are patients who cannot wake up, elderly patients, postoperative patients or post-chemotherapy patients from all groups of people, poor and all ages. The medical team that comes to the home is a nurse, doctor, or field, depending on the patient's needs by using a mini *Dottorotta* ambulance/car. *Dottorotta* cars are equipped with standard equipment and medicine. The standard equipment in the car is an ECG Telemedicine and oxygen (O2) tube. The doctor will check the condition of the patient to determine the follow-up of patient care, whether to be referred to the *Puskesmas* or to the hospital. If it does not require serious care, residents are only educated to check their health at the *Puskesmas*.

**Table 1. Home Care Health Services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Type of disease</td>
<td>All type of diseases</td>
<td>1. Cared for in the patient's home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social status</td>
<td>Rich, poor</td>
<td>2. Referred to the nearest health center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient’s condition</td>
<td>Can’t walk, elderly, postoperatively, post chemotherapy, paralyzed,</td>
<td>3. Referred to the hospital</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>All ages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Adopted from Standard Operating Procedure Home Care Makassar City.

**Table 2. Patient Rights in Home Care Services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care</td>
<td>Patients are entitled to complete and quality care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Response**

Patients have the right to get a quick response when they need help.

**Fair treatment**

Patients have the right to be treated equally and regardless of race, belief, gender, age, ethnicity, nationality, source of insurance.

**Treatment**

Have the right to know the problem, treatment plan, and treatment.

**Information**

The patient has the right to keep his medical information confidential.

**Expression**

The patient has the right to express grief or objection without fear that he will be repaid.

**Document**

Entitled to get written documents related to the disease.
Rejection

Entitled to refuse medical treatment after obtaining complete information

METHODS

This research was conducted in 5 Puskesmas which were sampled from 46 Puskesmas in Makassar City. Location determination is based on consideration of the location of the Puskesmas from the Makassar City Center. One Puskesmas located in the City Center, two Puskesmas located in the middle and two puskesmas located farthest from the center of Makassar.

This study uses a qualitative approach that aims to describe the discretion and dilemma faced by the Dottorotta Team in implementing the Home Care program launched by the Makassar City Government. Data collection is done by in-depth interviews, observations, and documentation studies. The informants in this study were SLBs who deliver health services "Dottorotta home care" such as the head of the health center (Puskesmas), doctors, nurses, laboratory staff, and telephone operators who are in charge of answering calls from patients or their families. In interviews the researchers used the voice recorder application to record the results of interviews and researchers also used stationery in the form of books and ballpoints to write things that were considered important that were conveyed by respondents. This interview is done formally (structured) using the interview guidelines that have been provided previously. Observation is used to obtain supporting information and data by using mobile phone cameras to monitor the events and atmosphere of services provided by health workers. While documentation studies are used to obtain information and supporting data sourced from reports about home care services. In addition, library data is also used as a support and reinforcement of data that has been obtained from interviews and observations.

The data analysis technique uses interactive analysis techniques, which are carried out continuously starting with examining all available data from various sources, namely from interviews, observations that have been written in field notes, documents and so on until drawing conclusions. In conducting the analysis, the researcher refers to several stages suggested by Milles & Huberman (1984) which consists of several stages, namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. At the stage of drawing conclusions or verification (conclusion drawing/verification), which is to look for patterns of explanation, possible configuration, flow of causation and propositions.

RESULTS

Discretion

To increase our understanding of the discretion and dilemma in home care services, we will examine the qualitative data. Each quote comes from a different street-level bureaucrat:

First, it became clear that SLBs have the authority to take discretion to overcome the limited human resources (doctors, laboratory, officers, pharmacists, nurses, and drivers) and medical equipment they have. The following quotes illustrate this:

We still lack medical personnel and medical devices, so we must use the Puskesmas budget to cover the shortcomings. Moreover, at home care services, where Dottorotta cars have minimal medical equipment, so inevitably we have to use medical devices for health centers to complete medical devices in the car. In addition, we also provide medical personnel and supporting staff to cover the lack of human resources. For example, ambulance drivers must pay their own salaries from the health center and we also use apprenticeships to assist in health services.

The number of health workers owned by the Puskesmas is still lacking. The average number of doctors in each Puskesmas is 4 people, and health workers are 25 people consisting of laboratory staff, pharmacists, and nurses. The number of health workers owned is considered to be lacking, because in addition to having to serve outpatients at the Puskesmas, they also have to serve home care patients visited to the patient's home. The population served by one
**Puskesmas** is around 30,000 residents. One of them stated that:

> medical devices that we use are tools from the Puskesmas themselves. There is no medical aid from the Makassar City government. Equipment for home care provided by the Makassar City government is only a *Dottorotta* car with limited medical equipment inside. That is what prevents us from going to the field, because we have to move medical devices from the *Puskesmas* to *Dottorotta* cars. Not to mention, if there is a request for service in the morning. Equipment is still used in the *Puskesmas*, so we have to wait for medical devices to be used.

The interview quotation above shows that SLBs have a strong commitment to provide services to the community. To overcome the various problems of limited resources, they make discretionary decisions that are not uncommon to use personal funds to hire a driver. Besides that, he also had to be willing to wait for the equipment to be used at the *Puskesmas* to be taken on a visit to the patient's home. If SLBs do not have the ability to take good discretion, then this limited resource will have an impact on the performance of the public bureaucracy. As stated by Tummer (2017), that limited resources have an impact on the low responsiveness and performance of public agents. Based on information from the person in charge of home care, limitations are not only related to medical personnel (doctors, nurses, laboratory officers), but also the limitations of drivers who can operate home care cars. This is a problem because almost all *Dottorotta* teams are women. To overcome such problems, the *Dottorotta* Team used apprenticeship staff to fill in the gaps.

Related to this, the discretion taken is also related to overcoming shortages of funds or delays in operational costs. Illustrating quotes are:

> We are still short of medical staff and medical devices, so we have to use the *Puskesmas* budget to cover the shortcomings. Moreover, at home care services, where *Dottorotta* cars lack medical equipment, so we inevitably have to use *puskesmas* tools to complete these medical devices. In addition, we also provide medical personnel and supporting staff. For example, our *Dottorotta* car driver has his own salary from the *Puskesmas* cash and, we also use apprenticeship staff to assist in health services.

The standard equipment that must be possessed for home care as listed in the Home Care Guidebook of Makassar City is as many as 18 types of medical devices, 8 types of consumables, and 5 types of other facilities. But in reality, only 6 types of medical devices, 5 types of consumables owned. Whereas the other 5 types of facilities are all available.

**Second**, communication technology barriers. In the digital era as it is today, information technology has become a very vital need in the millennial generation (Kowalik, 2019), including in home care health services. Home care services are also very dependent on information technology. Patients who need help must use information technology such as a telephone to contact the home care team. Information technology is often an obstacle in service if there is a disruption in the communication process, for example, the name is not clear, the address is not clear and complaints of the disease suffered by the patient. This is due to telephone network interference so that the sound does not sound properly. The following is an excerpt from an interview with a member of *Dottorotta*s home care team:

> We often encounter patients whose information is unclear. They called to ask for service and when we asked for patient information, suddenly the telephone was cut off or closed. Then we called back but the patient did not answer our telephone. There was also an incident, after we were around the patient's house, but when we contacted the patient the telephone was not picked up. And after being able to connect again, suddenly the patient cancels the request to be served even though our team has tried to find the patient's house.

Given the importance of information technology in human life, the government needs to allocate a budget to build telecommunications infrastructure to create...
smart cities (Pratama, 2018). At present Makassar City has been trying to develop infrastructure to build smart cities so that people can have smart cards. In this smart card there is a report or history of the disease that the card holder has, and the number of diseases that can be accommodated in the card is up to 125 types of diseases (Ramadhiani, 2015).

Third, service priority. In providing home care services, SLBs must also be able to determine whose priorities must be served first if requests come almost simultaneously. For these conditions, SLBs try to find out the true condition of the patient, and always put patients who are in critical condition to provide early assistance to save the lives of patients. SLBs must be able to be professional and prioritize patient safety. One of them stated that:

> There is often a demand for home care services at almost the same time. So, we give priority to patients who call first. Besides that, we also consider the condition of the patient, which one needs to get fast treatment, so that is what we put first. When patients call the call center, we ask in advance what type of illness they are suffering from so we can prioritize services.

Making service priority is one technique in overcoming resource problems. Prioritizing services using consideration of the patient’s condition is very appropriate. Patients with severe conditions need to be the first consideration for providing services, with the aim of saving the lives of patients. So, the element of justice in health services, not only seen in terms of service time, but also seen from how emergency the patient’s condition will be served.

Fourth, problem of service time. The problem of service time is also one of the problems faced by the Dottorotta home care team. Dottorotta home care services last 24 hours a day, so it is not uncommon for them to serve midnight patients. In these conditions, the medical team to the location also needs to pay attention to their safety. However, they must prioritize the interests of patients. One medical officer revealed that he must prioritize patient safety compared to fear of leaving at midnight. The patient's life is above all else, especially if it is known that the condition of the patient who needs help is in a critical condition so that he needs help as soon as possible. SLBs often feel the dilemma if many patients need the same service, while the limited number of resources is available such as doctors and nurses. On the other hand, if it is not served quickly, it can threaten the safety of the patient’s life.

Sensitivity and accuracy in making decisions will greatly affect the performance of services provided by Dottorotta’s home care team. They must have peace of mind in order to be able to decide which ones should be served early. When making a wrong decision, it can endanger the life of the patient.

Analysis of Dilemmas

The discretion taken by SLBs to overcoming various problems of limited resources has dilemmatic consequences. The dilemma faced can be categorized into two, namely ethical dilemma and psychological dilemma. An ethical dilemma is the situation faced by SLBs to be able to take a decision or behavior or action that is the best in conditions of limited resources. For example, when a doctor has to answer a call to take care of a patient’s home, while at the same time having to serve patients at the Puskesmas.

Another situation that can cause ethical dilemmas is the use of Health Technology Medicine (HIT), which is telemedicine. Not all medical personnel are able to use this health technology. In addition, the use of this technology is also hampered by the limitations of the infrastructure owned. Therefore, policymakers should consider developing policies that facilitate exploration and adoption of various Health Information Technology (HIT) capabilities that measurably improves quality of care (Zhao, Hamadi, Haley, White-Williams, Liu & Spaulding, 2019).

In general, telemedicine is the use of information and communication technology combined with medical expertise to provide health services, ranging from consultation, diagnosis and medical action, without limited space or carried out remotely. To be able to run well, this system requires communication technology that allows the transfer of data in the form of video, voice, and images interactively.
which is done in real time by integrating it into video-conference support technology. Included as supporting technology for telemedicine is image processing technology to analyze medical images.

Besides ethical dilemma, Dottorotta’s home care team also often experiences psychological dilemmas. On the one hand there is a desire to provide the best service for home care patients, on the other hand must be patient in facing the attitudes and behaviors of patients who are angry when late to be served. Another form of psychological dilemma is how to speak up the risks/signs of danger such as errors, irregularities, violations, and handling patients who are not in accordance with the SOP. Doctors and nurses as frontline staff play an important role in this matter. Speaking up is intended for health practitioners at the upper level to be able to hear and carry out preventive actions before a medical error/human error occurs that has an impact on patient safety.

Okuyama, Wagner & Bijnen (2014) in his study found that silence can be caused by several things including fear, avoiding conflict, and the pressure of social norms in the organization. In addition, several other factors that also influence are the high disproportionate authority, respect that is too high for superiors, and lack of resources. One study found that many health workers were hesitant in voicing patient safety even though they were aware that these patients could be in danger.

Discussion

The results of this field exploration found that an SLBs had discretionary authority in addressing the situation of limitations possessed by the government bureaucracy in providing home care-based health services. SLB as policy implementers crucially need the freedom to adapt the program to local conditions for being motivated to implement a policy (Lipsky, 2010; Rise, 2012; Thomann et al, 2018) has a great opportunity in taking discretion (Lipsky, 1980; 2010) to anticipated implementation barriers (Chan et al, 2018).

The discretion taken depends on the characteristics of each individual. The challenge faced by SLBs is how to take discretion based on the intention to prioritize safety and speed of service to the community. Therefore, an SLBs must be able to prioritize the right service so that it does not harm the patient and have good public service motivation (Kwon, 2014; Perry & Wise, 1990). Furthermore, Perry & Wise argued that people are motivated to work in the public service as a result of altruism, a desire to serve, or a wish to have an impact on society is a long-standing one.

The quality of priority choices depends on each individual SLBs, where we know that each individual is unique. SLBs that provide home care services have their own characteristics, but one thing that needs to be a major concern is how to make patient safety a priority in providing health services (Okuyama et al, 2014). The authority to take discretion needs to be based on the principle of autonomy with the belief that each individual is able to think logically and be able to make his own decisions. Medical personnel who are in charge of home services are adults who have the competence and strength to make their own, choose and have various decisions or choices that must be respected by others. Autonomy as a right of independence and freedom needs to be addressed properly and used responsibly by each SLBs, which is demonstrated through professional practice in providing health services to its patients. For example, respecting the rights of patients in making decisions about their care.

In different situations, the application of the principle of autonomy must sometimes clash with the desire to do good to patients. Autonomy given to patients does not necessarily produce the best verdict, but it often has to be taken by a nurse to please the patient. For example, when a patient does not want to be referred to a hospital for various reasons, the medical equipment that is brought by a doctor when visiting a patient’s home is very limited. Dilemmas like this are often felt by a doctor. On the one hand want to provide services with better medical equipment, but the other hand, patients do not want to be referred. Finally the service provided is not satisfactory.

Providing priority services as a form of discretion also has consequences on the principle of justice in the delivery of public services. The principle of justice is needed to provide equal and fair service to all patients by upholding morality and humanity. This value is reflected in the professional practice of a nurse
who works to provide proper care according to SOP standards.

To deal with various ethical dilemmas above, Endradita (2017) suggests that: “there are six approaches that can be done by people who are facing the dilemma, namely: (1) obtaining relevant facts, (2) Determining ethical issues from facts, (3) Determine the ready and how people or groups affected by the dilemma, (4) Determine the alternatives available in solving the dilemma, (5) Determine the possible consequences of each alternative, (6) Determine the right actions.”. The accuracy in using the approach in dealing with ethical dilemmas has a great influence on the quality of health services provided.

Conclusion

The main purpose of this article is to explore discretion taken by SLBs when faced with limited resources, while the demands and needs of the community exceeds the resources they have. In these conditions a bureaucrat must be able to take a policy to overcome these limitations so that they can provide services as needed by the community. SLBs have the opportunity to take discretion in overcoming various limitations such as the limitations of paramedics (doctors, laboratory officers, pharmacists, nurses) and drivers, communication technology barriers, customer priorities, and service time.

SLBs as policy implementers, should have professionalism in taking discretion by prioritizing patient safety and to improve the quality of public services. Therefore, SLBs must understand the principles of quality public services and apply them in service delivery. In addition, SLBs must also be able to overcome various psychological and ethical dilemmas faced. Efforts to overcome these various problems by increasing competence through education and training.

This study contributes to the theory of Street-Level Bureaucracy that has been developed by Michael Lipsky, with the results of this study can develop an analysis of factors that can provide opportunities for discretionary behavior for SLBs and perceived dilemmas in public services, especially in health services.

This research also encourages future researchers to expand the analysis of various public services.

REFERENCE


Hospital-Based Health Care Professionals: A Literature Review. BMC Health Service Research
The Management of Danau Sipin as a Waterfront City Tourism With Collaborative Governance Approach

M. Yusuf
Ilmu Pemerintahan, FISIPOL Universitas Jambi
myusuf@unja.ac.id

Samsuddin
Ilmu Pemerintahan, STISIP NH
samsuddinmip@gmail.com

Maiela Yuskha
Ilmu Komunikasi, STISIP NH
yuskhamaiela@gmail.com

Abstract
The growth of the tourism industry has significant increasingly on the international and national levels. The development of the tourism sector has to be done to fix the demand for tourist. The existence of a tourist attraction is to increase community income, tax contribution, and stimulate investment in a country. Increasing the income from tourism needs good governance based on collaborative governance perspective. This research aims to explore the collaborative process and actor mapping in the management of Danau Sipin as waterfront city tourism. The objective of collaborative is to gather the various issue and pattern of cooperation across stakeholders and resources. The collaboration requires the existence of partnerships between government and non-government. This study applies qualitative exploratory methods to understand the problems of tourism management. The data collected from informants are both formal and informal interviews. Then get data by observation and documentation, both primary and secondary sources. The data analyzed through stages. a. Reduction (coded using nVivo version 11), b. Data display in narratives, images, and tables, c. Drawing conclusions and verification. The results of this study find the main actors do not play an essential role in the management of the waterfront city as tourist attractions, but without key actors leads to the emergence of conflicts among government institutions. The collaboration process does not always start with a face to face dialogue involving stakeholders. If the community and the private sector that have collaborative initiatives, the process can implement following a mutual trust and strong commitment that emerges voluntarily.

Keywords: Collaborative Governance; Actor Involve; Waterfront City; Danau Sipin

Introduction
Industry in the tourism sector increases significantly both on a global and national scale. Tourism can encourage economic growth both at the state and local level, and increasing state revenues and people's income. However, the management of tourism faced socio-economic, disaster, and governance problems (Rahajeng, 2016; Zaenuri, 2014). The impact of poor management is decreasing visitor. Proper tourism management is essential to support tourists' activities in a tourist attraction.

This paper attempts to examine the collaboration process among government actors and non-government actors in the Danau Sipin management as a waterfront city tourism located in Jambi city. This study argues that the area will be maximal if management involves stakeholders with a partnership approach. Collaborative governance requires government actors and non-government actors. Also, collaboration gives various possible issues and patterns of cooperation across actors and resources (Benedetto, Carboni, & Corinto, 2016).

Studies about the waterfront city focus on policy cycles as management policies (Laras, Marimin, Nurjaya, & Budiharsono, 2011), implementation and effectiveness (Islmay, Alwi, Haning, & Allorante, 2017; Prihatin & Rinaldi, 2013), evaluation (Rifky, Supriyono, Wanto, & Kawano, 2017). Research about collaborative governance address the factors of successful implementation of collaboration (Sambodo & Pribadi, 2016), the role (Novita, 2018), the ability (Sofi & Mutiarin, 2018), supporting and obstacles factors (Dewi, 2012), governance transformation
and shifting paradigm (Zaenuri, 2014, 2016; Zaenuri, Zauhar, Wijaya, & Java, n.d.). Then, the papers that discuss actors view the dominance and motives in consensus (Mukhlis, 2017; Mukhlis, Nazir, Rahmatunissa, & Yuningsih, 2018; Roslinda, Darusman, Suharjito, & Nurrochmat, 2012).

Some of the previous studies have not explained the process of forming collaborations involving various actors in the same purpose. Policy cycle in waterfront city management fails in implementing policies and programs. Then, they unable to see the collaborative process that participates various actors; actors describe as parties who have individual interests rather than public interests. There is an opportunity to examine more deeply the management of waterfront city tourism viewed from the collaboration and involvement of collaborative actors.

**Theoretical Framework**

Governance in the institutional dimension focuses on involving the actor's non-government in managing public affairs. Then on the value aspect emphasizes the guidelines for implementing good management. At least governance has three main characters, first: it is a formal process that requires legitimate agreements among partners, and informal processes need a commitment by stakeholders to cooperate, second: partnerships are essential in governance, the number and type of connections are regulated and must involve among collaborators (Gibson, 2011).

Third: the decision-making process is suggested to use consensus, then realize it even though it cannot always achieve. We believe governance to be a new way of regulating the involvement of nongovernment actors. This process characterized by a stress on local/regional levels through the participation of stakeholders in autonomous and legitimate organizations or processes (Gibson, 2011).

Collaborative governance is management that is arranged by involving public bodies and non-governmental organizations in formal decision-making processes, deliberation, and consensus-building, and there is a division of roles to implement public policies or manage citizen programs and state assets. Through collaboration, it is possible to explore potential participants' and the existence of negotiations about roles, content, and results (Ansell & Gash, 2007; Plotnikof, 2015).

Collaboration allows the combination with another co-worker that involve individual actors, groups, or organizations to manage public affairs. The partnership is to build a collective vision, improve consistency, and harmonize activities among collaborators. Cooperation can be a negotiation process, including a supervisory role and coercive forces (Wanna, 2008). This procedure is a way for the government to involve nongovernment stakeholders, consensus-oriented, and deliberation in a collective decision-making process that aims to implement public policies quickly (Zaenuri, 2016).

The government cannot be a main agent on development without another actor. The government must involve several non-government partners from planning to implementing policies. Stakeholders as groups or individuals who can influence and or be influenced by the achievement of specific goals (Mitchell, Agle, & Wood, 1997).

Stakeholders generally grouped into several groups. The primary stakeholders are partners have a direct relationship or benefit from the impact of a policy, program, and project. Supporting stakeholders do not connect to the interests of a system, schedule, and plan but have a concern that they can voice and influence community attitudes and government on legal decisions. Key or main stakeholders who have legal authority in decision making (Roslinda et al., 2012; Sundawati & Sanudin, 2009). Identifying the involvement of actors based on the elements of power, legitimacy, and urgency (Zaenuri, 2016).

Collaboration has goals both for government and actors who involved in government affairs. In specific, the partnership aims to resolve complex problems through the exchange of resources and to share information that impacts on the target. Collaboration requires joint accountability, taking risks, and mutual benefits (Queen, 2011). Through a collaboration system, the government is expected to deliver continuous improvements in managing public affairs. Government institutions not only good on the internal management system, financial management, human resource management, information and communication technology, and performance management but also have to manage the most critical external stakeholders well to achieve the desired policies and produce high-quality services (Bovaird & Löffler, 2005).

The collaboration process is ways to govern institutionally. Several institutions, both
government and non-government, are involved by the portion of their concerns and objectives. Stages in the collaborative process include face-to-face dialogue, building trust, commitment to the process, understanding together, and temporary results — all collaborative governance built on the face-to-face dialogue among stakeholders. As a consensus process, direct conversation is needed to identify opportunities for mutual benefit (Ansell & Gash, 2007; Kurniasih, Setyoko, & Imron, 2017). Collaboration in the sense of a process is a series of methods to manage institutionally; institutions can be either government or non-government institutions that involve the following the portion of their purposes and objectives.

After the formed of collaboration, the next step is to maintain the sustainability of partnership with stakeholders involved. The factor that determines the guarantee of cooperation is the existence of interactions and relationships that previously established amidst the participants. This factors work dynamically and develop, but most importantly how to maintain a commitment to achieve the vision (Cradock-Henry, Greenhalgh, Brown, & Sinner, 2017).

Research Methods

The object of this research focuses on Danau Sipin that located in the middle of Jambi city which design as a tourist area and supported fisheries activities through Regional Regulation No. 9 of 2013 concerning Jambi City Spatial Plans 2013-2023. The lake with an area of 161 ha has a tourist function with a distinctive panorama, has economic and cultural features. The mayor of Jambi city is building the city of Jambi as sustainable water by reviving Danau Sipin as a form of waterfront city (WFC) that is developed and managed in partnership.

This research uses exploratory qualitative study; this conducted to understand specific problems (Soehartono, 2008). The primary data collection through structured or unstructured interviews and observations, qualitative interviews can be seen as partners in participant observation, where researchers try to identify and see the reality (Corbetta, 2003).

With qualitative interviews, researchers try to achieve a common goal of taking data sincerely by combining the two methods. Information is extracted by determining the key informant to know the information about the data. Furthermore, we use the snowball sampling technique, the researcher will ask for referrals of informants who have information related to the data. To support primary data, data from various sources such as reports, village regulations, news from the media, the results of the study are used as material to support research analysis.

All data is processed using nVivo version 11. At the end of the discussion, we draw conclusions and recommendations. In conclusion, the author gives a general statement that answers research questions that are useful for decision makers. For stakeholders to benefit from the results of this study, recommendations will provide both academically and practically.

Findings and Discussion

Actor involvement in collaboration

The management of Danau Sipin as a waterfront-city is regulated in the Jambi City Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2013 concerning the Jambi City spatial plan for 2013-2033. Then described in the Jambi city medium-term development plan (RPJMD) from 2013-2018. The development of the Danau Sipin area as a tourist object in the Jambi city has been one of the main concerns of the Jambi mayor since 2013. Construction of the area is vital to improve environmental health. The rehabilitation of this area, designed as a waterfront, will contribute to the advancement of ecological improvements (Laras et al., 2011; Vollmer, 2009). addition to improving the environment, lake that is managed sustainably will impact both the economic and social conditions of the people around the lake.

In the construction process faced obstacles because the development did not have a master plan in developing and managing the area. Besides, at the beginning of the mayor’s leadership in the 2013-2018 periods focus on the construction of road infrastructure to unravel congestion and structuring the city park. The building started in early 2017 which starts with the creation of dams and jogging tracks, platforms, bridges, drainage, parking locations, roads, sanitary facilities, and thematic parks (skateboarding and climbing) that beautify area. Other problems also arise related to institutional relations between government agencies, each of which competes for existence to show excellent performance. So, it is not surprising that in the management of matters of public interest there will be a policy disagreement.
The actors involved in the collaboration process of waterfront city management get play role according to power, legitimacy, and different levels of urgency. In the Danau Sipin management context, the involvement of the first primary actor comes from the Jambi City Tourism and Culture Office (JCTCO). JCTCO Legitimacy given from Regional Regulation No. 14 of 2016 concerning the Establishment of the Organization of Regional Offices of Jambi City, the urgency of this office based on job descriptions is responsible for planning and formulating technical policies, development, control, and supervision in the field of culture and tourism.

The involvement of the second primary actor comes from new groups such as community representatives as small business groups, parking management groups, tour boat service providers, community shooting services, approximately 1,200 fish cages. The existence of these actors directly interacts with tourists through information services and tour services. Generally, these actors depend on utilizing the lake as a source of life.

The involvement of the private sector promotes tourism objects and provides tour and travel services. There are hotels, travel agents, providers of spot photography, and companies partner with the government in the development of the area such as the construction of the dam and jogging tracks. Although the community and private group actors do not have legitimate power, legitimacy is from the opportunity to do activities such as fish farming, promotion of tourism objects also provides spot photography. The mayor requested that hotels promote and provide tour and travel services to increase the number of visitors, both local and national tourists. In this context, we see there is an indirect opportunity obtained by all actors who want to be involved.

Stakeholders who acted as secondary actors comes from the Central Government through Sumatra River Regional Office VI (SRRO VI) has carried out construction of a dam along the lake, Jambi Provincial Government built UKM centre, Jambi Public Works and Spatial Planning Office (PWSPO), Parks and Funeral Cleaning Services (PFCS) of Jambi city, Jambi Province's Culture and Tourism Office (CTO), Environmental Agency of Jambi City (EAJC) which has authority in monitoring on water quality, Jambi City Fisheries Service that provides fish cultivation training and capital assistance to the community, Jambi Police and Kodim 0415 / BTH, Denpom II / 2 Jambi, Telanaipura district, and Legok district.

In temporary, the involvement of stakeholders from the state is from the central government and local government. Its presence does not provide services directly to users of tour and travel services or information services through promotional activities. Each government institution takes a role that is not patterned and is not coordinated by an official organization. Development activities and assistance activities are purely project completion that is not accompanied by sustainable steps.

The secondary stakeholder participation of community groups is the ambassador of the Jambi Province Arts and Tourism, various elements of the community in the Danau Sipin area, communities and nature lovers in Jambi City. The presence of these stakeholders does not take a direct role, nor do private parties like some hotels. Its existence does not directly promote or provide tour and travel but makes a tourist attraction as a view.

From the explanation, we know that stakeholders in waterfront city management include the government, the private sector, and the civil society who have the power, legitimacy, and urgency of involvement. Primary stakeholders have a role in promoting tourism objects and providing services to visitors, while secondary stakeholders are only supporting the existence of Danau Sipin. The involvement of these secondary actors is not directly involved in management, but each actor takes a passive role in maintaining the sustainability of Danau Sipin. The actors from government agencies do not play a role as key actors in the collaboration process.

The pattern of relations shows the phenomenon of collaboration without formal forum initiated by a government institution. Horizontal and vertical coordination flows in the management of lake areas show a random pattern, nor are they centralized in one government institution. Each stakeholder takes a role following authorities such as the Jambi City Fisheries Office and fish farming community groups, monitoring water quality by the Environmental Agency, even though the result not informed to the community.

Tourism ambassadors, hotels, providers of photographer spots each take part to promote and provide tour packages. BWSS, the Provincial Government and the city government develop Bronjong, the construction of UKM centers,
parking locations, and other supporting facilities. This reality shows that there is no collaboration rule to manage the Danau Sipin as a waterfront-City tourist attraction, the tourism management plan that has the potential to seem uncoordinated.

Stakeholders in public affairs generally involve primary actors, secondary actors and key actors as groups or individuals who can influence each other (Mitchell et al., 1997; Roslinda et al., 2012; Sundawati & Sanudin, 2009). Based on the explanation above, this study found that there no key actors who possessed influential power and legitimacy to play a leading role as initiators of collaboration. The involvement of actors only arises from primary and secondary stakeholders from the government, the private sector, and community groups. Then the main actors from the government who are supposed to play an important role do not emerge. Each institution implements priority programs without going through vertical and horizontal coordination, so potential conflicts arise between government institutions.

The mayor of Jambi city as the leader who initiated Danau Sipin development, the leader did not design the partnership pattern for managing object. Likewise, with the provincial government and the central government, the construction did not involve the community as part of the development. Generally, regional development does not use participatory planning and implementation. The consequence, development ignore the aspirations of the people around the lake.

The absence of a dominant government agency in the management also proves the argument that control that is single and centralized is determined to be unable to achieve the objectives (Roslinda et al., 2012). However, the absence of a key actor in waterfront city management creates a potential conflict interest among stakeholders (Sundawati & Sanudin, 2009). The possibility of conflict arises because of the existence of sectoral egos from government institutions can block the collaboration. This phenomenon shows that the form of good institutional relations has not formed in government institutions in Jambi city yet.

Collaborative Process Management for Waterfront City Tourism

Collaboration process in management of Danau Sipin as a waterfront city tourism refers to the stages of face to face dialogue, trust building, commitment to the process, share understanding and intermediate outcomes (Ansell & Gash, 2007). Joint involvement coordinated by one leader to solve problems together can achieve through shared goals, a symmetrical structure with high-level negotiations through interactivity and interdependence (Lai, 2011).

A collaborative process is a series of ways to manage institutionally; institutions can be either government or non-government institutions involved following the portion of their interests and objectives (Ansell & Gash, 2007). Face-to-face dialogue in the collaboration process is essential because it is loaded with verbal communication (Kurniasih et al., 2017). Collaborative governance builds with face-to-face dialogue between stakeholders who oriented towards consensus and identification of shared interests. Its position is important because it can erase prejudice and disruption of communication that hinders profits so that it can build trust (Novita, 2018).

Face-to-face dialogue among primary and secondary stakeholders in one space and at the same time that is interactive discuss common interests is not done specifically and there is no specific initiation. The dialogue which was a little offensive to the management of lake was manifested in the development plan deliberations which touched upon a glimpse of tourism which would serve as an icon of Jambi city.

Various actors were not met explicitly in one room at the same time to accommodate the aspirations of the people around the lake. The effort to involve non-government actors is an informal invitation; the involvement of non-government actors is carried out voluntarily. This fact shows that the excellent communication mechanism between the parties is not arranged yet; the implication is that government agencies monopolize the flow of information in a one-way manner.

Trust building on the basis that each party involved has a responsibility to act according to the authority, legitimacy, and urgency of each. Developing of trust has existed since Danau Sipin as an icon, each primary actor and secondary actor from the government and non-government
mutually maintain the belief that each stakeholder has an equal position and public affairs. This reality proves the absence of conflicts of interest between actors from the government, the private sector, and the public.

Efforts to build trust can eliminate conflicts of interest among actors (government, private sector, and society) involved either directly or indirectly because actors have different levels of importance and do not compete with each other. Repeated and quality interactions through principled involvement will help foster trust, mutual understanding, internal legitimacy, and shared commitment, thus generating and sustaining (Emerson, Nabatchi, & Balogh, 2011). Each actor has the same responsibility to maintain the existence of Danau Sipin as a potential economic resource.

The emergence of institutional egos due to weak mutual trust among collaborators from government institutions at the beginning of the process. Collaboration is not limited to negotiations between the participants involved, but also there must be an effort to build mutual trust with each other. Building trust needs in the first collaboration process is carried out. If a belief has emerged from various collaborating parties, the communication will avoid obstacles. To build trust among government institutions needs actors or leaders who aware of the urgency of collaboration. Also, to collaborate can use coercive power. (Wanna, 2008).

In the planning process to the implementation, there no held a face-to-face dialogue among stakeholders who concern in the existence of Danau Sipin. However, there is a collective commitment to achieve common goals process. The actors commit to the promises each other’s; they aware that Danau Sipin is a local asset. They are open to each other to benefit from the existence of Danau Sipin.

Commitment has an impact on achieving collaboration; it creates the motivation to participate. Collaboration requires responsibility with legal agreements by stakeholders (Gibson, 2011). Strong assurance needs to prevent the risk from each stakeholder of the partnership process. Commitment is a complicated matter, but it can build based on mutual benefits. The promise is the stakeholder’s responsibility to develop strong relationships.

The external factors determine the success of the collaboration; also, commitment and mutual trust are vital to ensure the continuity of cooperation. The main factors, previous interactions, and relationships among participants impact the success cooperation (Cradock-Henry et al., 2017). It benefits the partnership because of the exchange of information birth an indirect agreement.

Mayor of Jambi city with the Office of Tourism and Culture aware the people in maintaining the sustainability of Danau Sipin. The process of sharing this understanding was hampered due to the disharmony between the Tourism and Culture Office and BAPPEDA regarding regional development plans. Cross actors from government agencies have not yet found an agreement on the concept of developing a plan for the area, and the current development seems without a reasoned idea.

At the same point in the collaboration process, the involved stakeholders must share their understanding of what they (stakeholders) can achieve through collaboration. This mutual understanding can be described as a shared mission, shared goals, general objectivity, shared vision, and the same ideology. Sharing knowledge can have implications for a collective agreement to interpret and interpret a problem.

Interim results from the ongoing collaboration process give rise to informal agreements. Stakeholders involved obtaining strategic benefits and values from the process of using the area as an economic source. The collaboration will occur when the goals and advantages of cooperation are concrete — the benefits of cooperation between stakeholders in the management of the area. The continued results of the collaboration process realize in the form of real outputs or outputs. This critical process result and essential in developing a momentum that can guide the success of a collaboration. These intermediate outcomes emerge when possible goals and benefits from collaboration are relatively concrete, and when "small wins" of collaboration can be possible.

Collaboration does not always have to start with face-to-face dialogue involving stakeholders at the same time and place. Constraints will arise if collaborators have low participation (Dewi, 2012), in the context of Danau Sipin it is also added that government institutions do not have management plans and involvement of actors who must contribute. What needs to be built is that there is a common vision between government
institutions that refers to the Regional Regulation No. 9 of 2013 concerning Jambi City RTWT 2013-2023 as the initial milestone in carrying out development.

Conclusion

Based on the research objectives in the background, namely to answer the involvement of actors and the collaborative process of managing Danau Sipin as a waterfront city tourist attraction. The first conclusion can be drawn, the participation of actors in the management of tourism objects involves primary and secondary actors who have the same goal of maintaining the sustainability of Danau Sipin as a tourist attraction as an economic source. Management of tourism objects does not always require key/main actors in coordinating partner. However, the absence of key/main actors from both the government and non-government creates a vertical and horizontal potential of conflict. Second, collaboration can occur between various actors who have to participate in initiatives to engage directly or indirectly without going through special face to face dialogue. Building trust, sharing knowledge, and committing to process is important because from this process in the context of Danau Sipin management can be done.

Based on the phenomenon of disharmony between government institutions, the alternative solution to the problem that can be done is the preparation of the master plan for development and management of Danau Sipin as a waterfront city tourist attraction. The potential for conflict between government institutions requires clear formulation of authority, not only across government institutions but also a strict formulation of the authority and urgency of the involvement of government and non-government actors. The complexity of institutional relations that are horizontal in the context of management of Danau Sipin is not answered in this study, therefore further specific research is needed.

Reference


ABSTRACT

Using mixed methodology, the research documented the collaborative governance exhibited through traditional marital dispute settlement patterns done by the community leaders from three provinces of the Cordillera Administrative Region, Philippines. Using both open ended interview schedule and prepared questionnaires, community elders from some tribes in Benguet, Mountain Province and Ifugao were asked to discuss the traditional mechanisms they follow in solving domestic disputes. Guided by the ideas of the Third World Feminist Theory, the Culture-Centered Approach, and Garoutte’s concept of “radical indigenism”, the profiles of Benguet, Mountain Province and Ifugao in terms of domestic violence were examined to come up with the rate of intimate partner violence in each of the provinces. At the end, the researcher recommended a new model of policy-making process that integrates ethnicity and gender at all times, focusing primarily on the benefits of collaborative governance.

Keywords: Indigenous Women, Cordillera Women, Third World Feminism, Culture –Centered Approach, Traditional Marital Dispute Settlement Patterns

Collaborative governance as a practice is becoming common in the public sector particularly dealing with complex issues like service innovation and welfare policy. It is observable over private, public, and non-profit organizations. (Plotnikof, 2016) The concept is also being utilized in the areas of economic development, public health, environmental protection and restoration, human services, land use, transportation and even in budgeting (Scott, 2017).

Collaborative governance is defined as “processes and structures of public policy decision making and management that engage people across the boundaries of public agencies, levels of government and/or the public, private for-profit, and civic spheres to carry out a public purpose”. The concept “emphasizes the process of working together” (Newig, 2018). For Scott (2017), collaborative governance is “an umbrella term for the myriad structures and processes used to shape collective action amongst independent organizations”.

This paper examined the collaborative governance of community leaders in relation to the traditional marital dispute settlement patterns among the Ibalois, Bontoks and Ifugaos from the Cordillera Administrative Region, Philippines. The primary aim was to document the indigenous practices of

1. What is the demographic profile of Benguet, Mountain Province and Ifugao in relation to the occurrence of domestic abuse or intimate partner violence (IPV)?

2. Does intimate partner violence exists among the people of the Cordillera? Is it commonly committed among the members of the tribe being studied?

3. What collaborative governance concepts from the traditional indigenous culture are being undertaken to solve intimate partner violence or domestic abuse among community members? Who are the holders of power in relation to the
implementation of the traditional customary practices?

4. From among the customary law/practices identified by the respondents and using the concepts of “radical indigenism” advanced by Garroutte (2003), and the concept of collaborative governance, what alternative policy-making model can be designed in order to integrate the concepts of ethnicity and gender in the policy-making process of the Philippines?

Domestic Abuse: A Definition

Sharma (2015) noted that in the Protection of Women from Domestic Violence Act in India, “domestic violence” is classified as “any act, omission or commission, or conduct of the respondent, which includes threat or actual abuse” (p. 132). Similarly, Gul (2013) defined it as a range of different behaviour happening within an intimate relationship which results to sexual, physical and psychological harm to the people within the relationship. For Sacco (2015) domestic violence is a multifaceted offense and is more commonly labelled as family violence or intimate partner violence. Under the Violence Against Women Act of the United States, domestic violence is generally interpreted as the same with intimate partner violence.

Indigenous Peoples and Gender Studies

Historically, the study on indigenous peoples and culture can be attributed to an anthropologist and social scientists named Margaret Mead (“Gender Views: Margaret Mead, George Murdock and Global Views”, 2018). Mead was the author of the book “Male and Female” published in 1949. Mead studied three groups of indigenous people from the islands of New Guinea during the early 1900’s.

Indigenous peoples have been exercising their own system of governance since before the onset of colonization in their respective areas. They comprise 370 million persons globally (Whyte, 2014). Policy producers have the political obligation to include the indigenous people in their research endeavour, planning activities and program development (Castro-Palaganas, 2001).

Individual indigenous people, even those of the same community, do not experience disruptions of systems of responsibilities in the same way. Kinship, age, wealth, race, religion, political situation, and other characteristics affect and frame what one experiences as an indigenous person (Whyte, 2014, p. 605). For example, records show that Native Americans are victims of crimes at a greater proportion than the rest of the American Population. The same is true in the case of intimate partner abuse. A great deal of Indian women is victim of domestic abuse, rape, physical abuse and stalking (Office of the Vice President, 2014). A study conducted by the University of Oklahoma among Native American women, revealed that 82% of the sample population had experienced physical or sexual abuse from their intimate partners (Monica Modi, 2014).

Casambre (1999) clarified that gender studies is similar to indigenous studies because both have an obvious partiality towards the “marginalized”. Both types of study also contribute to “cultural competency” which supposedly should be everybody’s concern (Juanita Sherwood, 2015). Pettit (2005) contends that gender and race categorize According to Weil (2016), violence in an abusive relationship usually starts with verbal or emotional abuse that eventually turns to be physical in nature. Women victims of abuse usually experience several incidents of hostility over the course of the relationship. Victims of violent relationship may either suffer from “intimate terrorism”, “situational violence” or “violent resistance” (Weil, 2016, [Abstract]).

Intimate terrorism happens when victims are passive but are living in fear, waiting for the occurrence of the next abusive situation. Situational violence happens if the violence is mutual or “bidirectional” and when the victims fight back, it becomes classified as “violent resistance” (Weil, 2016).

Indigenous Peoples and Gender Studies

Historically, the study on indigenous peoples and culture can be attributed to an anthropologist and social scientists named Margaret Mead (“Gender Views: Margaret Mead, George Murdock and Global Views”, 2018). Mead was the author of the book “Male and Female” published in 1949. Mead studied three groups of indigenous people from the islands of New Guinea during the early 1900’s.
women at the lower part of the social stratification system, treating them as ‘particularly vulnerable’ to sexual abuse, as a result of “mass injustice” without offering any solution to their situation (Pettit, 2005).

Statistics on Domestic Abuse

Kanai (2005) noted that domestic abuse happens in all nations of the world and transcends all religious, economic, social and cultural groupings. Generally, about 20% to 36% of females are abused physically or sexually; and around 40% to 75% are psychologically maltreated by their intimate partners (Weil, 2016). In addition, the World Health Organization reported that approximately 35% of females worldwide experience sexual or physical violence from the hands of their former or current partner. Around the world, 40% to 70% of female murders were done by their intimate partners (NCADV, 2007).

In the United States, more than three women murders committed by the husbands are recorded per day. In 2005 alone, their intimate partners murdered 1,181 women. An additional 2 million women are said to have experienced injuries inflicted by their intimate partner through violence every year. Based on a multi-country study conducted by the WHO, violence in the domicile ranged from 15% in urban Japan, to 71% in rural Ethiopia (NCADV, 2007). The common assumption that violence is initiated by men and directed towards women is not necessarily true to all, however, it should be noted that women are highly probable to be victims of domestic abuse than males.

In India, Sharma (2015) studied the same case and recorded similar outcomes. Sharma noted that although India is known to be the “dawn of civilization” and that the world has now come into a new millennium, the woman of India continues to be oppressed and ill-treated:

In the 1996 survey of 6902 men in the state of Uttar Pradesh, up to 45% of married men acknowledged physically abusing their wives … 1/3 of women (34%) between 15-49 years old have experienced spousal physical violence…In a community-based study involving 450 women in Gujarat, 42% experienced physical beatings and sexual abuse, and 23% experiences abusive language, belittlement and threats… 56% women belief that wife beating is justified… 85% of men admit they had indulged in violent behaviour against their wives at least once in last 12 months… 57% of men admitted to have sexual abuse with their wives… 32% of men admitted to committing violence on their pregnant wives. The men indulged in violence to establish their power over the weaker sex. (Sharma, 2015, pp. 132-133)

Avdeyeva (2007) further recounted that in Kazakhstan, more than half of those surveyed women reported domestic abuse but only around 1/3 of them filed cases against the perpetrators. In Ethiopia, approximately, 1 out of 10 women becomes a prey of rape, early forced marriage, spousal rape or seduction (Mangistie, 2015). Women become victims of violence in their homes 80% times more frequent than their male counterparts. What is surprising is that about 90% of Ethiopian rural women and 60% of Ethiopian urban women accept that their partners have the right to hurt them.

Domestic violence is the most rampant form of women abuse, which includes the physical, psychological, or sexual harm caused by a current or former partner (Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2013). As a result, it inflicts a massive burden for women throughout the globe (Kanai, 2005; Tumath, 2014; Gul A, 2013). However, although intimate partner violence is a recognized problem in developing countries, such as the Philippines, very little is known about the framework of violence in these countries (Hindin M. M., 2015).

The Cordilleran Women

Peterson (2010) studied the ethnic groups of the Cordillera Administrative Region
collectively called as Igorot. Their culture is classified to be independent because they resisted any form of foreign colonization (Peterson, 2010).

Technically, ethnic groups are defined by anthropologists as:

*A segment of a larger society whose members are thought of, by themselves or others, to have a common origin and to share important segments of a common culture and who, in addition, participate in shared activities in which the common origin and culture are significant ingredients* (Pamintuan-Riva, 2014, p. 1)

“Cordilleran” basically means the geographic region that has been described as “mountainous and rich in natural resources”. The people are called as the “Cordilleran,” divided among different ethno-linguistic groups.

Cordilleran indigenous women are generally farmworkers. They are engaged in subsistence farming and take part in clearing and land preparation, planting, weeding, harvesting, seed selection, storage and milling of the produce (Yogogan-Diano, 2015). Unlike in the lowland Philippines where men are customarily the farmers, women in Cordilleran indigenous groups usually do most of the work in the fields. They likewise raise domestic animals for food and cultural rituals. Males on the other hand are in charge of the opening and building of new rice fields as well as plowing. During critical times, men are tasked to go out of the community and search for additional economic sources which include, but not limited to, small-scale mining, hunting and engaging into wage labor (Gimenez, 2011).

Canilao (2001) noted that among the Cordillerans, the complementary effort of both sexes to earn a living as well as their survival schemes appear not to be gender specified. If ever there are differences in some tasks, this would be based on the perceived difference in strength of the sexes. There are no “taboos” imposed on women fulfilling men’s duties, most especially if there are no men available in the vicinity.

In terms of fulfilling the reproductive roles as parents, Castro-Palaganas (2004) noted that among the Ifugao people, men and women share the task. Accordingly, it was observed that men have as much concern about housework and the care of children as that of the women. Both parents share in the task of childcare while fulfilling their respective tasks in the farms. Household maintenance is likewise shared by both sexes.

The Study Site

The Cordillera Administrative Region (CAR) is a region found 200 kilometres north of Manila, the Capital City of the Philippines. The region is made up of six provinces (Ifugao, Mountain Province, Kalinga, Benguet, Apayao, and Abra) and a chartered city (Baguio City) (Philippine Statistics Authority, 2013).

CAR has a total land area of 1,829,370 hectares which is approximately 13% of the total land area of Luzon (Department of Agriculture, n.d.) and a total population as of 2010 of 1,616,867 (Philipine Statistics Authority, 2013). People in the area belong to different indigenous ethno-linguistic groups such as the Ibaloi, Bontok, Kalinga, Ifugao, Kankanaey, Tingguian, and Isneg among others (Carino, 2001; Peterson, 2010).

Because of financial constraints, distance from Baguio City where the main researcher came from, safety of the researchers during the fieldwork, and the availability of key contact persons from the area, the study covered some communities of Benguet, Mountain Province and Ifugao provinces only. From a total regional population of 1,376,640 the three provinces comprise 803,616 individuals or roughly 58.38% of the CAR total.

Benguet Province is composed of thirteen municipalities, the most interior of which are Kabayan, Kibungan and Bakun. From the Provincial Capitol, Kabayan, the home to the Kalanguya and Ibaloi tribes, is reachable after three hours bus ride to the town center and additional four hours hike to reach the most remote barangay. Meanwhile, three hours bus ride from the Capitol and additional five hours hiking is needed to reach the home of the
Kankanaey tribe in Kibungan. Bakun, on the other hand, is reachable after approximately four hours bus drive to Sinakbat then four to five hours hiking to reach barangay Bago where the Kankanaey tribe settles.

The second locale of the study is Mountain Province which is politically divided into 10 municipalities and 144 barangays. The municipality of Bontoc as its capital. (PSA, 2017). The other municipalities are: Barlig, Bauko, Besao, Natonin, Paraceles, Sabangan, Sadanga, Sagada and Tadian (Department of Interior and Local Government, 2019)

The last locale of the study is Ifugao, a province divided into eleven municipalities. It is home to Tuwali, Kalanguya and Ayangan tribes. Tuwali people are present in the key municipalities of Kiangan, Banaue, Hingyon, Hungduan and Lagawe. Meanwhile, Kalanguya tribes are found in Tinoc and Asipulo, and the Ayangan tribes are settled in Lagawe, Mayoyao, Aguinaldo and in some parts of Asipulo and Kiangan.

Ethical Considerations

Since the study involved human participants, an ethical clearance was secured from the UST Graduate School Ethics Committee prior to the conduct of the interviews. Similarly, a clearance was secured from the Regional Office of the National Commission on Indigenous Peoples (NCIP) - Cordillera Administrative Region because all of the respondents are members of indigenous tribes in the Cordillera.

Anonymity (Crisostomo, 2012; Marks, 2013) of the respondents was guaranteed. Personal rapport was established through actual visits and official introduction. Interviews were conducted in English and Ilocano languages (Marks, 2013; Hindin, 2014; Castro-Palaganas, 2001). Written informed consent (Crisostomo, 2012; Castro-Palaganas, 2001) and/or oral informed consent (Gul, 2013; Hindin, 2014) were also secured from the respondents. The interviewer explained to the participants the risks and benefits of agreeing with the activity. The interviewees’ right to withdraw and/or skip inappropriate questions was also practiced. It was emphasized to the respondents that the interview would be audio recorded and that the data would be used for research purposes only.

The issue of the researcher being an “outsider” was discussed during the focus group discussion (FGD) conducted with an Advisory Group (Sherwood, 2015) locally addressed as the community elders. The endorsement of the NCIP officers of the study was likewise helpful during this stage specifically in making the elders comfortable with the interviews.

To evade matters or inquiries measured as “sensitive” or taboo for the community, the researcher first conducted focus group discussions among Ibaloi, Bontok, and Ifugao key informants. Suggestions as to the extent of interviews in the community and other needs were settled out in this level.

For the Ibaloi and Bontok, the council of elders took charge of explaining every detail needed to answer the research questions.

In the case of Ifugao, the NCIP officers clarified that there is no need to look for the members of the council of elders, since there is no such concept in their region. The Ifugao are clannish and not comfortable of discussing their issues with those who are not “close” to them.

Theoretical Frameworks

Some theories served as guiding principles in the conduct of the study. One of these is the Third World Feminist Theory which includes culture and tradition as additional causes accountable for the suppression of women in the world (Crowley, 2014). Third world feminist theorists advance the idea that women studies should not be limited with looking at the situation of women in the light of the unequal gender relations, but should also identify policies and approaches to transform the world so as to make it a just place for every
by the political struggles of, “subaltern” communities (Dutta, 2015). The proponents of the CCA works for the re-writing of history from the point of view of the groups facing possible extinction. The followers of CCA distaste the erasure of the voices of the classed, raced and gendered subjects in the mainstream production of knowledge. They promote the idea of listening to narratives on local-specific stories and placing focus on the participation of the subalterns in everyday politics (Dutta, 2015).

Lastly, the study supported Garroutee’s call for “radical indigenism”, which aims to reassert and rebuild knowledge from the “root” or “radix” (Garroutte, 2003). Traditional knowledge or indigenous knowledge is composed of the practices of the indigenous communities including their awareness of traditional lifestyles (Fiagoy, 2011). This type of knowledge evolved from an extensive and established collective practice by indigenous and local peoples in the political, economic, and socio-cultural spheres of their lives. Being familiar with the culture of the indigenous peoples, thus, would be recreating our history as a people.

The Research Design

The study used mixed methodology, utilizing both quantitative and qualitative methods in the conduct of the research.

For the quantitative portion, descriptive statics were gathered from the Provincial Police Offices (PPO) of Benguet, Mountain Province and Ifugao. PPO’s were requested to give the annual data on domestic abuse cases reported in their respective offices. Letters asking permission were submitted to the Provincial Police Director for this purpose. The offices of the Department of Social Welfare and Development from the three provinces were likewise visited to gather data related to intimate partner violence. Likewise, data from the website of the Philippine Statistics Authority were also used for the demographic profiles.

For the qualitative portion, scholarly journal articles became the main source of literature. Ethnographic study of the local culture was made through key informant interviews from officers of the National Commission on Indigenous peoples (NCIP) and community elders.

Snowball sampling (Crisostomo, 2012; Dhoest, 2012), purposeful sampling (Hindin, 2014), and criterion sampling techniques were used in determining the respondents of the study. Snowballing technique and purposeful sampling are compatible with ethnographic researches because a key persons’ contact tends to be homogenous in relation to demographic profiling. This is because people tend to associate with those people they feel are similar to then (Dhoest, 2012).

The total number of the respondents was confirmed upon reaching “data saturation”. Data saturation is achieved when no new data is surfacing anymore and there is already an obvious repetition of answers.

During a certain phase of data gathering, a direct community integration (Carino, 2001) was undertaken by the researcher by attending a whole day seminar with the members of the council of elders from Benguet, sponsored by the office of NCIP-Benguet. It was observed that during community integration, the elders’ confidence and trust to the interviewer was achieved because of the endorsement made by the legal officer of the NCIP.

The validity and reliability of the result during the interview was tested through “negative case analysis”. Negative case analysis is done by looking for evidence and incidents that refute relationships identified during the interviews. The findings were then compared with the data from the focus group discussions (Hindin, 2014; Dhoest, 2012; WWTSVAW, 2009; Castro-Palaganas, 2001) conducted during the initial phase of the study for the purpose of triangulation.

Research Partners

Eleven elders were included in the study. There was one member of the council of elders and an Indigenous People Mandatory Representative (IPMR) from the Karao Tribe of Benguet. Six elders from the Ibaloi tribe of
Kabayan, Benguet, five of which are barangay IPMRs, while the other one is a barangay kagawad. One is a council of elders member from the Ibaloi of Itogon, Benguet who, at the same time, serves as the Municipal IPMR of Benguet.

Three elders were from the Mountain Province. One is a Municipal IPMR from Sagada. The other one is a native of Sadanga, also serving as an IPMR. The last respondent is from Alab Oriente, Bontoc, Mountain Province, also a member of the council of elders and an IPMR.

Only two of the eleven respondents from the council of elders are female. One of them was a former policewoman. One elder from Mountain Province was a former school teacher.

They all allowed the interviewer to record the conversation and were asked similar questions guided by a single interview schedule. Most of the elders spoke in English with mixed local terminologies, while some used the Ilocano language.

Results and Discussion

From the data gathered, the rate of domestic abuse in relation to the number of vulnerable women in Benguet is from 0.136% to 0.399%; in Mountain Province it is from .0038% to .1501%; and Ifugao the rate of domestic abuse in relation to the number of vulnerable women in the region is from 0.037% to 0.041%.

To come up with the frequency of occurrence of reported cases of domestic abuse from the three provinces, the rate of violation was computed by using the values related to the number of vulnerable women and frequency of occurrence per province. A percentage of not more than 0.5% was computed for all the three locales. The values indicate a very few number of reported cases related to intimate partner abuse.

Domestic abuse exists among the tribes of the Cordillera, however, intimate partner abuse is minimally committed by men from the tribes included in the study.

The respondents explained that only few cases of domestic violence happen in the community. They explained that there are years when not even one case of domestic violence was recorded. Moreover, they claim that most cases are resolved amicably and the couple lives together again.

Domestic abuse is not part of the traditional culture of the Ibaloi, Bontok and Ifugao. In fact, hurting the wives physically is generally considered a taboo in the communities, hence, not a common occurrence. If ever a violation was committed, it is resolved and there are sanctions imposed to the violators.

In cases were cases of intimate partner abuse is reported among the indigenous peoples, hurting women was deeply frowned upon or sneered at in the community level, in fact, the pressure of the community against committing it is more substantial. This is because the violator will surely be liable to the family, the tribe and the entire community. In some cases, domestic abuse may even lead to tribal wars, most especially if the married couple came from different tribes.

A respondent explained that when customary laws were still dominant in the life system of Cordillera indigenous peoples, respect and honor for women formed part of their early values and practices. Although domestic abuse is not tolerated, it is sometimes committed by some tribe members, but in such cases, the elders in the community would always mediate. The ancestors of the tribe always remind the younger ones not to hurt women.

Although there are so many beliefs systems and rituals done per tribe, in all the three cultures, the common feature in solving intimate partner abuse is their concept of “multa” or fine. The members of the council of elders and leaders determine the form and quantity of the “multa”.

174
For both the Ibaloi and Bontok, the council of elders are the primary in-charge with the settlement of disputes, including domestic affairs. The members of the council of elders are consulted with every problem in the family and the community.

For the Ifugao, there is no council of elders because they are clannish, or are used to clan-based resolutions of disputes. Members of the family exhibiting fair and just judgment are considered as “nanumnuman”. They are regarded with respect by relatives because of their character and credibility. Becoming a “nanumnuman” is not based on age but on the trust vested by one’s relatives.

The community has a mechanism of preventing the occurrence of domestic abuse even before it is committed by the members of their tribe. Elders disallow certain activities that may lead to violence against women. In case of drunkenness, for example, which is frequently cited as the primary cause of violent behavior among males, the “babbaket” or the elder women in the community patrol the neighborhood during night time and ask the young males to go home in case they are seen drinking in the area. Being reprimanded by the respected members of the tribe, the young husbands are not left with a choice but to abide by the words of the “babbaket” to stop drinking and stay home. Among Cordilleran communities, respect, as well as the more important role of mediation, is given to the Council of Elders. The people adhere to the suggestions of the Council more than entertaining the concept of sending into jail any member of the tribe.

**The Ibalois**

Among the Ibaloi of Benguet, they have the concept of “innayan”, the belief that a husband will be cursed if he physically hits his wife. This is why in the few cases of domestic violence, the belief of the community is that these are committed by “half-half”, or those who are not “pure Ibaloi”.

There is also a process of mediation called “tong-tong” where the elders, together with the couple and their immediate families, discuss the marital problem. The elders will advise and enumerate the disadvantages and advantages of the different options for the couple.

The couple could undergo the process of “idang”, or a trial separation upon the agreement in the tong-tong. If, after concept of “innayan”, the couple decides to come back together, another ritual called “sabusab” will be conducted by the elders. All the rituals entail the butchering of pigs as a form of sacrifice and offering. The elders will be the ones to determine the number of sacrifice animals to be butchered.

Specifically for the municipality of Kibungan, Benguet, there is a ritual called “magsigpet” that is done to give an end to the conflict between the married couple. Like others, the ritual entails the butchering of pigs and/or other animals for sacrifice and offering. If the couple decides to reconcile, the community will do another ritual called “isisep”. This last ritual is comparable to a wedding festivity and is headed by the council of elders.

For the Karao tribe, they have a ritual called “sintil”. The community shows their love and care to the couple by giving pieces of advice, be it solicited or otherwise. The “sintil” is done to allow the community to show their support through their interference.

“Kappi” is another ritual or tradition that is officiated by the Ibaloi elders. During the ritual, the couple will each offer a pig to butcher to be shared to the community. While eating the boiled meat, the elders will discuss the problem and will invoke the help of the spirits so the problem will not happen again. “Kappi” is like a process of cleansing the relationship.

Among the Ibaloi in general, the couple has the choice to separate, but this is the last recourse that will be offered to them. The community will always aim for reconciliation and for the couple to live together again.

**The Bontoks**

Among the members of the Bontok tribe, marriage is originally between family and
the community itself. The elders are allowed to interfere in solving marital problems.

For the Bontoks of Mountain Province, “lawa” serves as their moral doctrine. In “lawa”, which is an oral tradition, it is clear that violence against women is a taboo, it disallows abuse, greed, as well as evil thoughts and deeds among members of the community. “Lawa” specifically indicate respect of women, as well as human kind and common good in general.

The Bontoks also have “nga-ag”, which is comparable to the ten commandments of the Catholic Church and which states that men should not hurt their wives.

The process of talking together to settle marital issue is called “matutya”. There is another ritual that is conducted by the elders when the domestic issue is solved. The process of settlement starts with the butchering of pigs as sacrifice. The butchered pig will serve as the basis of their reading on how to advise the erring couple.

Within the Bontok community, it is a taboo not to care for the women of the family. They narrated that in Mt. Province, they have the “dap-ay”, which has numerous members. If the members of the dap-ay see a working woman who has just given birth, the members of the dap-ay will summon the husband and penalize him. Usually the members of the dap-ay are also the council of elders.

If a couple has a disagreement and this is not manageable within the confines of their own home, the “lallakays” (elderly men) will go to their home, butcher pigs and start the process of “pagsasaoan”. This is the reason why, according to an elder, men are afraid to enter into a discussion with their partner because “sayang ti baboy” (It is a waste to butcher a pig). Joking aside, the elder clarified that in Bontok, when a couple argues, they do it in a secretive and quiet manner; otherwise, the husband will be penalized by the council of elders.

The elders do not use the mainstream laws implemented on a top-down pattern by the government institutions in finding a solution to domestic problems. They would rather look for the best traditional solution and if the case is incorrigible, “pa-distero-mi ti lalaki”. The husband will be asked to leave the conjugal house, and is not allowed to carry with him anything. The husband is also not allowed to have a share of the conjugal properties and will be asked to look for a place for himself so he will not burden his wife anymore. This is the ultimate penalty that the Bontok elders impose.

One elder said that divorce is allowed in the Mt. Province, although they do not advocate it. If the couple is really not compatible, the elders will allow them to separate. But initially, when a couple asks for their permission to separate from each other, their initial opinion is not to allow it and to try to resolve it. Divorce is legal, however, if the couple is childless.

The Ifugaos

The Ifugaos, have a practice called “pani-o” or “paniyo” which makes hurting women a taboo. They also have “haliw”, the act of penalizing the faulty party if there is a case of domestic violence. “Haliw” does not necessarily end up in separation. In some cases, penalty or “multa” is imposed only because of the wrongdoing (wrong action) committed by the offender. “Multa” is not monetary in nature and is usually in the form of animals, usually pigs and/or chicken. Carabaos are also imposed in case of grave offense.

In Ifugao, indemnification is a community affair and is done between the families. It is not considered a private matter between husband and wife, and the elders determine sanctions.

“Humangan” is the process of settling the domestic problems of a couple with their parents and relatives. During the “humangan” there are mediators who are usually the elderly members of the clan. The problems are discussed and the couple is given pieces of advice. The decision whether to separate or try to live together again is based on the opinion of all parties, not only of the couple in conflict. The Ifugao are cautious to secure the opinion of the family members first before consulting with outsiders.
The Ifugaos call the ritual for closure as “hidit”. It is a process to prove that despite of what has happened between them and the separation, they can still live and eat together as members of the family. The matured members of the family lead this ritual.

Among the Ifugaos, they believe that before asking help from outsiders, they must first consult with their relatives. In fact, the family is so important among the Ifugaos that they consult even the relatives up to the 10th degree of consanguinity and affinity. The matured members of the family are objective enough to decide if a member is to be sent to jail or not, depending on the gravity of the offense; however, most of the times, problems are amicably settled among warring families.

**New Model of Policy-Making Process**

Based on the collaborative governance patterns gathered during the interviews, a new policy-making process was designed as the major output of the research.

The model will highlight the integration of the traditional knowledge and proposed solutions of those sectors being affected by a specific problem in the society. Even before a policy is proposed, it must have the approval of the elders and the sectoral representatives. In this way, the policy to be created will truly be a solution to the problem at hand. The policies are expected to be inclusive, gender-sensitive and useful to the target beneficiaries.

Generally, the elders have a very important role in the community. These roles are enumerated in the table below. The elders are likewise pro-active in deterring the occurrence of VAW in the community by disallowing activities that may lead to couple disagreements.

**Table 1. Elders Role in Preventing the Occurrence of Domestic Violence**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role of the Council of Elders</th>
<th>Among Ibalois and Bontoks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>General Role</strong></td>
<td>1. Council of elders are the primary in-charge with the settlement of disputes;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. They balance and weigh the two sides of the case; They investigate and are allowed to impose penalties to those who are at fault, if deemed necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. They give advises and lead the rituals performed in the community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Among the Ifugaos</strong></td>
<td>There are no council of elders but they use clan-based resolution of disputes; Family members up to almost 10th degree of affinity and consanguinity are consulted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Recommendations**

With the proliferation of the Western ideas in the country, a continuous study on Filipino indigenous groups should be undertaken in order to facilitate the formation of a Filipino Culture-Centered approach in analysing occurrences in the Philippine Society.

As Filipino researchers, we can help in fulfilling the need to contribute to the growth of the Third World Feminist Theory by exploring the situation of the Filipino women in general and the indigenous women in particular.

At the same time, collective settlement of disputes in the Barangay level is recommended to decongest the judicial courts of their pending cases.

It is further recommended that national and local policy makers ensure the inclusion of the result of a community-based mechanism on the bills they sponsor to guarantee that these would be acceptable to all and at the same time give the indigenous communities the opportunity to share their insights on the
suggested bills. Lawmakers should harvest the knowledge and expertise of the Council of Elders to guide them in constructing appropriate policies. In-depth consultation should always be a prerequisite of policy-making. The lessons of collaborative governance as exemplified by the community elders should serve as model at all times.

dahil may organization na sa community” (No organization was set up because there is abuse, but in reality, there is no abuse or there is minimal abuse because there are already organizations in the community).

To future researchers interested in conducting similar studies, a research incorporating cultural studies to come up with a more meaningful feminist paradigm may be considered. The other provinces of the Cordillera (Abra, Kalinga and Apayao) and the tribes within may also be tapped for a similar research.

Similarly, aside from those in the Cordillera Administrative Region, it is further recommended that studies be conducted in other tribes of indigenous peoples located in other regions in the country.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


The Urban Informality of Street Vending: Implications to Sustainable Urban and City Development

Ken M. Haictin  
ken.haictin@g.msuit.edu.ph  
Mindanao State University - Iligan Institute of Technology  
Alexa Marie S. Revelo  
alexamarie.revelo@g.msuit.edu.ph  
Mindanao State University - Iligan Institute of Technology  
Enrique B. Batara  
enrique.batara@g.msuit.edu.ph  
Mindanao State University - Iligan Institute of Technology

Abstract

Street vending provides accessible and cheap array of goods and plays a notable role in the vibrancy of public spaces, but it receives little attention in the formulation of urban development and city planning. Many cities restrict street vending in public spaces, but it thrives through verbal negotiations which primarily contributes to the street vendors’ precarious condition. This study aims to examine this unstable condition. Particularly, it includes analysis on the primary actors both from formal and informal sectors, the policies observed in relation to street vending, the norms and practices in street use and street vending, and its implications to city planning and urban development. The study is a qualitative research employing documentary review, observation, and in-depth key informant interviews. The NVivo software is used in coding and analyzing the primary and secondary data. Findings show that despite prohibition, street vending continues due to humanitarian consideration – vendors can sell to meet ends for the day – and fulfill condition like paying a daily fee. The results’ implications highlight the unsteady environment of street vendors since the city government can revoke verbal negotiations anytime. This calls for an inclusive and sustainable urban development and city planning in the use of public spaces. The findings could enhance formulation of public policies or re-evaluation and reassessment of existing policies that aim to manage street vending.

keywords: urban informality, street vending, sustainable urban and city planning, sustainable development

INTRODUCTION

The dominant perspective sees the state as the prime provider of goods and services, however, due to its inability, the people turn to informal mechanisms such as street vending or street hawking, even clandestine installations (Bayat, 1997), to satisfy their needs. These informal mechanisms constitute the so-called urban informality which has been a trend in urban studies and development. However, urban informality has developed negative undertones that is often associated with poverty (Roy, 2009), illegality and a feature of a weak state (Lubel, 1991; Dovey, 2012), governance issue (De Sotto, 1998) and a “major challenge to both long-standing and contemporary approaches to planning” (Porter, 2011, p. 115). Thus, this reinforces the duality of formal and informal mechanism towards urban studies and development where the latter is seen as the “other” against the modern and regulated activities maintained by the state.

Street vending refers to an economic activity of an individual who uses a public space
to sell his/her goods without setting up a permanent structure from which to sell (Bhowmik, 2005; Recio, Babiano, & Roitman, 2016). Certain narratives view it as an ‘eyesore’ (Yatmo, 2008) and a ‘blemish’ (Hanser, 2016) to the cityscape, hence, they become subject to purges (Recio, Babiano, & Roitman, 2016; Recio, 2018). In order to survive, hawkers or vendors employ what Bayat (1997) and Hanser (2016) call the ‘politics of the street’ or as Wataru (2010) posits as the ‘agency of the poor’—such as bribery, resistance, or even feigned submission. From this parlance, we see the entanglement of informal mechanisms to formalized structures; and the attempts of the formalized structure to regulate urban informality, specifically informal street vending, as manifested in the implementation of policies ranging from eviction, relocation, tolerance, to formalization of such informalities.

In Philippines, the national policy towards informal activities is often anchored in prohibition (Recio et al., 2016). However, there are several cases wherein the local governments allowed these informal activities to thrive. For example, in Manila, the local government had designed some plans for street vendors (Bhomik, 2005). This led to the creation of a division called hawker’s permit service wherein it is tasked “to receive, process, analyze applications for street vending” (Bhomik, 2005, p. 2260).

The City Ordinance No. 2246, series of 1993, otherwise known as the Market Code of Iligan City of 1993, prohibits street vending activities. Thus, occasional eviction and relocation policies are carried out against the street vendors. However, informal street vending thrives because the city promotes a degree of accommodation towards informal street vendors. This is due to the series of negotiations and agreements done between the local government and the informal street vendors. An example of this is the appropriation of a designated time and space for street vendors to sell their goods provided that they will pay a small fee (or sukay) towards the local government. Previously, the presence of night market reinforced the tolerant environment of Iligan City but it was stopped due to security alert status.

Utilizing Recio’s (2018) post-dualist approach, the study looks into the deemphasized intersection of formal institutions of the government and the informal mechanisms of the urban poor in relation to informal street vending; interrogates the underlying practices, norms, and policies that emerge from the formal-informal interface; and analyzes the implication of this intersection to city governance.

CONCEPTUAL AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The study examined urban informality, specifically on street vending through Recio’s (2018) post-dualism approach, which was loosely adopted from Giddens’s (1984) structuration theory. Drawing on the structuration theory of Giddens (1984), the post-dualist lens “links the structure-agency nexus to discourses and policy models on urban informality such as street vending” (Recio et al., p.1). Giddens (1984) introduced space for analyzing the role of social structures and human agency in informality. His conception of human agency affirms that people’s activity matters and at the same time in understanding these activities there is a need to attend to the institutional structures that is embedded in the society (Whittington, 2015). Thus, this interlinked view of structure and agency was important as it encapsulated how social structures and human actions “shape the causes, consequences, practices, and benefits of economic transactions” (Recio, 2016, p. 3).

In the literature of street vending, the narratives of agency vary that include an array of spontaneous and planned encroachments of the ordinary—the ordinary being the street vendors (Bayat, 1997; Musoni, 2010), forms of resistance (Crossa, 2009; Flock & Breitung, 2016), and engagement to government units (Cross, 2000; Peña, 1999). Moreover, the structure referred to the social systems that reinforce socioeconomic conditions such as poverty, employment, migration, and state policies aimed in regulating, controlling, or purging the informal settlers (Musoni, 2010; Peña, 1999; Recio & Gomez, 2013). This described the dynamics of agency and structure relations which was evident on how
vendors respond to state policies and how the state categorizes the legality of street vending.

Post-dualist framing referred to an approach that is “conscious of the inherent relations between the formal and informal economic transactions” (Recio, 2016, p. 7). Its formal-informal interface allowed the discovery and interrogation of factors, forces, and relations of urban informality vis-à-vis informal street vending. Also, the post-dualist approach also seeks to “problematize the contours of structural elements (e.g. socioeconomic conditions, political structures) and the forms of agency (e.g. resistance, submission) that drive the perceived duality and relations between formal and informal schemes” (Recio, 2016, p. 7). Furthermore, it challenged the reductionist neoliberal formulation that treats informal economic activities as an “outcome of cost-benefit calculations of rational individual actors” (Recio, 2016, p. 8).

Based on the post-dualist framework presented by Recio (2016), the study analyzed the interaction of the formal and informal actors governing the relations in urban informality, specifically on informal street vending.

Figure 1 Conceptual Framework (adapted from Recio, 2018)

To identify how formal and informal sectors related to each other in governing and appropriating contested vending spaces, the study examined the key actors, their respective policies and programs, and their roles and relations that drive the processes within, as well as the interface between.

In establishing how the formal and informal sectors interact, the study highlighted the norms and practices that came within the interlocking system of formal and informal mechanisms. Thus, the relational lens, a feature of the post-dualist framework, was applied in examining the practices of key actors, particularly how vendors have been able to gain access to and control over vending spaces. Similarly, the same lens was also used to determine the governing relations that oversees the relationship of the formal actors (e.g. local government) and the informal actors (the street vendors). Lastly, the governance implication was determined by how street vending affects and influences urban governance and city planning.

METHODOLOGY

The study employed key informant interviews to respondents identified by the city government as point persons that deal with street vending. Considering that the study dealt with informal street vendors – most of them were occasionally mobile or continuously mobile (Bromley, 2000; Recio & Gomez, 2013) a number of streets were chosen as fixed sites of analysis; namely, Aguinaldo extension, Badilles Street, Bernardo Picardal Street, Chico Street, Gregorio Nanaman Street, F. B. Laya Street, and Tomas Cabile Avenue.

The selection of study areas was be guided by: (1) magnitude of informal vending activity and (2) informal vendors were using contested vending spaces where they can employ human agency (Wataru, 2010) or “street politics” (Bayat, 1997; Hanser, 2016). Magnitude of informal vending activity pertained to the presence of informal vendors in public spaces (contested vending spaces) such as streets, sidewalks, and terminals (Recio, 2018).

The respondents were divided into four clusters: (1) local government officials, (2) city planners, (3) street-level bureaucrats (3) informal street vendors (members of organized vendors’ group and unorganized vendors), (4) costumers. The researcher interviewed 4
government officials, 4 street-level bureaucrats, 15 informal street vendors, and 2 costumers.

In gathering data, this study utilized both primary and secondary data to satisfy the research questions. These sets of information were as follows: (1) Market Code of Iligan City No. 2246, series of 1993; (2) verbal organizational policies and agreements among government officials, vendor groups, and customers that are relevant to street use and informal vending; (3) actual practices of government officials and vendors affecting the vending space governance; (4) perceptions of government officials, vendors and other customers on the formal-informal interface in contested vending spaces. To satisfy this, the study combined document review, in-depth interview, and observation. The gathering was done through 3 stages. Stage one focused on document review to explore for relevant themes and information that satisfy the research questions of the study. The initial themes gathered from document review informed the interview questions/guide and observation checklist of patterns and concepts relevant to street vending, contested vending spaces, and governing relations. The first data gathering happened in stage two through sets of interviews and observations. NVIVO software was used to categorize themes – those which were present in the conceptual framework and in the synthesizing concepts from literature review. After themes were categorized, another round of document review will be used to validate the gathered data. This served as the preliminary analysis of the qualitative data. The preliminary analysis was used to inform interview guide and observation for stage three which dealt with new set of interviews and focus observation to validate and clarify initial findings to further explain the established themes and the emerging themes.

ACTORS, POLICIES, AND HUMANITARIAN CONSIDERATION

The city relatively follows the guidelines laid by the City Ordinance No. 2246, series of 1993, known as the Market Code of Iligan City 1993. As such, it prohibits street vending. Under Chapter IX, Section 60, it reads:

No person shall peddle, hawk, offer for sale, or expose for sale any articles in the sidewalks, passageways, or aisles used by the market-going public. To avoid unjust competition, peddlers or hawkers shall not be permitted to offer for sale in the market and their surrounding within a radius of one hundred (100) meters from their confines. Market Officials and personnel, market police and policemen detailed in the vicinity of the market shall maintain vigilance strict vigilance on this matter and enjoin strict compliance with this provision.

Even if the Market Code stipulates that street vending activities are not allowed, the Iligan City’s Treasury collects money from the street vendors daily to permit them to sell their goods. Ironically, it uses the same Code as the basis for taxing the street vendors even though they are not considered as legal. Chapter VIII, Section 52 states, “Daily collection shall be made only from transient/ambulant vendors . . . using cash tickets.” This daily collection is locally known as sukay; the amount paid depends on the volume of items a street vendor has. However, this do not make the street vendors immune to evictions and confiscations.

There are three actors present in the precarious condition of street vendors. First, representation in the city government is one of the main concerns of the street vendors since many are ambulant vendors that move from place to place with no fixed space to sell their goods (Bhowmik, 2005; Hiemstra et al., 2006; Recio, 2013; Recio, Babiano, & Roitman, 2016). The vendors feared that they are not represented because they are considered illegal in the first place. Interestingly, the First Iligan City United Vendors Association (FICUVA) is established by the informal street vendors. It first acted as a cooperative for lending small finance to informal street vendors until later on expanded with a learning center. The primary aim of the organization is to cater to the needs of informal street vendors and act as a representative. Currently, it is composed of six chapters located at the various strategic
points of Iligan City. The association currently has approximately 200 members, and not all of street vendors in Iligan city is a member. Nevertheless, the association became the de facto voice of all street vendors. As shared by their president, "I negotiate for all street vendors and offer of alternatives to the government."

Second, politicians are pivotal to the survival of the street vendors. FICUVA shared that every after evictions and confiscations they go to city councilors and the mayor’s office to negotiate for their condition. The vendors rely on the rule of the city that only registered voters can do business. The city administrator have a poignant explanation to this, “...even if they are dull but they are many,...their vote counts. So, the politicians try to win them.” Hence, there are instances where the street vendors get to temporarily stay in the place.

One of the dilemmas of street vendors lies on the third actor, the bureaucrats. The city administrator who is the alter-ego of the mayor and the Hapsay Dalan Task Force which is composed of the Economic Enterprise Development and Management Office (EEDMO), the Anti-Littering Group, the Clean and Green Group, and the Iligan City Traffic and Parking Management Office (ICTPMO) represent the last actor. The city administrator and Hapsay Dalan maintain a dualist stance when it comes to dealing with street vendors. As reason by one market head, “buying and selling of crops, fish, and the likes, should only be done inside the market and not in the roads or the street.” These bureaucrats view street vendors as an eyesore to the cityscape. Hence, they conduct evictions and confiscations against the vendors.

Nevertheless, both politicians and bureaucrats acknowledged the motivation of street vendors to live. They recognized that the street vendors were only trying meet the ends at the end of the day. The street vendors have shared that they are vending in order to buy food and send their children to school. This motivation became the top reason why city government jumps back and forth from a hostile approach to tolerant approach in dealing with the vendors. This is referred as humanitarian consideration. One market superintendent lamented, “…we were advised particularly by our vice mayor to treat street vendors with respect. ‘justice without compassion is tyranny,’ that’s what the vice mayor said.”

Thus, the street vendors relied on humanitarian consideration for their survival. Also, humanitarian consideration served as the backbone of their rules and regulation as there are no specific policies that clearly deals with them. The street vendors shared that humanitarian consideration is highly volatile since they still experience evictions. The city government sees humanitarian consideration as a form of charity and special revocable privilege.

**THE FORMAL-INFORMAL INTERFACE:**

**NORMS AND PRACTICES IN CONTESTED VENDING SPACES**

Due to hostile and preventive nature of policies, street vendors utilized a subversive tactics (Bayat, 1997) to circumvent the policies. These subversive tactics helped street vendors persist despite prohibitions and evictions. The same was true to Iligan City. The street vendors had norms and practices in dealing with the city government vis-a-vis themselves in governing contested vending spaces.

Three themes emerged that captured the entanglement of the formal and informal sectors: (a) security of occupation, (b) socio-spatial factors, and (c) socio-temporal factors.

**Security of occupation**

In order to stay in the same place, the street vendors also practiced self-governance to secure their vending spaces. Self-governance was a mechanism for the street vendors to get preferential treatment from the city government. Batréau and Bonnet (2016) had also observed the same practice in Thailand. However, unlike Thailand where district administrators aligned themselves with the street vendors, the opposite was noted in Iligan City. The street vendors aligned their governing rules to the demands of the city government.

The practice was noted from FICUVA, an association formed by the street vendors. The association observes certain responsibilities levied on its members with regards to the use
of the street. These responsibilities were “in harmony of the policies of the city government...”, as stated by federated president of the association, that is to ensure that the vendors are properly arranged on their spaces – they do not obstruct or do not cause congestion and blockage to passageways and sidewalks. The members are expected to observe cleanliness. The members are required to have brooms, dustpans and trash bins for their wastes. Moreover, members were required to pay their sukay (daily taxes). In addition, the market authorities necessitated that stalls and structures built by the vendors should be for temporary use. One market superintendent explained that “the city government does not allow street vending. However, we allowed some construction of stalls but on the condition that it can be easily removed. The stalls should be built for convenience only and for temporary use because the city government might want to clean and demolish them anytime.”

Moreover, the president of FICUVA played a pivotal role for the association and the greater body of street vendors. The president is the primary representative of the street vendors. Whenever there were contentions and confiscations, the president acts as prime negotiator of the street vendors. Being the prime negotiator is one of the duties of vendors leaders (Recio, 2018). The leader ensures that (1) areas occupied by their members are clean and orderly; (2) member-vendors are within their assigned spaces, and (3) enforce the market order to only build temporary stalls or structures. Batréau and Bonnet (2016), Hanser (2016) and Recio (2018) highlighted these responsibilities and requirements form the authorities are common to cities, especially those from the global south. It can be observed that there is a lack of a long-term plan for secure occupancy (Recio, 2018). The responsibilities are limited to immediate and short-term mechanisms, such as sanitation, which are parallel to the demands of the city government.

Furthermore, street vendors had also observed the cultivation of tenuous ties in order to secure their occupancy. This was practiced by either, but not limited to, illicit financial transaction, daily acts of ‘goodwill’, sending of gifts during Christmas season, and fictive kinships, or a combination thereof. These tenuous ties surmounted the harsh policies of the government, although precarious but, were proven effective. These “grassroots” mechanisms were seen as “the agency of the poor” (Wataru, 2010). Scholars coined it as “politics of the street” (Bayat, 1997; Hansen, 2016), strategic and tactical agencies (Honwana, 2008), “politics of the governed” (Chatterjee, 2004), and “everyday politics” (Kerkvliets, 2009).

FICUVA admitted that before 2009, the past presidents were engaged with illicit collection of monetary contribution of at least 150 pesos to appease the city official every after evictions and confiscations. “We give some to the policemen, some to the traffic officers, and some to the politicians,” the current president shared. The same practice was done by street vendors in flea markets of Manila (Recio, 2018). The locals called the practice as lagay (bribe). This practice had been normalized and became a common feature of informal economic activities in the global south (Batréau & Bonnet, 2016; Chatterjee, 2004). However, FICUVA denounced these practices now, branding it as “corrupt”, “unjust”, and “unfair” for the street vendors who are living a “humble and dignified livelihood.” Ironically, the association sends gifts to government officials and city councilors who are their “intermediary” (Recio, 2018; Wataru, 2010) in the city government.

Sending of gifts created a “tie” between the street vendors and the formal authorities. This “tie” was considered as a tenuous link and enforced by an “act of goodwill” (Recio, 2018). This “act of goodwill” strengthened the relationship because it engendered indebtedness. The unsolicited presentation of goods and/or services created the concept of “Utang na loob” which reflects a system of social sentiments of “…deep and strong affective nature and expressively symbolizes a whole configuration of reciprocal obligation” (Kaut, 1961, p. 258). This “reciprocal obligation” was pivotal for the occupancy and tenure of the street vendors in their respective vending spaces because of the following reasons: first,
as the street vendors suggested, it stimulated a “less harsh approach” in clearing operations and “humane treatment” in dealing with them; second, it prompted a “preference” (Recio, 2018) to the members of the association or the organized vendors—meaning, purges were directed to unorganized, itinerary, ambulant vendors rather than to the general body of street vendors.

Socio-spatial factors affecting contested vending spaces

Two themes emerged from these factors. In Iligan City, street vendors observed the concept of suki relationship or the concept of a “special customer” (Stark, 1992) and the incidence of extensions where market stallholders have vending spaces on the streets. These two concepts explain the socio-spatial factors that encourage street vending.

Suki is an economic relationship that links socially distinct groups, producers and consumers into a potentially long-term relationship (Stark, 1992). This relationship persisted with or without kin (and even fictive kin) ties and was usually found in the markets of the Philippines (Stark, 1992). A suki-like relationships were not, however, exclusive to the Philippines. Stark (1992) noted that the same economic relationship was witnessed in Melanesia and Indonesia.

In the same vein, vendors of Iligan city were engaged in a suki relationship. This relationship offered a socio-spatial explanation of why street vending persists vis-à-vis why street vendors, despite demolitions and evictions, resisted relocations and went back to the same spot (the contested vending space). One street vendor shared, “my customers know that I vend here. My suki will always come back to this area because this has been known to them—a place where they can buy flowers, where they can find me. So, I have reservations with the idea of relocating to another area.” This was affirmed by the interviewed customers when they said, “you will always locate them in their spaces”. In this case, the suki (special customer) always associates the vendor to his/her vending space; and the suki will always go to the same area to find the vendor. Moreover, market superintendents explained that when an area becomes known to the customers, it will lead to a trickle-down effect: “more vendors, who sell different goods, will gather in the same spot, consequently, customers will converge in the same area too... [That] is problematic because of tendencies on congestion and maybe increase crimes.”

Suki system works operates like a patron-client relationship. Where the patron (street vendor) gives discounts and pakapin (an extra item/good for free) in exchange for the client’s (customer’s) patronage. For instance, the researchers observed that a bundle of drumstick tree leaves is paired with three pieces of lemongrass as a giveaway for the customer of which the street vendor considered as his/her suki. Moreover, the street vendors do not strictly follow the price determination. A rounding off mechanism is observed by negating excess grams. For instance, when the weight of the purchased item is 1.2 kilograms (kg), the vendor excludes the excess grams and consider it as 1 kg. The giving of giveaways and discounts enforce the suki-relationship.

On the other hand, there has been an observed incidence of “extensions”. This means that registered stallholders inside the market are also engaged in street vending. Commonly, this extension is carried out by their relatives and/or immediate family members or by another vendors. One of the street vendors interviewed was engaged in such a practice. He stated that his wife, a fruit vendor, has a stall inside the market. He added that he wanted to help his wife because the money that she earned by her wife was not enough to feed their family. Thus, he took it to his volition to help his wife in increasing the income of the family. However, his goods were not from his wife but from another registered vendor. This practiced helped promote street vending, and this had a connection to socio-spatial factors. As emphasized by the respondents, selling in the street was more advantageous than doing it inside the market. This was the top reason for the existence of this phenomenon. Since the customers were always found in the streets, thus, in a way to increase income, registered stallholders send kin to the streets to vend. Although Bromley (2000) and Recio and Gomez (2013) noted a similar movement, however, it was limited to the expansion of
vending spaces when a street vendor occupies or rents adjacent and/or creation of branches.

**Socio-temporal Factors affecting Street Vending in Iligan City**

Recio (2018), in his study in Baclaran, noted that there is a policy shift to tolerant approach every “season of giving and compassion. He termed it as Bermoths—refers to the Christmas-New year season in the Philippines which stretch from early September to the middle of January (Recio, 2018). He related the season to a socio-cultural underpinning. The observation of Manila’s vending policy is shaped by social values that permeate the implementation process and weakened the degree of compliance (Illy, 1986; Recio, 2018). “As socio-cultural values blend with economic vulnerability, the hostile legal environment, and the consumerist rush during Christmas season, the Bermonths season appears to represent a socio-spatial ordering that recognizes vending as legitimate employment” (Recio, 2018, p.145). However, the effect of temporal factor varied across countries. For example, in Mexico, during Christmas and Easter, the vendors received a permit to sell (Crossa, 2009). On the other hand, during Spring Festival in Chinese Cities, Flock and Breitung (2016) highlighted a heightened and stricter regulation and implementation of policies; the same tighter situations were observed in other national celebrations.

In Iligan City, such dimension was also observed. The head of Central Market confirmed by saying: “They are not allowed. These street vendors are not allowed to use the streets, except when on special occasions like All Saints Day, Christmas, and during the city fiesta. We can give those spaces during those times. But, outside of this, they are not allowed to vend in all of the streets here in Iligan.” However, unlike in Manila where sidewalks become available for street vendors during this season, in Iligan City, the vendors had to send a formal letter of request and permission addressed to the City Mayor’s office. Rolando had to say: “we have to negotiate a space with the mayor.”

This tolerant atmosphere usually was frequently observed during the month of September to early October, a month when the city’s local festival—Diyandi festival—is celebrated; the first week of November, were candle and flower vendors were given a special privilege. It favored vendors whose goods fit the season’s need. Meaning, for instance during All Saints day, candle and flower vendors gain special considerations.

Diyandi and Christmas seasons, on the other hand, displayed different socio-spatiotemporal consideration for the street vendors. With the permission of the mayor, an assigned area where a convergence of vendors and amusements gather. This place was locally popularized as mugna (to create). Inside mugna, vendors of all sorts from ukay-ukayan (assorted cloth section), sapatusan (shoe section), balut vendors, food stalls, to accessory vendors were present. Subsequently, mugna attracts ambulant vendors near its premises since the convergence of people into one area is perceived as an opportunity. The area outside mugna becomes a contested vending space for the street vendors because nearby areas are automatically used as parking spaces. The vendors had to compete with cars and motorcycles in occupying spaces. Moreover, traffic personnel and the police are deployed in the area. The presence of these formal actors made the potential vending areas tight for the street vendors. Despite the tolerant season, the formal actors favoured order, thus, favouring a parking space than a vending space.

Another temporal dimension is the election period. Election period is part of a broader socio-temporal and political factors that affect street vending activities in Iligan city. It has been observed that during the election period, the regulation loosens and after election purges continue. The midterm election was approaching for senators and local government officials. Meanwhile, the campaign period for local candidates – for governors down to municipal councilors and for district representatives – was set for March 29 to May 11, 2019, and election day was on Monday, May 13, 2019 (Bueza, 2018). Recio (2018) considered this action as part of a patron-client relation or broadly known as clientelism where some vendors relate to local officials by patronage relationship, which in the body of
literature is considered a common engagement of hostile policies and corruption (Crossa, 2009; Donavan, 2008). The local politicians of Iligan engaging in such a relationship. However, this occurrence was highly temporal. The respondents agreed that it was only happening during campaign period where clearing and confiscations were seldomly done by the Hapsay Dalan team. Street vendors supplied that “…there we a lot of confiscations last year, even in December…” and this changed when campaign period came; they had not witnessed any evictions since March; they expected evictions to resume after the election. In fact, the street vendors all agreed that incumbent administration is the hardest one.

**IMPLICATION OF INFORMAL STREET VENDING TO CITY PLANNING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT**

The city’s vision towards its city planning and urban development is geared towards beautification of the city through reordering and realigning its landscape. This means that urban informality has no place in the city, because it represents the opposite of what a “global city” should look, thus reinforcing the dualist conception of development in terms of urban development. The street vendors are viewed as generators of chaos, congestion, and lawlessness. This perspective is reflected formal actors’ reference to “loose governance and poor planning.” This is seen in studies of De Sotto (1998), Dovey (2012), Lubel (1991) where urban informal economic activities such as street vending is a sign of governance issue; a feature of illegality and a weak state. Leo, as the city administrator, has expressed the same line of concern, hence, he laid his plans of “beautifying the city” where there are no stray vendors obstructing the passageways and sidewalks.

Recognizing the necessities of the street vendors, the state officials allowed them through humanitarian consideration. However, this humanitarian consideration, like all verbal agreements which stemmed from this consideration, is temporary. Still, this temporariness will stay as long as there is no concrete street vending policy that will regulate the street vendors in the city. The formal actors admitted that street vending is inevitable. However, in spite of the realization, the city government still relies on the market code. Aside from the Market Code, no further policies that attempt to regulate street vending are made. This lack of policy fosters uncertainty which leads to disjunctive city planning and implementation. Moreover, the uncertainty is prone to politicization and clientelist-relationship (Recio, 2018). Thus, in view with the government, there is a negative implication of the existence of urban informality to the development of the city.

For the street vendors, street vending is a dignified living; it is a better way of life than stealing or doing the crime. Rolando, believed that street vendors are a great help to the local economy of the city because they contribute to tax revenues of the city. He asked for a place where the can gather and promote it as an attraction; and called for inclusive regulations and “humane” treatment to them. In fact, street vendors were willing to become “watchdogs” to keep a track of the number of peddlers in the city. All that was needed was a formulation of concrete policies on street vending so negotiations with the city government will not again fall as a verbal agreement which is fragile since it can be revoked or dishonored anytime.

What was challenging for the vendors was the disjunctive implementation of policies. This meant that the state actors themselves had conflicting ideas on the enforcement of policies. And this was evident when Rolando said, “wa’ mi kabalo kinsay sundon” (We do not know whom to follow). The statement denoted the incongruence what was negotiated by the FICUVA with the incumbent politicians and the implementation of the Hapsay Dalan Taskforce. Recio (2018) cited this as a situation where there are conflicting rationalities of the politicians and bureaucrats. While politicians consider his/her constituents’ political support, bureaucrats, on the other hand, are devoid of political considerations, hence, detached attitude to planning process where planning offices are powerless in decision-making (Recio, 2018).

Whereas number 11 of the United Nation’s Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) called for safe, sustainable, resilient, and inclusive cities, plus, a banner of “no one gets left behind” development. However, the
prevailing perspective of Iligan city is exclusive and heeded on ideals of urban scenario. As expressed by Leo, the city administrator, the right hand and alter-ego of the mayor, informality has no place in his vision of a modern and beautiful city.

As recommended by Recio (2013, 2016, 2018), there is a need for right-centered and inclusive urbanization, a multi-tiered inclusion mechanism which ensures "...that prevailing institutions (market regulation, service provision; space use) incorporate the voices and reflect the needs of disadvantaged groups; and c. Ensuring that the human rights of disadvantaged groups are fully met through, among other means, markets, services and access to spaces (McGranahan et al., 2016, p. 17 as cited by Recio, 2018).

There is a need to reconsider streets as a place of works and determine the "appropriateness" of this livelihood in such streets or area (Yatmo, 2008). Brown (2017 as cited by Recio, 2018) positioned it, "...[U]rban public space as a ‘common-pool resource’ can provide a new framework of collective rights in the public domain, which would include a variety of rights – to work, to move through and to enjoy public space... The challenge is how to manage the resulting congestion and ‘tragedy of the commons’ that may occur. For street traders, the bundles of rights might include access to and beneficial use, but with conditions requiring contributions to collective management of the resource."

There has to be adequate attention to the needs, rights, and aspirations of the informal workers like vendors. In order for inclusive right to be adequate for urban poor, it is essential to recognize the legitimacy of informal economies, their collective management of urban resources and social values appropriated to public spaces as areas for livelihood (Brown 2017; Recio, 2018)

CONCLUSION

This study revolved around the premise of how street vending is governed in Iligan City. Subsequently, it examined the actors involved, the norms and practices, and implications of the presence of street vending in city planning and urban development.

Firstly, there were three categories for formal actors that interact with street vendors— who were either semi-fixed or ambulant and were either organized or unorganized. Local politicians were the point persons of street vendors every after evictions and confiscations. Street Vendors attempt to communicate with the city mayor and councilor to negotiate their occupancy in public spaces. Out of discretionary powers and humanitarian consideration, these politicians allow street vendors to use certain public spaces. However, bureaucrats like the city administrator, EEDMO heads, and Hapsay Dalan Task Force, also exercise discretionary powers over the vending spaces hence, amounting to disjointive implementation of city policies. Street vendors resented the confusion that these discretionary powers made.

Secondly, Iligan City prohibit street vending activities as stated by the Market Code of Iligan city. As such, this LGU leaned on eviction and relocation policies. However, there are instances that they accommodate these street vendors due to humanitarian consideration. In the case of informal sectors, specifically on street vendors, they have developed their own rules, norms, and practices in order to adapt the policies made by the formal sectors.

Thirdly, in order to circumvent the hostile-oriented policies, the street vendors observed norms and practices in contested vending spaces. To secure their occupancy in their vending spaces, the vendors respect each other’s’ pwesto, follow demands of the market authorities, cultivate tenuous ties with state personnel, and maintain mobility. Street vending vending was affected by socio-spatial factors (suki system and incidence of extension) and socio-temporal factors (seasonal occasions and election period) which were driven by socio-cultural and economic needs. In its broadest sense, these norms and practices are enmeshed with the formal structure of the city. These norms and practices bypass harsh conditions leading to a tolerant environment.

Fourthly, street vending and urban informality per se are still a challenge for the city government in terms of city planning and urban development. The formal actors branded urban
informality as a sign of weak governance and poor development. In aiming towards a post-dualist structure, this is still a challenge in a sense that considering public spaces as vending spaces entails extensive reconstruction of streets, widening it to accommodate the vendors, passers, and vehicle. Moreover, the view of the LGU is anchored on dualist perspective thus, making policies exclusive and discriminatory.

In sum, street vending in Iligan City is a precarious livelihood. The reasons for this are, first, there are no inclusive legislated policies or ordinances that deal with street vending. The regulations of the local government are anchored on the 26-year old Market Code that does not recognize street vending as a legitimate livelihood. Hence, the tolerant orientation of the city is banking on to humanitarian consideration. This set-up problematic in two levels: firstly, it is reliant to discretionary powers of both local politicians and bureaucrats, secondly, it does not provide an institutionalized formal mechanism for the street vendors vis-a-vis the local government in dealing with each other, which leads us to the second reason. The lack of ordinances or policies engenders informal agencies. The street vendors resort to tenuous ties, resistance, opportunistic strategies and similar agencies because of the uncertainty of their conditions and to circumvent hostile structure of policies making both actors (formal and informal) enmeshed in an attenuated governing relationship, because the absence of policies makes this governing relationship dependent on the next sitting politicians and government officials. This leads to the last reason; this character of a government-street vending nexus implies planning and development challenges for the city.

REFERENCES


Room 6

Overall Program 2019
An Assessment on the Outcomes of HIV/AIDS Development Intervention Management In the Cities of Bukidnon, Philippines

by:
Marjorie T. Sobradil

ABSTRACT

This study is designed to investigate the outcomes of HIV/AIDS intervention management in Valencia City and Malaybalay City, Bukidnon, Philippines. Specifically on the adoption of multi-sectoral intervention in terms of community support for the care and treatment of HIV/AIDS, as well as in designing strategies to promote information, education and communication on HIV/AIDS. The multi-sectoral involvement of the government and private sectors enables them to do the planning, execution and monitoring of the status of HIV/AIDS in their respective jurisdiction. The CHO, CSWD, City AIDS Council, community and religious based organization, media, LGBT, women’s organization, PNP and Academe collaborative efforts to conduct Mobile VCT, HIV/AIDS awareness Peer education, prevention and diagnostic tests were successful. The partnership of Alagad ng Mindanao, LGU’s and several hospitals provided the doctors, nurses, pharmacist and trained volunteers with STI & HIV management training, primary care training, HIV proficiency for Medtech on HIV testing and as well as Regional AIDS Assistance team meetings. Those infected with HIV/AIDS are encouraged to break free from the stigma and embarrassment and more patients avails the treatment and care services and indulged themselves for regular check-up and monitoring of HIV/AIDS status. There is a gradual decrease of social stigma and discrimination and avail the needed medication to slow the effects of the HIV/AIDS and continue to perform their day-to-day activities. The local response is a key element of the country's program for combating HIV/AIDS. The two local governments (LGUs), along with Cagayan De Oro City, are the core of the program in Region X. They had committed to reduce HIV infection through the Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) and the HIV and AIDS Medium-Term Plan (AMTP).

Keywords: Intervention, Management, HIV/AIDS

I. RATIONALE

HIV/AIDS also known as Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) and Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (AIDS) are one of the well-known epidemics that have spread across the globe, it is a virus that can badly affect one’s immune system, therefore, impairing a certain affected person to function well. AIDS has drastically spread across the globe, including the Philippines, the first case of HIV infection in the Philippines reported in 1984. From January 1984 to March 2016, there have been 32, 647 victims who were infected. Based on the epidemic trends of National HIV/AIDS & STI Surveillance and Strategic Information Unit, Epidemiology Bureau of the Department of Health (DOH), 26 individuals is estimated to be newly diagnosed with HIV per day. In this raging war, even within or beyond the country, AIDS remains the concern of the country (Philippine Red Cross, 2016).

While we are still a low HIV-prevalence country, with less than 0.1 percent of the adult population estimated to be HIV positive, this reveals a seventy nine percent (79%) increase of newly reported HIV cases compared to 2012 (UNICEF, 2013). As of January 2013, the Department of Health (DOH) AIDS Registry in the Philippines reported 12,082 HIV cases (25 already AIDS) and 10,514 people living with AIDS. The Philippines is one of only two countries in Asia, and one of seven worldwide, where the number of new cases has increased by over 25 percent from 2001 to 2009 and an estimated 200 deaths each year (HIV/AIDS Statistics Worldwide) reaching a total of 7,235 HIV cases in the country as of 2011. Two of
these HIV cases are from Malaybalay City and another two from Valencia City according to the report of the Alliance Against AIDS (ALAGAD) Mindanao. In 2014, Philippines ranked 83rd as one of the countries with the most cases of HIV/AIDS all over the world (“Index Mundi,” 2014).

Northern Mindanao is the seventh (7th) fastest in the HIV-Aids case growth rate with 2 percent growth (PIA, 2016). In Region 10, there are 1,142 reported HIV cases where Cagayan de Oro comprises 42 percent, Iligan 10 percent, Valencia 4 percent, Ozamiz 3 percent and Malaybalay 3 percent (PIA, 2017).

According to the Alliance against AIDS in Mindanao (ALAGAD Mindanao), there are 12 cases of AIDS reported in Malaybalay City (Balistoy, 2014). While Valencia City, had its first HIV/AIDS positive case recorded in 1994, and as of February 2015, 12 cases in the city were documented in the National Registry of HIV/AIDS. The city was even more alarmed knowing that as of May 2015 the number of cases increased to 16 where two of the cases have already died. It was also recorded that the majority of the victims were men who practiced unsafe sex. There was already a total of 49 HIV/AIDS cases recorded on the disease in Bukidnon. (PIA, 2018).

II. Objectives of the Study

1. To determine if the city governments of Bukidnon have developed multi-sectoral strategies to combat HIV/AIDS.

2. To determine if the city government has community support for care and treatment for HIV/AIDS and has functional community-based organizations.

3. To determine if the city governments has integrated HIV/AIDS into its city development plans to combat HIV/AIDS in the city.

4. To find out if the city government has a general policy or strategy to promote information, education and communication on HIV/AIDS.

To strengthen sustainable local AIDS responses, UNDP aimed to develop leadership capacities of local government units (LGUs) and the Regional Assistance Team (RAATs), as well as empower the community, particularly the MSM and TG populations.

This study is designed to investigate the outcomes of the HIV/AIDS development interventions, management of the local urban governments of Valencia and Malaybalay City, specifically in the development community support for the care and treatment of HIV/AIDS, and provide facilities capable of providing interventions for prevention and medical treatment for HIV/AIDS patients. The response of the local level is critical for the success of the national program for HIV/AIDS. There is a need to strengthen and build the capacity of partners, including local governments, in the national response. Vital to the campaign is to effect political commitments among local chief executives and local legislative councils in the promotion and integration of HIV/AIDS priorities in annual development plans and budgets and strengthened the capacity of the local government for coordinated multi-sector HIV responses.

III. Research Methodology

The study employed a qualitative-descriptive research. Data are gathered through document inventory and interview schedule. The indicators used in the study are based on the UNDP Resource Catalogue in Measuring Capacities which is used as the guide in benchmarking to gather the necessary data. The respondents of the study are the implements of the prevention of the HIV AIDS from the cities of Bukidnon and collaborators from different sectors to combat HIV/AIDS. They are chosen as the respondents based on their expertise and knowledge of the programs implemented and to determine the extent of collaboration between the city governments and private sectors to combat HIV/AIDS in their respective jurisdiction.

There are sixty five (65) respondents of the study coming from Valencia and Malaybalay City: 1) Twenty (20) Heads of Offices from City Social
Welfare Development (CSWD), City Health Office (CHO) and City AIDS Council: (8) from CSWD, (7) from CHO; and (5) from City AIDS; (2) Thirty (35) are Heads of Offices from the civic organizations: (16) from CBO’s (Community Based Organization; (12) from FBO’s (Faith based Organizations); (6) from Women’s organization; (2) from LGBT; (3) from Dep-Ed; (2) from Media; and (3) social workers.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Multi-Sectoral strategies of the City Governments of Bukidnon to combat HIV/AIDS

Government

The city governments of Bukidnon (Malaybalay and Valencia City) adopted a multi-sectoral strategies to combat the increasing number of HIV/AIDS cases in their respective jurisdiction. Both cities collaborated and mobilize the Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO), community based organizations, religious groups, women, LGBT organization, education and media sectors to combat the prevalence of HIV/AIDS.

Each of these sectors played an active role in the campaign to reduce the cases of HIV/AIDS. The (ALAGAD-Mindanao, Inc.) or Alliance Against AIDS in Mindanao, Inc., An NGO based in Davao City, which is a non-stock, non-profit, non-denominational, and multi-sectoral alliance composed of institutions, organizations, and individuals responded to the issue of STI, HIV, and AIDS through education, organizing, advocacy and provision of preventive, medication and treatment services.

The community based organizations provided home base care utilizing the community's skills and training to help HIV/AIDS victims, youth, and food security caregivers. Malaybalay City work with STI, HIV and AIDS Support Link or SHASLINK which is a community-based organization organized by the city government of Malaybalay to fight against HIV/AIDS. The organization consists of different agencies such as the CSWD, academes specifically the DEPED, City Health Office (CHO), PNP, Private and Public hospitals, entertainment establishments, business groups, and different religious sects.

While Valencia City work with KAVAPCA (Kaabag Valencia AIDS Protection & Control Advocates) composed of personalities from the City Social Welfare and Development Services (CSWD), City Police Department, Department of Education, media and non-government (NGOs) where its mission was to work together for the education and control of AIDS in the city.

The LGBT communities were also tapped and mobilize to support the campaign to combat the HIV/AIDS. Malaybalay City work with United Gays of Malaybalay (GUGMA) committed to enhance and improve the social, political and economic growth and progress of the LGBT community through fostering sexual health and gay rights. The community groups work with MSM in HIV/AIDS prevention and education and to give care and support, especially for the treatment of HIV/AIDS of Men having Sex with other Men (MSM). While Valencia City LGBT groups work and coordinated with the ALAGAD-Mindanao Inc, CHO and Education sector to provide sex education to both men and women, before they become sexually active and focus on reducing the stigma associated with HIVAIDS at the city levels.

The faith based organizations are also mobilized to encourage the development of an ethics of responsibility among men and women for health and well-being of their sexual partners and children as the foundation of efforts to prevent both violence and HIV/AIDS transmission, reducing the stigma associated with HIV/AIDS and encourage influential members of the government and community to speak up HIV/AIDS and provide active leadership and encourage the LGBT community to join their religious gatherings for spiritual meditation. Media (radio) are mobilized to air the lectures conducted by the CHO personnel's about marriage, pre-marital sex and hazardous effects of HIV/AIDS in the human body.

The women’s organizations work to ensure that everyone has access to the
programs and services provided to their clienteles, especially to the victims of HIV/AIDS where the accessibility of the services is given without gender and sex biases to avail its programs and services to combat the full blown of HIV/AIDS. They also encourage community group/orrganizations that deal with violence against women to join the prevention HIV/AIDS.

While the Education sectors disseminate information through the conduct of lectures and symposia to combat HIV/AIDS and increase awareness about the disease to different schools in the cities and extends community services even outside the school premises accommodating couples to broaden their knowledge about HIV/AIDS in partnership with the City Health Office.

B. City government Community Support for Care and Treatment for HIV/AIDS and Functional community-based organizations.

To help prevent the spread of Sexually Transmitted Infections (STI), HIV and AIDS, the Department of Health of Malaybalay and Valencia had done a basic training on HIV prevention, treatment, care, and support issues for most members of each of their Local AIDS Council, heads of offices of the different city government agencies, school administrators and all barangay health workers (BHWs). All the heads of offices of the different city government agencies and the BHWs were required to attend and re-echo the training in their respective offices and barangays. The training sought to empower the participants on prevention and control of STI, HIV and AIDS. It also allowed the sharing of knowledge and resources and building partnerships with fellow advocates. Valencia conducts regular symposium on AIDS prevention to mothers while Malaybalay conducts a free HIV/AIDS mother and child transmission HIV tests twice a year.

Both the city health centers of Malaybalay and Valencia offer free HIV testing following the required pre and post counseling. Free re-agents, HIV kit and medicines are readily available on a first come, first served basis until supply last in the Center for Reproductive Health of Valencia City and Social Hygiene Clinic in Malaybalay City. Very few, however had availed of this free test.

A referral system is observed by the city health workers in both Malaybalay City and Valencia City Health Centers. Patients with initial positive results may be referred to the Research Institute of Technology (RITM) and once confirmed may further be referred to Alliance Against AIDS in Mindanao (ALAGAD Mindanao) for intensive counseling and voluntary psychotherapy and recently, with the HIV and AIDS Core team (HAC) of Northern Mindanao Medical Center (NMMC) Region X. NMRH was formerly a satellite, but, now a hub for HIV and AIDS cases.

Weekly regular monitoring and mandatory check-up of registered sex workers are practiced by Malaybalay and Valencia. These weekly sessions allow the city health workers to conduct informal IEC to people in prostitution (PIP) of the two cities. Outreach Program had been conducted to freelance/transient sex workers, working mostly in the two city bus terminals, inviting them to visit and avail of the free medical check-up offered by the city health centers. Some cases of STI medical check-ups by transients had been administered by the Social Hygiene Clinic of Malaybalay City and Valencia Center for Reproductive Health. The apparent common practice by clients/patients is to avail STI, HIV/AIDS test and seek medical confidentiality in other cities. This is one problem with the monitoring of HIV/AIDS cases.

Malaybalay City has a Social Hygiene Clinic and Valencia City has a Center for Reproductive Health which cater to HIV and AIDS cases. Both health centers have the machineries for HIV/AIDS test and health workers trained on STI/HIV/AIDS Voluntary Counseling and Testing (HCT).

The City Health Office (CHO), CSWD and City AIDS Council are premiere agencies in the city who spearheaded the campaign against the spread of HIV/AIDS diseases. To accomplish this advocacy, the city government’s work with the local community based organizations to give adequate support to victims of HIV/AIDS. They offered three (3)
HIV preventive services such as awareness, identification and the intervention. They conducted educational and awareness campaign, distributed of flyers, services, treatment and care, HIV/AIDS testing and counselling. The DOH is taking an on-hand perspective regarding the HIV/AIDS incidence and lead the role of mapping groups who are vulnerable to the HIV/AIDS and conducted awareness and HIV free testing and treatment in collaboration with the ALAGAD-MINDANAO. They also collaborated with the media through regular talks in the radio station on the basic information and the risks of HIV/AIDS as well as giving information on the services in testing, treatment and care.

In Malaybalay City, SHASLINK (STI, HIV and AIDS Support Link) is one the functional community-based organization for support and care organized by the city government of Malaybalay to fight against HIV/AIDS. The organization is composed of the CSWD, academe (DEPED), CHO, PNP, private and public hospitals, entertainment establishment, business, and different religious sects. This organization played an active role in implementing the mandate of the national government in preventing the spread of HIV/AIDS; safe practice and procedures; testing, screening and counseling; health and support service, monitoring of STI, HIV and AIDS; and ensure women’s access to HIV/AIDS care and treatment services. It provided home based care utilizing community to help the victims and involved themselves in facilitating access to antiretroviral treatment which is solely given by the City Health Office and ALAGAD Mindanao Inc.

Another functional community based organization in Malaybalay City, is GUGMA (United Gays of Malaybalay) who work with the CHO in conducting an HIV/AIDS mobile clinic to all the barangay’s in Malaybalay City for HIV/AIDS tests services. They facilitate in helping the LGBT group or the Male having sex with Male (MSM) who are willing to be tested for HIV/ AIDS. They also help in giving free HIV/AIDS counseling service to the Identified HIV positive and refer identified persons with HIV/AIDS to SHASLINK, Cagayan city HIV/AIDS satellite Center and Manila for further confirmatory. Confirmed victims of HIV/AIDS are referred to Alagad Mindanao further medical assistance and medication such as the Anti Retroviral Medicine.

Malaybalay City and Valencia City communities regularly join the whole world in Commemorations of the International AIDS Candlelight Memorial and Mobilization (IACMM) every 3rd Sunday of May and World's AIDS Day every 1st of December of each year and World's AIDS Prevention Month every December.

Information dissemination has been made by the two city governments of the cash assistance of five thousand pesos (PhP5,000) to individuals and family in a crisis situation that is part of the health program of the Department of Social Welfare and Development Services (DSWD) of the province.

City Governments Integration of HIV/AIDS into the City Development plans with their Strategies to Address the Problem

Both Malaybalay City and Valencia City have integrated HIV/AIDS into its general development plans. The two cities have created their own HIV Council in accordance with the National Policy Guidelines for the prevention and management of sexually transmitted diseases (STDs). Malaybalay City calls it Malaybalay City STI, HIV Council and Valencia City calls it Valencia City AIDS Council (VCAC). Each council functions as a local multi-sectoral HIV/AIDS management and coordination body where the City Mayor, the City Health Officer, the Schools Division Superintendent, City Social Welfare and Development Officer, Local Government Operations Officer, Chief of Police, President of Private Schools in High School and Colleges/Universities serves as one of the members of the City AIDS Council. It is the central advisory, planning and policy making body and the lead group in undertaking information, education and communication campaigns on the prevention and control of HIV/AIDS. It assists in coordinating civil
society organizations that are actively involved in the cause.

The local councils of both cities have a general policy to promote information, education, and communication (IEC) on HIV/AIDS. This had been realized in partnership with the Philippine Information Agency (PIA), their City Information Office, and various local media organizations. School symposiums and public forums in the barangays had been done as part of information dissemination on STD, HIV and AIDS prevention and control. The councils have implemented the policy of mandatory/compulsory annual seminar attendance on HIV/AIDS prevention for all entertainment business establishments, massage clinics and other similar establishments as a requirement for renewal of business permit. Sponsorship of non-government organizations and attendance of personalities (media and showbiz) during rallies livened up the campaigns.

Valencia city government health personnel have made active IEC dialogues between MSM leaders and their peers. A proactive AIDS response has been adopted by the community based MSM group in the city. They have been made to realize of the important role they play in the prevention and spread of AIDS. They have organized themselves and have established peer-collaborations. The head of Public Employment Service Office (PESO) of Valencia City, a member of the city AIDS Council, had made IEC as part of the lectures attended by overseas Filipino workers (OFWs) of the city.

The Malaybalay City had allocated two hundred fifty thousand pesos (Php250,000) to five hundred thousand pesos (PHP 500,000) budget in 2013 to 2015 respectively, for the operation of City STI HIV Council and the implementation of its policies. Succeeding budgets, however had been shared with other health programs and projects of both cities. While other health programs have clear targets to be met, there is none for HIV/AIDS, thus, the first were given more priority in terms of budget. There is an apparent reduction of the budget which limits the participants in the annual IEC seminar on HIV/AIDS prevention and basic training on HIV prevention, treatment, care, and support issues and in particular training on STI/HIV/AIDS and Voluntary Counseling and Testing (HCT).

The Social Hygiene Clinic Malaybalay City and the Center for Reproductive Health of Valencia City had been funded by the Department of Health national budget, but, the training of the health staff and workers on STI/HIV/AIDS and Voluntary Counseling and Testing (HCT) had been funded by each of the city government where funding is limited.

City Government Policy and Strategies to Promote Information, Education and Communication on HIV/AIDS

Both Malaybalay City and Valencia City have integrated HIV/AIDS into its general development plans. The two cities have created their own HIV Council in accordance with the National Policy Guidelines for the prevention and management of sexually transmitted diseases (STDs). Malaybalay City calls it Malaybalay City STI, HIV Council and Valencia City calls it Valencia City AIDS Council (VCAC). Each council functions as a local multi-sectoral HIV/AIDS management and coordination body. It is the central advisory, planning and policy making body and the lead group in undertaking information, education and communication campaigns on the prevention and control of HIV/AIDS. It assists in coordinating civil society organizations that are actively involved in the cause.

The local councils of both cities have a general policy to promote information, education, and communication (IEC) on HIV/AIDS. This had been realized in partnership with the Philippine Information Agency (PIA), their City Information Office, and various local media organizations. School symposiums and public forums in the barangays had been done as part of information dissemination on STD, HIV and AIDS prevention and control. The councils have implemented the policy of mandatory/compulsory annual seminar attendance on HIV/AIDS prevention for all entertainment business establishments,
massage clinics and other similar establishments as a requirement for renewal of business permit. Sponsorship of non-government organizations and attendance of personalities (media and showbiz) during rallies livened up the campaigns.

Valencia city government health personnel have made active IEC dialogues between MSM leaders and their peers. A proactive AIDS response has been adopted by the community based MSM group in the city. They have been made to realize of the important role they play in the prevention and spread of AIDS. They have organized themselves and have established peer-collaborations. The head of Public Employment Service Office (PESO) of Valencia City, a member of the city AIDS Council, had made IEC as part of the lectures attended by overseas Filipino workers (OFWs) of the city.

**Outcomes of the Intervention Management**

The outcomes of the efforts of the city Government, City AIDS Council, CSWD and DOH to combat HIV/AIDS increased the knowledge of the LGU's of HIV/AIDS mortality rate at the same increased the morbidity rate since there are people who are aware of the services of the city regarding HIV/AIDS and availed it. The city governments conducted random HIV/AIDS tests through their mobile clinic and encourage more people to avail the programs of the government to help the HIV/AIDS victims for their treatment and medication in collaboration ALAGAD-MINDANAO Inc and the DOH Region X in Cagayan de Oro City.

Through the collaborative efforts of the city governments (City AID Council, DOH, CSWD), Non Government organizations (ALAGAD Mindanao Inc.), community based organizations (SHAS-LINK, KAVAPCA), LGBT, Media and Education sectors, the HIV/AIDS patients are receiving treatment, free condoms for sex protection, regular psychological counseling, medical counselling, educational information regarding unprotected sex and more HIV/AIDS patients were able to inform their partners, family, and children about their HIV status.

According to the City AIDS Council, the social stigma is gradually decreasing through education and information campaign and more people are aware of their basic rights and privileges to receive the medical treatment and care. More people are encouraged to help people affected with HIV/AIDS and refer them to the City AIDS Council and DOH to receive proper treatment, medical, counselling, and medicines that can slow down the effect of HIV/AIDS.

According to Valencia Social Worker Officer 1, Rudolph Xyris, one of the possible outcomes of the interventions to control the spread of HIV/AIDS, is the trust and confidence of those contaminated with the disease that the government can help them because after asking for assistance, they kept on coming back to ask for more but on the other hand, victims become dependent to them especially those who cannot afford the treatment and medicines.

According to Ian Jone C. Baang spokesperson of DOH Malaybalay City that based on their data (Malaybalay City DOH Annual Report, 2017), HIV/AIDS patients HIV/AIDS patients and citizens are receiving regular source of medicines, medical counselling, condoms and educational information. Some HIV/AIDS patients are now also starting to open up to their families and partners about their HIV status which is a great help to the patients. The mortality and morbidity of HIV/AIDS incidence in the city are still alarming despite of the programs implemented since there are some people who refuse to avail the HIV testing and treatment and care services because of social stigma. The awareness and education campaign of the DOH that HIV/AIDS is a sickness that needed to be treated and cured, widen the perspectives of the people to help HIV/AIDS patients and prevent the occurrence of the disease that help reduce the social stigma.

Valencia City was able to undergo HIV testing to 1,033 people. Out of 1,033, there are 9 who are reactive. As of June 2017, they had about 33 HIV AIDS cases (CHO, Annual Report, 2017). Furthermore, the CHO also provide pre-counseling before
HIV Testing. According to Administrative Officer V Ethel Joy Montebon, “the counseling is dependent on the honesty of the victims of HIV/AIDS and consent, whether he is willing to undergo the testing, without counselling then testing cannot be administered and definitely no confirmatory testing. Samples are sent to Davao or CDO and if the result of the confirmatory test is reactive, then post-counselling and monitoring will be conducted with the patient will start taking ARV or Anti-retroviral drugs”. The causes of the 33 cases of HIV are still being sought, whether they made contacts with their partners using or they acquired the disease through blood transfusion. The challenging part of detecting the disease is the “window period” of six (6) months, where virus can only be detected after 6 months of contaminating the disease. The increase of HIV/AIDS cases in Valencia City despite all the interventions are caused by the social stigma and discrimination and some engage in sexual contact as a normal activity without knowing that their sexual partner has the disease.

The interventions of giving medical treatment and drugs cannot heal the client, but it can help the client live longer and healthier. Furthermore, the City Health Office regularly conducts gram staining for the EEW’s or the Establishment Entertainment Workers for regular monitoring of sexual infections, where treatment is provided.

CHALLENGES OF THE INTERVENTION MANAGEMENT TO CONTROL HIV/AIDS

The intervention management of the HIV/AIDS program in the cities of Bukidnon are confronted with the challenges (1) social stigma and discrimination where People Living with HIV (PLHIV) are afraid to be tested or to ask help despite of being aware that they are positive; (2) Insufficient Funding, especially for Trained Peer Educators assigned in far-flung barangays who wanted to conduct HIV testing, but the testing must be done in Social Hygiene Clinic are forced to provide fares to their clients from their own pockets so that can fully express their advocacy to help the community. Due to lack of budget they acted on their will to educate the masses about the prevention and risk behavior of HIV/AIDS; (3) Guidance and lack of community’s interest to the services offered by the government for basic basic prevention, treatment, awareness of symptoms and manifestations of HIV/AIDS and medical services. Furthermore, the community is not yet completely aware of the importance of the interventions of HIV/AIDS and the services offered by the city government; (4) Lack of manpower and trained staff in the CSWD office to provide the services of to reduce the occurrence of HIV/AIDS. The CSWD of Valencia City has only (4) trained staff to cater the psychotherapy, counselling, conduct of seminars and Malaybalay City lacks the manpower to provide the services like conducting seminars and implementing the programs of HIV/AIDS. The greatest challenge of the office is how to cope up with the demands several barangays and schools in their advocacy for HIV/AIDS prevention because they have also primary jobs in livelihood and the community; (5) Denial of PLWHAs victim, for they are afraid of admitting that they have HIV/AIDS and do not seek help in the first stage of HIV/AIDS and only ask help when its worst.

V. CONCLUSION

The collaborative efforts of the city governments (City Aid Council, DOH, CSWD), Non Government organizations (ALAGAD Mindanao Inc.), community based organizations (SHAS-LINK, KAVAPCA), LGBT, Media and Education sectors, the HIV/AIDS patients are receiving treatment, free condoms for sex protection, regular psychological counseling, medical counselling, educational information regarding unprotected sex and more HIV/AIDS patients were able to inform their partners, family, and children about their HIV status. Malaybalay and Valencia City have integrated HIV/AIDS into its general development plans. The two cities have created their own HIV Council in accordance with the National Policy Guidelines for the prevention and management of sexually transmitted diseases (STDs) guided by the
principles of mainstreaming HIV responses in the local government plans and multi-sector involvement in the planning, execution and monitoring of the response. They coordinated with Region X, Department of Health regional office who conducted most of the technical supports, such as trainings for implementers of the Social Hygiene Clinic and all the rural health clinics, STI management and logistic support (STI medicines, condoms, lubricants, testing the testing kits and other specific programs), quarterly meetings the regional aids assistance meeting.

Campaigns for the prevention and control of HIV and AIDS in the two cities of Bukidnon started strong, but had dwindled due to insufficient budget, social stigma and discrimination, lack of manpower such as volunteers and trained staff to implement more programs to advocate the reduction of HIV/AIDS. Its governance structure designed to be the forefront is encumbered with uneven political commitments specially in terms of allocating bigger budget for HIV/AIDS programs. This is a reflection of how HIV responses have a propensity to give way to other competing administrative priorities as recognized by local chief executives.

VI. RECOMMENDATION

To raise public awareness, erase the stigma of HIV/AIDS, and encourage many vulnerable groups to avail of the free test, Malaybalay and Valencia LGUs should conduct a more aggressive and committed public health education and free access to health services. The capacity building of each AIDS Council should be strengthened and a follow up seminar on HIV/AIDS should be conducted for old and new members. Existing ordinances should be reviewed to ensure their relevance in support of overall HIV and AIDS prevention and control efforts. Malaybalay should include an ordinance of its policy for special protection and support of children and orphans.

Continue and build up partnership with civil society groups and the community and the mobilization of multi-sectoral support. Young people and people living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA) should be involved in the city design, planning, implementation for a more effective response to HIV/AIDS.

The two local AIDS councils should make a more active role coordinating local AIDS responses and provide guidance on issues related to HIV risks, vulnerabilities, and impact of AIDS. A more harmonize efforts with UN Joint Team on AIDS (UNJTA), Leadership for Effective and Sustained Responses to HIV and AIDS under the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), Philippine National AIDS Council (PNAC), STI, HIV and AIDS Support Link (SHASLink), Regional AIDS Assistance Teams (RAATs), Misamis Oriental Council for AIDS Network (MOCAN), Council for AIDS Network of Cagayan De Oro and other stakeholders may be established.

An annual budget that is solely for HIV/AIDS and separate from other city health programs and projects should be provided by both LGUs. It is further recommended that both should adopt a more comprehensive HIV program that is sustainable and encompasses a wider coverage.

Manual Operation Training should be conducted among the health personnel, social workers, and community based organizations of the two cities. There is a need for training on the implementation of the Manual Operation for HIV counseling and treatment that had been revised to tailor the mentioned specific target groups.

Increased local investment for quality improvement of Malaybalay and Valencia health facilities and build health worker capabilities. Enable a safe, legal environment in the delivery of health services to the identified vulnerable and marginalized groups.

IX. References


X. Acknowledgement:

The researcher would like to extend heartfelt thanks Central Mindanao University through the Research Office for the opportunity to be one of the recipients of the CMU funded research. The researcher would like to acknowledge the help of the city government of Valencia and Malaybalay City to allow us the gather the data and special thanks to the research aids to gather the data
CIVIL SOCIETY ENGAGEMENT IN HIV/AIDS AND CHILD LABOR RESPONSE IN THE PROVINCE OF BUKIDNON, PHILIPPINES: AN ASSESSMENT

May Alinie C. Postrano-Butalid
Meshelle M. Rivera
Aljean T. Sareno
myebutalid@gmail.com
Central Mindanao University
Musuan, Maramag, Bukidnon, Philippines

Abstract

HIV/AIDS and Child Labor are among the pressing social issues and concerns that are present in the Province of Bukidnon, Philippines. This study aimed to determine the presence of Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) that is concerned with HIV/AIDS and child labor problem and assessed the CSOs engagement in addressing HIV/AIDS and child labor incidence. This also sought to determine the challenges of the CSOs and Local Government Units (LGUs) in providing support programs and services to HIV/AIDS and Child Labor. Qualitative research design was used in gathering information from the key informants through in-depth interviews using open-ended question guide and in the examination of relevant documents.

The study revealed that there are CSOs present that addressed HIV/AIDS and Child Labor Problem in the province understudy. In the case of HIV/AIDS, CSOs and the LGUs fostered meaningful engagement in combating HIV/AIDS are evidently found in their collaboration of their activities. However, despite the ease of LGU-CSO engagement, problems like: 1) lack of community interest on HIV/AIDS; 2) cooperation of the victims to subject themselves from treatment and counseling S; and 3) the absence of Treatment Hub in the Province are among the challenges that hinders the elimination/prevention of the HIV/AIDS in the province. In the case of child labor, CSOs and LGUs have a very minimal engagement. Most of the time they work on their own activities with very less if no involvement of one to the other. CSOs addressing child labor incidence also become less active. In addition, the contrasting lenses of looking at child labor – academically/legally viewed as a hindrance of child’s development and culturally viewed as good trait of a responsible child is also an issue at hand.

These CSOs are hurdled by challenges that needed immediate attention to foster a more meaningful engagement in addressing these two social concerns.

Keywords: Child Labor Incidence, HIV/AIDS Problem, Civil Society Organization

INTRODUCTION

International organizations have identified the Philippines to be under crisis when it comes to two of the most alarming social issues/problems that need immediate and sustainable solutions – HIV/AIDS and Child Labor.

On one hand, according to the United Nations (UN), Philippines is one of the countries at risk of full-blown epidemic. The Department of Health’s Epidemiology Bureau, in 2016, there are 22 HIV newly diagnosed per day in contrast to only one in 2008. On the other hand, the International Labor Organization (ILO) identified 13 barangays in two cities and two municipalities of Bukidnon as having the most rampant child labor incidence in the country. According to the National Statistics Office (NSO) there are 5.5 million child laborers in the country.

The government through its legislative branch has formulated laws to address these social issues/problems respectively. A statutory law - RA 8504 established the role of the national and local
government in HIV and AIDS prevention activities while Republic Act 9231 provided for the special protection of children from all forms of abuse, neglect, exploitation and discrimination and conditions prejudicial to their development including child labor and its worst form. In addition, the vital role of the civil society organization in complementing and extending the delivery of public sector services is necessary.

However, Civil society organizations involvement in coming up with programs and services for a meaningful solution and/or prevention to issues/problems like these is but necessary. Thus, the assessment of the concerted efforts of state and non-state actors in the province of Bukidnon is the main focus of this study.

OBJECTIVES

This study seeks to:

1. Determine the civil society response to HIV/AIDS and child labor incidence in the province of Bukidnon.
2. Determine the specific HIV/AIDS and Anti-Child Labor programs, policies, and services that the civil society made inputs in fostering meaningful engagement responses.
3. Determine the challenges of the civil society and local government in providing the support program and services to the HIV/AIDS and problems of child labor

METHODOLOGY

Design. The study used a qualitative research design that primarily involves data gathering that described the events and then organizes data collection to answer the sets of problems. A prepared checklist containing the list of desired documents from the CSOs and the LGUs was utilized as a tool to organize data in patterns that emerge in the analysis of the study. An in-depth interview among key informants was utilized using an open-ended question structured before the interview allowing the researcher to ask more questions if necessary. The study integrated the use of official records, annual reports and legal documents and the use of the information from the internet to fill in the gaps and the lack of materials.

Locale of the Study. In gathering vital information about HIV/AIDS, the two cities of Bukidnon- Malaybalay and Valencia were examined. These two cities are the most densely populated area in the province and entertainment establishments are present. On the other hand, in the case of Child Labor incidence, the study focused on the two cities- Malaybalay and Valencia and two municipalities- Maramag and Quezon. These areas are identified by the International Labor Organization (ILO) as child labor incidence are high in the province.

Gathering of Data. An appointment to the key informants for in-depth interview was a scheduled right after the approval of the conduct of the study by the executive heads of the identified cities and municipalities. In addition, the information needed to support the study are as follows: 1) List of programs being implemented and to be implemented by the LGU addressing the problems of both HIV/AIDS and child labor. 2.) Policies regulated by the government addressing both HIV/AIDS and child labor issues. 3.) List of services/activities conducted related to HIV/AIDS and child labor problems. 4.) List of CSOs present in the locale that advocate HIV/AIDS reduction/elimination and child labor solution. Hence, in this study, data collection procedures were done through interviews, observations and review of documents.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. CSOs addressing HIV/AIDS problem

These are the CSOs present in the province that caters HIV/AIDS concerns and issues.
A.1. Alagad Mindanao

As early as 1987, Alliance Against AIDS in Mindanao (Alagad Mindanao), a non-government organization in Davao City was already responding to the issue of STI, HIV, and AIDS through education, organizing and advocacy. Its goal is to have an alliance that shall enhanced its capacity and established a system for the effective prevention, care, and support programs as HIV/AIDS victims. In Valancia City, Bukidnon, community based organizations that are linked with Algae Mindanao are Kaabag Valencia Aids Prevention and Control Advocates (KAVAPCA), and United Gay Association in Valencia City (UGAV). While in Malaybalay City, STI/HIV AIDS Support Link (SHAS-LINK), and the Group of United Gays in Malaybalay (GUGMA). They facilitated the formation of Gays and those Men having sex with Men (MSM) organizations such as the UGAV and GUGMA. These organizations initiate STI, HIV and AIDS peer education and counseling activities among the gay people.

As written in Organizational Profile of Alagad Mindanao in their Capability Building Programs, it has the following Program Components:

1. Training, seminars, and workshops.
2. Study Sessions and Education Activities.
3. Community-based STI, HIV and AIDS Education.
4. Tri-media campaign.
7. Resource and Data Banking for STI, HIV and AIDS.

Alagad Mindanao members provide service by visiting the victims house to house for the pre and post counselling sessions. They communicate with the Department of Health everytime there is a referral of a victim that had been suspected positive from the disease. One of the prominent tasks of this organization is to track/locate the latest partner of the HIV/AIDS victim who recently died to do conduct test and provide counseling to police the spread of the disease.

They also partnered with the DOH every time there is a symposia and seminars to be conducted.

A.2. Kaabag Valencia AIDS Prevention and Control Advocates (KAVAPCA)

According to Jun Sapanghari, the president of the KAVAPCA, there are doctors who actively and willingly provide services in Valencia City when it comes to HIV/AIDS cases which eventually topped as advisers of KAVAPCA. Accordingly, all hospitals in Valencia City have representatives of KAVAPCA, including their representatives from other sectors such as Department of Education, Women’s Desk, City Reproductive Health Office, German Doctors, Bukidnon Doctors, religious sector as faith-based organization in the Catholic church of Valencia, the MSM, HATAW, including the LGU. They also have representatives coming from corporations and companies such as SUMIFRU and South Dole Sky Land as well as in the local radio stations.

The vast membership of this organization is an advantage in reaching out the people about the awareness of HIV/AIDS. They also focus on disseminating information those students to students who are in their adolescence as these are the most curious about sexuality. Thus, they also tap DepEd
personnel/teachers to easily reach out the students and conduct information drive to schools in Valencia City.

KAVAPCA has no fund that is why they partnered the LGU through Mayor Azucena P. Huervas to be able to secure funding for their programs and activities. One of this is the celebration of “Worlds Aids Day and Candle Lighting Ceremony for the departed HIV/AIDS victims. Even though KAVAPCA is not yet formally accredited by the LGU of Valencia City yet it is already an acknowledged partner of the city in implementation of programs and services on HIV/AIDS. Mayor Huervas intensified its support to HIV/AIDS initiatives of KAVAPCA and eventually created the Local AIDS Council where KAVAPCA members are tapped.

In Valencia City an Ordinance No. 42 s. 2011 titled “The Valencia City Bukidnon STI, HIV and AIDS Ordinance” is legislated. In Section 2 of Article V of the said ordinance, Advocacy Programs for the AIDS awareness month to be made in May in which the dissemination of information for the prevention and control of STI, HIV, and AIDS is done.

In celebrating of the World AIDS Day, the City Government of Valencia through the Valencia City AIDS Council together with Kaabag Valencia AIDS Prevention and Control Advocates (KAVAPCA) spearheaded the observance of World AIDS Day on December 1, 2016, with the theme, “HANDS UP #HIVPREVENTION.” DepEd dancers, HATAW community headed, Youth Groups, and Entertainment Establishment Workers performed and participated in the activity through their dance presentation. Leaflets about HIV/AIDS were distributed to the viewers. LGU Valencia coordinated the smooth sailing flow of the event.

This shows that LGU Valencia and KAVAPCA harmoniously worked to combat HIV/AIDS. This is a manifestation of an enabling environment to strengthen awareness on HIV/AIDS.

A.3. The United Gay Association of Valencia (UGAV)

The focus of UGAV is on educational campaign to make the people particularly the students aware about HIV/AIDS through distribution of tangible materials and fliers. They also conduct symposia about HIV/AIDS in several schools in Valencia City.

In Section XI, Art. IV of Ordinance No. 42 s. 2011 entitled “The Valencia City Bukidnon STI, HIV and AIDS Ordinance”, Peer Educator is required. The owner and manager of all entertainment establishments shall have at least two (2) peer educators within the establishment trained by the City Health Office or accredited Non-government Organization to sustain STI, HIV, and AIDS prevention campaign among the workers.” In this connection the UGAV president, Mr. Rey Cañete is one of the Peer Educator in the city who was trained by Alagad Mindanao, a non-governmental organization. Every week, he has services in the Health Center for the scheduled counseling to HIV/AIDS victims. UGAV also provides free testing, laboratory testing and medication for free and is open to public.

A.4. STI, HIV, AIDS Support Link (SHAS-Link)

The main goal of SHAS-LINK is to do by any means of prevention measures for the spread of HIV such as conducting Information Education Campaign, distributing Information Education Campaign materials for free, facilitate symposium, and conduct
information drive. The membership of SHAS-LINK is diverse, from medical technologist, those working in entertainment establishments, doctors, and nurses. SHAS-LINK is able to establish a good network with the Alagad Mindanao.

According to Reynaldo Valdez, a member of SHAS-LINK and is the Project Development Officer in the City Social Development Welfare (CSWD), one of the prominent partners of City Social Welfare and Development in Malaybalay in implementing services for the HIV/AIDS victims is the SHAS-LINK. In every Information Education Campaign, SHAS-LINK and CSWD work together. SHAS-LINK prepares for the respondents and the venue for the seminar while the CSWD takes care in looking for a good speaker for the event.

The CSWD together with the SHAS-LINK conduct meetings with the entertainment/night owners to remind entertainers to ensure safe sex to avoid HIV/AIDS. They also encourage the regular check up and testing among the night club entertainers.

PNP and SHAS-Link also work together. According to SP03 Calamba, a SHAS-Link member and is police officer, SHAS-link work in tandem with the PNP in the apprehension of violators. They sanctioned those nightclubs and establishments that do not comply the requirements particularly the regular check up of the night establishment workers. Most of these night establishments are being apprehended because they let their employees be on duty even without having social hygiene from the City Health Office first. The participation of SHAS-Link is on the monitoring of cases.

A.4. GUGMA (Group of United Gay in Malaybalay)

In an interview with Roger A. Gamba, the president of GUGMA, their goal, as stipulated in their by-laws in Section III, Art II, which states that by 2027, 1) The Group of United Gays of Malaybalay (GUGMA) is empowered to defend their rights, to advance economic activities and engage in STI, HIV and AIDS prevention, care and support activities. All of their countermeasures for the disease of HIV/AIDS based on their by-laws which were stated in Section V Art III which stipulates that; 2) GUGMA is knowledgeable of their LGBT rights to prevent stigma and discrimination. 3) GUGMA has increased their knowledge and skills to become economically productive. 4) GUGMA has increased their knowledge and skills to prevent STI, HIV, and AIDS and provide care and support to those who are infected and affected.

One of the activities that GUGMA does is the HIV 101 Lecture. The LGU Malaybalay and Alagad Mindanao showed support in this activity. They do Mobile Clinic that reaches out far-flung barangays. GUGMA particularly organizes the peer educators, the medical technologists from the City Health Office, counselors and members in Alagad Mindanao to conduct seminars and lecture in those places where transportations is quite challenging. There will be HIV testing by the medi-techs and conduct of pre and post counseling by peer educators.

Last April 8 and 9 2018, GUGMA had a celebration of Gay Olympics including their Gala Night which was funded by the City Health Office for almost P180,000 for the funds needed for the program. Clearly, There is a harmonious working relationship between the LGU and GUGMA.

Gamba said that, because of the CSOs like GUGMA and others with the efforts of the government through
its concerned units, the stigma and discrimination is somehow lessened from as well as the social stereotyping of the LGBT community. He also mentioned that the LGBT community in Malaybalay, in his perception has become stronger because they knew they have the government on their side as well as the CSOs, particularly the Alagad Mindanao.

B. CSOs addressing child labor incidence

On the other hand, there are a number of Civil Society Organization present in Bukidnon particularly in the cities and municipalities under study that look into the child labor incidence.

B.1. DOLE other partner CSOs

It most of these activities were held was held 2011-2014 with Department of Labor and Employment (DOLE-BPO/DOLE-X) as the prime mover of this activity according to Archibald Batica, the staff of DOLE the researcher interviewed. These activities proved that the government and the CSOs can work together to address child labor incidence. Little Red School in Barangay Butong, Quezon, Bukidnon, built towards eliminating child labor in the area is the best result of the engagement aside from the programs shown in the table. The provincial government, in partnership with Coca-Cola Foundation, DepEd, Quezon Manobo Tribal Association, SIFI, Department of Labor and Employment, private sectors and civil society groups pooled resources and expertise to implement this project, which benefits Barangay Butong's identified child laborers.

Provided that the government had structured programs and services that address child labor incidence in two identified cities and municipalities of Bukidnon thus the study revealed that it is possible for both government and the civil society to create a strong commitment resulting a meaningful engagement for a positive impact if they work together on the same issue and the same goal. Documents given by the Department of Labor and Employment Region 10 provided a proof of the claim. Band, it was supported and confirmed by Archibald S. Batica DOLE-X Buk PFO Staff in an interview, “The last 2010-2014, International Labor Organization gave donation to make an action program to be called “Elimination on Child Labor Industry in Bukidnon.” The focus of the program is to eradicate or eliminate child labor incidence within the sugar industry. It was then cooperated by municipalities and barangays within the sugar industries covered within the area of Crystal Milling Company and BUSCO. They had given us funds with objectives which are to intervene to help not just the laborers but also the family of the child laborers particularly the parents and the siblings considering the possibilities that they will also follow what their brothers and sisters are doing.”

B.2. World vision

In identified cities and municipalities there are civil society organizations exist and mostly are accredited by the local government units. But not all existing and accredited CSOs serve the sole purpose to address child labor incidence. Meanwhile, in the Municipality of Quezon, World Vision is present that addresses child labor incidence. During the interview, when asked on the programs and services their organization engaged in the activities of the government and as to how do they respond and deliver their support and services to the government, World Vision Coordinator Peligrino (2018) answered, “One of our programs is child protection, so we engage with the government, we have
a partnership with them regarding facilitating the communities with child protection mechanism like Barangay Council for a Protection of Children. We try to engage with training before, but we don’t know yet, and we don’t even monitor as how is its impacts was and if it was continued and implemented by the barangay and municipal.”

World Vision accordingly has generally two technical programs one is for Health Allocation, and the other one is for Economic development. So it is in economic development where child labor could be addressed. Poverty is among their primary goal to increase family income for them to provide their basic family needs and for the education of the children. Through the livelihood programs given to parents, children need not engage in labor Community Manage Savings and Credit Association (COMSCA) is a project model that helps the parents with financial literacy orientation for them to be able to save money in spite of small earnings. Natural Farming is one of among project model along with container gardening. And of course, World Vision has Education Child Sponsorship Programs where funds are coming from the international support office particularly the United States of America.

B.2. Rescue 1

Rescue 1 is an existing CSO based in Valencia City. The services that they offer however cover the cities and municipalities of Bukidnon. Unlike the World Vision, it does not directly respond to the government regarding their programs and services, and it doesn’t strong engagement as they address child labor incidence. Unlike World Vision, it does not focus on agricultural child labor. Rescue 1 advocates and combats slavery and human trafficking mostly children are subject to means to earn income. One of the worst forms of child labor include all forms of slavery, as defined under the Anti-trafficking in Persons Act of 2003, or practices similar to slavery, such as sale and trafficking of children, debt bondage, and serfdom and forced or compulsory labor. It is an international organization where its mother foundation is from Tennessy, Nashville, the USA which has three major advocacy/programs namely: prevention, rescue, and restoration. The design of Greenland Kinder School supported by the foundation provides quality education to the children is one of their programs in prevention. It is done through educational scholarship program supported by the foundation instead of the parents who solely pay school fees.

Accordingly, they are also conducting an anti-human trafficking awareness campaign, and that is done regularly twice a month. In fact, as they started last year Rescue 1 had visited 90% of municipalities here in Bukidnon through Mayors and social workers. And for the rescue and restoration, Rescue 1 Global: Philippines had two survivors under their care.

The program on Anti-human Trafficking campaign has been conducted for almost two years in different places mostly are in remote areas. This campaign includes presentation of Rescue1 Global Foundation advocacies and programs on Prevention, Rescue and Restoration of the vulnerable and the victimized. Rescue 1 partnered with the DSWD in the implementation of this program.

B.4. Aral Bata Para sa Kinabukasan (ABK)

In an interview with Vanissa Guimbao, a community watch officer of ABK, she said that ABK is a community watch group that ensures that children go to school and not working in farms. This organization is present in the municipality Maramag. They undergo trainings and seminars to equip themselves as community watch
office. They also conduct seminars on proper livestock raising. They also train farm technicians before beneficiaries are provided with farming and gardening tools as well as seedlings to plant. In addition, they also provide school supplies to elementary students. According to Guimbao, ABK was very active back then. They did regularly monthly meetings to look into the progress and concerns of the organization. This was when the original ABK members were still present in the locale. However, after the former head lay low because of health reasons, ABK members only meet when there is an immediate concern to discuss. The organization became less active.

As a community watch group, they update the Barangay Council for the Protection of children (BCPC) on the progress of their programs. They also team up and provide assistance to LGU specially in the feeding program in areas where assumed child laborers are located.

The very challenge that this organization faced is continuity sustainability in doing their function. They seem to be at a lost after the head of ABK lay low.

C. Challenges Encountered by the Civil Society Organizations in Fostering Meaningful Response in Combatting HIV/AIDS

In spite of the huge effort in combatting HIV/AIDS, challenges in implementing services and programs in the civil society organization are inevitable, and this makes hinder of these organization to fully advocacy and cause as their role to combat HIV/AIDS.

C.1. Lack of Community Interest

CSOs and the government did a consorted effort to propagate the HIV/AIDS awareness and address concerns on HIV/AIDS. LGU came up with an ordinance that ensure recognition of the issues and provide financial assistance to victim in their medications, conduct symposium, distribution of leaflets among others. However, the large chunk of the population seemed not to care particularly those who are not directly concerned with HIV/AIDS. According to them, they are more concern on their own struggles and ordeal in life. This means that CSOs need to intensify their campaign particularly in disseminating the potential threat of HIV/AIDS that could actually affect those who people who think that they are not in any way affected or concerned with HIV/AIDS.

C. 2. Cooperation of the Victims

Although CSOs and the government work together in subjecting those workers in nightclubs to do regular test and the use of condoms in sexual intercourse, some night club owners and night club workers are seemingly negligent. On the other hand, stigma and public discrimination hinder the victims to undergo treatment. This is quite challenging to both the government and the CSOs concern because they cannot police the spread of the HIV/AIDS. These are actually some of the reasons why the victims are increasing astronomically. Victims are in denial that is why their medication/treatment is in denial. The peer educators really provide counseling to have an appropriate approach in dealing with the situation. That is why even if CSOs and the government provide free testing for those who are potentially infected with HIV and treatment to victims to at least prolong their lives, these efforts are far from useful because the lack of cooperation of the potentially infected and the victims.

C.3. No Treatment Hub in Bukidnon
In Region X, the treatment hub of HIV/AIDS Victims are in Cagayan de Oro City. That means that those HIV/AIDS victims in Bukidnon need to travel to CDO to avail the anti-retroviral drugs as these are only available in treatment hubs. This Anti-retroviral drug is supposed to slow down the progress of disease and improve life expectancy of the victim but are not readily available in Bukidnon that is why is assumed that many victims died early in the province. And although the local government has subsidized the expenses to victim’s travel to CDO, some victims accordingly would rather restand not travel. The travel to the treatment hub alone is causing stress to the victim already. However, the province has requested already for a treatment hub in Bukidnon, as of the moment it is not yet realized.

D. Challenges Encountered by the Civil Society in Fostering Meaningful Response to Address the Child Labor Incidence

Addressing child labor is an act of volunteerism on the part of the civil society; it is an extra job and extra expense of money only to provide a solution to the problem. This part presented the challenges that the key informant of the identified civil society had well-thought-out.

D.1. Varied definition of child labor

Child labor is a sensitive issue where not everyone would confidently want to discuss. This turns out to be one of the challenges encountered as they sought to address child labor incidence. From the definition itself, child labor is confusing as for the families practicing such act considered it as part of their daily living and thus they enjoyed it since it serves as a playground to them. Because even the parents who are primarily obliged to protect their children also allowed them to work for they are in most needs. A key informant from the World Vision even mentioned that they could not pinpoint the exact areas affected by the issue of child labor; they find it is so challenging and hard to gather data in this issue considering it is a sensitive issue. Which has supported by the statement of PESO Labor and Employment Officer I Paulin (2018), when asked about the challenges possibly is facing in addressing child labor he answered, “By virtue, their willingness to work is another perspective that should be considered, that is why we give them extended consideration allowing them to work but not to exceed four hours with higher wage compare to regular farm workers in spite of lesser output. Even if we forced them not to engage there is the presence of “ningas cogon” attitude where they will stop for a while but after that will do the same cycle. The government provides an educational institution for accessible education but the next day will still stop going to school with numbers of reasons.”

The statements implicate an analysis that child labor incidence in Bukidnon cannot be eradicated instantly and as possible as what the government and the civil society would want to, considering that even the children preferred and willingly would do it as a means of help and assistance to their family. Some of them would rather work because for them education is a waste of time and additional expenses for the family. Furthermore, as part of their culture particularly in agricultural child labor where they consider it as their childhood playtimes without having the idea of child labor and how it affects their development.

D.2. Resources for Sustainability of Programs

Another factor that most civil societies had encountered causing a big challenge is the budget, as uttered by the key informants, most of the financial support to supplement the continuity of
the programs. Even government agencies coherently perceived this as very challenging on their behalf. Even though there are already sponsors, but as for years a project will be effective it's immeasurable.

"Resources will never be enough for many programs that we deliver, but if ever there will be NGOs let’s say World Vision that will try to encourage other people to help in sponsoring the children for them to attend school. In the first place resources will always be our greatest enemy. Why would a child engage in labor it’s not just for fun but because of lack of resources simply because of poverty. So if only we could address poverty, then I could say children will attend school for sure if only they had the resources and access to education, for sure they would rather go to school instead of working. But because of poverty, it would be their initiative to help their parents as if they have a choice. Maybe if there is an agency that would cater and will help to augment their family income probably child labor will be eliminated."

Perceptions of the government support the idea that resources to address child labor are one of the factors for the sustainability of the programs. Civil society would admit that they have to look for international donors to raise a big amount that could provide the needs for their programs.

D.3. Implementation of the civil society

It is also a challenge for some civil society to acquire recognition from the government to be accredited in the locality Rescue 1Global: the Philippines is among one of the organizations who finds it very hard to acquire recognition from the government for the validity and legally conduct their advocacy.

Even recognition from the target beneficiaries could be of great challenge for the civil society. People around are giving them the benefit of the doubt about the sincerity and the validity of the programs. Civil society faced some common challenges as they address effective participation in addressing child labor incidence. The challenges that were enumerated by the key informants indicate that even structured agency find it difficult to address child labor incidence. Even the one doing such act is in denial that he/she fits in the standard definition of what child labor is. They think of working as for the last choice that they have. Even if both the government and the civil society function to help them if they does not willingly adopt the change and will not take the opportunities then we shall accept the child labor will never diminished. Allocated funds from the government will never be enough to suffice their needs, and none of the people will give money easily knowing they might be needing it as well.

Their response through invitations indicates that at least there is a sense of formality. Both the government and the civil society fostered independent interventions to address the issue, and they have self-financed. Their advocacy still in lined to what the government has been doing yet they are doing on their means. This indicates that audibly there are organizations actively deliver services even without the recognition from the public and even without supporting funds from public sectors. What is challenging on this matter is how the government could enlighten the participation of civil society in assistance to their main objective. This paper made clear that as of the present civil society in the identified cities and municipalities does not directly a response to the government regarding programs and services also do not develop strong engagement in addressing child labor incidence. Thus, this existing civil society organization is foreign sponsored organization only that it is run by Filipino volunteers, as an implication people in Bukidnon are not politically participative and does not take actions to address this...
kind of issues.

These challenges enumerated implies that civil society exist of a short term considering that they have limited access to all possible means to address the issue effectively. Sustainability will always challenge the positive impact of the programs and services. It is then challenging for less developed countries to appreciate civil society because of these challenges; conditions are less favorable in most times than in the developed countries.

D.4. LGU’s denial of the existence of child labor

LGU asserts that there is no child laborer present in their locality. However, other agency has listing of child laborers admitted in their program. Malaybalay City is identified by ILO where child labor is present. However, in the best of the ability of the researcher to look for CSOs in the city, none was found. The local government of the city denied the presence of child labor problem. However, the city’s Department of Education: Alternative Learning System (ALS) has a record of child laborers that are admitted in the program. They do labor on weekdays and go to ALS on the weekend. It could be inferred that there is lack of coordination of local efforts as there is no congruent report recording of the local agency. ILO is an organization recognized for its credibility in giving accurate information, ascertained the presence of child labor in the city. Thus, it is a probability that there really is. This implies that child labor as a social problem is not given much attention that it should have.

CONCLUSION

Evidently, the presence of Civil Society Organizations in the province helped the government in combating two of its alarming social problems: HIV/AIDS and Child Labor.

In the case of HIV/AIDS, the civil society organizations worked harmoniously with the local government units under study. It is observed that those working for the different governmental agencies that address HIV/AIDS are also active members of the different civil society organization. Thus, thus coordination of activities and engagements in coming up with a viable solution to combat HIV/AIDS was never a problem. However, despite the ease of LGU-CSO engagement, problems like: 1) lack of community interest on HIV/AIDS; 2) cooperation of the victims to subject themselves from treatment and counseling as well as subjecting those who are potentially affected by HIV/AIDS; and 3) the absence of Treatment hub in the Province are among the challenges that hinders the elimination/prevention of the HIV/AIDS in the province.

In the case of child labor incidence, some civil society organizations present in the province do not directly focus on child labor as a problem. It is more of addressing poverty alleviation and providing for opportunities to augment family income. The activities conducted by the CSOs lacks follow through to ensure sustainability. This is the result of CSOs that are becoming less active through time in engaging the government. Although the 4Ps program of the government satisfies/assures children are in schools, CSOs engagement in this program is not observed. The contrasting lenses of looking at child labor – academically/legally (viewed as a hindrance of child’s development) and culturally (a manifestation of a responsible child) is also a concern. Another is the lack of funding for sustainable programs and the LGU’s in denial of the existence of child labor are some of the challenges in addressing child labor incidence.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Augment LGU-CSO engagements/dialogues to address the challenges encountered in addressing HIV/AIDS and Child Labor Incidence.

2. Conduct a related study exploring the efforts made by other CSO groups like business sector, religious organizations, individual or small concerned groups that work in combat HIV/AIDS and Child Labor Incidence.
3. Conduct a study that includes other municipalities in the province to have a more comprehensive result.

4. Interview of HIV/AIDS victims and those families that are engaged in child labor incidence to validate the effort of the LGU and the CSOs.

REFERENCES


COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT IN REDUCING COASTAL POVERTY THROUGH THE COASTAL COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT MOVEMENT (GERBANG MAPAN)

Isti’adah Ferdiani

Program Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan, Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang, Jalan Perintis Kemerdekaan I No. 33 Kota Tangerang, Indonesia, 15118

E-mail: isti.a.ferdiani@gmail.com

Adie Dwiyanto Nurlukman

Program Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan, Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang, Jalan Perintis Kemerdekaan I No. 33 Kota Tangerang, Indonesia, 15118

E-mail: adiedwiyanto@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This article seeks to analyze the efforts of the Tangerang Regency government in Province Banten of Indonesia to alleviate poverty in the coastal area through the program of the coastal community development movement (Gerbang Mapan). Gerbang Mapan is a coastal area development program by emphasizing the pattern of development based on community empowerment. Empowerment efforts are carried out through programs that focus on improving basic skills, extracting potential and resources, providing business assistance, and opening community access. In its implementation, this program focuses more on development in an effort to improve the economy through existing groups such as fisheries and mangrove cultivation groups. This article concludes in general Gerbang Mapan have been running in accordance with the established on RoadMap and are able to improve the economy especially in the fields of fisheries and mangroves.

Keywords: Community Empowerment, Poverty, Coastal Area, Gerbang Mapan
INTRODUCTION

Poverty in coastal areas, even resulting in economic marginalization of coastal areas. Even though economically marginalized, coastal areas through their superior power in terms of their fishing industry, they cannot be underestimated in supporting food security, nutrition, livelihoods, rural development, and poverty alleviation (Jentoft & Chuenpagdee, 2015).

In contrast to the poverty that occurs, it turns out that the fishing industry owned by coastal areas is actually one of the sectors of the food industry that has the fastest development (Bostock et al., 2010; Ting et al., 2015). This shows if the coastal area with its fisheries sector has significant potential if it can be managed and managed properly. Therefore, research on the development of coastal areas is an interesting topic to discuss in efforts to equate development and alleviate poverty in coastal (Dahuri & Dutton, 2000; Rudyanto, 2004).

Although basically coastal poverty is not much different from poverty in general which is multidimensional. The root cause lies in economic policies that are less favorable for coastal communities, in which the majority work as fishermen (Wekke & Cahaya, 2015). For example, limited access to the main resources needed to depend on their lives is forced to live in the category of (Barclay, 2013; Fabinyi, 2011). Although basically coastal resources are abundant, many natural resources are collected or hunted, and especially in coastal areas, there are boundaries where these resources can be harvested sustainably.

Exploitation of scarce resources is likely to be a problem when management does not effectively regulate the level of extraction. Based on these problems, the poverty of coastal areas can be caused by (1) The lack of coastal resources that have competition in managing their territories, (2) Limited capital and technology, (3) Difficulty in diversifying fishing businesses, (4) minimal processing technology, and (5) damage to marine and fisheries ecosystems (Kusnadi, 2003).

The orientation of development in coastal areas of Indonesia has arisen since the era of Soekarno's leadership, with the desire to make Indonesia a prosperous and living seafaring country from the sea so that a Djauandia declaration was issued which emphasized that the form of the Indonesian state was a maritime state and the sea boundary was confirmed by the stipulation of Indonesian sea ordinate points as one of the elements of sovereignty as well as being the boundary of the management of the Indonesian maritime region so that supervision and protection of the region is easy to (Noor, 2014). Over time, the development of coastal areas, including marine affairs, has become an important task of the government, both the central and regional governments so that Indonesia can become one of the strongest maritime countries in the world that can enjoy the fruits of the sea as one of the sources to improve the welfare of the Indonesian people.

Through Nawacita, which contains the goal of building Indonesia from the periphery by strengthening regional areas within the framework of a unitary state, the leadership of President and Vice President Joko Widodo-Jusuf Kalla seeks to focus on existing marine programs to restore Indonesia to become the strongest maritime country in the world that can be reached through various ways, one of which is development in the coastal areas of Indonesia (Kumolo, 2017; Syamsi, 2015).

In order to realize the goal of Nawacita, development carried out in coastal areas must be based on the concept of sustainable development so that regulations need to be and the right targets so that these objectives can be realized properly and have a direct impact on the community (Soleman & Noer, 2017).

Apart from that, as an effort to improve the quality of coastal community resources through community empowerment. but unfortunately the condition of coastal communities in Indonesia until now it still depicts a stereotype that is bad in the eyes of the public and the Indonesian government, so that in the development and empowerment carried out in coastal areas has not yet produced optimal results so that the goal of efforts to improve the welfare of all the people
of Indonesia, especially the coastal areas that often become marginalized groups of society has not yet been able to be felt to the maximum. Often the problems that occur are limited community involvement, and this is generally still motivated by fundamental problems such as the level of knowledge and education of the people who are still low (Fadli & Nurlukman, 2018a).

District Tangerang in the Tangerang Raya area, is the only region that has an area of oceanic waters covering 377.40 km2 with a coastal area of 298.52 km2, based on the district administration in District Tangerang, which consists of 7 districts and 23 villages, consisting Sub district of Kronjo, Sub district of Mauk, Sub district of Kemiri, Sub district of Sukadari, Sub district of Pakuhaji, Sub district of Teluk Naga, and Sub district of Kosambi (Pemerintah Kabupaten Tangerang, 2013).

One of the potentials of District Tangerang is the natural potential of the sea, although it has not been well explored so that the people in the coastal areas of District Tangerang with a large part of their work as fishermen are still lagging behind in terms of the economy compared to the people who live in the industrial area. Of the total area of sea that is owned, it should be able to bring the Tangerang district community, especially coastal communities, to get a decent life with a stable economic condition but unfortunately this does not apply because based on the 2016 Tangerang Regency Central Bureau of Statistics data, the population of District Tangerang based on the results of the 2015 population projection has a population of more than 3,300,000 people (BPS Kabupaten Tangerang, 2016), spread in 29 sub-districts spread in Tangerang district, with 7% of poor households in coastal areas (Maharani, 2017).

To overcome the problem of poverty that occurs in coastal areas, The local government of district Tangerang makes one of the 25 priority programs of District Tangerang namely the Coastal Community Development Movement Program (Gerbang Mapan) with the aim of resolving the problems of poverty that occur in the coastal areas of District Tangerang, with the aim of increasing the economy and the procurement of supporting infrastructure in coastal areas by promoting community empowerment in managing natural resources which has not been managed to the maximum with the program's validity period in 2015-2018. As a form of actualizing the duties of the regional government in managing the area based on their potential, the government of District Tangerang makes one of the coastal areas one of the tasks for management, while at the same time overcoming coastal poverty that still occurs. one of them is through the Coastal Community Development Program (Gerbang Mapan) as a program designed to improve the coastal economy in an effort to solve poverty.

Based on the 2013-2018 Regional Medium-Term Development Plan document, one of the ways taken before implementing a government program is to make a plan and strategy, the person in charge, and the plan that will be carried out, are made aware of the needs and objectives of the program to be carried out. The purpose is to implement the program that has been implemented can achieve the goals that have been targeted and have a direct impact on the community, considering the overall government program is a program that is directly related to the community and often not even involves and makes the community as one of the objectives of implementing a program made (Fadli & Nurlukman, 2018b).

With the principle that the economic improvement program by prioritizing the empowerment of coastal communities is carried out appropriately and according to the target, so that economic improvement is not only experienced by coastal communities but also the Tangerang Regency government, so that it is expected that the poverty rate in the Tangerang regency region can be minimized by realizing independence in the community in exploring and managing the coastal potential that is owned, and realizing efforts to make Indonesia as the strongest maritime country in the world through one way, namely the welfare of coastal communities which acts as one of the indicators of the maritime country, namely people who inhabit and depend on the available marine resources.

This paper intends to analyze the process of empowering coastal communities
carried out by the Tangerang District government in the Coastal Community Development Movement (Gerbang Mapan) program. Analysis of efforts to implement community empowerment activities is based on the arguments put forward by Patmiaty and Suryani (2012) who argued that empowerment efforts were carried out through five ways, namely: 1) Enhancement and capacity of the community, 2) Exploring potential and resources owned, 3) Extracting basic values, 4) Giving access, and 5) Giving business assistance (Padmiaty & Suryani, 2012).

RESULT AND EXPLANATION The Improving Basic Skills

The increasing basic skill is important thing which to do activity in empowerment society, it has been purposing to enhance skill and to actualize potency which they are have as coastal society. That's things based on belief that society have an opportunity to evolve their potency especially with the best management potency which they are have. It is same as empowerment society program which is focused to do empowerment potency of them because the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) have purpose to increase skill of society for managing its potency and nature source. So, encourage is needed for them to get improving and training skill of them for venture of economic which can create prosperity for society better life in coastal area of district Tangerang.

The another shape of increasing basic skill which was done by the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) program is as effort to increase coastal economy through empowerment society which has done for Tunas Tambak mandiri group as receiving group in early year execution of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) 2015 until 2016 by Marine and Fisheries Office of District Tangerang with several ways such as given training skill and counseling feeding to fishery community to change feeding method from conventional to semi intensive method to manage dike of bandeng fish at 25 villages especially in Kemiri Village of district Tangerang.

The method used in this study is a qualitative method that aims to analyze and deeply explore how efforts to empower coastal communities in poverty alleviation through coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) the government does. The process of analysis is done by reducing and sorting data obtained through interviews with parties related to the topic of research and field observations relating to efforts to empower coastal communities.

The informants in this study were chosen based on the reasons for the relevance of the research topic, namely community empowerment, which among others was the Tangerang Regency local government, in this matter is the Head of the Production and Cultivation Technology section (TPUB) and the Head of the Mangrove Service and Management Section of the Marine and Fisheries Office of District Tangerang, and association representative or coastal community groups to determine the extent to which community empowerment programs carried out in the Gerbang Mapan program, are in accordance with community needs and can spur community economic growth.

In the context of this study, community empowerment carried out in the coastal district of Tangerang was carried out by carrying out participatory observation activities in three villages and three districts (Patramanggala Village of sub-district Kemiri, Kronjo Village of sub-district Kronjo, and Ketapang Village of sub-district Mauk).
obtained that practice semi intensive method with 50% percent from nature feed and 50% from artificial feed is proved which has been increasing of crops result from 750-1200 Kg/Ha before they applicated these method to 1500-2000 Kg/Ha from 111 m³ of dike field Bandeng fish commodities which is located in Patramanggala village, Kemiri of District Tangerang with 18 members of groups Tunas Tambak Mandiri after the government of District Tangerang did collaboration with IPB and Marine and Fisheries Office of District Tangerang.

These activities that is purposed to increase economic of coastal society from result of empowering farm fishery group by Gerbang Mapan. The increasing of result crops Bandeng commodity since 2015 until 2016 (grafik 1) that it have been doing program of increasing economy to empower cultivate fishery group in dike coastal of district Tangerang especially in Patramanggala Village as receiving program. From the result of bandeng fishery can be seen more significantly result of crops of bandeng commodity at field of aquaculture fisheries if it is compared before they get providing business assistance by Gerbang Mapan program on 2014. The increasing of result of bandeng fishery crop at Patramanggala villages causes they get more income for their group from Gerbang Mapan program.

Grafik 1. Data of the result of Bandeng fishery crops by Tunas Tambak Mandiri Group

According to data, the increasing of fields of aquaculture fisheries after they did the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) which is collaborate as effort to increase income for fishery group especially to Bandeng fishery commodities. This have scheduled on on roadmap which was made by Marine and fishery office of district Tangerang and Bogor Agriculture Institute. The increasing of results of crops fishery has been more increasing as much as 6,230 kg during two cycle of bandeng crops in Tunas Tambak Mandiri group if it is compared with result of bandeng crops on 2014 before they get the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan). From data result of the increasing of bandeng fishery crops is found quarrel income of Tunas Tambak Mandiri group as much as Rp. 248.353.000 with range Rp. 2.237.414/ m³ from 111 m³ dike land have them owned although amount of bandeng crops commodity in their group have not been significantly results but still get evolving income as positive effect after they got the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) in effort to empowerment coastal society in District Tangerang.

Result of the increasing economy and skill which is happened in Tunas mandiri as receiving group of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) in Patramanggala village accordance with the degree of empowerment are consist of some indicators such as raising awareness and desire to change be better, evolving capacity ability to get access, ability to face up obstacles and increasing ability to cooperation and solidarity of members (Firmansyah, 2012). It is based on the indicator of empowerment that, increasing capability coastal society after they got realization from empowerment of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) which become one of 25 premier program of local government in district Tangerang, Province Banten, Indonesia and it show a successful of empowerment program in coastal village of district Tangerang are considered of collaboration between marine and fisheries office of district Tangerang and the field of agriculture fishery group of coastal society to grow, develop, and optimize nature.
resources which they are have as effort to increase economic of coastal society in district Tangerang.

On the other side, the increasing basic skill which is done by marine and fisheries office of district Tangerang on the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) to coastal society not only implicate fields of aquaculture fisheries group but also to fisheries product processing group in Patramanggala village of district Tangerang and implicate women to make a real action on effort to increase income of society’s coastal area especially to improve basic skill of them as wife of fisherman which work as member of fields of aquaculture fisheries group or fisherman. Therefore, the local government of district Tangerang has been focused to involve economic of coastal area by the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan). It is based on Roadmap of Gerbang Mapan which use method that is called one village one product (OVOP). It is an effort to develop of local commodity with pressure skill of society on coastal villages to make one product a villages as effort to develop region commodity which they have and to involve that potency with integrated to improve self-sufficiency, welfare of society and the increasing income of society or income to local region also to make a new icon of coastal area in district Tangerang.

Based on data of field research which is done by researcher is known that the ways to develop and manage processing product fisheries groups in coastal area of district Tangerang was does with several fishery processing group to do build local icon of coastal villages in district Tangerang as local regional identity which is make a different with other villages. The way to improve and managed refinery fishery product in One Village One Product (OVOP) which is used in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) program implicate refinery group to create a hygienic product from fishery potency from coastal village to support economic growing in coastal village, district Tangerang.

To realization RoadMap of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) to create iconic product in coastal village is happened the local government of district Tangerang has made a step to give basic skill of processing product fisheries groups. The local government through collaboration between PKSPL of Bogor Agriculture Institute and marine and fishery office of district Tangerang in 2015 did give 25 training to improve basic skill to the group of the fishery processing product on 3 villages which they are consist of Patramanggala village, Margamulya village, and Muara village although only Patramanggala village was hold out until ending of Gerbang Mapan program. It is because processing product fisheries groups in Patramanggala village through “Manggala Putri group” has a high self-awareness and support from their members so that they get implementation improvement basic skill especially to bandeng processing product as local potency which they have in their village. The increasing of basic skill which is applied to the other groups be adapted with skill which is they have. Conformity of application of the increasing basic skill to the group of fisheries office of district Tangerang which is collaborate with PKSPL IPB refer to RoadMap of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan). In the outline of that purpose of Gerbang Mapan program is aimed to increase basic skill of processing of fishery group to create iconic product on every coastal villages in district Tangerang to be stimulant to the economy of coastal society and as effort to give innovate and economic creative which can grow from new potency in their village so that it is can make the easier of effort to create featured product by processing product of fishery group in villages of district Tangerang.

According to result of research about Roadmap, there are five main principle of this featured programs which more press to development activities and empowerment society to realize the purpose of increasing economy of coastal area. As for the plan of effort of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) as sustainable program so that the government of district Tangerang have to do this five main principles which consist of:

1. Protection and management of destruction of natural and artificial
resource
2. Protection, recovery and habitat management
3. Utilization and provision of water resource
4. Food endurance and livelihood management Pollution reduction and sewage management (PKSPL IPB, 2013)

This is based on the benefits of the sea as one of Indonesia's biggest potentials as a maritime country, so that in the implementation of development in coastal and marine areas must maintain that marine and fisheries resources can be maintained and sustainable and make the nation of Indonesia a living and prosperous country from the results of sea resources (Kementeriaan Kelautan dan Perikanan, 2017)

Extracting Coastal Potential and Resources

The activity of extracting potential and coastal resources in the implementation the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) activities related to community empowerment is a method taken to optimize the resources owned and processed in order to bring benefits to the surrounding community. This is based on awareness of the potential of the community to be developed and maximized.

Implementation of extracting potential and coastal resources by beneficiaries of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) in the coastal area of Tangerang Regency which is focused on implementing economic improvement programs through community empowerment in the fields of aquaculture fisheries, fisheries product processing groups, and the group of mangrove cultivation as a series of activities that were used as the focus of the implementation the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) by involving the marine and fisheries services as the leading sector of Gerbang Mapan. The exploration of potential and resources in community empowerment activities aims to enable the potential of the community to develop and strengthen the potential of the community. The form of extracting potential and resources that was felt when carrying out economic improvement activities in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) was the effort of the marine service to try to implement new commodities in groups other than milkfish cultivation which had been successfully implemented in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan)

In that case, the steps taken by the department are the right steps in accordance with the capacity of the Maritime and Fisheries Department as the leading sector of the Gerbang Mapan program and ensure that the planned programs can run in realizing the economic improvement of the Tangerang coastal community through changing the strategy by empowering group of empowering family welfare (PKK) which is empowered by woman in coastal area. From a number of things regarding the implementation of community empowerment activities as an effort to improve the coastal economy in the Tangerang Regency area, especially in the implementation of activities carried out by the fisheries processing group, referring to 3 of 5 bases of empowerment according to Friedman (Firmansyah, 2012), namely: community-based development, sustainability, community participation, development of community social capital, and elimination of gender inequality.

First, namely to continue to develop the community through efforts to empower coastal communities to carry out economic improvements through processing group activities even though the initial target in processing groups was the wife of the fisherman's, which was replaced at the initiative of the Marine and Fisheries Department to involve empowering family welfare (PKK) groups that were in accordance with the criteria for holding fisheries product processing groups from the
potential and ability to run coastal processed products in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan).

Second, the participation of coastal village communities, especially in the Patramanggala village, is quite high in receiving empowerment activities to optimize the abilities that PKK groups have in realizing the target of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan), namely one village one product program that is beneficial to improving the community economy as well as a coastal village commodity in the Tangerang Regency, which can also be beneficial for increasing the income of coastal villages.

Third, is the principle of sustainability, namely by ensuring that the planning that has been confirmed in the Gerbang Mapan Road Map in empowering processing groups can be carried out even though there is a change in the target of the processing group to guarantee economic growth in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan), specifically in terms of involving the community in accordance with their potential.

Although in its implementation there are obstacles regarding maximizing processing groups in carrying out group activities, the activities of extracting potential and resources by the fisheries department by using existing potential and resources, namely milkfish commodities, run quite well, but unfortunately it cannot develop causing dependence only on that single potential. This can also be proven by the Mangrove Learning and Restoration Center (PRPM) to utilize its resources and potential owned by Tangerang Regency in the form of farm land which is used for the activities of making mangrove arboretum parks or mangrove collection parks in the Tangerang Regency area.

The involvement of the village apparatus with the Tangerang district marine and fisheries department for efforts to improve the economy of the community through community empowerment in the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) is considered unfair in accordance with the concept of the Gerbang Mapan contained in the Roadmap and in contravention of Undang-undang number 27 of 2007, concerning the management of coastal areas and small island islands in Chapter II article 3 which contains the principle of managing coastal areas and small island islands consisting of some principles include the principle of sustainability, consistency, integration, legal certainty, partnership, equity, community participation, openness, decentralization, accountability and justice.

In the issue of the lack of community involvement in community empowerment efforts to manage coastal areas, especially in PRPM activities in Ketapang village, Tangerang Regency, which are contrary to the principle of justice, the principle of openness, and the principle of community participation.

The lack of efforts to involve the public and information disclosure regarding community empowerment activities in the PRPM group was because the community was not invited to form the PRPM masterplan or the creation of RoadMap from the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan), and only involved the village apparatus so that the community empowerment program in coastal villages did not meet community needs and often vulnerable to conflict.

Open Community Access

Opening access through activities and results of community empowerment aims to improve the connectivity of recipients of community empowerment programs to other parties with the aim that when empowerment activities are completed, potential exploration activities that have been explored can continue to be carried out and developed in realizing community welfare and independence so that they do not depend to the government.

Therefore, managing the maritime territory is not only the responsibility of the government but there must be efforts from other parties such as the private sector who
also have a stake in managing coastal areas, both in the effort to manage natural resources and the environment. Economic improvement activities through community empowerment stated that the form of access that was felt by the group when and after the implementation of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) was able to establish cooperation with Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) through a series of agreed Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), one of which was the use of feed from CV. Prima.

Agreement with CV. Prima is an alternative effort from dependence on the government which sometimes cannot fulfill the feed needs of existing groups. The Department of Marine and Fisheries stated that opening opportunities with other parties was deliberately directed to groups to establish cooperation with other parties, which meant encouraging groups to be independent in taking advantage of existing opportunities.

External involvement in the Gerbang Mapan also occurs in the cultivation of mangroves with CSR. The involvement of CSR in mangrove cultivation emphasizes the role of planting and care. The involvement of outside parties and for official efforts in the seriousness of the management of mangrove cultivation are beginning to be felt by the results and benefits both economically in groups and coastal environments. The results of mangrove planting began to look successful in the form of a green belt as a deterrent to abrasion in the coastal area of District Tangerang.

Providing Business Assistance

Providing business assistance which is implemented to make a successful activities for community empowerment in order to increase the economy of the community and to solve poverty problem that still occurs. The form of providing business assistance in order to create the empowered, sustainable and independent coastal community based on the available potency of coastal area.

The form of providing business assistance in the program of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) is more tend to be allocated to improvement production equipment and support sustain group agendas which is empowered and it is included to not giving cash money to prevent abuse of base function which there are so that the aiming is given to stimulate group to increase their well-being life. During the implementation of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) was provided with sharing Bandeng fish seeds or they called as Nener and food which be adapted with mount of field which have by fish pond in the village where receiving group exist. Another from which is provided for man who works in fishpond is given equipment to increase activity manage the Bandeng fish as Presto to cultivate main ingredient to be other refined with Big or small size which is adapted with their needed and giving Frezeer for preserving products which have made to save result fishery product before it issold.

The activities provide business assistance is stimulant to coastal groups so that they can be active and independent for managing business fish which aim to increase coastal economic in District Tangerang with means to provide what people need in society’s activity. Furthermore, in implementation of this program which is provided by Marine and fishery office of District Tangerang with collaborated with Bogor Agriculture Institute did gradually to monitoring and evaluation as supervisor for coastal group who get providing business assistance by previous program.

Providing business assistance on the form of providing production support equipment to improvement economic program at the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) which has been given by the Government of district Tangerang as effort to stimulate local group of coastal society to be empowered based on their potential and to make a positive impact for the next empowerment activities can run sustainable. This is addaptance with the management principles of the coastal
CONCLUSION

When did the empowerment activities of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) as effort to increase economy coastal society, the local government of district Tangerang have done choose coastal group who have skill and potency on coastal resource to do collaboration Marine and Fisheries office of district Tangerang which is not only as leading sector of the coastal community movement programs (Gerbang Mapan) sector but also parties which be on duty to do activity, controlling, and evaluation which did Gerbang Mapan program to be three years classification such as on 2015, Gerbang Mapan Program was focused to do all of activities which were formulated on Forum Group Discussion (FGD) in 2104, on 2016 activities of Gerbang Mapan were focused to dike fishery and mangrove cultivation group, and on 2017 till that program was finish on 2018 is focused to realize activities on mangrove cultivation.

As result of field activities, Gerbang Mapan program has able to increase economic of coastal area especially to cultivate group fishery and refinery fishery groups although not all of 8 (eight) sub district of 25 (twenty five) coastal villages in district Tangerang get positive effect by Gerbang Mapan program to increase income of coastal society to reduce coastal poverty which is happened. It is happened because egocentric behavior between official service unit (SKPD) of district Tangerang still high so that the local government cannot implemented all of purpose and plan in Gerbang Mapan program which has created and planned because Gerbang Mapan Program is planned to collaborate 20 (twenty) official service unit (SKPD) and not only cover fishery and refinery area but also agriculture and ranch of coastal area. That condition was compel the local government of district Tangerang empower Marine and Fisheries office of district Tangerang to handle Gerbang Mapan program. although on the implementation by Marine and Fisheries office of district Tangerang more pressure to do activities which is faced to fishery activity such as activities of groups cultivate dike fishery, mangrove conservation, refinery fishery, and fisherman because they have limited area to implement all of plan on Roadmap Gerbang Mapan program but even though Gerbang Mapan has done to increase economic of society of coastal area, the local government still have problem because this program have not cover of main development which is consist of the increasing of
knowledge and education to realize the better life of society to long time.

SUGGESTION

1. The local government should be improve collaboration between coastal community group at coastal area with Marine and fisheries office of district Tangerang which is purposed to do another premier program for society especially society of coastal management who still have a poverty problem. Therefor the local government have to make a program which can directly give effect to society activities.

2. The local government of district Tangerang should do give suggestion to Regional Government Agency of district Tangerang (Bappeda) to handle all of premier programs which is purposed to applicate all of program which can relate with plan that have been planning to guarantee regional work unit of district Tangerang does that program.

3. The local government should involve all of elements of society to be a active role to manage of resources and skills which they have on village or region of them to increase local economic especially to coastal society.

4. The government should create a new coastal group which have guarantee from marine and fishery office to create an equality of coastal community program so that this program can be given for all of coastal area and village in district Tangerang.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


Governance Collaboration in Local Tourism Management: Opportunities and Barriers to the Sustainability of Tourism Development in Indonesia

Siti Aisyah (aisyah@ecampus.ut.ac.id)
Universitas Terbuka, Indonesia
Cherly Kemala Ulfa (cherly@ecampus.ut.ac.id)
Universitas Terbuka, Indonesia

Abstract

Problems that arise in tourism management by local governments are: 1). There are limited regional resources in developing tourism even though tourism is a priority to increase foreign exchange; 2). Lack of role of local government in utilizing potential elements owned by the local. This article aims to analyze governance collaboration in supporting the sustainability of development in the tourism sector in the local. This article is the result of qualitative research. The research location is in Toba Samosir Regency, North Sumatra Province. Primary data includes several informants determined by the snowball technique. Secondary data consists of government policy documents, related research results, literature studies and other relevant data. The findings of this study are: 1). Pillars that play a role in managing tourism in the local are a local governments, "sadawri" communities, and indigenous groups. 2). overlapping interests between local government units in tourism development which caused confusion in community groups. 3). The Local government does not carry out monitoring and motivating functions in tourism management in the local. The implication of this finding is the importance of developing a pilot project that develops the concept of government collaboration in the tourism sector in regions that have the potential of tourism in Indonesia to support the sustainability of tourism development in Indonesia.

Keywords: governance collaboration, tourism, local government

INTRODUCTION

Article 12 paragraph (3) of the Republic of Indonesia Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Governments regulates optional government affairs. Optional government affairs are carried out to determine the regions that have optional affairs based on potential, projections, employment, and land use. One area that has tourism potential is Toba Samosir Regency, North Sumatra Province. Toba Samosir is proliferation of administration from North Tapanuli district which was ratified by Republic of Indonesia Law Number 12 of 1998 concerning the Establishment of Toba Samosir District. One of the missions of Toba Samosir Regency is to develop national tourism destinations. Toba Samosir Regency is one of 10 national tourism priority distortions launched by the Government since 2016 (Liputan6.com). Tourism is one of the affairs set by Toba Samosir Regency, to support the mission of Toba Samosir Regency. Wasistiono (2018) illustrates the optional of government affairs in the Cafeteria Theory. According to Cafeteria theory, the central government provides a number of matters of government choice, local governments are welcome to choose several affairs which are deemed in accordance with the development of their respective regional potential.

The mainstay of tourism in Toba Samosir Regency is Lake Toba, natural beauty (28 natural attractions), local cultural attractions (in 2017 there are 42 times local cultural attractions), culinary diversity, and so on. The motto of Toba Samosir Regency is Tampakna do Rantosna, Rimni Tahi do Gogona (Togetherness reflects Strength). The number of tourist visits to Toba Samosir Regency during 2012-2017 experienced fluctuations, even in 2013 it decreased by 20.97%. Overall, in the 2012-2017 period, the growth of tourist arrivals in Toba Samosir Regency decreased by 0.67%. A significant increase occurred in 2014 amounting to 14.45% with the number of visits of 119,225 people. In 2015 tourist visits decreased by 3.88% with the number of tourist visits of 114,594 people. The development of tourist visits in 2012-2017 can be seen in Table 1.
The government's desire to increase regional income from the tourism sector has not been accompanied by regional government efforts in improving services in the tourism sector. Toba Samosir Regency has limited human resources, infrastructure, and the nature of community culture that considered to be less supportive of tourism development. At the Tourism Office, employees who have competence in tourism are only 3 (three) people from 29 employees. HR limitations certainly affect the development of the tourism sector. One of the less supportive regional infrastructures is the quality of district roads. The quality of district roads is only around 219.12 KM (45.64 percent), the condition is good, while the conditions are recorded at 72.26 Km (35.44 percent) and the rest along 610.66 km are in damaged and severely damaged conditions. The cultural aspect of the Toba Samosir community is still often complained of by the tourism industry. The characteristics of the people of Toba Samosir tend to be homogeneous and show less openness to visitors. On the other hand, the regional government still does not utilize the potential elements possessed by the region for the tourism sector, such as traditional leaders, tourism villages, and local tourism industry players. According to the collaboration theory there are several elements that can be built in guaranteeing the sustainability of development, such as the triple helix theory, quarto helix, and so on. This article aims to analyze government collaboration in supporting sustainable development in the tourism sector in the region.

### METHODS
This article is the result of qualitative research. This article is the result of qualitative research. The research location is in Toba Samosir Regency, North Sumatra Province. The informants included the Head of the Village Community Empowerment Service, Head of the Tourism Office, traditional leaders, several tourism village heads, and business actors in the tourism sector. Secondary data consists of government policy documents, related research results, library studies and other relevant data.

### RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS
Lake Toba is one of the buffer zones, which provides opportunities for tourism development on a local, national and international scale. Preparation of tourist areas is a matter that needs attention, both in terms of preparation of tourist areas and availability of accessibility. The strategy formulated by the government is increasing IT-based promotion and effectiveness of tourist attractions, improving tourist infrastructure facilities in good condition and improving management of tourist attractions, and increasing tourism service business development and developing institutional and HR capacity (KSPN, 2016). Improving the standard of living and welfare of the local community is the main measure of the success of the concept of the KSPN. The concept of KSPN seems to have not shown positive results at Toba Samosir. Until 2017, tourist arrivals in Toba Samosir have not shown a significant increase. The development of tourist visits in 2012-2017 can be seen in Table 1.

Toba Samosir Regency has a variety of natural, cultural and historical potential that can be extracted and preserved and used as assets in supporting the development of the tourism sector. This potential is closely related to the attraction and value of tourism objects spread across several districts consisting of spiritual attractions, natural or recreational tourism, history or culture as well as forest or garden attractions. Tourist areas in Toba Samosir Regency can be seen in Table 2.

### Table 1
Tourist Visit of Toba Samosir Regency in 2012-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Foreign tourist visits</td>
<td>15.464</td>
<td>10.680</td>
<td>12.329</td>
<td>11.828</td>
<td>11.975</td>
<td>12.121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Domestic tourist visits</td>
<td>116.349</td>
<td>93.493</td>
<td>106.896</td>
<td>102.766</td>
<td>436.260</td>
<td>765.907</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ammount (t)</td>
<td>131.813</td>
<td>104.173</td>
<td>119.225</td>
<td>114.594</td>
<td>448.235</td>
<td>753.687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Growth (%)</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>-20.97</td>
<td>14.46</td>
<td>-3.88</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Dinas Pariwisata dan Kebudayaan Kab. Toba Samosir, 2018
Cultural aspects become one of the important factors in human life. The role of local government in managing the wealth of arts, culture and infrastructure that supports it can be seen in Table 3.

### Table 2
**Tourism Area of Toba Samosir Regency**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Tourism Destination</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Area Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Tugu D.I. Panjaitan</td>
<td>Historical Tourism</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Museum T.B Silalahi Center</td>
<td>Historical Tourism</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Museum Batak</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Pantai Lumban silintong</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Muali Sirambe</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Kolam Renang Pagar Balu</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Rest House Gurgur</td>
<td>Natural Tourism</td>
<td>Tampah Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Bukit Dolok Tolong</td>
<td>Natural Tourism</td>
<td>Tampah Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Pantai Tarabunga</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Tampah Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Pantai Lintong Ni Huta</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Tampah Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Pantai Meat</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Tampah Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Pantai Pasifik</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Porsea Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Pantai Siregar Aek Na Nas</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Uluan Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Rumah Adat Lumban Nabolon</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage</td>
<td>Uluan Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Agrowisata Lumban julu</td>
<td>Natural Tourism</td>
<td>L. Julu Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Taman Eden 100</td>
<td>Natural Tourism</td>
<td>L. Julu Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Jingga Dolok</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage</td>
<td>L. Julu Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Kawasan makam DR. I L Nomenssen</td>
<td>Historical Tourism</td>
<td>Sigumpar Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Bukit senyum Motung</td>
<td>Natural Tourism</td>
<td>Aijaba Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Pantai Aijaba</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Aijaba Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Makam Raja Sisingamangaraja XII</td>
<td>Historical Tourism</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Pasar Tradisional Balige</td>
<td>Cultural Heritage</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Gereja Tua HKBP</td>
<td>Spiritual Wonders</td>
<td>Balige and Sigumpar Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Pantai Lumban Binanga</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Laguboti Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Pantai Pasifik</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Porsea Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Pantai Sigaol</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Uluan Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Pantai Lumban Bulbul</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Pantai Lumban Gaol</td>
<td>Water Recreation</td>
<td>Balige Region</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Dinas Pariwisata dan Kebudayaan Kab. Toba Samosir, 2018

### Table 3
**Art and Culture Development of Toba Samosir Regency 2012-2017**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Number of cultural arts groups / cultural studios that are fostered</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of art buildings / studios</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Percentage of preserved cultural heritage</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The number of holding arts and cultural festivals</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Dinas Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata, 2018

### OPPORTUNITIES AND BARRIERS IN THE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

Opportunities for tourism sector development can be seen from the aspects that can be sold in Toba Samosir Regency. According to Proctor (2017) there are 7 aspects in government marketing, namely people, product, price, promotion, physical evidence, process, and place. Among the 7 elements, there are 2 elements which are opportunities to support the sustainability of tourism development, namely physical evidence and product.

Physical evidence can be seen from websites, newsletters, organization's facilities and buildings. Website Lake Toba tours are available on the internet. Promotion from the Ministry of Tourism about Lake Toba has a big contribution in increasing tourist visits. Panoramic photos of the beauty of Lake Toba, museums, historical tours are easily found in various media. The website of the Government of Toba Samosir Regency is unfortunately not well maintained. The news and information uploaded are mostly not current. Even though this website is officially owned by the local government. This website does not use the media as part of a strategy to improve tourist destinations as soon as possible. Many tourist information is obtained from other websites.

According to Proctor (2007) the product aspects include The Service, Features, location, Design, Branding. Products in providing tourism...
services include services, features, locations and branding designs. For Service quality includes the provision of access facilities, ease of receiving information, friendliness of employees. The location of tourism includes the beauty of nature and the availability of adequate public facilities, such as roads, accommodations, restaurants, and facilities for worship. While branding design is related to planting a brand or image of a tourism destination. Based on secondary observations, the following data are obtained:

Table 4: Condition of Tourism Facilities in Toba Samosir Regency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Conditions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Quality of Provision of Tourism Services</td>
<td>Online Travel Website is available (traveloka, gobatak.com, other travel web)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>Land Transportation (240 km from Capital City, Medan), Air Transportation (Silangit Siborong-Borong Airport)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feature</td>
<td>Tourism Nature (Beach Tourism, Hill) Museum, Traditional Market</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Brand Design</td>
<td>Still in Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Acommodation</td>
<td>Resort, 3 and 4 Star Hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>Muslim Restaurant is very limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Prayer Facility</td>
<td>48 Church, 4 Mosque, 3 Mini-Mosque</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Processed from various sources

Table 4 illustrates the conditions of facilities and infrastructure related to tourism management in Toba Samosir Regency. Tourism in Toba Samosir Regency is still limited to natural tourism and historical tourism. Tourism potential that has not been developed is culinary tourism, cultural tourism, and shopping tours. The limitations of tourist facilities (accommodation and restaurants) affect the visits of foreign and local tourists. Branding design which is one of the elements in tourism development is still in the process of being drafted. According to the Assistant Deputy I Regional I of the Ministry of Tourism “Branding is the sales mission of Lake Toba and is expected to increase the awareness of the tourist market towards Lake Toba destinations”. The proposed branding of Lake Toba in the process is “Lake Toba Caldera of Kings”. With the meaning of the socio-cultural approach and one more meaning of the approach “Wonderful Indonesia (Deputy for Marketing Kemenpar, www.hetanew.com, 11 April 2018). The effort to compile the branding of Lake Toba is done by comparing strategic marketing in 3 big cities in Indonesia like Yogyakarta, Surabaya and Semarang. Efforts to compile the branding also invited several airlines, such as Garuda and Citilink (krjogja.com, September 9, 2018).

BARRIERS

There are 3 elements that become obstacles in the sustainability of tourism development, namely people, processes in government, and place. People / stakeholder includes human resources that handle the provision of government services. Tourism services are part of the administration of selected government affairs in the tourism sector. In terms of human resources that handle tourism affairs, there are 29 people, with details of 4 people graduating from high school, 4 people graduating from the Diploma program, 17 people graduating from undergraduate programs, and 4 people graduating from the master’s program. The complete information can be seen in Table 5

Table 5: The composition of civil servants in the Culture and Tourism Office

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Educational Level</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>High school</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Bachelor degree</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Master degree</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The average number of civil servants in the services of the Toba Samosir Regency Government is almost the same. For example: the number of civil servants in the Population and Civil Registry Service is 30 people, 33 civil servants in the Market, Cleanliness and Landscaping Service. The highest number of civil
servants is in the Education Office, which is 2,834 people and the Health Office as many as 537 people. The two offices consist of civil servants who are teachers and medical professionals.

One of the causes of the underdevelopment of the tourism sector in Toba Samosir Regency is the lack of seriousness of the local government in managing tourism. In fact, tourism is the fifth mission of the regional mission. In accordance with the Local Planning (RPJMD), the main focus of regional government is to improve community welfare, which until now has been caused by: not yet optimal governance, the quality of human resources that are still low, the availability of infrastructure that is not in line with expectations, and low economic growth rates. Figure 4.6 illustrates the main problems of Toba Samosir District Government.

Figure 1 Problems of Toba Samosir Regency Government

Tourism management does require quality human resources. In the public sector, in addition to the quality of human resources, aspects of government authority have a very important role. According to the Sumatra Region Marketing Officer, Ministry of Tourism, the management of Lake Toba since 2016 has become the authority of the Lake Toba Authority, which covers all access and potential of Lake Toba. Therefore, the District Government of Toba Samosir says that the authority was in BODT. The adequacy of the authority of the Toba Samosir Regency Government in tourism management can be an input in improving tourism management. This needs further study.

Process aspects are related to community satisfaction surveys. Survey of tracked community satisfaction is also LAPOR (People’s Online Aspiration and Complaint Service). The application is available on the website: tobasamosirkab.go.id. However, the application cannot be accessed by the public. The Community Satisfaction Survey is a suggestion to obtain input from the community regarding the quality of services in the area. For example, the Surabaya City Government uploaded its annual Community Satisfaction Survey Report. SKM is part of public accountability and to improve the performance of government agencies in carrying out service functions. The Guidelines for Preparing the Community Satisfaction Survey (SKM) is regulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform Number 14 of 2017. According to the Ministerial Regulation on RB, SKM is conducted at least once a year. The survey can work with other institutions, which have credibility and reputation in research. SKM must be implemented in the Public Service Unit. In some places such as the South Tangerang City Government, SKM is carried out in the LLAJR, Licensing, Sub-District and Puskesmas Service. Unfortunately not all agencies implement SKM. Even though overall, the Government was formed to carry out the service function. Likewise the case in the Office of Tourism and Culture, rarely and even has never done SKM.

Place aspects include distribution channels, coverage: location, convenience availability (distribution channels that include location and convenience). In the context of providing tourism services, local governments need to pay attention to distribution channels (ease of reaching other locations) and pay attention to comfort (security, availability of public facilities, and food). Safety factors must be a guarantee for tourists. Data from BPS shows that there were 402 crimes in Toba Samosir Regency in 2015. The biggest cases of crime were 96 cases of maltreatment, 58 gambling cases cases, damaging 34 cases, scam 34 cases, theft with 28 cases, 24 cases of ordinary theft, and motor vehicle theft 21 cases. Generally, travel agents are very concerned about security factors in promoting a tourist destination. Availability of public facilities is also a consideration in marketing tourism products, for example the availability of health facilities, religious facilities, and adequate road access. In Toba Samosir Regency, the number of health facilities recorded were 3 hospitals, 19 health centers and 9 health clinics. Whereas cases of infectious diseases (TB) were 153 cases of TB and 77 cases of dengue fever (DB). The number of underprivileged families in 2015 was
16,405 families. A house of worship is one element for the convenience of visitors. According to BPS 2016 data, the houses of worship in Toba Samosir Regency were 37 mosques, 13 mosques, 315 Protestant churches and 66 Catholic churches.

Looking at these data the tendency of decreasing visits of tourists and tourists in Toba Samosir, then the safety and comfort factor would certainly be a separate consideration for agents and tourists to visit the area. Place factor is one of the determining factors in increasing the number of tourist visits. The Tourism Office developed 5 tourism destinations in 2015 to become 10 tourism destinations in 2021. The average budgeted cost is 1.8 billion / year for the development of tourism detention. While the tourism target groups amounted to 5 in 2015, with a budget of Rp. 750 million / year or 1 group an average of Rp. 150 million / year. People related to human factors, both in attitude and daily behavior. The Toba Samosir community still upholds customs. On the one hand, the strength of customs is the local wisdom possessed by the Toba Samosir community. Local wisdom is reflected in customs especially in land ownership. Most of the land in Toba Samosir belongs to the original family of Toba Samosir. By some people, especially young people considered to be a limiting factor in inviting tourism investors from other regions, such as hotels, restaurants, and so on.

**SUSTAINABILITY OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT**

Guarantees for the sustainability of tourism development can be seen from the grand design developed by the central government and regional governments. The central government sets the Lake Toba area as one of the national leading destinations. The 5th mission of Toba Samosir Regency is the realization of Toba Samosir as one of the national tourism priority destinations. Therefore, in view of the government's political will, the sustainability of tourism development is still guaranteed by the government.

Guaranteeing the sustainability of tourism sector development can be seen from the aspect of implementation of the grand design of tourism development. Grindle (1999) looks at policy implementation from aspects of policy content and policy context. In terms of policy content, the authority of the district government in tourism development is still relatively limited. This can be seen from the still large authority of the central government, namely the establishment of the Lake Toba Authority (BODT) which is based in Medan. The authority of BODT covers all aspects related to the preservation of ecosystems, culture, infrastructure around the Lake Toba area, which is the authority of BODT. The implementation of tourism affairs is only Toba Samosir district only gets a very small portion of the budget. Therefore, from the aspect of authority, the Toba Samosir district government cannot do much in developing tourism. What is often disputed is how effective BODT is in carrying out its functions.

Situmorang (2016) said that BODT was designed to act as a coordinator, accelerator, and executor with high legitimacy and effectiveness, needed to design community-based ecotourism development and truly pay attention to aspects of culture and environmental conservation. The coordinative role carried out by BODT should also be more facilitative and collaborative. Thus, space remains for the community, business world, and district governments to take part in the entire development process, starting from planning, implementation, and sustainability. BPOPKDT was formed through Presidential Regulation No. 49, 2016, 13 July 2016, whose structure consists of a Steering Board chaired by the Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs and as the chief executive of the Ministry of Tourism.

Judging from the policy context, there are several elements that support the sustainability of tourism development in Toba Samosir district. The existence of Tourism Awareness (Sadarwi) groups which are under the auspices of the Tourism Office are the trigger for the development of tourism in the local area. The Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Areas, and Transmigration initiated the development of tourism supporting infrastructure in a number of Tourism Villages in Toba Samosir district, such as the construction of parks, canteen arrangement, and selfie booths in Lumban Gaol Village, Bulbul Beach, and Lumban Binanga. Entrance tickets for tourist locations are also free by the local village government.

Public acceptance and recognition of the presence of tourism is also a consideration in the sustainability of tourism. Batak people have a living philosophy, such as “Dalihan na Tolu” Anakkonhido hamoraon diau”, “Hagabeon, hasangapon and hamoraon”, and “Pogos diarta alai mora diadat”. The philosophy of life of the Batak people is deeply rooted and strengthens the lives of the Batak people. According to Situmorang (2016) although ordinary Batak
people are known to be smart, assertive, hard-working, tolerant, and have extraordinary adaptive abilities, all these characteristics do not necessarily correspond with the demands of tourism services businesses. Some people able to accept outside influences, but others have not been able to accept the presence of the tourism industry. The role of the university as part of the collaboration element, such as the cancellation of the Helix Theory may need to be improved. For example Tourism Village socialization by universities is needed to promote tourism development. Socialization by Medan State University in this case by the Center for the Study of Social Sciences and History (PUSSIS), as well as activities to strengthen community collective awareness facilitated by the University of North Sumatra (USU).

Based on the description above, the community elements that support the sustainability of tourism development are the government (central and regional), Sadrawi groups, entrepreneurs, indigenous peoples, and universities. The community element initiated by the Toba Samosir Regency Government is the Sadarwi group, which is facilitated by the Tourism Office. While groups of entrepreneurs, traditional leaders, and universities have a relatively small share in government collaboration, especially in the tourism sector. Coordination between levels of government is initiated by the Ministry of Village, Development of Disadvantaged Areas, and Transmigration through the realization of tourism villages, as well as the Ministry of Tourism embodied in KSPN.

CONCLUSION

The findings of this study are: 1). The pillars that play a role in managing tourism in the region, are local governments, tourism conscious communities (conscious), business actors, and indigenous groups. 2). The overlapping interests between agencies in tourism development are confusing the community. 3). The government does not carry out monitoring and motivating functions in tourism management in the region. The implication of this finding is the need to develop a pilot project that develops the concept of government collaboration in the tourism sector in regions that have the potential of tourism in Indonesia to support the sustainability of tourism development in Indonesia.

REFERENCE

Covey, Stephen R. The 7 Habits of Highly Effective People. Powerfull Lessons in Personal Change.


